

XX.

BAVLI SHABBAT CHAPTER TWENTY

FOLIOS 137B-141B

20:1

- A. R. Eliezer says, “(1) On the festival they spread out a strainer, and (2) on the Sabbath they pour [wine] into one which is already spread out.”
 - B. And sages say, “(1) On the festival they do not spread out a strainer, and (2) on the Sabbath they do not pour [wine] into one which is spread out.
 - C. “But on the festival they pour [wine] into one which is spread out.”
- I.1**
- A. *Since R. Eliezer maintains that one may not add to a temporary “tent” [such as is involved in suspending a strainer], can it be supposed that he would permit making one to begin with?*
 - B. *What’s this all about?*
 - C. *It is as we have learned in the Mishnah: The window shutter [stopper of a skylight] — R. Eliezer says, “When it is tied on and suspended, they shut [the window] with it. And if not, they do not shut [the window] with it.” And sages say, “One way or the other, they shut the window with it” [M. 17:7]. And said Rabbah bar bar Hannah said R. Yohanan, “All concur that to begin with, on a festival, one may not make a temporary shelter, and it goes without saying, or on the Sabbath. They differ in the matter of adding on to a building, R. Eliezer says, ‘They do not add to a building on the festival, and it goes without saying, or on the Sabbath.’ And Sages say, ‘They do add to a building on the Sabbath, and, it goes without saying, on the festival’ [T. Suk. 1:8E-F].”*
 - D. *R. Eliezer further accepts the theory of R. Judah, for it has been taught on Tannaite authority: There is no difference between a festival day and the*

Sabbath except for preparing food alone [= M. **Meg. 1:5**]. R. Judah even permits [one to do what is] preliminary to [preparing] food, [for example, sharpening the knife, contrary to M. **Bes. 3:7A**] [T. **Meg. 1:7**].

E. *Well, I may well maintain that we have heard that R. Judah holds that position with respect to those things needed for food preparation that one cannot make prior to the festival. But has he been heard to maintain that position in the case of things needed for food preparation that one may make prior to the festival?*

F. *Well, as a matter of fact, R. Eliezer goes further than R. Judah in that aspect.*

II.1 A. **And sages say, “(1) On the festival they do not spread out a strainer, and (2) on the Sabbath they do not pour [wine] into one which is spread out. But on the festival they pour [wine] into one which is spread out”:**

B. *The question was raised: If one does spread it out, what is the rule?*

C. Said R. Joseph, “If one does suspend it, he is liable to a sin-offering.”

D. *Said to him Abbayye, “Well, then, if one suspended a pitcher on a peg, is he liable, too?”* [This is not a real building, such a thing being permitted only by authority of rabbis, not by the Torah.]

E. **[138A]** *Rather, said Abbayye, “Such a thing is forbidden by the authority of rabbis, so that one does not do the act the way he would on an ordinary day.”*

II.2 A. *Abbayye collected strict rulings of Tannaite statements external to the Mishnah and repeated them: A leather bag, strainer, canopy, or camp chair one may not stretch out, and if he did so, he is exempt from penalty, while such an act is forbidden. Permanent tents he should not set up, and if he did so, he is liable to a sin-offering. But as to a bed, chair, three-legged stool, and footstool he may set up to begin with [these are not in the category of tents, since the covers are permanently spread out].*

III.1 A. **...On the Sabbath they do not pour [wine] into one which is spread out:**

B. *The question was raised: If one strained wine, what is the law?*

C. Said R. Kahana, “If one strained wine, he is liable to a sin-offering.”

D. *Objected R. Sheshet, “Well, now, is there something for which, on the authority of rabbis, one is liable to a sin-offering, but that R. Eliezer permits to begin with?”*

E. *Objected R. Joseph, “Well, why not? There is, after all, the golden tiara, on account of the wearing of which on the Sabbath R. Meir imposes liability to a*

sin-offering, but which R. Eliezer permits wearing to begin with on the Sabbath!"

F. *Where is the reference to this item?*

G. *It is in line with that which has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

H. **"A woman should not go out in public domain wearing a golden tiara, and if she went out, she is liable to a sin-offering," the words of R. Meir.**

I. **And sages say, "She may not go out, but if she did, she is exempt."**

J. **R. Eliezer says, "A woman may go out to begin with wearing a golden tiara" [T. [Shab. 4:6A-D](#)].**

K. *Said to him Abbayye, "But do you really think R. Eliezer makes reference to the opinion of R. Meir, who holds that she is liable to a sin-offering? It is to rabbis that he makes reference, within their opinion that she is exempt though such an act is forbidden, and he says to them, to begin with it is permitted."*

III.2 A. *On what grounds do we admonish a person [not to perform the action, so that, if he does so, it will have been a deliberate and knowing act and he will be liable]?*

B. Rabbah said, "On the count of selecting [winnowing]."

C. R. Zira said, "On the count of sifting."

D. *Said Rabbah, "In accord with my view it is more reasonable, for just as it is the way of one who selects is to take something and eat it and leave the refuse, so here, too, he takes the edible, which is the wine, and leaves the refuse."*

E. *Said R. Zira, "In accord with my view it is more reasonable, for just as it is the way of one who sifts to keep the refuse on top and the edible at the bottom, so here, too, the refuse is on top and the edible on the bottom."*

III.3 A. *R. Ammi bar Ezekiel repeated as a Tannaite statement: "As to a doubled-over sheet, one may not spread it out, but if he did so, he is exempt [Freedman: because the top of this improvised tent is less than a handbreadth in width], though the act is forbidden. If a thread or cord was wound around it [Freedman: the sheet was already on the pole from before the Sabbath, and a thread or cord was attached thereto by means of which it might be pulled down; when it is pulled down, one merely adds to a temporary or improvised tent], to begin with it is permitted to spread it out."*

III.4 A. R. Kahana asked Rab, "As to a canopy, what is the law?"

- B. He said to him, "Even a bed is forbidden."
- C. "As to a bed, what is the law?"
- D. "Even a canopy is permitted."
- E. "As to a canopy and a bed, what is the law?"
- F. He said to him, "The canopy is forbidden and the bed is permitted."

G. But there is no contradiction among these rulings. When he said, Even a bed is forbidden, he was referring to the kind used by the Kermanians. When he said to him, Even a canopy is permitted, he was referring to the kind used by R. Ammi bar Ezekiel. And when he said, The canopy is forbidden and the bed is permitted, that refers to one like ours.

H. Said R. Joseph, "I saw the canopies used in the household of R. Huna, which are stretched out at night and dismantled in the morning."

- III.5** A. Said Rab in the name of R. Hiyya, "A door curtain may be hung up and taken down [being no tent, for it has no roof (Freedman)]."
- B. And said Samuel in the name of R. Hiyya, **[138B]** "A bridal canopy may be spread out and may be taken down."
- C. Said R. Sheshet b. R. Idi, "We have made this statement only in the case of one that does not have at its top a square handbreadth, but if it has at its top [as a roof] a square handbreadth of space, it is forbidden to do so. *And even if it has not got a square handbreadth at its top too, we have made that statement only if there is not the width of a handbreadth within the space of three handbreadths from the top, but if there is the width of a handbreadth within the space of three handbreadths from the top, it is forbidden. And we have made this statement only if the slope was less than a handbreadth, but if the slope was a handbreadth, then the slope of a tent is classified as a tent. And we have made that statement only if it does not descend a handbreadth below the bed, but if it does, it also is forbidden.*"

III.6 A. And said R. Sheshet b. R. Idi, "A peaked cap is permitted."

B. *But hasn't it been taught, "A peaked cap is forbidden"?*

C. *No problem, in the one case it's a handbreadth in size [and so forms a tent and may not be worn on the Sabbath], in the other, it is not so large as that.*

D. *Well, then, what about this case: If one lets his cloak protrude by a handbreadth, would he be culpable too? Rather, say: No problem, in the one case it is tightly fitted to the head, in the other case not [and it is forbidden, since the wind may blow it off and he may end up carrying it (Freedman/Rashi)].*

- III.7** A. *R. Ammi bar Ezekiel sent word to R. Huna, “Tell us please, some of those really excellent statements that you told us in the name of Rab, two concerning the Sabbath, one concerning the Torah.”*
- B. [The Sabbath:] *He replied to him, “This is what has been taught on Tannaite authority: As to a leather bag, it is permitted to stretch it by its thongs. Said Rab, ‘They made this statement only with reference to two men’s doing so, but if done by one man, it is forbidden.’”*
- C. Said Abbaye, *“And as to a canopy, even if it was stretched by ten men, it is forbidden, for it is not possible that it won’t be somewhat stretch by them.”*
- D. *And what is the other?*
- E. [The Sabbath:] *“As has been taught on Tannaite authority: A stove, one of the legs of which has fallen off, it still may be handled; if both do, it may not be handled. Said Rab, ‘Even if one falls out, it is forbidden to handle it, lest he fix it.’”*
- F. [The Torah:] As to the Torah, Rab said, “The Torah is destined to be forgotten in Israel: ‘Then the Lord will make plagues wonderful’ (Deu. 28:59). But I don’t know how they will be wonderful. Then it is said, ‘Therefore behold I will proceed to do a wonderful work among this people, even a wonderful work and a wonder, and the wisdom of their wise men shall perish’ (Isa. 29:14), so it means that this ‘wonder’ involves the Torah.”

**Topical Appendix on the Proposition
that the Torah is destined to be forgotten in Israel**

III.8 A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

B. **When our rabbis entered the vineyard in Yavneh, they said, “The Torah is destined to be forgotten in Israel, for it is said, ‘Lo, the days are coming, says the Lord God, that I shall send a famine in the land, not a famine of bread nor a third for water but of hearing the words of the Lord....And they shall wander from sea to sea and from the north even to the east; they shall run to and**

fro to seek the word of the Lord and shall not find it' (Amo. 8:11-12).

C. "...The word of the Lord': That means, law.

D. "...The word of the Lord': That means, the end.

E. "...The word of the Lord': That means, prophecy" [T. Ed. 1:1A-F].

F. *And what is the meaning of, "They shall run to and fro to seek the word of the Lord and shall not find it"?*

G. They said, "A woman is destined to take a loaf of bread in the status of heave-offering and make the rounds of synagogues and houses of study to find out whether it is unclean or whether it is clean, and no one will understand what is clean or unclean."

H. *But that matter is explicitly stated in Scripture:* "All food that may be eaten... shall be unclean" (Lev. 11:34) [and the Written Torah is there to consult]!

I. Rather, to find out whether it is in the first remove of uncleanness or whether it is in the second remove of uncleanness, and no one will understand.

J. *But that, too, is explicitly stated in the Mishnah, for we have learned therein:* [As to] the insect which is found in the oven, the bread which is in it [is unclean in the] second [degree of uncleanness], for the oven [is unclean in the] first [degree of uncleanness] [M. Kel. 8:5E-H]!

K. *What will be subject to doubt for them will be what R. Adda bar Ahbah asked Raba, "But why not regard the oven as though it were entirely filled with uncleanness [since its airspace is unclean, even if the creeping thing never gets to the sides], in which case the bread would be in the first remove of uncleanness?"*

L. *He said to him, "We don't invoke the conception, 'But why not regard the oven as though it were entirely filled with uncleanness,' for it has been taught on Tannaite authority:* Might one suppose that all utensils will contract uncleanness from the air space of an earthenware utensil? Scripture states, 'Whatever is in it shall be unclean... all food therein that may

be eaten,' meaning, food contracts uncleanness from the contained air space of a clay utensil, but utensils do not contract uncleanness from the contained air space of a clay utensil."

III.9 A. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

B. R. Simeon b. Yohai says, "God forbid that the Torah should be forgotten in Israel, as it is said, 'For it shall not be forgotten out of the mouths of their descendants' (Deu. 31:21). But then how should I interpret the verse, 'they shall run to and fro to seek the word of the Lord and shall not find it' (Amo. 8:11-12)? That they will not find [139A] a clarification of a statement of the law or a clarification of a passage of the Mishnah in any place."

III.10 A. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

B. R. Yosé b. Elisha says, "If you see a generation on which great troubles break, go and examine the judges of Israel, for any punishment that comes into the world comes only on account of the judges of Israel, as it is said, 'Hear this, please you heads of the house of Jacob and rulers of the house of Israel, who abhor judgment and pervert all equity. They build up Zion with blood and Jerusalem with iniquity. The heads thereof judge for reward, and the priests thereof teach for hire, and the prophets thereof divine for money, yet will they lean upon the Lord? (Mic. 3:9-11). They are wicked, yet they put their trust in him who by speaking brought the world into being. Therefore the Holy One, blessed be He, will bring upon them three punishments for three transgressions for which they bear responsibility, as it is said, 'Therefore shall Zion for your sake be ploughed as a field, and Jerusalem shall become heaps, and the mountain of the house as the high places of a forest' (Mic. 3:12).

C. "And the Holy One, blessed be He, will bring his Presence to rest on Israel only when the wicked judges and rulers will come to an end in Israel, as it is said, 'And I will turn my hand upon you and thoroughly purge away your dross and will take away all your tin, and I will restore your judges as at the first and your counsellors as at the beginning' (Isa. 1:25-26)."

III.11 A. Said Ulla, “Jerusalem will be redeemed only through righteousness, as it is written, ‘Zion shall be redeemed with judgment and her converts with righteousness’ (Isa. 1:27).”

B. Said R. Pappa, “*If the arrogant end [in Israel], the Magi will end [in Iran], if the judges end [in Israel], the rulers of thousands will come to an end [in Iran]. If the arrogant end [in Israel], the magi will end [in Iran], as it is written, ‘And I will purely purge away your haughty ones and take away all your tin’ (Isa. 1:25). If judges end [in Israel], the rulers of thousands will come to an end [in Iran], as it is written, ‘The Lord has taken away your judgments, he has cast out your enemy’ (Zep. 3:15).*”

III.12 A. Said R. Milai in the name of R. Eleazar b. R. Simeon, “What is the meaning of the verse, ‘The Lord has broken the staff of the wicked, the scepter of the rulers’ (Isa. 14: 5)? ‘The Lord has broken the staff of the wicked’: This refers to judges who become a staff for their court officers; ‘The scepter of the rulers’ refers to disciples of sages who belong to families of the judges.”

B. Mar Zutra said, “This refers to disciples of sages who teach public law to ignorant judges.”

III.13 A. Said R. Milai in the name of R. Eleazar b. R. Simeon, “What is the meaning of the verse, ‘For your hands are defiled with blood, and your fingers with iniquity; your lips have spoken lies, your tongue speaks wickedness’ (Isa. 59: 3)? ‘For your hands are defiled with blood’ speaks of judges; ‘and your fingers with iniquity’ speaks of the scribes of the judges; ‘your lips have spoken lies’ refers to the court clerks of the judges; ‘your tongue speaks wickedness’ means litigants.”

III.14 A. And said R. Milai in the name of R. Isaac Magdalene, “From the day on which Joseph took his leave of his brothers, he didn’t taste the taste of wine: ‘The blessings of your father shall be on the head of Joseph, and on the crown of the head of him who was a Nazirite since his departure from his brothers’ (Gen. 49:26).”

B. R. Yosé bar Hanina said, “They, too, didn’t taste wine: ‘And they drank and drank largely with him’ (Gen. 43:34) — *they didn’t get drunk until that moment.*”

C. *And the holder of the contrary view?*

D. *There was no inebriation, but there was drinking in moderation.*

III.15 A. And said R. Milai, “As a reward for the fact, ‘and when he sees you, he shall be glad in his heart’ (Exo. 4:14) [Aaron] will have the merit of wearing the breastplate of judgment on his heart.”

Further Study of the Issues of the Mishnah-Paragraph

III.16 A. *The people of Bashkar sent word to Levi, “As to setting up a canopy on the Sabbath, what is the law? About planting cuscuta in a vineyard, what is the law? As to dealing with a corpse on a festival, what is the law?”*

B. *While the messenger was en route, Levi died. Said Samuel to R. Menassaya, “If you have the knowledge to reply to them.”*

C. *He replied to them, “As to a canopy, we have reviewed all aspects of the canopy, and we have found no grounds for permitting doing so.”*

D. *So why didn’t he reply to them in line with what R. Ammi bar Ezekiel said?*

E. *Because they weren’t fully masters of the Torah.*

F. *“As to planting cuscuta in a vineyard, it falls into the category of a mixture [of seeds, and forbidden].”*

G. *So why didn’t he reply to them in accord with R. Tarfon, for it has been taught on Tannaite authority: As for cuscuta, R. Tarfon says, “It is not mixed seeds in a vineyard,” and sages say, “It is mixed seeds in a vineyard” [T. Kil. 3:15]? For it is an established principle for us: Any opinion that is lenient in respect to the Land is decided law outside of the Land?*

H. *Because they weren’t fully masters of the Torah.*

III.17 A. *Declared Rab, “One who wants to may plant cuscuta in a vineyard.”*

B. *R. Amram the Pious excommunicated someone on that account.*

C. *R. Mesharshayya would give a penny to a gentile child to sow it for him.*

D. *Yeah, so why not give it to an Israelite child for the same purpose?*

E. *He might turn out to retain this practice when he grows up.*

F. *Yeah, so why not give it to a gentile adult for the same purpose?*

G. *He might end up substituting an Israelite for a gentile.*

III.18 A. *As to a corpse, he sent them word, “As to a corpse, neither Jews nor gentiles should get involved with it either on the first day of a festival or on the second day of a festival.”*

B. *Now is that so? But didn’t R. Judah bar Shilat say R. Assi said, “There was an incident in the synagogue of Maon on a festival toward the advent of the Sabbath, [140A] and I don’t know whether it was before or after it, and they came to R. Yohanan, and he said to them, ‘Let gentiles get involved with it’”?*

C. *And said Raba, “As to a death on the first day of a festival, gentiles may get involved with it, on the second, Israelites may do so, and that is the case even on the second festival day of the New Year, which is not the case with the disposition of an egg [laid on the first festival day of a festival; it may be eaten on the second day].”*

D. *Because they weren’t fully masters of the Torah.*

III.19 A. *Said R. Abin bar Huna said R. Hama bar Guria, “A person may wrap himself in a canopy sheet and tie it with its cords to go out into the street on the Sabbath and need not scruple.”*

B. *How does this differ from what R. Huna said, for said R. Huna said Rab, “He who goes out on the Sabbath with a cloak that does not have show fringes in accord with the law is liable to a sin-offering”?*

C. *Show fringes with respect to a cloak are taken into account and so are not merged in it; these but are regarded as null.*

III.20 A. *Said Rabbah bar R. Huna, “A person may practice deception with a strainer on a festival. This he does by spreading it out as if to hold pomegranates, but straining lees in it.”*

B. *Said R. Ashi, “But that is the case only if he actually put pomegranates in it.”*

C. *How does it differ from that which has been taught on Tannaite authority:* It is permitted to pour in the ingredients for brewing mead during the intermediate days of the festival for us on the festival, but if it is not for use on the festival, it is forbidden. And if one had some left over, it is permitted, so long as one does not practice deception in the matter?

D. *In that case, the evasion is not self-evident to third parties, in this case it is [and so it is subject to restrictions].*

III.21 A. *Rabbis told R. Ashi, “See, master, that neophyte rabbi, R. Huna bar Hivan by name, and some say, R. Huna bar Halvan by name, who has taken a peel of garlic, put it on the bung-hole of a barrel, and said, ‘My intention is to put it away here’ [but he really wanted to keep the wine in the barrel, and so he repaired the barrel by this subterfuge]. Furthermore, he went and dozed in a ferry boat, by that means crossing to the other side so as to examine his produce in the field, saying, ‘But my intention is to sleep here.’”*

B. *He said to him, “Are you speaking of deception? It is deception in connection with a prohibition of rabbis [not a prohibition of the Torah], and a disciple of rabbis is not going to do such a thing to begin with.”*

20:2

- A. They pour water over wine dregs so that they will be clarified.
- B. And they strain wine in cloths or in a twig basket.
- C. And they put an egg into a mustard strainer.
- D. And they prepare honeyed wine on the Sabbath.
- E. R. Judah says, “On the Sabbath [it is done] in a cup, and on a festival day in a flagon, and on the intervening days of a festival in a barrel.”
- F. R. Sadoq says, “All depends on the number of guests.”

I.1 A. [They pour water over wine dregs so that they will be clarified:] Said Zeiri, “A person may put clear wine and clear water into a strainer on the Sabbath without apprehension, but not turbid liquid [since this might constitute straining].”

- B. *By way of objection:* Rabban Simeon b. Gamaliel says, “One may stir up a barrel of wine, wine and lees, and put it into a strainer on the Sabbath without apprehension [even though the liquid is made turbid by the stirring (Freedman)].
- C. *Zeiri explained,* “They repeated this rule with reference to the season of wine pressing [when all wine is turbid and drunk that way, so at that time it does not involve preparation of the wine].”

II.1 A. And they strain wine in cloths or in a twig basket.

- B. Said R. Shimi bar Hiyya, “And that is on condition that one doesn’t make a hollow in the cloth.”

II.2 A. And they strain wine in cloths or in a twig basket:

- B. Said R. Hiyya bar Ashi said Rab, “And that is on condition that he doesn’t lift the basket a handbreadth above the bottom of the utensil that receives the wine [and so make a tent of it].”

II.3 A. Said Rab, “Spreading a rag over half a cask to cover it is permitted; over the whole is forbidden [on the count of making a tent].”

II.4 A. Said R. Pappa, “Someone shouldn’t stuff wood chips into the mouth of a cask jug, since it looks as though he’s making a strainer.”

B. *Members of the household of R. Pappa would pour wine slowly from one utensil to the other [leaving the sediment].*

C. *Said R. Aha of Difta to Rabina, “But lo, there is the residue?” [That is left behind, so the clear purpose is to strain the wine.]*

D. *“In the household of R. Pappa, residue was of no value [he would throw it out].”*

III.1 A. And they put an egg into a mustard strainer:

- B. *R. Jacob Qorhah repeated as a Tannaite statement: [140A] “That is because that is done only to color [the stew, but not for the purpose of straining or selecting].”*

III.2 A. It has been stated:

- B. As to mustard grain that one needed on the Sabbath eve, on the next day —
- C. Said Rab, “One may crush it in a utensil but not by hand.”
- D. *Said to him Samuel, “By hand? But does someone on ordinary days crush it by hand? That would be food for asses.”*

- E. Rather, said Samuel, “One crushes it by hand and doesn’t crush it by means of a utensil.”

III.3 A. *It has been stated:*

- B. R. Eleazar said, “One way or the other, it is forbidden.”
- C. And R. Yohanan said, “One way or the other, it is permitted.”
- D. Both Abbayye and Raba said, “The decided law is not in accord with R. Yohanan.”

E. *R. Yohanan confirmed the theory of R. Eleazar, and R. Eleazar adopted the theory of Samuel. Then both Abbayye and Raba said, “The decided law conforms to the position of R. Yohanan.”*

III.4 A. *Abbayye’s mother made some for him and he didn’t eat it. Zeira’s wife made some for R. Hiyya bar Ashi and he wouldn’t eat it. She said to him, “Well, I made some for your teacher and he ate it, and you won’t eat it?”*

III.5 A. *Said Raba bar Sheba, “I was standing before Rabina and stirred mustard for him with the smooth part of the garlic, and he ate it.”*

III.6 A. *Said Mar Zutra, “The decided law is not in accord with any of these traditions. But it is in accord with that which has been stated: As to mustard that is knead on the eve of the Sabbath, on the next day one may crush it whether by hand or with a utensil and may put honey in it, but not beat it up but may only be mixed. If cress is chopped up on the eve of the Sabbath, the next day one may put in oil and vinegar and add pepperwort, and he must not beat it up but may mix it. Garlic that is crushed on the eve of the Sabbath, on the next day one may put in beans and grits, but not pound them, but may mix them up and add pepperwort.”*

B. *What’s pepperwort?*

C. *Mint.*

D. *Said Abbayye, “That shows that mint is good for seasoning cress.”*

IV.1 A. **And they prepare honeyed wine on the Sabbath.**

- B. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
- C. *On the Sabbath people may prepare a wine-honey-pepper mixture, but not aromatic water.*

- D. What is the definition of the former and of the latter?
- E. The former is a mixture of wine, honey, and pepper, the latter is a mixture of old wine, pure water, and balsam.
- F. *The latter is used in the bathhouse as a cooler.*

IV.2 A. *Said R. Joseph, "Once I went after Mar Uqba to the bathhouse. When I went out, they gave me as a drink a cup of that kind of wine, and I felt it from the hair of my head down to my toenails, and if I had drunk another glass, I would have feared lest the pleasure of it be deducted from the store of merit that I enjoy for the world to come."*
 B. *Yeah, well Mar Uqba drank it every day.*
 C. *Mar Uqba was exceptional, because he was accustomed to it.*

20:3

- A. **They do not soak asafoetida in warm water.**
- B. **But one puts it into vinegar.**
- C. **And they do not soak vetches or rub them.**
- D. **But one puts them into a sieve or a basket.**
- E. **They do not sift chopped straw in a sifter.**
- F. **Nor does one put it on a high place so that the chaff will fall out.**
- G. **But one takes it in a sieve and pours it into the crib.**

- I.1** A. **[They do not soak asafoetida in warm water. But one puts it into vinegar:]** *The question was raised: If one did soak it, what is the law?*
 B. *R. Ada of Nersh explained before R. Joseph, "If one soaked it, he is liable to a sin-offering."*
 C. *Said to him Abbayye, "Well, then if one soaked raw meat in water, wouldn't he be liable too?"*
 D. *Rather, said Abbayye, "On the basis of the authority of rabbis, one should not do things on the Sabbath in the way that he does during the week."*
- I.2** A. *R. Yohanan asked R. Yannai, "What is the law if one soaked asafoetida in cold water?"*
 B. *He said to him, "It is forbidden."*
 C. *"But lo, we have learned in the Mishnah: **They do not soak asafoetida in warm water.** Therefore doing so in cold water must be permitted."*

- D. "If so, what makes me better than you in our Mishnah studies? *Our Mishnah paragraph in fact represents only a schismatic view, as has been taught on Tannaite authority: They do not soak asafoetida in warm water. R. Yosé says, 'It is forbidden to do so in warm water but permitted to do so in cold water' [T. Shab. 16:A-B].*"

- I.3** A. *For what do people make it?*
B. *For asthma.*

- I.4** A. *R. Aha bar Joseph suffered from asthma. He came before Mar Uqba. He said to him, "Go drink three weights of asafoetida on three days."*
B. *So he went and drank it on Thursday and on Friday. The next morning he went to the house of study and asked whether he might do so that day too.*
C. *They said to him, "A Tannaite authority of the household of R. Ada, and some say, a Tannaite authority of the household of Mar bar R. Ada [stated], 'One may drink a qab or two and not scruple.'"*
D. *He said to them, "Well, I wasn't asking about drinking it. What I wanted to ask is, what is the law as to soaking it?"*
E. *Said to them R. Hiyya bar Abin, "I personally had such a case, and I came and asked R. Ada bar Ahbah, and he didn't have the answer in hand, so I went and asked R. Huna, and he said to me, 'This is what Rab said, "He may dissolve it in cold water and put it into the sun.'"*
F. *Is this in accord only with him who permits dissolving it?*
G. *No, it is even according to him who forbids doing so; that is only if he had never drunk it, but in this case, since he had drunk it Thursday and Friday, if he didn't drink it on the Sabbath, he would endanger his life.*

- I.5** A. *R. Aha bar Joseph was walking along leaning on the shoulder of R. Nahman bar Isaac, his sister's son. He said to him, "When we get to R. Safra's house, lead me in." When they got there, he led him in.*
B. *He asked him, "What is the law on rubbing the stiffness of linen out on the Sabbath? Is the intent to soften the linen, so one may do so, or is the intention to whiten it, and that would be forbidden?"*
C. *He said to him, "The intention is to soften it, and it is permitted."*

- D. *When he came out, he asked, "What did you ask him?"*
- E. *He said to him, "I asked him, what is the law on rubbing the stiffness of linen out on the Sabbath? And he told me it's o.k."*
- F. *"Well, why didn't the master ask him about a scarf?"*
- G. *"I didn't ask him about a scarf, because I'd asked R. Huna about that and he settled that question for me."*
- H. *"Well, then, why didn't the master solve this problem on the basis of that information?"*
- I. *He said to him, "In that case, it looks as though he is whitening it; here it doesn't look as though he is whitening it."*

Composite of Rulings in Hisda's Name on the Sabbath, joined to begin with as a gloss to the foregoing

- I.6** A. *Said R. Hisda, "As to linen, [140B] it is permitted to draw it away from the cane, it is forbidden to draw it out of the cane."*
- B. *Said Raba, "But if it is a weaver's implement, it is permitted [as a utensil that may be handled]."*
- I.7** A. *Said R. Hisda, "As to a bunch of vegetables, if it is fit for food for animals, it may be handled, if not, it is forbidden."*
- B. *Said R. Hiyya bar Ashi said Rab, "A meat hook may be handled, a fish hook may not."*
- I.8** A. *Said R. Qattina, "He who stands on the middle of a bed is as though he stood on a woman's belly."*
- B. *But that ain't so.*
- I.9** A. *And said R. Hisda, "A member of a household of a master who buys vegetables should buy long ones, for as to thickness, one bundle is as thick as the other, so the extra length comes for nothing."*
- B. *And said R. Hisda, "A member of a household of a master who buys cane for fuel should buy long ones, for as to thickness, one bundle is as thick as the other, so the extra length comes for nothing."*

C. *And said R. Hisda, "A member of a household of a master who doesn't have much bread shouldn't eat vegetables, because they whet the appetite."*

D. *And said R. Hisda, "As for me, when I was poor, I didn't eat vegetables, and when I am rich, I don't eat vegetables. When I was poor, it was because it whets the appetite; when rich, because I say, well, where vegetables can go, let fish and meat go."*

E. *And said R. Hisda, "A member of a household of a master who doesn't have much bread shouldn't divide his meal" [since he won't have enough however he eats].*

F. *And said R. Hisda, "A member of a household of a master who doesn't have much bread shouldn't break bread at the beginning of a meal. How come? Because he can't do it with a lavish hand."*

G. *And said R. Hisda, "As for me, I wouldn't break bread until I had run my hand through my whole pocket and found there as much as I needed."*

H. *And said R. Hisda, "If one can eat bread made of barley but eats bread made of wheat, he violates the injunction against wanton destruction of property [at Deu. 20:19]."*

I. *And said R. Pappa, "One who can drink beer but drinks wine violates the injunction against wanton destruction of property [at Deu. 20:19]."*

J. *But that's not true: The commandment against wanton destruction applied to one's own person is applied at a higher level [and one may pamper himself, since that does good].*

K. *And said R. Hisda, "A member of a household of a master who doesn't have oil should wash in pit water."*

L. *And said R. Hisda, "A member of a household of a master who buys raw meat should buy the neck, since it has three kinds of meat."*

M. *And said R. Hisda, "A member of a household of a master who buys linen underwear should get it from Nehar*

Abba and wash it every thirty days, and I assure you he won't have to buy another one for a whole year."

N. What is the meaning of 'underwear'?

O. Fine flax.

P. And said R. Hisda, "A member of a household of a master should not sit on a new mat, since it wears out the garments."

Q. And said R. Hisda, "A member of a household of a master should not send his clothes to his innkeeper for washing, since that is improper, for he might see some semen in the garment and treat him lightly."

R. Said R. Hisda to his daughters, "Be most before your men. Don't eat bread in front of your husbands, don't eat vegetables at night, don't eat dates at night, don't drink beer at night, don't defecate where your men do, and when someone knocks at the door, don't say, 'who is he,' but 'who is she?'"

S. He held a pearl in one hand and a seed grain in the other; he showed them the pearl, but not the seed grain, until they were dying to know what it was, and then he showed it to them [Freedman: to prove the folly of curiosity].

- II.1** A. **And they do not soak vetches or rub them. But one puts them into a sieve or a basket:**
- B. *Our Mishnah rule does not accord with the following Tannaite authority, as has been taught on Tannaite authority: R. Eliezer b. Jacob says, "They don't look at a sieve at all [or handle it for any purpose]."*

20:4

- A. **"They clean out [a manger] before an ox that is being fattened.**
- B. **"And they sweep aside [spilled fodder] on account of a grazing animal [or: excrement]," the words of R. Dosa.**
- C. **And sages prohibit [doing so].**
- D. **They take [fodder] from before one beast and put it before another beast on the Sabbath.**
- I.1** A. *The question was raised: Do rabbis disagree with the first or the second of the two rulings of R. Dosa or with them both?*

- B. *Come and take note of what has been taught on Tannaite authority: And sages say, "All the same for the one and for the other: One should not remove it to the sides} [and so they disagree with them both]."*
- C. Said R. Hisda, "The dispute concerns the ground manger [Freedman: a small low fenced enclosure on the ground; the rabbis forbid it lest one come to level up holes in the ground]. But as to a manger that is in a utensil, all concur that it is permitted."
- D. *But as to a manger in the ground, is there anyone who permits it? Surely one will level the holes in the ground!*
- E. *Rather, if such a statement was made, this is what it has to have been:* Said R. Hisda, "The dispute concerns a manger in a utensil, but as to one in the ground, all concur that it is forbidden."

II.1 A. They take [fodder] from before one beast and put it before another beast on the Sabbath:

- B. *One Tannaite statement:* They take fodder from before an animal that is fastidious and they put it before one that is not. *And it has further been taught on Tannaite authority:* They take it from before an animal that is not fastidious and put it before one that is.

C. Said Abbaye, "Both the one and the other take for granted that one may take food from before an ass to put it before an ox, but not from before an ox to put it before an ass. When the Tannaite rule states, they take fodder from before an animal that is fastidious, that speaks of an ass, which doesn't slobber; and they put it before one that is not speaks of an ox, [141A] which slobbers. And when the Tannaite rule maintains, they take it from before an animal that is not fastidious, it speaks of an ass, which eats anything, and put it before one that is speaks of an ox, which is particular about what it eats.

20:5

- A. **The straw which is on the bed —**
- B. **One should not shift it with his hand.**
- C. **But he shifts it with his body.**
- D. **And if it was food for a beast, or if there was a cushion or a sheet on it, he may shift it with his hand.**
- E. **A press used by householders do they loosen but do they not tighten.**
- F. **And one of laundrymen one should not touch [at all].**

- G. **R. Judah says, “If it was untied on the eve of the Sabbath, one may untie the whole thing and remove [clothing from] it.”**

Miscellaneous Rulings on Sabbath Conduct

I.1 A. *Said R. Nahman, “As to a radish, if it is right side up, it is permitted, if it is upside down, it is forbidden [because carrying indirectly is not classified as handling].”*

B. *Said R. Adda bar Abba, “They said in the household of Rab, ‘The Mishnah rule does not accord with R. Nahman: **The straw which is on the bed — one should not shift it with his hand. But he shifts it with his body. And if it was food for a beast, or if there was a cushion or a sheet on it, he may shift it with his hand.** This proves that indirect handling is not classified as handling.’”*

C. *Sure does.*

I.2 A. *Said R. Judah, “As to peppercorns, one may crush them one by one with a knife handle; it is forbidden to do so in twos.”*

B. *Raba said, “But if he does it in an unusual way [the usual would involve a peppermill], even more than that would be permitted.”*

I.3 A. *And said R. Judah, “One who bathes in water should first dry the part of his body that is not in the water, then come up out of the water, lest he come to carry water that is on him for four cubits in neglected public domain.”*

B. *If so, when he gets into the water, too, the force of his entry may force water for four cubits, and that would be forbidden!*

C. *There is no precautionary decree that covers secondary effects of force so far as neglected public domain is concerned.*

I.4 A. *Said Abbaye, and some say R. Judah, “As to mud on one’s foot, one may scrape it off on the ground but not on the wall.”*

B. *Said Raba, “How come not on a wall? Because it looks like building? But that would be the building of a field worker [and not classified as building in a proper way!].”*

C. *Rather, said Raba, “One may dry it off on the wall but not on the ground, lest he come to fill up holes.”*

I.5 A. *It has been stated:*

B. Mar b. Rabina said, "All the same are the one and the other: It is forbidden."

C. R. Pappa said, "All the same are the one and the other: It is permitted."

D. *From the perspective of Mar b. Rabina, how does he wipe it off?*

E. *He wipes it off on a beam.*

I.6 A. Said Raba, "A person shouldn't sit on the head of a stake, lest something roll away from him [into public domain] and he end up retrieving it."

B. *And said Raba, "Someone shouldn't bend a cask sideways that is standing on the ground, lest he end up leveling holes in the ground."*

C. *And said Raba, "One shouldn't squeeze a cloth stopper into the mouth of a jug, lest he end up wringing it out."*

I.7 A. Said R. Kahana, "As to mud on one's garment, one may rub off the inside but not the outside."

B. *An objection was raised:* As to mud on one's shoe, one scrapes it off with the back of a knife, and as to that which is on one's garment, he may scrape it off with his fingernail, so long as he doesn't rub it. *Surely that means, he shouldn't rub it off at all?*

C. *No, it means, he shouldn't rub it off on the outside but only on the inside.*

I.8 A. Said R. Abbahu said R. Eleazar said R. Yannai, "They may scrape off a new shoe but not an old one."

B. **[141B]** With what does one scrape it?

C. Said R. Abbahu, "With the back of a knife."

D. *Said to him a certain elder, "Drop your teaching in favor of that which R. Hiyya taught as a Tannaite rule: **They do not scrape off either old shoes or new shoes; nor may one rub his foot with oil while it is in the shoe or sandal; but he may rub his foot with oil and put it in the shoe or sandal. He may also oil his whole body and roll himself on a leather spread without scruple** [T. Shab. 3:15C-D, 3:16A-E, T. 3:17].*

E. Said R. Hisda, “They repeated this rule only if it was to polish the leather, but if it was to work it, it is forbidden.”

F. ...To polish it? *Obviously! And furthermore, is there anyone who permits polishing it?*

G. *Rather, if any such statement was made, this is what the statement presented:*

H. Said R. Hisda, “They permitted doing so only if the quantity of oil was sufficient only to polish it; but if the quantity was sufficient to work it, it is forbidden.”

I.9 A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

B. A person with small feet shouldn't go forth wearing shoes for a person with big feet, but he may wear too large a shirt. A woman may not go out with an open toed shoe, nor may she perform the rite of removing the shoe with such a shoe, but if she does, the rite of removing the shoe is valid. And one may not go out into public domain wearing new shoes.

C. With what sort of shoe did they deal? With a woman's shoe.

D. *Bar Qappara repeated as a Tannaite statement:* They repeated this only if she hadn't walk out about in it for even a brief moment prior to nightfall, but if she had gone out with it on the eve of the Sabbath, it is permitted.

I.10 A. *One Tannaite teaching:* They remove a shoe from off its last. *And it has been further taught on Tannaite authority:* They do not remove it.

B. *No problem, the one represents the view of R. Eliezer, the other, of rabbis, as we have learned in the Mishnah: A shoe which is on the last — R. Eliezer declares clean. And sages declare unclean [M. Kel. 26:4G-I].*

C. *That answer serves from the perspective of Raba, who has said, “As to something that serves a forbidden purpose, whether it is needed for itself or for the place where it is located, it is permitted to handle such an object.” Then there are no problems. But from the viewpoint of Abbaye, who said, “If it is needed for itself, it is permitted, but if one has to*

handle the object because one requires the place in which the object is located, it is forbidden,” *what is to be said?*

D. *Here with what case do we deal? With one that was on the last but was loose and didn't have to be untied. For it has been taught on Tannaite authority:* R. Judah says, “If it was loose, it is permitted.” *So the operative consideration is that it was loose; lo, if it wasn't loose, it would not be permitted.*

E. *Well, that poses no problem for Abbaye's position, who has said, “It is permitted to handle an object the ordinary use of which is forbidden, if one wants to make use of the object itself [for a permitted purpose] it is forbidden to do so merely to get at its location.” But as to Raba, who has said, “It is permitted to do so whether the need is for the object itself or for the place in which it is located,” why distinguish its being loose, when even if it were not loose, it would still be permitted to move it?*

F. *The statement of R. Judah is in the name of R. Eliezer, for it has been taught on Tannaite authority:* R. Judah says in the name of R. Eliezer, “If it was loose, it is permitted.”