

## II

---

# BAVLI BERAKHOT CHAPTER TWO

## FOLIOS 13A-17B

2:1-2

- A. As to one who was reading [the verses of the Shema] in the Torah and the time for the recitation [of the Shema] arrived:
- B. if he directed his heart [to read in order to carry out his obligation to recite the Shema], he fulfilled his obligation [to recite the Shema].
- C. [B lacks: And if [he did] not, he has not fulfilled his obligation.]
- D. “At the breaks [between the paragraphs of the Shema] one may greet [his fellow] out of respect,
- E. “and respond [to a greeting extended to him].
- F. “And in the middle [of a paragraph] one may give a greeting out of fear,
- G. “and respond,” the words of R. Meir.
- H. R. Judah says, “In the middle [of a paragraph] one may give a greeting out of fear,
- I. “and respond out of respect.
- J. “In the breaks [between the paragraphs] one may greet out of respect and
- K. “respond to the greeting of any man.”

M. 2:1

- A. The following are [those places referred to as breaks] “between the paragraphs”:
- B. Between the first blessing and the second [of those which precede the Shema];
- C. or between the second blessing and [the paragraph which begins] Shema (Deu. 6:4-9);
- D. or between [the two sections which begins] Shema and “And it shall come to pass if you shall hearken” (Deu. 11:13-21);
- E. Between [the two sections beginning] “And it shall come to pass” and “And God said to Moses” (Num. 15:37-41);
- F. Between [the two sections] “And the Lord said” and “True and upright.”

- G. R. Judah said, “Between [the two sections] ‘And the Lord said’ and ‘True and upright’ one may not interrupt.”
- H. Said R. Joshua b. Qorha, “Why does Shema precede ‘And it shall come to pass’ [in the order of this liturgy]?”
- I. “So that one should first accept upon himself the yoke of the kingdom of heaven and afterwards accept the yoke of the commandments.
- J. “[Why does] ‘And it shall come to pass’ [precede]: ‘And the Lord said’?”
- K. “For ‘And it shall come to pass’ is customarily [recited] by both day and night.
- L. “And ‘And the Lord said’ is customarily [recited] only by day.

**M. 2:2**

- I.1** A. *[The statement at M. 2:1A-C] bears the implication that carrying out religious duties requires the intention to do just that [since it is clearly stated that only if the person directed his heart to the fulfillment of his obligation to recite the Shema when he actually read the words of the Shema has he carried out that obligation].*
- B. *[That is not necessarily the proper inference to draw, for] what is the sense of, **If he directed his heart?***
- C. It is “to recite the Scripture.”
- D. *But how can that be the case, since lo, the person is already reciting the Scripture? [The proposed sense of the statement is impossible.]*
- E. No, we deal with a case of one who is reciting the Scripture only so as to see that the letters of the text at hand are correctly written [and is not reciting it as to meaning. But if he were then to recite the text only so as to make an intelligible statement, rather than merely to proof-read, that would suffice in carrying out his obligation, even though the man did not intend to carry out that obligation in reciting the passage at hand.]

### **Topical Composite of Rules on the Recitation of the Shema**

- I.2** A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
- B. “The recitation of the Shema must be as it is written [in the Hebrew language],” the words of Rabbi.
- C. And sages say, “In any language.”
- D. *What is the scriptural basis for the view of Rabbi?*
- E. Scripture has said, “And they shall be...” (Deu. 6: 6), meaning, “Just as they are,” [that is, in Hebrew].
- F. *And as to rabbis, what is the scriptural basis for their view?*
- G. Scripture has said, “Hear...” (Deu. 6: 4), meaning, in any language that you understand.
- H. *And as to Rabbi, lo, it indeed is written “Hear”?*
- I. *He requires that statement to make its own point, which is that one should make his ears hear what his mouth says [and so has to say the Shema out loud].*
- J. *And rabbis? They take the position of the one who has said, “If one has not made his ear hear what his mouth has said, he has nonetheless carried out his obligation.”*
- K. *And in the view of rabbis, lo, it is written, “And they shall be....”*

- L. *They require that statement to prove that a person should not read the passage backward.*
- M. *And as to Rabbi, how does he prove that one should not read the passage backward?*
- N. *He proves that proposition from the use of the definite article in the word, "words," thus, "these words" [in the sense of, these words, in this order].*
- O. *And rabbis? They draw no conclusions from the use of the definite article [in "words"].*
- P. *Now the foregoing dispute bears the implication that, so far as Rabbi is concerned, the entire Torah was stated in all languages. For if you think that it was stated only in the Holy Language [of Hebrew], what need was there for the All-Merciful to stipulate, "They shall be"? [If it were in Hebrew, Scripture would not have to insist that this passage in particular be read in Hebrew, as Rabbi maintains is the sense of the passage].*
- Q. *It was indeed necessary to make that explicit reference to "They shall be," because, after all, it also is written, "Hear," [which bears the implication rabbis have said. Accordingly, Scripture had to make explicit that, despite the implication of the word, "Hear," these words must be said only in Hebrew.]*
- R. *And does not the passage at hand further bear the implication that, so far as rabbis are concerned, the entire Torah was written in Hebrew?*
- S. *For if you take the view that it was written in all languages, what was the point of having the All-Merciful stipulate, "Hear"?*
- T. *It was necessary to say exactly that, because, after all, the words, "And they shall be..." have been written down. [Accordingly, rabbis explain the reference without implying their view on the original language of composition of Scripture as a whole.]*

**I.3 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. *"And they shall be" means that one should not read the passage backward.*
- C. *"These words upon your heart":*
- D. *"One might have taken the view that the recitation of the entire passage requires that the one who says it intend thereby to carry out his obligation.*
- E. *"Accordingly, Scripture states, '... these...', meaning, up to this passage in the recitation of the Shema, one has to have the intention of carrying out his obligation to recite the Shema by stating these words. From that point onward it is not necessary to have that intention," the words of R. Eliezer.*
- F. *Said to him R. Aqiba, "Lo, Scripture says, [13B] 'Which I command you this day upon your heart' (Deu. 6: 6). This means that the recitation of the entire passage must be accompanied by the intention to carry out one's obligation to recite the Shema [if one is to fulfill that obligation]."*
- G. *Said Rabbah b. b. Hana said R. Yohanan, "The law accords with the position of R. Aqiba."*
- H. *There are those who repeat the passage on Tannaite authority in the following terms, for it has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- I. **One who recites the Shema must direct his heart [so as to intend to carry out his obligation] [cf. M. Ber. 2:1].**
- J. **R. Aha says in the name of R. Judah, “If he did so during [his recitation of] the first paragraph [even though he did not concentrate during his recitation of the last paragraph, he has fulfilled his obligation] and need not do so further.” [T. Ber. 2:2A-B].**
- K. Said Rabbah b. b. Hana said R. Yohanan, “The decided law accords with the view of R. Aha, which he said in the name of R. Judah.”

**I.4 A.** *A further teaching on Tannaite authority:*

- B. “And they shall be” means that one should not read them backward.
- C. “Upon your heart”:
- D. R. Zutra says, “Up to this point, the religious duty involves correct intention [to fulfill one’s obligation to read the Shema by the recitation at hand]. From that point, the religious duty is simply one of reading the words [aloud, without necessarily having the intention of thereby carrying out one’s religious obligation to recite the Shema].”
- E. R. Josiah says, “Up to that point the religious duty involves simply reciting the words aloud. From that point, the religious duty involves having the correct intention to fulfill one’s duty to recite the Shema, [not merely to read the words at hand].”
- F. *What differentiates the two passages, so that, from that point it is a religious duty only to read the words [as Zutra has said]?*
- G. *It is written, “To speak of them” (Deu. 6:11) [which bears the commandment to recite the words aloud].*
- H. *Here too it is written, “And you shall speak of them” [so the same implication applies to both parts of the passage under discussion].*
- I. *This is the sense of the wording:*
- J. Up to this point the religious duty involves the obligation to have the proper intention to recite the Shema and so carry out one’s obligation, and also to read the words at hand. From this point onward, the duty involves only the recitation of the words at hand, without the further intention of fulfilling one’s religious duty to say the Shema.
- K. *And what differentiates the passage, so that, up to the designated point, it is a religious duty both to have the intention to fulfill his obligation to recite the Shema and also to recite aloud the words at hand?*
- L. *For it is written, “Upon your heart, and you shall speak of them...” (Deu. 6: 6).*
- M. *But there too it is written, “Upon your heart, to speak of them” (Deu. 11:18).*
- N. *That other reference [has no bearing upon the present problem, for] it is required to prove the proposition of R. Isaac, who has said, “‘And you shall put these words of mine upon your heart’ (Deu. 11:18). This proves that the location of [one of the phylacteries] should be opposite the heart.”*

**I.5 A.** A master stated: R. Josiah says, “Up to that point the religious duty involves simply reciting the words. From that point, the religious duty involves having the correct intention to fulfill one’s duty to recite the Shema.”

- B. *What differentiates the passage at hand to indicate that, from that point onward, it is an issue of having the proper intention to recite the Shema and so to carry out one's obligation?*
- C. *It is because it is written, "Upon your heart."*
- D. *Here too, lo, it is written, "Upon your heart" [as above].*
- E. *This is the sense of the passage: Up to that point the religious duty involves both reciting the words and also having the proper intention to carry out one's obligation to recite the Shema. From that point forward what is required is the intention to carry out one's religious duty to recite the Shema without necessarily having the intention to recite the words aloud [for one may just follow them and read silently].*
- F. *And what distinguishes the passage so that, up to that point it is a religious duty up to the stated passage to both recite the words aloud and also to have the intention thereby to recite the Shema?*
- G. *For it is written, "Upon your heart, and you shall speak of them."*
- H. *But elsewhere it also is written, "Upon your heart, to speak of them"?*
- I. *That latter statement concerns words of Torah, and this is the sense of the All-Merciful: "Teach your children Torah, so that they may be knowledgeable in it."*

**I.6 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. *"Hear O Israel, the Lord our God, the Lord is one" (Deu. 6: 4):*
- C. *"Up to that point in the recitation of the Shema it is necessary that the heart be directed [toward the fulfillment of one's religious duty to recite the Shema]," the words of R. Meir.*
- D. *Said Raba, "The decided law accords with the position of R. Meir."*

**I.7 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. *Sumkhos says, "Whoever lengthens the recitation of the word 'one' [ehad] has his days and years lengthened as well."*
- C. *Said R. Aha bar Jacob, "And that applies, in particular, to lengthening the letter D in the word for one."*
- D. *Said R. Ashi, "And that is on condition that one not slur the letter H."*
- E. *R. Jeremiah was in session before R. Hiyya bar Abba. He noticed that someone prolonged the letters too much. He instructed him, "Once you have [in your heart] declared God to be king above and below and in the four quarters of heaven, you do not have to persist in the matter."*

**I.8 A.** *Said R. Nathan bar Mar Uqba said R. Judah, "'Upon your heart' means that that passage must be said standing."*

- B. *"Upon your heart" alone is what you think? Rather, I should say, "Up to the passage, 'Upon your heart,' must be said standing. From that point it is not necessary."*
- C. *R. Yohanan said, "The entire passage must be said standing."*
- D. *And R. Yohanan is consistent with other views, for Rabbah bar bar Hanah said R. Yohanan said, "The decided law accords with the view of R. Aha, which he stated in the name of R. Judah."*

**I.9 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. "Hear O Israel, the Lord our God, the Lord is one" (Deu. 6: 4) — this is the form of the Shema as it was recited [early, prior to prayer] by R. Judah the Patriarch.
- C. *Said Rab to R. Hiyya, "I did not see Rabbi [Judah] accept upon himself the dominion of heaven."*
- D. *He said to him, "Son of the nobility, at the very moment at which he passes his hands across his face, he accepts the dominion of Heaven."*
- E. Does [Judah the Patriarch] later on go back and complete the recitation of the Shema [which he said only incompletely earlier], or does he not do so?
- F. Bar Qappara says, "He does not go back and complete it."
- G. R. Simeon b. Rabbi says, "He does go back and complete the recitation."
- H. *Said Bar Qappara to R. Simeon b. Rabbi, "Now there is no problem with my view, for I maintain that he does not go back and complete [the recitation of the Shema]. That is why Rabbi always reviews in his public study a passage which makes reference to the Exodus from Egypt. [This one must mention, so if it is not in the Shema, it will occur in the study materials]. But from your viewpoint, since you maintain that Rabbi does go back and complete the recitation of the Shema, why should Rabbi find it necessary to include in his review of traditions a passage involving the Exodus from Egypt [since that is included in the Shema in any case]?"*
- I. [He replied,] "It is so that he may make mention of the Exodus from Egypt at the right time [namely, at the time of day at which the Exodus took place]."

**I.10 A.** *Said R. Ela, son of R. Samuel bar Marta, in the name of Rab, "If one has recited, 'Hear O Israel, the Lord our God, the Lord is one,' and then was overcome by sleep, he has carried out his obligation."*

- B. *Said R. Nahman to Daro his slave, "Keep us awake for the recitation of the first verse, but from that point, do not both to keep us awake."*
- C. *Said R. Joseph to R. Joseph son of Rabbah, "How did your father do it?"*
- D. *He said to him, "For the recitation of the first verse he would take trouble [to stay awake], but for more than that he would not take trouble."*

**I.11 A.** *Said R. Joseph, "Someone lying on his back should not recite the Shema."*

- B. *That statement then implies that in that position he may not recite the Shema, but he may indeed sleep in that position.*
- C. *But lo, R. Joshua b. Levi cursed anyone who slept lying on his back.*
- D. *They replied, "As to sleeping on one's back, so long as one turns to the side, that is all right, but as to reciting the Shema, even though one turns to the side, it is also forbidden."*
- E. *And lo, R. Yohanan would turn to his side and recite the Shema!*
- F. *R. Yohanan was a special case, because he was fat.*

**II.1 A.** **At the break one may greet, etc. [M. 2:1D]:**

- B. *[And respond to a greeting extended to him, M. 2:1E:] On what account may he respond?*

- C. *If I say that it is on account of respect owing to the other, [then I must ask the following question:]*
- D. *If one may to begin with greet his fellow, is there any question that he may also reply to him?*
- E. Rather, he greets his fellow on account of respect, and he replies with a greeting to anyone [whether out of respect or not].
- F. *Then I may point to the concluding passage of the same unit:*
- G. **In the middle one may give a greeting out of fear and respond [so Meir] [M. 2:1F-G].**
- H. *Now on what account should one reply? If I say it is because of fear, now lo, if one may greet a person out of fear, is there any question of whether he may reply to him? [Of course he may!]*
- I. *Rather it is because of respect.*
- J. *But that is the opinion of R. Judah! For we have learned in the Mishnah:*
- K. **R. Judah says, “In the middle of a paragraph one may give a greeting out of fear and respond out of respect. In the breaks between the paragraphs one may greet out of respect and respond to the greeting of any man” [M. 2:1I-L].**
- L. *Something is missing in the formulation of the passage at hand, and this is how the passage should be repeated:*
- M. **“At the breaks one may greet someone out of respect, and, it is not necessary to add that he may reply to him. In the middle of a paragraph one may greet someone out of fear, and it is not necessary to add, that he may, of course, reply,” the words of R. Meir.**
- N. **R. Judah says, “In the middle of a paragraph one may greet a person out of fear and reply to him out of respect.**
- O. **“[14A] And in the breaks between the paragraphs one may greet a person out of respect and reply with a greeting to anybody.”**
- P. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority along these same lines:*
- Q. “He who is reciting the Shema and his master or someone of higher status than he met him, at the breaks between paragraphs he gives a greeting out of respect, and it is not necessary to say that he replies to a greeting, and in the middle of a paragraph he gives a greeting only out of fear, and it is not necessary to add that he responds to a greeting,” the words of R. Meir.
- R. R. Judah says, “In the middle of a paragraph he gives a greeting out of fear and responds out of respect, and at the breaks between paragraphs he gives a greeting out of respect and responds with a greeting to anyone at all.”

**II.2 A.** *Ahi, the Tannaite authority at the house of R. Hiyya, asked R. Hiyya, “In the case of reciting the Hallel-psalms or the Scroll of Esther, what is the law about interrupting [his recitation to greet someone]? Do we rule that it is an argument a fortiori: In the case of reciting the Shema, which derives from the authority of the Torah, one interrupts his reading, so is it any issue about interrupting the recitation of the Hallel-Psalms, which rest upon the authority of rabbis? Or since*



*the purpose of reciting the Psalms is to make a miracle known, the recitation of the Hallel-psalms is more important.”*

- B. He said to him, “One interrupts the recitation [to give a greeting], and there is no objection to doing so.”
- C. Said Rabbah, “On days on which an individual praying by himself says the entire Hallel-Psalms, one may interrupt to give a greeting between one passage and another, but in the middle of a given passage he may not interrupt to give a greeting.
- D. “And on days on which the individual does not complete the recitation of the Hallel-psalms, even in the middle of a passage he may interrupt the recitation to give a greeting.”
- E. *Is that really the case? And lo, Rab bar Sheba happened by the house of Rabina. It was on one of the days on which the individual does not complete the recitation of the Hallel-Psalms, and yet he did not interrupt his recitation to greet him.*
- F. *Rab bar Sheba was a special case, because Rabina had held him of no account.*

**II.3** A. *Asyan, the Tannaite authority of the house of R. Ammi, asked R. Ammi, “If someone is fasting, what is the law about his tasting food or drink [to test the food]? Has he accepted the discipline of the fast, and in such a taste there is no violation of the basic fast? Or perhaps he has undertaken the discipline of not gaining any enjoyment of food or drink whatsoever, and in such a taste, there would be benefit?”*

- B. He said to him, “One may take a taste and there is no objection whatever to doing so.”
- C. *It has been taught along these same lines on Tannaite authority:*
- D. If one takes a mere taste, it is not necessary to say a blessing.
- E. One who is fasting may take a taste and there is no objection to his doing so.
- F. *How much?*
- G. *R. Ammi and R. Assi took a taste to the measure of a quarter-log.*

**II.4** A. Said Rab, “Whoever greets his fellow before saying the Prayer is as if he treated him as a high place.

- B. “For it is said, ‘Cease from man in whose nostrils is a breath, for how little is he to be accounted’ (Isa. 2:22).
- C. “Read the word for ‘how little’ with different vowels as ‘high place.’”
- D. Samuel said, “[Reading the word differently:] ‘On what account have you esteemed this one, and not God.’”
- E. *R. Sheshet objected: “In the breaks one may greet his fellow out of respect and respond [M. 2:1D-E]. [All the more so doing so before saying the Prayer].”*
- F. *R. Abba interprets [the statement of Rab and Samuel] to refer to someone who gets up early in the morning to go to the other’s door.*
- G. Said R. Idi bar Abin said R. Isaac bar Asyan, “It is forbidden for a person to do his own business before he says his Prayer.
- H. “For it is said, ‘Righteousness shall go before him and then he shall set his steps on his own way’ (Psa. 85:14).”



- I. And R. Idi bar Abin said R. Isaac bar Isyan said, “Whoever says his Prayer and afterward goes out to the public way has the Holy One, blessed be he, to do his business.
- J. “For it is said, ‘Righteousness shall go before him and then he shall set his steps on his own way’ (Psa. 85:14).”

**II.5** A. Said R. Jonah said R. Zira, “Whoever sleeps for seven days without a dream is called wicked.

- B. “For it is said, ‘And he that has it shall abide satisfied, he shall not be visited with evil’ (Pro. 19:23).
- C. “Do not read the word for ‘satisfied’ but the word for ‘seven.’” [Simon, p. 82, n. 12: And render, “If he abides seven days without and is not visited with a dream, this shows that he is evil.”]
- D. Said R. Aha, son of R. Hiyya bar Abba, “This is what R. Hiyya said R. Yohanan said, ‘Whoever is sated with words of Torah and goes to sleep will not be told bad news [in a dream].
- E. “For it is said, ‘And if he abides sated he shall not be visited with evil’ (Pro. 19:23).”

**III.1** A. **The following are those places referred to as breaks between the paragraphs [M. 2:2A]:**

- B. Said R. Abbahu said R. Yohanan, “The decided law accords with the view of R. Judah, who has said, ‘**Between the two sections, “And the Lord said” and “True and upright” one may not interrupt**’ [M. 2:2G].”
- C. *Said R. Abbahu said R. Yohanan, “What is the scriptural basis for the view of R. Judah?*
- D. “It is because it is written, “[14B] ‘The Lord God is truth’ (Jer. 10:10).”
- E. [Simon, p. 83, n. 2: After concluding the Shema with the word true,] does one have to repeat the word true [which is really the beginning of the next paragraph in the prayers], or does one not do so?
- F. Said R. Abbahu said R. Yohanan, “One has to go back and repeat the word, ‘True.’”
- G. Rabbah said, “One does not do so.”
- H. *Someone went down [to lead the prayers] in the presence of Rabbah, and Rabbah heard him say, “True... true...” two times. Said Rabbah, “[Simon:] The whole of truth has got hold of this man.”*

**III.2** A. *Said R. Joseph, “How lovely is this tradition which, when R. Samuel bar Judah came, he reported that they say in the West: ‘In the evening they say, “Speak to the children of Israel and you shall say to them, I am the Lord your God. True.”’ [They thus omit reference to the middle part of the third paragraph of the Shema, which deals with show-fringes. That requirement is not applicable by night, so the people do not say the prayer referring to them by night.]”*

- B. *Abbaye said to him, “What is so lovely about that tradition? Lo, R. Kahana said Rab said, ‘[In the evening] one does not have to begin [to recite that section of the Shema at all, although] if he did begin to recite it, he must complete it.’”*

- C. *“And should you maintain that the words, ‘And you shall say to them,’ do not constitute the beginning of the third paragraph of the Shema,*
- D. *“has not R. Samuel bar Isaac said Rab said, ‘The phrase, “Speak to the children of Israel” does not constitute the beginning of the paragraph, but “You shall say to them” does constitute the beginning of the paragraph’?”*
- E. *Said R. Papa, “In the West they maintain that the phrase, ‘And you shall say to them’ does not constitute the beginning of the third paragraph of the Shema. It begins only at ‘That they make for themselves show-fringes.’”*
- F. *Said Abbaye, “Therefore we [in Babylonia] begin [to recite the section], for they do so in the West. But once we begin it, we also complete it.*
- G. *“For lo, R. Kahana said Rab said, ‘One should not begin to recite the third paragraph of the Shema, but if he did so, he must complete it.’”*
- H. *Hiyya bar Rab said, “If [in the evening] one has said, ‘I am the Lord your God,’ he also has to say, ‘True.’*
- I. *“If he did not say, ‘I am the Lord your God,’ he does not have to say, ‘True.’”*
- J. *But lo, one has to make mention of the Exodus from Egypt [which is included in the paragraph beginning, “True”]?*
- K. *One may say this prayer: “We give thanks to you, Lord our God, because you took us out of the land of Egypt and redeemed us from the house of slavery and performed miracles and wonders for us at the sea, where we sang a song to you.”*

**IV.1 A. Said R. Joshua b. Qorha, “Why does the Shema precede, etc. [M. 2:2H]:**

- B. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*
- C. *R. Simeon b. Yohai says, “It is quite proper that one should say, ‘Hear O Israel,’ before the paragraph, ‘And it shall come to pass, if you listen...,’ for the former speaks of learning, the latter of teaching.*
- D. *“And the paragraph, ‘It shall come to pass...,’ should come before, ‘And he said...,’ for the former speaks of teaching and the latter of doing.”*
- E. *But is it the case that the Shema speaks of learning but not of teaching and doing? And lo, it is written, “And you shall teach them diligently... and shall bind them and shall write them...”*
- F. *And is it the case that the paragraph beginning, “It shall come to pass” speaks of teaching but not of doing? And lo, it is written in that very paragraph, “And you shall bind them... and you shall write them...”*
- G. *But this is the sense of his statement: “It is quite proper that one should say, ‘Hear O Israel,’ before the paragraph, ‘And it shall come to pass, if you listen,’ for the former speaks of learning, teaching, and doing, [the latter only of teaching and doing].*
- H. *“And the paragraph, ‘It shall come to pass...,’ should come before, ‘And he said...,’ for the former speaks of teaching and doing and the latter speaks only of doing.”*
- I. *But can one not explain matters satisfactorily through the reasons given by R. Joshua b. Qorhah [at M. 2:2I-L]?*
- J. *[Simeon’s] point is to say, “There are both this consideration and yet another one.”*

- K. That is, “First, so that **one should first accept upon himself the yoke of the kingdom of heaven and afterwards accept the yoke of the commandments [M. 2:2I],**
- L. *“And, furthermore, because in the passage at hand are these several other matters as well.”*

**IV.2 A.** *Rab washed his hands, recited the Shema, put on phylacteries, and then said the Prayer.*

- B. *How could he have done it this way?*
- C. *And has it not been stated on Tannaite authority:*
- D. He who digs a burial niche for a corpse in a grave-area is exempt from the requirement to recite the Shema and from having to say the Prayer and from having to put on phylacteries and from all of the religious duties that are listed in the Torah. Once the time for reciting the Shema comes, he comes up [out of the hole], washes his hands, puts on his phylacteries, recites the Shema and says the Prayer.
- E. *Lo, there is a contradiction in the cited passage itself, which announces at the beginning that one is exempt and at the end that he is obligated [to carry out the rites].*
- F. *That indeed is no contradiction, since the latter part deals with a case in which there are two ditch-diggers, and the former part a case in which there is only one.*
- G. *In any event the cited passage presents a contradiction to the position of Rab [at A].*
- H. *Rab accords with R. Joshua b. Qorhah, who has said, “First comes accepting the yoke of the kingdom of Heaven and afterward comes accepting the yoke of the commandments [on which account the phylacteries, which serve to carry out a commandment, come after reciting the Shema].”*
- I. *Now I can well understand that R. Joshua b. Qorhah had the idea of reciting one passage before reciting another passage. But does he mean to imply that one should place a recitation of a passage before the actual carrying out of one’s religious duty [with reference to the phylacteries]?*
- J. *And, furthermore, does he really accord with the view of R. Joshua b. Qorhah?*
- K. *And has not R. Hiyya bar Ashi said, “Many times I stood before Rab, and he would first of all wash his hands and say a blessing, then he would repeat our chapter to us, then he would put on his phylacteries, then recite the Shema.”*
- L. *Now if you say that he referred to the time before the hour for reciting the Shema had come, if that were the case, what would be the purpose of the testimony of R. Hiyya bar Ashi?*
- M. *It would serve to exclude the position of one who maintains that it is not necessary to say a blessing in connection with Mishnah-study.*
- N. *Thus [Hiyya] has informed us that also for Mishnah-study it is required to say a blessing.*
- O. *In any event it is a contradiction to the position of Rab [outlined at the outset].*
- P. *His messenger was the one who made the mistake [and brought his phylacteries too late that day. Normally he put them on first.]*

- IV.3** A. Said Ulla, “Whoever recites the Shema without putting on phylacteries is as if he gave false testimony against himself.”
- B. Said R. Hiyya bar Abba said R. Yohanan, “It is as if he brought a burnt-offering without added a meal-offering, or a sacrifice without drink-offerings.”
- C. And R. Yohanan said, “He who wants to accept upon himself the yoke of the kingdom of Heaven in a full way **[15A]** should first empty his bowel, then wash his hands, put on his phylacteries, recite the Shema, and say the Prayer, and this constitutes accepting the kingdom of Heaven in a full way.”
- D. And R. Hiyya bar Abba said R. Yohanan said, “Whoever empties his bowel, then washes his hands, puts on his phylacteries, recites the Shema and says the Prayer is regarded by Scripture as if he had built an altar and offering an offering on it.
- E. “For it is written, ‘I will wash my hands in cleanliness and I will walk around your altar, O Lord’ (Psa. 26: 6).”
- F. *Said Raba to him, “Does not the master maintain that it is as if he had immersed,*
- G. *“for it is written, ‘I shall wash in cleanliness, and not, ‘I shall wash my hands.’”*
- H. *Said Rabina to Raba, “See, master, how this neophyte among the rabbis who has come from the West has said, ‘He who has no water to wash his hands may dry his hands in dirt or pebbles or sawdust.’”*
- I. *He said to him, “What he says is quite correct. Is it written, ‘I shall wash in innocence in water’? What is written is merely, ‘In cleanliness,’ meaning, ‘anything that serves to clean [the hands].”*
- J. *For lo, R. Hisda cursed anyone who went in search of water at the time of prayer [maintaining that dirt would do.]*
- K. But the rule at hand applies to the recitation of the Shema. As to cleaning the hands for saying the Prayer, one does have to go in search of water.
- L. How far must one search? To a parasang.
- M. And that applies to a forward search [for water prior to saying the Prayer].
- N. But as to backtracking, he may not go back even a mil.
- O. He may not backtrack by a mil, but if it is less than a mil, he may indeed backtrack [in search of water].

### 2:3

- A. One who recites the Shema but did not recite it audibly — [still] has fulfilled his obligation.**
- B. R. Yosé says, “He has not fulfilled his obligation.”**
- C. One who recited and did not articulate the letters precisely —**
- D. R. Yosé says, “He has fulfilled his obligation.”**
- E. And R. Judah says, “He has not fulfilled his obligation.”**
- F. One who recites in improper order has not fulfilled his obligation.**
- G. One who recited and erred [in the recitation, later realizing his error] should return to the place where he erred [and continue reciting from there to the conclusion].**

**I.1** A. *What is the scriptural basis for the view of R. Yosé?*

- B. It is because it is written, “Hear” (Deu. 6: 4), meaning: “Let your ear hear what your mouth says.”
- C. *And the first authority [at M. 2:3A]?*
- D. *He takes the view that the sense of “Hear” is to say the Shema in any language that you hear [and understand].*
- E. *And R. Yosé? He derives two lessons from the same word.*
- I.2 A.** *There we have learned: A deaf person who can speak but not hear may not separate heave-offering. But if he separated heave-offering, that which he has separated is valid heave-offering [M. Ter. 1:2, Peck, p. 30]. Now who so construes Tannaite teaching to maintain that a deaf person who can speak but not hear [who does such a deed] post facto [is credited after the fact with a valid action] but de novo is not [credited to begin with with a valid action]?*
- B. *Said R. Hisda, “It represents the view of R. Yosé. For we have learned in the Mishnah: ‘One who recites the Shema but did not recite it audibly has carried out his obligation,’ the words of R. Judah. R. Yosé says, ‘He has not carried out his obligation’ [M. 2:3A-B].”*
- C. *[No, it need not be Yosé at all], for R. Yosé takes the position that one has not carried out his obligation only with regard to the recitation of the Shema, which rests upon the authority of the Torah. But in the matter of the separation of heave-offering, the operative consideration is the recitation of the blessing over the separation of heave-offering [which the one who says must hear]. But the recitation of the blessing is required only upon the authority of rabbis [so, in that case, Yosé might well concur that a deaf-person may conduct the action validly, post facto].*
- D. *[The reason is that] the matter does not depend upon the validity of the blessing [but only upon the actual physical action of designating that portion of the crop that is to be regarded as heave-offering].*
- E. *Now why maintain that the rule accords with the principle of R. Yosé? Why not maintain the possibility that it is R. Judah.*
- F. *And he has taken the view that, even with reference to the recitation of the Shema, post facto [a deaf-mute] may indeed [recite the Shema, even though he does not actually hear the words], while only de novo he may not [validly do so].*
- G. *You may derive evidence from the framing of the Mishnah-passage itself that that is the case, for it is framed in this language: **One who recites**, yielding the sense, “Post facto, it is a valid act, though de novo it is not.”*
- H. *To that possibility I may say the following:*
- I. *The point of framing the Mishnah-passage in terms of, **One who recites** in fact is to show you the extent to which R. Yosé will go. For he takes the view that, even after the fact, the deaf-mute who has recited the Shema has not carried out his obligation.*
- J. *For if you maintain that it is R. Judah’s view, then even de novo he would maintain that such a one has carried out his obligation.*
- K. *In that case, what is the upshot of the matter? It is that the cited passage [at M. Ter.] accords with the view of R. Yosé.*
- L. *In that case, how do you deal with the following Tannaite tradition:*

- M. A person should not say the Grace after Meals silently [in his heart], but if he has done so, he has carried out his obligation.
- N. *According to whom is the cited teaching? It cannot be either R. Yosé or R. Judah.*
- O. *For in the view of R. Judah, he has maintained the position that even de novo, one has carried out his obligation [if he has said a prayer silently] while in the view of R. Yosé, he maintains the view that even post facto one has not carried out his obligation [if he has said a prayer silently].*
- P. *What then is the outcome?*
- Q. *It is R. Judah's view, and he takes the position that post facto one has [carried out his obligation if he has said a prayer silently], while de novo he has not.*
- R. *Then let us turn to the following teaching on Tannaite authority of R. Judah, son of R. Simeon b. Pazzi: "A deaf-mute who can speak but not hear may to begin with separate heave-offering."*
- S. *In accord with which of the two authorities is that teaching? It can be neither R. Judah nor R. Yosé.*
- T. *If it were R. Judah, lo, he has taken the position that, de facto one may indeed do so, but only de novo he may not, and in the view of R. Yosé, lo, he has said that even de facto one may not do so.*
- U. *Then the upshot is that it must accord with R. Judah, and even de novo one may also [carry out the action, even though he cannot hear the blessing].*
- V. *And there is no real contradiction [between the versions of R. Judah's views, for] the one is his own view, and the other is the view of his master.*
- W. *For we have learned on Tannaite authority: R. Judah says in the name of R. Eleazar b. Azariah, "He who recites the Shema has to do so audibly, as it is said, 'Hear O Israel, the Lord our God, the Lord is one.'"*
- X. Said to him R. Meir, "Lo, Scripture says, 'Which I command you this day shall be upon your heart' (Deu. 6: 5).
- Y. "Matters follow the intention of the heart [and not what your lips speak, so one need not actually say the Shema audibly]."
- Z. *Now that you have reached this point, you may as well take the view that R. Judah concurs with the position of his master. There is still no contradiction among the several passages, since on the one side we have the view of R. Judah, on the other, R. Meir [who holds that even de novo a deaf-mute who cannot hear but can speak may carry out the several actions].*
- I.3 A.** *We have learned in the following Mishnah-passage: All are valid to read the Esther-Scroll on Purim, except for a deaf-mute, an idiot, and a minor. R. Judah declares valid in the case of a minor [M. Meg. 2:4A-B]. Who takes the view on Tannaite authority that a deaf-mute even de facto may not [read the Esther-scroll]?*
- B. *Said R. Matenah, "It is R. Yosé, for we have learned in the Mishnah:*
- C. *"One who recites the Shema but did not recite it audibly has carried out his obligation," the words of R. Judah.*
- D. *"R. Yosé says, 'He has not carried out his obligation' [M. 2:3A-B]."*



- E. *Why take the view that it is the position of R. Yosé [that is represented in the anonymous clause of M. Meg. 2:4A], and that even post facto, the deaf-mute also may not read the Esther-scroll?*
- F. **[15B]** *Perhaps the position at hand belongs to R. Judah, and it is de novo that he maintains a deaf-mute may not read the Esther-scroll in public, but de facto it is quite all right.*
- G. *Let that proposition not enter your mind! For the passage at hand treats the deaf-mute as equivalent to an idiot and a minor. Just as, in the case of an idiot and a minor, even post facto the action is null, also with respect to the deaf-mute, what is post facto also is invalid.*
- H. *And perhaps we may maintain that one category follows the rule applying to that category, and the other the rule applying to a different category.*
- I. *But can you actually conclude that the passage at hand is to be assigned to R. Judah? And lo, since the concluding clause of the construction states, **R. Judah declares valid in the case of a minor**, surely it follows that the opening clause of the same construction cannot represent the view of R. Judah! [He should not be arguing with himself.]*
- J. *But perhaps the entire construction indeed does follow the view of R. Judah, and at issue are two categories of minor. The passage, then, exhibits a flaw, and this is the way it is to be repeated on Tannaite authority:*
- K. **“All are valid to read the Esther-scroll except for a deaf-mute, an idiot, and a minor.**
- L. **“Under what circumstances [may a minor not read the Esther-scroll]? It is a minor who is not yet of age to be taught. But in the case of a minor who has reached the age at which he may be taught, even to begin with he is valid to recite the Esther-scroll,”** the words of R. Judah.
- M. **For R. Judah declares valid in the case of a minor.**
- N. *What then is the outcome? It is R. Judah’s view, and he takes the position that, post facto, one has [carried out his obligation], while, de novo, he has not.*
- O. *Then let us turn to the following teaching on Tannaite authority of R. Judah, son of R. Simeon b. Pazzi: “A deaf-mute who can speak but not hear may to begin with separate heave-offering.”*
- P. *In accord with which of the two authorities is that teaching? It can be neither R. Judah nor R. Yosé.*
- Q. *If it were R. Judah, lo, he has taken the position that, de facto one may indeed do so, but only de novo he may not, and, in the view of R. Yosé, lo, he has said that even de facto one may not do so.*
- R. *Then the upshot is that it must accord with R. Judah, and even de novo one may also [carry out the action].*
- S. *Then let us consider the following, that is taught on Tannaite authority:*
- T. *A person should not say the Grace after Meals silently [in his heart], but if he has done so, he has carried [post facto] out his obligation.*
- U. *According to whom is the cited teaching? It cannot be either R. Yosé or R. Judah.*



- V. *For in the view of R. Judah, he has maintained the position that even de novo, one has carried out his obligation [if he has said a prayer silently], while in the view of R. Yosé, he has the position that even post facto one has not carried out his obligation.*
- W. *What then is the outcome?*
- X. *It is R. Judah's view, and he takes the position that even de novo one has [carried out his obligation if he has said a prayer silently].*
- Y. *And there is no contradiction between the versions of R. Judah's views, for the one is his own view, and the other is the view of his master..*
- Z. *For we have learned on Tannaite authority: R. Judah says in the name of R. Eleazar b. Azariah, "He who recites the Shema has to do so audibly, as it is said, 'Hear O Israel, the Lord our God, the Lord is one.'"*
- AA. Said to him R. Meir, "Lo, Scripture says, 'Which I command you this day shall be upon your heart' (Deu. 6: 5).
- BB. "Matters follow the intention of the heart."
- CC. *Now that you have reached this point, you may take the view that R. Judah concurs with the position of his master. There is, then, no contradiction among the several passages, since, on the one side, we have the view of R. Judah, on the other, R. Meir.*
- DD. Said R. Hisda said R. Shila, "The decided law accords with the position of R. Judah stated in the name of R. Eleazar b. Azariah.
- EE. "And the law accords with R. Judah."
- FF. *And it is necessary to have both statements of the decided law in hand, for had we heard only that the law accords with R. Judah, I might have supposed that that is the case even de novo. Accordingly we are told [that that is not the case], but the decided law accords with R. Judah as he stated matters in the name of R. Eleazar b. Azariah.*
- GG. *And had we learned only that the law accords with R. Judah as he stated it in the name of R. Eleazar b. Azariah, I should have reached the conclusion that it is necessary to do things that way, and there is no remedy if one did not do it that way.*
- HH. *Accordingly we are informed also that the law accords with R. Judah [so there is a remedy if one has not done things properly].*
- I.4 A.** Said R. Joseph, "The dispute concerns only the recitation of the Shema. But as to all other religious duties, all parties concur that if the prayer is not heard, one has not carried out his obligation.
- B. "For it is said, 'Attend and hear, O Israel' (Deu. 27: 9)."
- C. *An objection was raised from the following: A person should not say Grace after Meals silently, but if he did so, he has carried out his obligation. [So the Foregoing is impossible.]*
- D. *But if the matter was stated on Amoraic authority, this is how it was phrased:*
- E. Said R. Joseph, "The dispute concerns the recitation of the Shema, because it is written, 'Hear O Israel.'

- F. “But as to all other religious duties, all parties concur that one does carry out his obligation [even if the blessing is said inaudibly].”
- G. But has it not been written, “Attend and hear, O Israel” (Deu. 27: 9)?
- H. That verse refers only to teachings of Torah [which must be learned and transmitted audibly].

**II.1 A. One who recited the Shema and did not articulate the letters precisely [M. 2:3C]:**

- B. Said R. Tabi said R. Josiah, “The law accords with the views of both authorities [named in the Mishnah-paragraph] when it comes to imposing a lenient ruling [so: Judah as to audibility, Yosé as to pronunciation].”
- C. *And R. Tabi taught in the name of R. Josiah*, “What is the sense of the verse of Scripture: ‘There are three things which are never satisfied... the grave and the barren womb’ (Pro. 30:15, 16)?
- D. “What is the connection between the grave and the womb?
- E. “It is to tell you, Just as the womb receives and gives forth, so Sheol receives and gives forth.
- F. “And that moreover yields an argument a fortiori: If the womb receives in secret but gives forth with loud cries, Sheol, which receives with loud cries [of mourning] surely should give forth [the dead] with great noise indeed!
- G. “On the basis of that argument there is an answer to those who say that, on the basis of the teachings of the Torah in particular, there is no basis for expecting the resurrection of the dead.”

**II.2 A. R. Oshaiah taught on Tannaite authority before Raba**, “‘And you shall write them’ (Deu. 6: 9) means that everything must be written down [in the mezuzah and in the phylacteries,] even the commands [to do so, that is, the words ‘And you shall write them and you shall bind them’].”

- B. *He said to him*, “*Who is the authority for this view of yours [that a text is required to prove that even the command to write must be written down]?*
- C. “*This is the view of R. Judah, who has said with reference to the rite of the accused wife*, ‘The curses one writes down on the scroll of the accused wife, but the commandments one does not write down.’ [Hence it is necessary, following Judah’s line of reasoning, to find a proof-text for writing the commandment that indicates one has to inscribe in the document at hand not only the body of the document, but also the commandment. Ordinarily one would not write it down.]
- D. “*But [Raba continues in the exposition of Judah’s reasoning] in that case [namely, the matter of the accused wife], there is a particular text which states*, ‘And he shall write these curses’ (Num. 5:23).
- E. “*But here [with regard to the Shema], since it is written*, ‘And you shall write them,’ even the commandments are included.
- F. *[Raba now objects to this thesis:] “But was the scriptural basis for the view of R. Judah the fact that it is written*, ‘And he shall write...’ (Num. 5:23)?
- G. “*The real reason for R. Judah’s view is that it is written*, ‘Curses,’ meaning, ‘One does write the curses, but not the commandment attached to them to write them

down.’ [Simon, p. 92, n. 3: And but for that implied limitation the expression ‘he shall write’ by itself would have included commands].”

- H. *[A reply to Raba’s view of matters follows:] Nonetheless, a proof-text is needed [to show that one must write down the commandment to write down in the phylacteries and mezuzah not only the formula but also the commandment too].*
- I. *[Why so?] It might have entered your mind to derive the sense of “writing” from the use of the word “writing” in that other passage. Just as, in that other passage, one writes down the curses, but not the commandment to write down the curses, so here too one might have understood that one does not write down the commandment to write down the commandment. Accordingly, the All-Merciful has said, “And you will write them,” meaning, “even the commandments [to write the formula].”*

**II.3 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority by R. Obadiah before Raba, ““And you shall teach them’ (Deu. 11:19) means that your teaching should be perfect [Simon, p. 92, n. 6: ‘And you shall train them’ is read as ‘and the teaching shall be perfect’].*

- B. *“So one must pause between the joints [so that if one word ends with the same letter with which the next begins, one should pause between one word and the next].”*
- C. *[Agreeing,] Raba responded along the lines of what he said, “For example, ‘Upon your heart,’ ‘Upon your heart [pl.]’, ‘With all your heart,’ and the like.”*

**II.4 A.** *Said R. Hama b. Hanina, “For whoever recites the Shema and pronounces the letters distinctly they cool down the fires of Gehenna.*

- B. *“For it is said, ‘When the Almighty scatters kings therein, it snows in Zalmon’ (Psa. 68:15).*
- C. *“Read the word ‘when he scatters’ as ‘when one pronounces distinctly,’ and read the word ‘in Zalmon’ as ‘in the shadow of death.’”*
- D. *And R. Hama b. R. Hanina said, “Why is the word ‘tents’ [16A] juxtaposed to the word ‘streams’?*
- E. *“For it says, [‘How goodly are your tents, O Jacob...], as streams stretched out and as gardens by the riverside, as aloes planted...’ (Num. 24: 5).*
- F. *“Just as a stream raises a person from a state of uncleanness to a state of cultic cleanness, so sitting in tents [in study of Torah] raises a person from the scale of guilt to the scale of merit.”*

**III.1 A.** **One who recites in improper order has not carried out his obligation [M. 2:3F]:**

- B. *R. Ammi and R. Assi were decorating the bridal chamber of R. Eleazar.*
- C. *He said to them, “While you are doing this, I’ll go and listen to what is being taught in the study-house and I’ll come back and report it to you.”*
- D. *He went and found the Tannaite authority of the study-house repeating before R. Yohanan:*
- E. **If one was reciting the Shema and erred and does not know where he erred, if it was in the middle of a paragraph, he should go back to the beginning of the paragraph. If it was between one paragraph and the next, he should go**

back to the beginning of the first of the two paragraphs. If it was between one reference to ‘writing’ and the other reference to ‘writing’ [in the Shema], he should go back to the first reference to ‘writing.’ [T. Ber. 2:5].

- F. Said to him R. Yohanan, “That rule applies only if one has not begun to read the words, ‘In order that your days may be lengthened.’ But if one has reached the words, ‘In order that your days may be lengthened,’ he has [presumably] taken his habitual course [and said things right].”
- G. He came and reported this to them. They said to him, “Had we come only to hear this fine teaching, it would have been enough for us.”

## 2:4-5

- A. **Craftsmen recite the Shema while atop a tree or a scaffold,**
- B. **something which they are not permitted to do with respect to the Prayer [i.e., the eighteen benedictions].**

M. 2:4

- A. **A bridegroom is exempt from the recitation of the Shema on the first night [after the wedding] until after the Sabbath [following the wedding],**
- B. **if he did not yet consummate the marriage.**
- C. **McSH B: Rabban Gamaliel who was married and recited the Shema on the first night of his marriage.**
- D. **[His students] said to him, “Did our master not teach us: ‘A bridegroom is exempt from the recitation of the Shema on the first night’?”**
- E. **He said to them, “I cannot accede to you so as to suspend myself from [accepting] the kingdom of heaven [even] for one hour.”**

**I.1** A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. **Craftsmen recite [the Shema] while in a treetop or a scaffold and recite the Prayer while atop an olive tree or atop a fig tree.**
- C. **[As for] all the other kinds of trees — they must climb down [first] and [then] recite the Prayer.**
- D. **But a householder must always climb down and [then] recite the Prayer [since the height will] distract him. [T. Ber. 2:8].**
- E. *R. Mari, son of the daughter of Samuel, objected to Raba, “We have learned in the Mishnah: **Craftsmen recite the Shema while atop a tree or a scaffold [M. 2:4A].** It then follows that in the recitation of the Shema one does not have to direct his heart [to the recitation of the Shema in fulfillment of his obligation to do so. Merely saying the words suffices.]*
- F. *“Now note the contrast: ‘He who recites the Shema has to direct his heart, since it is said, “Hear O Israel,” (Deu. 6: 4) and elsewhere it says, “Pay attention and hear O Israel” (Deu. 27: 9). Just as in that latter passage one has to be attentive, so here one has to be attentive.”*
- G. *[Raba] remained silent.*
- H. *[Mari] said to him, “Have you heard anything about this problem?”*
- I. *He said to him, “This is what R. Sheshet said, ‘And [the law at M. 2:4A] applies to a case in which the workers stop working and recite the Shema.’ [Hence there*

is no conflict between the cited passage of the Mishnah and the contrasting teaching, since the former takes for granted the workers stop working and direct their hearts to the recitation of the Shema, rather than doing so mechanically.]”

- J. *But has it not been taught on Tannaite authority:*
- K. “The House of Hillel say, ‘Workers may continue their work and recite the Shema’?”
- L. *There is no problem, since the former teaching [that one has to direct his heart to what he is doing] applies to the first paragraph of the recitation of the Shema, and the latter teaching [that one does not have to do so] applies to the second.*

**I.2 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. **Workers who were at work at a household [take time to] recite the Shema and recite the benedictions before it and after it,**
- C. **and eat their bread and recite the benedictions before it [the meal] and after it [cf. T. Ber. 5:24],**
- D. **and recite [three times daily] the Prayer of eighteen [blessings].**
- E. **But they do not descend before the ark [to lead the recitations of the Prayer in a synagogue].**
- F. **And they do not lift up their hands [in the priestly benediction] [T. Ber. 2:9].**
- G. *But has it not been taught on Tannaite authority: “[They say not the complete Prayer but only] an abbreviation of the eighteen benedictions”?*
- H. *Said R. Sheshet, “There is no contradiction. The one position represents the position of Rabban Gamaliel, the other of R. Joshua [at M. Ber. 4:3].”*
- I. *If it is R. Joshua’s view [represented at G], why specify that the rule applies to workers? [In Joshua’s view, the same law] pertains even to ordinary people.*
- J. *Rather, both positions represent the view of Rabban Gamaliel, and there still is no contradiction between the two statements, for the statement [permitting the workers to say only the abbreviated version] speaks of workers who are laboring for a wage, while the other speaks of workers who are working for their keep [and the latter may take longer in reciting the Prayer].*
- K. *And [in proof of the foregoing distinction] has it not been taught on Tannaite authority: Workers who were at work at a household take time to recite the Shema and recite the benedictions before it and after it and eat their bread but do not recite a benediction before it but they do recite the benedictions after it, stating both required blessings. How so? They recite the first of the two blessings as it is laid down, and in the second one, one opens with a blessing for the Land, then including “who builds Jerusalem” in the blessing of the Land. Under what circumstances [does this rule apply]? It applies to workers who are working for a wage, but in the case of those who are working for their keep, or with whom the householder was joined in the meal, one says the entire blessing as it has been laid down.*

**II.1 A.** **A bridegroom is exempt from the recitation of the Shema [M. 2:5A]:**

- B. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- C. “When you sit in your house” (Deu. 6: 6) serves to exclude from the requirement to recite the Shema one who is engaged in carrying out a religious duty.
- D. “And when you walk by the way” (Deu. 6: 6) serves to exclude a bridegroom from the requirement to recite the Shema.
- E. On this basis [sages] have ruled, “He who marries a virgin is exempt from the requirement of reciting the Shema, but if he marries a widow, he is liable.”
- F. *What is the proof for that distinction?*
- G. Said R. Papa, “The matter derives from the analogy supplied by the word ‘way.’ Just as going on the way is an optional matter, so here to it is an optional matter.”
- H. *Do we not in fact deal with one who is on the way to carry out a religious duty? And even so, the All-Merciful has said that one should recite the Shema.*
- I. *If that were the appropriate conclusion, Scripture should have said, “While walking.” Why does it specify, “In your walking on the way”? That yields the inference that one is going on a trip on his own volition in which case one is liable to recite the Shema. But if he should be on a trip in connection with carrying out a religious duty, he is exempt.*
- J. **[16B]** *If that is the operative consideration, then why emphasize that the exemption applies only to one who marries a virgin? Even one who marries a widow should also be exempt.*
- K. *In the one case the bridegroom is preoccupied, in the other he is not.*
- L. *If the operative consideration is whether or not the groom is preoccupied, then even if one’s ship is sinking in the sea, he should also be exempt.*
- M. *But on what account, then, did R. Abba bar Zabeda say Rab said, “A mourner is liable to carry out all of the religious duties that are listed in the Torah except for the religious duty of putting on phylacteries.*
- N. *“For lo, in their regard, it is said, ‘Glory,’ as it is stated, ‘Your glory bound upon your head’ (Eze. 24:26).”*
- O. *One may reply, In that case we deal with a preoccupation involving an optional matter, here it involves a religious duty.*

## 2:6-8

- A. **[Gamaliel] washed on the first night after the death of his wife.**
- B. **[His students] said to him, “Did not our master teach us that it is forbidden for a mourner to wash?”**
- C. **He said to them, “I am not like other men, I am frail.”**

**M. 2:6**

- A. **And when Tabi, [Gamaliel’s] servant, died [Gamaliel] received condolences on his account.**
- B. **Said to him [his students], “Did not our master teach us that one does not receive condolences for [the loss of] slaves?”**
- C. **He said to them, “Tabi my slave was not like other slaves. He was proper (kasher).”**

**M. 2:7**



- A. If a bridegroom wishes to receive the Shema on the first night [after his wedding] — he may recite it.
- B. Rabban Simeon b. Gamaliel says, “Not all who wish to take the name [so claiming high rank as a sage] may do so.”

**M. 2:8**

- I.1 A.** *What is the basis for Rabban Gamaliel’s action [described at M. 2:6A]?*
- B. *He took the view that the rules of mourning by night derive solely from the authority of rabbis [and that mourning rites apply only by day, so far as the requirement of the Torah is concerned].*
- C. For it is written, “[And I will make it as the mourning for an only son] and the end thereof as a bitter day” (Amo. 8:10). [Thus it is only by day that the bitterness of mourning applies].
- D. In a case in which one is frail, rabbis made no such decree [on which account Gamaliel felt free not to mourn by night, so he washed up].

**II.1 A. And when Tabi his servant died etc. [M. 2:7A]:**

- B. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
- C. As to man-servants and woman-servants, one may not on their account stand in line [to receive condolences] or express on their account either the blessing for mourners or the condolence for mourners.
- D. M<sup>c</sup>SH W: The serving woman of R. Eliezer died. His disciples came to comfort him. When he saw them, he went up to the upper room. They went up after him. He entered the anteroom. They went after him. He went into the dining hall. They went after him. He said to them, “I supposed that you would be scalded by warm water, but you are not affected even by boiling water.
- E. “Have I not repeated for you the following: ‘As to man-servants and woman-servants, one may not on their account stand in line [to receive condolences] or express on their account either the blessing for mourners or the condolence for mourners’?
- F. ““What then do they say in their regard? They say what people say to someone on account of his ox or ass who have died, namely, “May the Omnipresent replace your loss.” So they say to someone on account of the death of his man-servant or woman-servant: “May the Omnipresent replace your loss.””
- G. *It has been further taught on Tannaite authority:*
- H. As to man-servants and woman-servants they do not make a funeral lamentation for them.
- I. R. Yosé says, “If it was a suitable servant, they do make a funeral lamentation on his account, in these terms: ‘Woe for the good and faithful man, who lived from his own labor.’”
- J. They said to him, “If that is the case, then what do you leave for suitable [people who are not slaves at all]?”

**II.2 A. Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:**

- B. People may call “fathers” only the three patriarchs, and “mothers” only the four matriarchs. [The others of the early generations do not merit those titles.]



- C. *What is the reason? Is it because we do not know whether we come from Reuben or Simeon? If so, then the same problem applies to the matriarchs, since we do not know whether we come from Rachel or from Leah.*
- D. *Rather the reason is this: To that point the ancestors are regarded as worthy, and from that point they are not regarded as worthy.*
- E. *It has further been taught on Tannaite authority:*
- F. *As to man servants and woman servants, they do not call them, "Father So-and-so" or "Mother So-and-so."*
- G. *But the one of Rabban Gamaliel they called "Father So-and-so" or "Mother So-and-so" [as at M. 2:7C].*
- H. *Does the precedent contradict the rule?*
- I. *[No, it is] because [Tabi] was important.*

### **Various Prayers for Special Occasions**

- II.3 A.** *Said R. Eleazar, "What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture: 'So will I bless you as long as I live, in your name I will lift up my hands' (Psa. 63: 5)?"*
- B. *"'I will bless you as long as I live' refers to the Shema.*
- C. *"'In your name I will lift up my hands' speaks of the Prayer.*
- D. *"If one does so, Scripture says of such a one, 'My soul is satisfied as with marrow and fat' (Psa. 63: 6).*
- E. *"Not only so, but such a one inherits two worlds, this and the next, as it says, 'And my mouth praises you with [two] joyful lips' (Psa. 63: 6)."*
- II.4 A.** *When R. Eleazar finished saying his prayer, this is what he said: "May it be pleasing before you, O Lord our God, to bring to dwell within our lot love, brotherhood, peace, and friendship, and make our territories rich in disciples, and make our destiny succeed with a future and a hope, and place our portion in the Garden of Eden, and provide us with a good colleague and good impulse in your world. And may we get up in the morning and find the yearning of our heart to fear your name. And may the serenity of our souls come before you for good."*
- B. *When R. Yohanan had finished saying his Prayer, this is what he said: "May it be pleasing before you, O Lord our God, to look upon our shame and see our suffering, and clothe yourself in mercy, cover yourself in your strength, and cloak yourself in your loyalty, and gird yourself in your compassion, and may the attribute of goodness come before you and that of your gentleness."*
- C. *When R. Zira had finished saying his Prayer, this is what he said: "May it be pleasing before you, O Lord our God, that we not sin or be ashamed or disgrace ourselves more than did our fathers."*
- D. *When R. Hiyya had finished saying his Prayer, this is what he said: "May it be pleasing before you, O Lord our God, that your Torah will be our craft, and that our heart not get sick or our eyes grow dim."*
- E. *When Rab had finished saying his Prayer, this is what he said: "May it be pleasing before you, O Lord our God, to give us long life, peaceful life, good life, blessed life, abundant life, secure life, a life of fear of sin, a life not marred by shame or humiliation, a life of wealth and honor, a life of love of Torah and fear of Heaven, a life in which you fill all the desires of our hearts for good."*

- F. *When Rabbi had finished saying his Prayer, this is what he said:* “May it be pleasing before you, O Lord our God and God of our fathers, that you save us from those who are arrogant and from arrogance, from a bad man and a bad encounter, from the evil impulse and a bad associate, from a bad neighbor and from the destructive Satan, from a bad judgment and from a difficult litigant, whether a member of the covenant or not.”
- G. *[He said that prayer] even though there were guards standing over Rabbi.*
- H. *When R. Safra finished saying his Prayer, this is what he said,* “May it be pleasing before you, O Lord our God, to make peace **[17A]** in the heavenly family and in the earthly family and among the disciples who are occupied with your Torah, whether they are occupied with it for its own sake or not for its own sake.
- I. “And as to all those who are occupied with Torah not for its own sake, may it be pleasing before you that they should be occupied with it for its own sake.”
- J. *When R. Alexandri had finished saying his Prayer, this is what he said:* “May it be pleasing before you, O Lord our God, to set us up in a well-lit corner and not in a dark one, and may our hearts not grow sick, or our eyes dim.”
- K. *There are those who report that R. Hamnuna said that prayer.*
- L. *And when R. Alexandri had finished saying his Prayer, this is what he said:* “Lord of the ages, it is perfectly obvious to you that our will is to do your will. But what prevents it? It is the leaven in the dough, the subjugation to the pagan kingdoms. May it be pleasing before you, O Lord our God, to save us from their power so that we may return to carry out the rules that please you with a whole heart.”
- M. *When Raba finished saying his Prayer, this is what he said:* “My God, before I was created, I was unworthy, and now that I have been created, it is as if I had not been created. I am dust in my life, all the more so in my death. Lo, I am before you as a utensil filled with shame and humiliation. May it be pleasing before you, O Lord my God, that I not sin again, and as to the sins that I have committed before you, wipe them out in your great mercies. But this should not be done through suffering or painful ailments.”
- N. *This is, moreover, the form of the Confession that was said by the younger R. Hamnuna on the Day of Atonement.*
- O. *When Mar, son of Rabina, finished saying his Prayer, this is what he said:* “My God, guard my tongue from gossiping and my lips from deceit. To those who curse me, may my soul be silent, and may my soul be as dust to everyone. Open my heart to your Torah, and let my soul pursue your religious duties. Keep me from a bad encounter, a bad impulse, a bad woman, and from all sorts of bad events that may come into the world. Quickly nullify the counsel of all who plan to do me ill and frustrate their plans. May what my mouth says and what my heart reflects be pleasing before you, O Lord, my rock and redeemer.”
- P. *When R. Sheshet would sit fasting, after he had said his Prayer, he would say this:* “Lord of the ages, it is perfectly obvious to you that, when the house of the sanctuary stood, a person who had sinned would make an offering. And of that offering the priests would offer up only the fat and blood, yet atonement would be attained for that person. Now I have sat in a fast, and so my fat and blood have

become less. May it be pleasing before you that my fat and blood that have become less be received as if I had offered them up before you on the altar and so be reconciled with me.”

- Q. *When R. Yohanan would finish [the study of] the book of Job, this is what he said:* “The destiny of a person is to die, and the destiny of a beast is to be slaughtered, so all are destined to death. Happy is the one who grows in knowledge of Torah, whose labor is in Torah, who thereby brings pleasure to his Creator, who grows in good repute, and who dies in good repute in this world. Concerning such a one Solomon said, ‘A good name is better than precious oil, and the day of death than the day of one’s birth’ (Qoh. 7: 1).”

- II.5** A. *A pearl in R. Meir’s mouth:* “Learn with all your heart and with all your soul to know my ways and to attend upon the entries of my Torah. Keep my Torah in your heart and let awe of me be before your eyes. Keep your mouth from every sort of sin, purify and sanctify yourself from all guilt and transgression. Then I shall be with you everywhere.”
- B. *A pearl in the mouth of rabbis of Yabneh:* “I am mortal and so is my fellow. But my labor is in town, and his is in the field. I get up early to do my work and he gets up early to do his work. Just as he does not infringe upon my work, so I do not infringe upon his work. And perhaps you might suppose that I do much and he does little? We have learned to repeat: ‘All the same is the one who does much and the one who does little, so long as a person directs his heart to Heaven.’”
- C. *A pearl in the mouth of Abbayye:* “A person should always be subtle [in finding ways to] fear [Heaven]. ‘A soft answer turns away anger’ (Pro. 15: 1). One should increase peace with his brethren and relatives and everyone, even with a gentile in the marketplace, so that he may be beloved above and pleasing below and accepted by people.”
- D. They said about Rabban Yohanan ben Zakkai that no person ever greeted him first, even a gentile in the marketplace.
- E. *A pearl in the mouth of Raba:* “The concrete realization of wisdom lies in repentance and good deeds. So a person should not study Scripture and repeat Mishnah-traditions but at the same time abuse his father, his mother, his master, or someone greater than himself in wisdom and in years [Simon: rank], as it is said, ‘The fear of the Lord is the beginning of wisdom, a good understanding have all they who do thereafter’ (Psa. 111:10). It is not said, ‘To those who do,’ but ‘Those who do thereafter,’ meaning, those who do for their own sake and not for those who do them not for their own sake. And whoever does not for its own sake would have been better off not having been created.”
- F. *A pearl in the mouth of Rab:* “The world to come is not like this world. In the world to come there is neither eating nor drinking nor procreating nor give and take nor envy nor hatred nor competition. But the righteous are enthroned with their crowns on their heads, enjoying the splendor of the Presence of God. For it is said, ‘And they beheld God and [it was that that they] ate and drank’ (Exo. 24:11).”

**II.6 A.** The promise made by the Holy One, blessed be he, to women is greater than that to the men, for it is said, “Rise up, you women that are at ease, you confident daughters, give ear to my speech” (Isa. 32: 9).

B. *Said Rab to R. Hiyya, “How do women gain merit? It is by having their children learn to recite Scripture in the synagogue, and having their husbands learn to repeat Mishnah-traditions at the rabbis’ house, and by watching for their husbands until they come from the rabbis’ house.”*

**II.7 A.** *When rabbis took their leave of the house of R. Ammi, and some say, from the house of R. Hanina, this is what they said to him: “May you see to your world[ly needs] in your lifetime and your future in the world to come and your hope in the generations to follow. May your heart attain understanding, your mouth speak wisdom, your tongue express song, your eyelids look straight before you [Simon, p. 103, n. 3: The meaning here seems to be, ‘may you have a correct insight into the meaning of the Torah’], may your eyes be illumined in the light of the Torah, your faith glisten in the glow of the firmament, your lips speak knowledge, your reins rejoice in uprightness, and your feet run to listen to the words of the Ancient of Days.”*

B. *When rabbis took their leave of the house of R. Hisda, and some say, from the house of R. Samuel bar Nahmani, this is what they said to him: “We are instructed, we are well laden” (Psa. 144:14).”*

**II.8 A.** “We are instructed, we are well laden” (Psa. 144:14):

B. *Rab and Samuel, and some say it was R. Yohanan and R. Eleazar:*

C. One said, “‘We are instructed’ in Torah and ‘we are well-laden’ with religious duties.”

D. The other said, “‘We are instructed’ in Torah and in religious duties,’ and we are well laden’ in suffering.”

E. **[17B]** “There is no breach” (Psa. 144:14): May our class not be like the class of David, from which Ahitophel went forth.

F. “And no going forth” (Psa. 144:14): May our class not be like the class of Saul, from which Doeg the Edomite went forth.

G. “And no outcry” (Psa. 144:14): May our class not be like the class of Elisha, from which Gehazi went forth.

H. “In our broad places” (Psa. 144:14): May we have no son or disciple who humiliates himself in public.

**II.9 A.** “Listen to me, you stout-hearted, who are far from charity” (Isa. 46:12):

B. Rab and Samuel, and some say it was R. Yohanan and R. Eleazar:

C. One said, “The entire world is sustained through charity, but they are sustained by force.”

D. And one said, “The entire world is sustained on their merit, but as to them, even on the basis of their own merit they are not sustained.”

E. *This accords with what R. Judah said in the name of Rab,*

F. For R. Judah said Rab said, “Every day an echo goes forth from Mount Horeb and says, ‘The entire world is sustained on account of my son, Hanina, and my son Hanina finds sufficient a qab of carobs from one week to the next.’”

- G. *This explanation [of the reference of Isa. 46:12] differs from what R. Judah said.*
- H. *For R. Judah said, "Who are the stout-hearted? They are the stupid Gubeans."*
- I. *Said R. Joseph, "You may know that that is so, for out of that group a proselyte has never come."*
- J. *Said R. Ashi, "The people who live in Mata Mehasia are the 'stout-hearted,' for lo, they witness the glory of the Torah twice a year [when the sages assemble there], and yet a single proselyte has never come forth from among them."*

### **III.1 A. If a bridegroom wishes to recite the Shema [M. 2:8A]:**

- B. *[Does the statement of Rabban Simeon b. Gamaliel at M. 2:8B] bear the implication that Rabban Simeon b. Gamaliel takes account of the possibility of showing off, and the rabbis do not? But lo, we have heard exactly the opposite views imputed to both parties. For we have learned in the Mishnah:*
- C. **Where they are accustomed to do work on the ninth of Ab, they do it. Where they are accustomed not to do work, they do not do it. And in every place disciples of sages refrain from labor.**
- D. **Rabban Simeon b. Gamaliel says, "Under all circumstances should a man act on his own like a disciple of a sage" [M. Pes. 4:5A-D].**
- E. *There is then a contradiction between the two sayings assigned to rabbis, and there is a contradiction between the two sayings assigned to Rabban Simeon b. Gamaliel.*
- F. *Said R. Yohanan, "Reverse the theories [assigned to the respective parties]."*
- G. *R. Sisha, son of R. Idi, said, "There is no need to make such an exchange. The position of rabbis in the one passage does not present a contradiction to the position of the rabbis in the other. As to the recitation of the Shema, since everyone says it, if the bridegroom also says it, it will not look as though he is acting in a self-important way. But here, since everyone else does work, if he does not do work, it will appear as though he is acting in a self-important way. The views of Rabban Simeon b. Gamaliel likewise do not contradict one another. In that other matter [involving the recitation of the Shema], the matter depends upon proper attitude, and we can give testimony that under the conditions [of newly-weds], the man cannot properly attain the right attitude. But here [in the matter of refraining from work, which Simeon permits anyone to do], one who sees [the man refrain from work] will say, 'He simply does not have a job.' For go and see how many unemployed people there are in the market-place."*