

# XI.

## BAVLI SANHEDRIN CHAPTER ELEVEN

### FOLIOS 90A-113B

#### 11:1-2

- A. All Israelites have a share in the world to come,
- B. as it is said, “your people also shall be all righteous, they shall inherit the land forever; the branch of my planting, the work of my hands, that I may be glorified” (Isa. 60:21).
- C. And these are the ones who have no portion in the world to come:
- D. He who says, the resurrection of the dead is a teaching which does not derive from the Torah, and the Torah does not come from Heaven; and an Epicurean.
- E. R. Aqiba says, “Also: He who reads in heretical books,
- F. “and he who whispers over a wound and says, ‘I will put none of the diseases upon you which I have put on the Egyptians, for I am the Lord who heals you’ (Exo. 15:26).”
- G. Abba Saul says, “Also: He who pronounces the divine Name as it is spelled out.”

M. 11:1

- A. Three kings and four ordinary folk have no portion in the world to come.
- B. Three kings: Jeroboam, Ahab, and Manasseh.
- C. R. Judah says, “Manasseh has a portion in the world to come,
- D. “since it is said, ‘And he prayed to him and he was entreated of him and heard his supplication and brought him again to Jerusalem into his kingdom’ (2Ch. 33:13).”
- E. They said to him, “To his kingdom he brought him back, but to the life of the world to come he did not bring him back.”
- F. Four ordinary folk: Balaam, Doeg, Ahitophel, and Gehazi.

M. 11:2

**I.1** A. Why all this [that is, why deny the world to come to those listed]?

- B. *On Tannaite authority [it was stated], “Such a one denied the resurrection of the dead, therefore he will not have a portion in the resurrection of the dead.*
- C. *“For all the measures [meted out by] the Holy One, blessed be he, are in accord with the principle of measure for measure.”*
- D. *For R. Samuel bar Nahmani said R. Jonathan said, “How do we know that all the measures [meted out by] the Holy One, blessed be he, accord with the principle of measure for measure?*
- E. *“As it is written, ‘Then Elisha said, Hear you the word of the Lord. Thus says the Lord, Tomorrow about this time shall a measure of fine flour be sold for a shekel, and two measures of barley for a shekel in the gates of Samaria’ (2Ki. 7: 1).*
- F. *“And it is written, ‘Then a lord on whose hand the king leaned answered the man of God and said, Behold, if the Lord made windows in heaven, might this thing be? And he said, Behold, you shall see it with your eyes, but shall not eat thereof’ (2Ki. 7: 2).*
- G. **[90B]** *“And it is written, ‘And so it fell unto him; for the people trod him in the gate and he died’ (2Ki. 7:20).*
- H. *But perhaps it was Elisha’s curse that made it happen to him, for R. Judah said Rab said, “The curse of a sage, even for nothing, will come about”?*
- I. *If so, Scripture should have said, “They trod upon him and he died.” Why say, “They trod upon him in the gate”?*
- J. *It was that on account of matters pertaining to [the sale of wheat and barley at] the gate [which he had denied, that he died].*

**I.2 A.** How, on the basis of the Torah, do we know about the resurrection of the dead?

- B. *As it is said, “And you shall give thereof the Lord’s heave-offering to Aaron the priest” (Num. 18:28).*
- C. *And will Aaron live forever? And is it not the case that he did not even get to enter the Land of Israel, from the produce of which heave-offering is given? [So there is no point in Aaron’s life at which he would receive the priestly rations.]*
- D. *Rather, this teaches that he is destined once more to live, and the Israelites will give him heave-offering.*
- E. *On the basis of this verse, therefore, we see that the resurrection of the dead is a teaching of the Torah.*

**I.3 A.** *A Tannaite authority of the house of R. Ishmael [taught], “... to Aaron ..., ‘like Aaron. [That is to say,] just as Aaron was in the status of an associate [who ate his produce in a state of cultic cleanness even when not in the Temple], so his sons must be in the status of associates.”*

- B. *Said R. Samuel bar Nahmani said R. Jonathan, “How on the basis of Scripture do we know that people do not give heave-offering to a priest who is in the status of an ordinary person [and not an associate]?”*
- C. *“As it is said, ‘Moreover he commanded the people who lived in Jerusalem to give the portion of the Levites, that they might hold fast to the Torah of the Lord’ (2Ch. 31: 4).*
- D. *“Whoever holds fast to the Torah of the Lord has a portion, and whoever does not hold fast to the Torah of the Lord has no portion.”*

- E. Said R. Aha bar Ada said R. Judah, "Whoever hands over heave-offering to a priest who is in the status of an ordinary person is as if he throws it in front of a lion.
- F. "Just as, in the case of a lion, it is a matter of doubt whether he will tear at the prey and eat it or not do so,
- G. "so in the case of a priest who is in the status of an ordinary person, it is a matter of doubt whether he will eat it in a condition of cultic cleanness or eat it in a condition of cultic uncleanness."
- H. R. Yohanan said, "[if one gives it to an improper priest], he also causes him to die, for it is said, 'And ... die therefore if they profane it' (Lev. 22: 9).
- I. *The Tannaite authority of the house of R. Eliezer B. Jacob [taught]*, "One also gets him involved in the sin of guilt [of various kinds], for it is written, 'Or suffer them to bear the iniquity of trespass when they eat their holy things' (Lev. 22:16)."

**I.4 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. R. Simai says, "How on the basis of the Torah do we know about the resurrection of the dead?
- C. "As it is said, 'And I also have established my covenant with [the patriarchs] to give them the land of Canaan' (Exo. 6: 4).
- D. "'With you' is not stated, but rather, 'with them,' indicating on the basis of the Torah that there is the resurrection of the dead."

**I.5 A.** Minim asked Rabban Gamaliel, "How do we know that the Holy One, blessed be he, will resurrect the dead?"

- B. He said to them, "It is proved from the Torah, from the Prophets, and from the Writings." But they did not accept his proofs.
- C. "From the Torah: for it is written, 'And the Lord said to Moses, Behold, you shall sleep with your fathers and rise up' (Deu. 31:16)."
- D. *They said to him, "But perhaps the sense of the passage is, 'And the people will rise up' (Deu. 31:16)?"*
- E. "From the Prophets: as it is written, 'Thy dead men shall live, together with my dead body they shall arise. Awake and sing, you that live in the dust, for your dew is as the dew of herbs, and the earth shall cast out its dead' (Isa. 26:19)."
- F. *"But perhaps that refers to the dead whom Ezekiel raised up."*
- G. "From the Writings, as it is written, 'And the roof of your mouth, like the best wine of my beloved, that goes down sweetly, causing the lips of those who are asleep to speak' (Son. 7: 9)."
- H. *"But perhaps this means that the dead will move their lips?"*
- I. *That would accord with the view of R. Yohanan.*
- J. For R. Yohanan said in the name of R. Simeon b. Yehosedeq, "Any authority in whose name a law is stated in this world moves his lips in the grave,
- K. "as it is said, 'Causing the lips of those that are asleep to speak.'"
- L. [The minim would not concur in Gamaliel's view] until he cited for them the following verse: "'Which the Lord swore to your fathers to give to them'

(Deu. 11:21) — to them and not to you, so proving from the Torah that the dead will live.”

- M. And there are those who say that it was the following verse that he cited to them: “‘But you who cleaved to the Lord you God are alive, everyone of you this day’ (Deu. 4: 4). Just as on this day all of you are alive, so in the world to come all of you will live.”

**I.6 A.** Romans asked R. Joshua b. Hananiah, “How do we know that the Holy One will bring the dead to life and also that he knows what is going to happen in the future?”

B. *He said to them, “Both propositions derive from the following verse of Scripture:*

C. *“As it is said, ‘And the Lord said to Moses, Behold you shall sleep with you fathers and rise up again, and this people shall go awhoring ...’ (Deu. 31:16).”*

D. *“But perhaps the sense is, ‘[the people] will rise up and go awhoring’*

E. *He said to them, “Then you have gained half of the matter, that God knows what is going to happen in the future.”*

**I.7 A.** *It has also been stated on Amoraic authority:*

B. Said R. Yohanan in the name of R. Simeon b. Yohai, “How do we know that the Holy One, blessed be he, will bring the dead to life and knows what is going to happen in the future?”

C. “As it is said, ‘Behold, you shall sleep with you fathers, and ... rise again ... (Deu. 31:16).”

**I.8 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

B. Said R. Eliezer b. R. Yosé, “In this matter I proved false the books of the minim.

C. “For they would say, ‘The principle of the resurrection of the dead does not derive from the Torah.’

D. “I said to them, ‘You have forged your Torah and have gained nothing on that account.

E. “‘For you say, “The principle of the resurrection of the dead does not derive from the Torah.”

F. “‘Lo, Scripture says, “[Because he has despised the Lord of the Lord ...] that soul shall be cut off completely, his iniquity shall be upon him” (Num. 15:31).

G. ““‘... shall be utterly cut off ...,’ in this world, in which case, at what point will “... his iniquity be upon him ...”?

H. ““Will it not be in the world to come?”

I. *Said R. Pappa to Abbaye, “And might one not have replied to them that the words ‘utterly ...’ ‘... cut off ...,’ signify the two worlds [this and the next]?”*

J. *[He said to him,] “They would have answered, ‘The Torah speaks in human language [and the doubling of the verb carries no meaning beyond its normal sense].”*

**I.9 A.** *This accords with the following Tannaite dispute:*

B. ““That soul shall be utterly cut off” — ‘shall be cut off’ — in this world, ‘utterly’ — in the world to come,” the words of R. Aqiba.

- C. Said R. Ishmael to him, "And has it not been said, 'He reproaches the Lord, and that soul shall be cut off' (Num. 15:31). Does this mean that there are three worlds?"
- D. "Rather: '... it will be cut off ...,' in this world, '... utterly ...,' in the world to come, and 'utterly cut off ...,' indicates that the Torah speaks in ordinary human language."
- E. *Whether from the view of R. Ishmael or of R. Aqiba, what is the meaning of the phrase, "His iniquity shall be upon him"?*
- F. *It accords with that which has been taught on Tannaite authority:*
- G. Is it possible that that is the case even if he repented?
- H. Scripture states, "His iniquity shall be upon him."
- I. I have made the statement at hand only for a case in which "his iniquity is yet upon him" [but not if he repented].

**I.10** A. *Queen Cleopatra asked R. Meir, saying, "I know that the dead will live, for it is written, 'And [the righteous] shall blossom forth out of your city like the grass of the earth' (Psa. 72:16).*

- B. "But when they rise, will they rise naked or in their clothing?"
- C. He said to her, "It is an argument a fortiori based on the grain of wheat.
- D. "Now if a grain of wheat, which is buried naked, comes forth in many garments, the righteous, who are buried in their garments, all the more so [will rise in many garments]!"

**I.11** A. *Caesar said to Rabban Gamaliel, "You maintain that the dead will live. But they are dust, and can the dust live?"*

- B. **[91A]** *His daughter said to him, "Allow me to answer him:*
- C. "There are two potters in our town, one who works with water, the other who works with clay. Which is the more impressive?"
- D. He said to her, "The one who works with water."
- E. She said to him, "If he works with water, will he not create even more out of clay?"

**I.12** A. *A Tannaite authority of the house of R. Ishmael [taught], "[Resurrection] is a matter of an argument a fortiori based on the case of a glass utensil.*

- B. "Now if glassware, which is the work of the breath of a mortal man, when broken, can be repaired,
- C. "A mortal man, who is made by the breath of the Holy One, blessed be he, how much the more so [that he can be repaired, in the resurrection of the dead]."

**I.13** A. *A min said to R. Ammi, "You say that the dead will live. But they are dust, and will the dust live?"*

- B. He said to him, "I shall draw a parable for you. To what may the matter be compared?"
- C. "It may be compared to the case of a mortal king, who said to his staff, 'Go and build a great palace for me, in a place in which there is no water or dirt [for bricks].
- D. "They went and built it, but after a while it collapsed.

- E. “He said to them, ‘Go and rebuild it in a place in which there are dirt and water [for bricks].’
- F. “They said to him, ‘We cannot do so.’
- G. “He became angry with them and said to them, ‘In a place in which there is neither water nor dirt you were able to build, and now in a place in which there are water and dirt, how much the more so [should you be able to build it]!’
- H. “And if you [the min] do not believe it, go to a valley and look at a rat, which today is half-flesh and half-dirt and tomorrow will turn into a creeping thing, made all of flesh. Will you say that it takes much time? Then go up to a mountain and see that today there is only one snail, but tomorrow it will rain and the whole of it will be filled with snails.”

**I.14 A.** *A min said to Gebiha, son of Pesisa, [a hunchback,] “Woe for you! You are guilty! For you say that the dead will live. Those who are alive die, and will those who are dead live?”*

- B. *He said to him, “Woe for you! You are guilty! For you say that the dead will not live. [Now if we] who were not [alive before birth] now live, will not those who do live all the more so [live again]?”*
- C. *He said to him, “Have you then called me guilty? If I stood up, I could kick you and straighten out your hump.”*
- D. *He said to him, “If you could do that, you would be a physician, a specialist who collects enormous fees.”*

### **Topical Appendix on Gebiha, son of Pasisa and Alexander the Great**

**I.15 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. *On the twenty-four of Nisan the tax-farmers were dismissed from Judea and Jerusalem.*
- C. *When the Africans came to trial with Israel before Alexander of Macedonia, they said to him, “The land of Canaan belongs to us, for it is written, ‘The land of Canaan, with the coasts thereof’ (Num. 34: 2), and Canaan was the father of these men.”*
- D. *Said Gebiha, son of Pasisa, to sages, “Give me permission, and I shall go and defend the case with them before Alexander of Macedonia. If they should win out over me, say, ‘You won over a perfectly common person of our group,’ and if I should win out over them, say to them, ‘It is the Torah of Moses that overcame you.’”*
- E. *They gave him permission, and he went and engaged in debate with them. He said to them, “From whence do you bring proof?”*
- F. *They said to him, “From the Torah.”*
- G. *He said to them, “I too shall bring you proof only from the Torah, for it is said, ‘And he said, Cursed be Canaan, a servant of servants shall he be to his brothers’ (Gen. 9:25).*
- H. *“Now if a slave acquires property, for whom does he acquire it? And to whom is the property assigned?*
- I. *“And not only so, but it is quite a number of years since you have served us.”*

- J. Said King Alexander to them, "Give him an answer."
- K. They said to him, "Give us a span of three days time." He gave them time.
- L. They searched and did not find an answer. They forthwith fled, leaving their fields fully sown and their vineyards laden with fruit, and that year was the Sabbatical Year. [So the Israelites could enjoy the produce in a time in which they most needed it.]

- I.16** A. There was another time, [and] the Egyptians came to lay claim against Israel before Alexander of Macedonia. They said to him, "Lo, Scripture says, 'And the Lord gave the people favor in the sight of the Egyptians, and they lent them gold and precious stones' (Exo. 12:36). Give us back the silver and gold that you took from us."
- B. Said Gebiha, son of Pasisa, to sages, "Give me permission, and I shall go and defend the case with them before Alexander of Macedonia. If they should win out over me, say, 'You won over a perfectly common person of our group,' and if I should win out over them, say to them, 'It is the Torah of Moses, our master, that overcame you.'"
  - C. They gave him permission, and he went and engaged in debate with them. He said to them, "From whence do you bring proof?"
  - D. They said to him, "From the Torah."
  - E. He said to them, "I too shall bring you proof only from the Torah, for it is said, 'Now the sojourning of the children of Israel, who dwelt in Egypt, was four hundred and thirty years' (Exo. 12:40)."
  - F. "Now pay us the salary of six hundred thousand people whom you enslaved in Egypt for four hundred and thirty years."
  - G. Said Alexander of Macedonia to them, "Give him an answer."
  - H. They said to him, "Give us time, a span of three days."
  - I. He gave them time. They searched and found no answer. They forthwith fled, leaving their fields sown and their vineyards laden with fruit, and that year was the Sabbatical Year.

- I.17** A. There was another time, [and] the children of Ishmael and the children of Keturah came to trial with the Israelites before Alexander of Macedonia. They said to him, "The land of Canaan belongs to us as well as to you, for it is written, 'Now these are the generations of Ishmael, son of Abraham' (Gen. 25:12), and it is written, 'And these are the generations of Isaac, Abraham's son' (Gen. 25:19). [Both Ishmael and Isaac have an equal claim on the land, hence so too their descendants]."
- B. Said Gebiha, son of Pasisa, to sages, "Give me permission, and I shall go and defend the case with them before Alexander of Macedonia. If they should win out over me, say, 'You won over a perfectly common person of our group,' and if I should win out over them, say to them, 'It is the Torah of Moses, our master, that overcame you.'"
  - C. They gave him permission, and he went and engaged in debate with them. He said to them, "From whence do you bring proof?"
  - D. They said to him, "From the Torah."



- E. He said to them, "I too shall bring you proof only from the Torah, for it is said, 'And Abraham gave all that he had to Isaac. But to the sons of the concubines which Abraham had Abraham gave gifts' (Gen. 25:5-6).
- F. "In the case of a father who gave a bequest to his sons while he was yet alive and sent them away from one another, does any one of them have a claim on the other? [Certainly not.]"
- G. *What were the gifts [that he gave]?*
- H. Said R. Jeremiah bar Abba, "This teaches that he gave them [the power of utilizing the divine] Name [for] unclean [purposes]."

### **Topical Appendix on Antoninus and Rabbi**

- I.18** A. Antoninus said to Rabbi, "The body and the soul both can exempt themselves from judgment.
- B. "How so? The body will say, 'The soul is the one that has sinned, for from the day that it left me, lo, I am left like a silent stone in the grave.'
  - C. "And the soul will say, 'The body is the one that sinned. For from the day that I left it, lo, I have been flying about in the air like a bird.'"
  - D. He said to him, "I shall draw a parable for you. To what may the matter be likened? To the case of a mortal king who had a lovely orchard, and in it were **[91B]** luscious figs. He set in it two watchmen, one crippled and one blind.
  - E. "Said the cripple to the blind man, 'There are luscious figs that I see in the orchard. Come and carry me, and let us get some to eat. The cripple rode on the blind man and they got the figs and ate them. After a while the king said to them, 'Where are the luscious figs?'
  - F. "Said the cripple, 'Do I have feet to go to them?'
  - G. "Said the blind man, 'Do I have eyes to see?'
  - H. "What did the king do? He had the cripple climb onto the blind man, and he inflicted judgment on them as one.
  - I. "So the Holy One, blessed be he, brings the soul and places it back in the body and judges them as one, as it is said, 'He shall call to the heavens from above and to the earth, that he may judge his people' (Psa. 50: 4).
  - J. "He shall call to the heavens from above' — this is the soul.
  - K. "And to the earth, that he may judge his people' — this is the body."
- I.19** A. Said Antoninus to Rabbi, "Why does the sun rise in the east and set in the west?"
- B. *He said to him, "If thing were opposite, you would still ask me the same thing!"*
  - . *He said to him, "This is what I meant to ask you: Why does it set in the west?"*
  - D. He said, "To give a greeting to its maker, as it is written, 'And the host of the heavens make obeisance to you' (Neh. 9: 6)..."
  - E. *He said to him, "Then let it go half way through the firmament, pay its respects, and then ascend from there [eastward]."*
  - F. "It is because of workers and wayfarers [who need to know when the day is over]."



- I.20** A. Said Antoninus to Rabbi, “At what point is the soul placed in man? Is it at the moment that it is decreed [that the person shall be born] or when the embryo is formed?”
- B. He said to him, “From the moment when it is formed.”
- C. He said to him, “Is it possible that a piece of flesh should keep for three days of it is not salted and not become rotten?”
- D. “Rather, it should be from the time at which it is decreed [that the person should come into being.]”
- E. Said Rabbi, “This is something that Antoninus taught me, and a verse of Scripture supports his view, for it is said, ‘And your decree has preserved my soul’ (Job. 10:12).”
- I.21** A. And Antoninus said to Rabbi, “At what point does the impulse to do evil take hold of a man? Is it from the moment of creation or from the moment of parturition?”
- B. He said to him, “It is from the moment of creation.”
- C. He said to him, “If so, the fetus will kick its mother’s womb and escape. Rather, it is from the moment of parturition.”
- D. Said Rabbi, “This is something that Antoninus taught me, and a verse of Scripture supports his view, for it is said, ‘At the door [of the womb] sin lies in wait’ (Gen. 4: 7).”

### **Contrasting Verses of Scripture and the Death of Death**

- I.22** A. *R. Simeon b. Laqish contrasted [these two verses]: “It is written, ‘I will gather them ... with the blind and the lame, the woman with child and her that trail travails with child together’ (Jer. 31: 8), and it is written, ‘Then shall the lame man leap as a hart and the tongue of the dumb sing, for in the wilderness shall waters break out and streams in the desert’ (Isa. 35: 6). How so [will the dead both retain their defects and also be healed]?*
- B. “They will rise [from the grave] bearing their defects and then be healed.”
- I.23** A. *Ulla contrasted [these two verses]: “It is written, ‘He will destroy death forever and the Lord God will wipe away tears from all faces’ (Isa. 25: 9), and it is written, ‘For the child shall die a hundred years old ... there shall no more thence an infant of days’ (Isa. 65:20).*
- B. *“There is no contradiction. The one speaks of Israel, the other of idolators.”*
- C. *But what do idolators want there [Freedman, p. 612, n. 9: in the reestablished state after the resurrection]?*
- D. It is to those concerning whom it is written, “And strangers shall stand and feed your flocks, and the sons of the alien shall be your plowmen and your vinedressers” (Isa. 61: 5).”
- I.24** A. *R. Hisda contrasted [these two verses]: “It is written, ‘Then the moon shall be confounded and the sun ashamed, when the Lord of hosts shall reign’ (Is 24:23), and it is written, ‘Moreover the light of the moon shall be as the light of seven days’ (Isa. 30:26).*

- B. *“There is no contradiction. The one refers to the days of the Messiah, the other to the world to come.”*
- C. *And in the view of Samuel, who has said, “There is no difference between the world to come and the days of the messiah, except the end of the subjugation of the exilic communities of Israel”?*
- D. *There still is no contradiction. The one speaks of the camp of the righteous, the other the camp of the Presence of God.*

**I.25 A.** *Raba contrasted [these two verses]: “It is written, ‘I kill and I make alive’ (Deu. 32:39) and it is written, ‘I wound and I heal’ (Deu. 32:39). [Freedman, p. 613, n. 4, 5: The former implies that one is resurrected just as he was at death, thus with blemishes, and the other implies that at the resurrection all wounds are healed].*

- B. *“Said the Holy One, blessed be he, ‘What I kill I bring to life,’ and then, ‘What I have wounded I heal.’”*

### **How on the basis of the Torah do we know about the resurrection of the dead?**

**I.26 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority: “I kill and I make alive” (Deu. 32:39).”*

- B. *Is it possible to suppose that there is death for one person and life for the other, just as the world is accustomed [now]?*
- C. *Scripture says, “I wound and I heal” (Deu. 32:39).*
- D. *Just as wounding and healing happen to one person, so death and then resurrection happen to one person.*
- E. *From this fact we derive an answer to those who say, “There is no evidence of the resurrection of the dead based on the teachings of the Torah.”*

**I.27 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. *R. Meir says, “How on the basis of the Torah do we know about the resurrection of the dead?”*
- C. *“As it is said, ‘Then shall Moses and the children of Israel sing this song to the Lord’ (Exo. 15: 1).*
- D. *“What is said is not ‘sang’ but ‘will sing,’ on the basis of which there is proof from the Torah of the resurrection of the dead.*
- E. *“Along these same lines: ‘Then shall Joshua build an altar to the Lord God of Israel’ (Jos. 8:30).*
- F. *“What is said is not ‘built’ but ‘will build,’ on the basis of which there is proof from the Torah of the resurrection of the dead.*
- G. *Then what about this verse: “Then will Solomon build a high place for Chemosh, abomination of Moab” (1Ki. 11: 7)? Does it mean that he will build it? Rather, the Scripture treats him as though he had built it [even though he had merely thought about doing so].*

**I.28 A.** *Said R. Joshua b. Levi, “How on the basis of Scripture may we prove the resurrection of the dead?”*

- B. “As it is said, ‘Blessed are those who dwell in your house, they shall ever praise you, selah’ (Psa. 84: 5).
- C. “What is said is not ‘praised you’ but ‘shall praise you,’ on the basis of which there is proof from the Torah of the resurrection of the dead.”
- D. And R. Joshua b. Levi said, “Whoever recites the song [of praise] in this world will have the merit of saying it in the world to come,
- E. “as it is said, ‘Happy are those who dwell in you house, they shall ever praise you, selah’ (Psa. 84: 5).”
- F. Said R. Hiyya b. Abba said R. Yohanan, “On what basis do we know about the resurrection of the dead from Scripture.”
- G. “As it says, ‘Your watchman shall lift up the voice, with the voice together they shall sing (Isa. 52: 8).”
- H. What is said is not ‘sang’ but ‘will sing’ on the basis of which there is proof from the Torah of the resurrection of the dead.
- I. Said R. Yohanan, “In the future all the prophets will sing in unison, as it is written, ‘Your watchman shall lift up the voice, with the voice together they shall sing (Isa. 57: 8).”

- I.29** A. Said R. Judah said Rab, “Whoever withholds a teaching of law from a disciple is as if he steals the inheritance of his fathers from him,
- B. “for it is said, ‘Moses commanded us Torah, even the inheritance of the congregation of Jacob’ (Deu. 33: 4).
  - C. “It is an inheritance destined for all Israel from the six days of creation.”
  - D. Said R. Hana bar Bizna said R. Simeon the Pious, “Whoever withholds a teaching of law from a disciple is cursed even by the fetuses in their mothers’ womb, as it is said, ‘He who withholds grain [92A] will be cursed by the embryo’ (Pro. 11:26), for the word at hand can only mean ‘embryo,’ as it is written, ‘And one embryo shall be stronger than the other people’ (Gen. 25:23) [referring to Jacob and Esau in the womb].
  - E. “And the cited word can only mean ‘cursing,’ as it is written, ‘How shall a curse whom God has not cursed?’ (Num. 23: 8).
  - F. “And the word for grain speaks only of ‘the Torah,’ as it is written, ‘Nourish yourselves with grain lest he be angry’ (Psa. 2:12).”
  - G. Ulla bar Ishmael says, “They pierce him like a sieve, for here it is written, ‘The people will pierce him,’ (Pro. 11:26), and the word means pierce in the verse, ‘And he pierced a hole in the lid of it’ (2Ki. 12:10).”
  - H. *And Abbayye said, “He will be like a fuller’s trough [so perforated as a drainage plank].”*
  - I. And if he does teach a law, what is his reward?
  - J. Said Raba said R. Sheshet, “He will merit blessings like those that came to Joseph, as it is said, ‘But blessing shall be upon the head of the one who sells’ (Pro. 11:26).
  - K. “And the one who sells speaks only of Joseph, as it is said, ‘And Joseph was the governor over the land, and he was the one who sells to all the people of the land’ (Gen. 47: 6).”

- I.30** A. Said R. Sheshet, “Whoever teaches Torah in this world will have the merit of teaching it in the world to come,  
 B. “as it is said, ‘And he who waters shall water again too’ (Pro. 11:25).”
- I.31** A. Said Raba, “How on the basis of the Torah do we find evidence for the resurrection of the dead?  
 B. “As it is said, ‘Let Reuben live and not die’ (Deu. 33: 6).  
 C. “‘Let Reuben live’ in this world, and ‘not die’, in the world to come.”  
 D. *Rabina said, “Proof derives from here: ‘And many of them that sleep in the dust of the earth shall awake, some to everlasting life, and some to shame and everlasting contempt.’ (Den. 12: 2).”*  
 E. *R. Ashi said, “Proof derives from here: ‘But go your way till the end be, for you shall rest and stand in your lot at the end of days’ (Dan. 12:13).”*
- I.32** A. Said R. Eleazar, “Every authority who leads the community serenely will have the merit of leading them in the world to come, as it is said, ‘For he who has mercy on them shall lead them, even by springs of water shall he guide them’ (Isa. 49:10).”  
 B. And said R. Eleazar, “Great is knowledge, for it is set between two names [lit. letters] [of God], as it is written, ‘For a God of knowledge is the Lord’ (1Sa. 2: 3).”  
 C. And said R. Eleazar, “Great is the sanctuary, for it is set between two names [of God], as it is written, ‘You have made for yourself, O Lord, a sanctuary, O Lord, your hands have established it’ (Exo. 15:17).”  
 D. *To this view R. Ada Qarhinaah objected, “Then how about the following: Great is vengeance, for it is set between two names [of God], as it is written, ‘O God of vengeance, O Lord, O God of Vengeance, appear’ (Psa. 94: 1).”*  
 E. *He said to him, “In context, that is quite so, in line with what Ulla said.”*  
 F. For Ulla said, “What purpose is served by these two references to ‘appear’? One speaks of the measure of good, the other, the measure of punishment.”  
 G. And said R. Eleazar, “In the case of any man who has knowledge it is as if the house of the sanctuary had been built in his own time, for this [knowledge] is set between two names of [God], and that [the Temple] likewise is set between two names of [God].”  
 H. And said R. Eleazar, “Any man in whom there is knowledge in the end will be rich, for it is said, ‘And by knowledge shall the chambers be filled with all precious and pleasant riches’ (Pro. 24: 4).”  
 I. And said R. Eleazar, “It is forbidden to have pity on any man in whom there is no knowledge, as it is said, ‘For it is a people of no understanding; therefore he that made them will not have mercy upon them, and he that formed them will show them no favor’ (Isa. 27:11).”  
 J. And said R. Eleazar, “Whoever gives his bread to someone who does not have knowledge in the end will be afflicted with sufferings, for it is said, ‘They who eat your bread have laid a wound under you, there is no understanding in him’ (Oba. 1: 7), and the word for ‘wound’ can mean only suffering, as it is written,

‘When Ephraim saw his sickness and Judah his suffering’ [using the same word] (Hos. 5:13).”

- K. And said R. Eleazar, “Any man who has no knowledge in the end will go into exile, as it is said, ‘Therefore my people have gone into exile, because they have no knowledge’ (Isa. 5:13).”
- L. And said R. Eleazar, “Any house in which words of Torah are not heard by night will be eaten up by fire, as it is said, ‘All darkness is hid in his secret places; a fire not blown shall consume him; he grudges him that is left in his tabernacle’ (Job. 20:26).
- M. “The word for ‘grudges’ means only a disciple of a sage, as it is written, ‘And in those left [using the same root] whom the Lord shall call’ (Joe. 3: 5). [Freedman, p. 616, n. 12: The first part of the verse, ‘all darkness is hid ...,’ is interpreted as, his secret places are not illumined by the study of the law; the last part, ‘he grudges ...,’ as, he looks with disfavor upon any student who enters his house for a meal].”
- N. And said R. Eleazar, “Whoever does not give a benefit to disciples of sages from his property will see no blessing ever, as it is said, ‘There is none who remains to eat it, therefore shall he not hope for prosperity’ (Job. 20:21).
- O. “The word for ‘remain’ refers only to a disciple of a sage, as it is written, ‘And in those left whom the Lord shall call’ (Joe. 3: 5).”
- P. And said R. Eleazar, “Anyone who does not leave a piece of bread on his table will never see a sign of blessing, as it is said, ‘There be none of his food left, therefore shall he not hope for his prosperity’ (Job. 20:21).”
- Q. But has not R. Eleazar said, “Whoever leaves pieces of bread on his table is as if he worships an idol, as it is said, ‘That prepare a table for God and that furnish the drink offering to Meni’ (Isa. 65:11)”?
- R. *There is no contradiction, in the one case [the latter] a complete loaf is left alongside, and in the other case [the former], no complete loaf is left [with the crumbs].*
- S. And said R. Eleazar, “Whoever goes back on what he has said is as if he worships an idol.
- T. “Here it is written, ‘And I seem to him as a deceiver’ (Gen. 27:12), and elsewhere it is written, ‘They [idols] are vanity and the work of deceivers’ (Jer. 10:15).”
- U. And said R. Eleazar, “Whoever stares at a woman’s sexual parts will find that his ‘bow’ is emptied out, as it is said, ‘Shame shall empty you bow [of strength]’ (Hab. 3: 9).”
- V. And said R. Eleazar, “One should always accept [things] and so endure.”
- W. *Said R. Zira, “We too also have learned on Tannaite authority:*
- X. **“As to a room without windows, people are not to open windows for it to examine whether or not it is afflicted with a plague-sign [M. Neg. 2:3].** [Thus the possible signs will be missed because of the obscurity of the room. Likewise humility protects one’s life.]”
- Y. *That makes the case.*

- I.33** A. *Said R. Tabi said R. Josiah, “What is the meaning of this verse of Scripture: ‘The grave and the barren womb and the earth that is not filled by water’ (Pro. 30:16).*
- B. “What has the grave to do with the womb?
- C. “It is to say to you, just as the womb takes in and gives forth, so Sheol takes in and gives forth.
- D. “And is it not an argument a fortiori? If in the case of the womb, in which they insert [something] in secret, the womb brings forth in loud cries, Sheol, into which [bodies] are placed with loud cries, is it not reasonable to suppose that from the grave people will be brought forth with great cries?
- E. “On the basis of this argument there is an answer to those who say that the doctrine of the resurrection of the dead does not derive from the Torah.”
- I.34** A. *A Tannaite authority of the house of Elisha [taught], “The righteous whom the Holy One, blessed be he, is going to resurrect will not revert to dust,*
- B. “for it is said, ‘And it shall come to pass that he that is left in Zion and he that remains in Jerusalem shall be called holy, even everyone that is written among the living in Jerusalem, (Isa. 4: 3).
- C. “Just as the Holy One lives forever, so they shall live forever.
- D. **[92B]** “And if you want to ask, as to those years in which the Holy One, blessed be he, will renew his world, as it is said, ‘And the Lord alone shall be exalted in that day’ (Isa. 2:11), during that time what will the righteous do?
- E. “The answer is that the Holy One, blessed be he, will make them wings like eagles, and they will flutter above the water, as it is said, ‘Therefore will not fear, when the earth be moved and the mountains be carried in the midst of the sea’ (Psa. 44: 3).
- F. “And if you should say that they will have pain [in all this], Scripture says, ‘But those who wait upon the Lord shall renew their strength, they shall mount up with wings as eagles, they shall run and not be weary, they shall walk and not be faint’ (Isa. 40:31).”
- G. *And should we derive [the opposite view] from the dead whom Ezekiel resurrected?*
- H. *He accords with the view of him who said that, in truth, it was really a parable.*
- I. *For it has been taught on Tannaite authority:*
- J. R. Eliezer says, “The dead whom Ezekiel resurrected stood on their feet, recited a song, and they died.
- K. “What song did they recite?
- L. “‘The Lord kills in righteousness and revives in mercy’ (1Sa. 2: 6).”
- M. R. Joshua says, “They recited this song, ‘The Lord kills and makes live, he brings down to the grave and brings up’ (1Sa. 2: 6).”
- N. R. Judah says, “It was truly a parable.”
- O. Said to him R. Nehemiah, “If it was true, then why a parable? And if a parable, why true? But in truth it was a parable.”
- P. R. Eliezer, son of R. Yosé the Galilean, says, “The dead whom Ezekiel resurrected went up to the Land of Israel and got married and produced sons and daughters.”

- Q. R. Judah b. Betera stood up and said, "I am one of their grandsons, and these are the phylacteries that father's father left me from them."
- R. *And who were the dead whom Ezekiel resurrected?*
- S. Said Rab, "They were the Ephraimites who reckoned the end of time and erred, as it is said, 'And the sons of Ephraim, Shuthelah and Bared his son and Tahath his son and Eladah his son and Tahath his son. And Zabad his son and Shuthelah his son and Ezzer and Elead, whom the men of Gath that were born in the land slew' (1Ch. 7:20-21). And it is written, 'And Ephraim their father mourned many days and his brethren came to comfort him' (1Ch. 7:22)."
- T. And Samuel said, "They were those who denied the resurrection of the dead, as it is said, 'Then he said to me, Son of man, these bones are the whole house of Israel; behold, they say, Our bones are dried and our hope is lost, we are cut off for our parts' (Eze. 37:11)."
- U. Said R. Jeremiah, "These were the men who had not a drop of religious duties to their credit, as it is written, 'O you dry bones, hear the word of the Lord' (Eze. 37: 4)."
- V. R. Isaac Nappaha said, "They were the men who had covered the sanctuary entirely with abominations and creeping things, as it is said, 'So I went in and saw, and behold, every form of creeping things and abominable beasts and all the idols of the house of Israel, portrayed upon the wall round about' (Eze. 8:10).
- W. "While [in the case of the dry bones] it is written, 'And caused me to pass by them round about' (Eze. 37: 2). [Freedman, p. 620, n. 1: The identification is based on the use of 'round about' in both narratives. In his view even those who in their despair surrender themselves to abominable worship are not excluded from the bliss of resurrection.]"
- X. R. Yohanan said, "They were the dead in the valley of Dura."
- Y. And said R. Yohanan, "From the river Eshel to Rabbath is the valley of Dura. For when Nebuchadnezzar, that wicked man, exiled Israel, there were young men who outshone the sun in their beauty. Chaldean women would see them and reach orgasm [from the mere gaze]. They told their husbands and their husbands told the king. The king ordered them killed. Still, the wives would reach orgasm [merely from laying eyes on the corpses]. The king gave an order and they trampled [the corpses beyond all recognition]."

**I.35 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. When Nebuchadnezzar, the wicked man, cast Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah, into the fiery furnace, the Holy One, blessed be he, said to Ezekiel, "Go and raise the dead in the valley of Dura."
- C. When he had raised them, the bones came and smacked that wicked man in his face. He said, "What are these things?"
- D. They said to him, "The friend of these is raising the dead in the valley of Dura."



- E. He then said, “How great are his signs, and how mighty his wonders. His kingdom is an everlasting kingdom, and his dominion is from generation to generation’ (Dan. 3:23).”
- F. Said R. Isaac, “May liquid gold pour into the mouth of that wicked man.
- G. “For had not an angel come and slapped his mouth shut, he would have attempted to shame [by the excellence of his composition] all the songs and praises that David had recited in the book of Psalms.”

## Topical Appendix on Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah

### I.36 A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. Six miracles were done on that day, and these are they:
- C. the furnace floated, the furnace split open, the foundations crumbled, the image was turned over on its face, the four kings were burned up, and Ezekiel raised the dead in the valley of Dura.
- D. *And all of the others were a matter of tradition*, but the [miracle of the] four kings is indicated in a verse of Scripture: “Then Nebuchadnezzar the king sent to gather together the princes, the governors, and the captains, the judges, the treasurers, the counsellors, the sheriffs, and all the rulers of the provinces [to come to the dedication of the image]” (Dan. 3: 2),
- E. and it is written, “There are certain Jews ...” (Deu. 3: 2),
- F. and also: “And the princes, governors, and captains, and the king’s counsellors, being gathered together, saw these men, upon whom the fire had no power” (Dan. 3:27).

### I.37 A. *A Tannaite authority of the house of R. Eliezer b. Jacob [taught]*, “Even in time of danger a person should not pretend that he does not hold his high office,

- B. “For it is said, ‘Then these men were bound in their coats, their hose, and their other garments’ (Dan. 3:21). [Freedman, p. 621, n. 8: These were garments specially worn by men in their exalted position, and they did not doff them though cast into the furnace.]”

### I.38 A. Said R. Yohanan, “[93A] The righteous are greater than ministering angels.

- B. “For it is said, ‘He answered and said, Lo, I see four men loose, walking in the midst of the fire, and they are

not hurt, and the form of the fourth is like the son of God' (Dan. 3:25) [Freedman, p. 621, n. 9: Thus the angel is mentioned last, as being least esteemed]."

- I.39** A. Said R. Tanhum bar Hanilai, "When Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah went out of the fiery furnace, all the nations of the world came and slapped the enemies of Israel [that is, Israel] on their faces.
- B. "They said to them, 'You have a god such as this, and yet you bow down to an idol!'
- C. "Forthwith they said this verse, 'O Lord, righteousness belongs to you, but to us shamefacedness, as at this day' (Dan. 9: 7).:
- I.40** A. *Said R. Samuel bar Nahmani said R. Jonathan, "What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture, 'I said, I will go up to the palm tree, I will take hold of the boughs thereof' (Son. 7: 9)?*
- B. "I said I will go up to the palm tree' refers to Israel.
- C. "But now 'I grasped' only one bough, namely, Hananiah, Mishael and Azariah."
- I.41** A. *And said R. Yohanan, "What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture, 'I saw by night, and behold a man riding upon a red horse, and he stood among the myrtle trees that were in the bottom' (Zec. 1: 8).?*
- B. What is the meaning of, 'I saw by night'?
- C. "The Holy One blessed be he, sought to turn the entire world into night.
- D. "And behold, a man riding' — 'man' refers only to the Holy One, blessed be he, as it is said, 'The Lord is a man of war, the Lord is his name' (Exo. 15: 3).
- E. "On a red horse' — the Holy One, blessed be he, sought to turn the entire world to blood.
- F. "When, however, he saw Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah, he cooled off, as it is said, 'And he stood among the myrtle trees that were in the deep.'
- G. "The word for 'myrtle trees' speaks only of the righteous as it is written, 'And he brought up the myrtle' (Est. 2: 7) [another name of Esther].
- H. "And the word for 'deep' speaks only of Babylonia, as it is said, 'That says to the deep, be dry, and I will dry up your rivers' (Isa. 44:27) [Freedman, p. 622, n. 11: To Babylon, situated in a hollow].

I. “Forthwith, those who were filled with [red] anger turned pale, and those who were red turned white [in serenity].”

J. *Said R. Pappa, “Those proves that a white horse in a dream is a good thing.”*

**I.42 A.** *The rabbis [Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah] — where did they go?*

B. Said Rab, “They died through the working of the evil eye.”

C. And Samuel said, “They drowned in spit.”

D. And R. Yohanan, said, “They went up to the land of Israel, got married, and produced sons and daughters.”

E. *This accords with a Tannaite dispute on the same issue:*

F. R. Eliezer says, “They died through the working of the evil eye.”

G. R. Joshua says, “They drowned in spit.

H. And sages say, “They went up to the land of Israel, got married, and produced sons and daughters, as it is said, ‘Hear now, Joshua, the high priest, and your fellows who sit before you, for they are men wondered at’ (Zec. 3: 8).

I. “Who are men who are wondered at? One must say, This refers to Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah.”

J. *And where did Daniel go?*

K. *Said Rab, “To dig a large well at Tiberias.”*

L. *And Samuel said, “To buy fodder.”*

M. *R. Yohanan said, “To buy pigs in Alexandria, Egypt.”*

N. *Can this be true?*

O. *And have we not learned in the Mishnah: Todos the physician said, “A cow or a pig does not leave Alexandria, Egypt, out of which they do not cut its womb, so that it will not breed” [M. San. 4:4].*

P. *He brought little ones, to which they gave no thought.*

**I.43 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

B. There were three who were involved in that scheme [to keep Daniel out of the furnace]: the Holy One, blessed be he, Daniel, and Nebuchadnezzar.

C. *The Holy One, blessed be he, said, "Let Daniel leave here, so that people should not say that they were saved on account of Daniel's merit [and not on their own merit]."*

D. *Daniel said, "Let me get out of here, so that through me the verse will not be carried out, 'The graven images of their gods you shall burn with fire' (Dan. 7:25). [They may make a god of me.]"*

E. *Nebuchadnezzar said, "Let Daniel get out of here, lest people say that [the king] has burned up his god [Daniel] in fire."*

F. *And how do we know that [Nebuchadnezzar] worshipped [Daniel]?*

G. *As it is written, "Then the king Nebuchadnezzar fell upon his face and worshipped Daniel" (Dan. 2:46).*

**I.44 A.** "Thus says the Lord of hosts, the God of Israel, of Ahab, son of Kolaiah, and of Zedekiah, son of Maaseiah, who prophesy a lie to you in my name" (Jer. 29:21).

B. And it is written, "And of them shall be taken up a curse by all the captivity of Judah who are in Babylonia, saying, The Lord make you like Zedekiah and like Ahab, whom the king of Babylonia roasted in fire" (Jer. 29:22).

C. What is said is not "whom he burned in fire" but "whom he roasted in fire."

D. Said R. Yohanan in the name of R. Simeon b. Yohai, "This teaches that he turned them into pop corn."

**I.45 A.** "Because they have committed villainy in Israel and have committed adultery with their neighbors' wives" (Jer. 29:23):

B. *What did they do?*

C. *They went to Nebuchadnezzar's daughter.* Ahab said to her, "Thus said the Lord, 'Give yourself to Zedekiah.'"

D. And Zedekiah said, "Thus said the Lord, 'Give yourself to Ahab.'"

- E. *She went and told her father. He said to her, "The god of these men hates lewdness. When they come to you, send them to me."*
- F. *When they came to her, she sent them to her father. He said to them, "Who said this to you?"*
- G. *They said, "The Holy One, blessed be he."*
- H. *"But lo, I asked Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah, and they said to me, 'It is forbidden.'"*
- I. *They said to him, "We too are prophets like them. To them the message was not given, to us [God] gave the message."*
- J. *He said to him, "I want to test you in the same manner I tested Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah."*
- K. *They said to him, "They were three, and we are two."*
- L. *He said to them, "Choose anyone you like to go with you."*
- M. *They said to him, "Joshua, the high priest." They were thinking, "Joshua, whose merit is great, will protect us."*
- N. *They seized them and tossed them into the fire. They were roasted. As to Joshua, the high priest, his clothing was singed.*
- O. *For it is said, "And he showed me Joshua, the high priest, standing before the angel of the Lord" (Zec. 3: 1), and it is written, "'And the Lord said to Satan, the Lord rebuke you, O Satan" (Zec. 3: 2).*
- P. *[Nebuchadnezzar] said to [Joshua], "I know that you are righteous. But what is the reason that the fire had any power whatsoever over you? Over Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah the fire had no power at all."*
- Q. *He said to him, "They were three, and I am only one."*
- R. *He said to him, "Lo, Abraham was only one."*
- S. *"But there were no wicked men with him, and the fire was not given power to burn him, while in my case, I was joined with wicked men, so the fire had the power to burn me."*
- T. *This is in line with what people say, "If there are two dry brands and one wet one, the dry ones kindle the wet one."*
- U. *Why was he punished in this way?*
- V. *Said R. Pappa, "Because his sons had married wives who were not fit for marriage"*

into the priesthood and he did not object, as it is said, 'Now Joshua was clothed with filthy clothing' (Zec. 3: 3).

W. "Now was it Joshua's way to dress in filthy garments? Rather this teaches that his sons had married women who were not worthy to marry into the priesthood, and he did not object."

**I.46** A. Said R. Tanhum, "*In Sepphoris, Bar Qappara interpreted the following verse: 'These six [grains] of barley gave he to me' (Rut. 3:17).*

B. "*What are the six of barley? If we should say that they were actually six of barley, was it the way of Boaz to give out a gift of only six barley grains?*

C. "[93B] Rather it must have been six seahs of barley?

D. "And is it the way of a woman to carry six seahs?

E. "Rather, this formed an omen to her that six sons are destined to come forth from her, each of whom would receive six blessings, and these are they: David, the Messiah, Daniel, Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah.

F. "David, as it is written, 'Then answered one of the servants and said, Behold I have seen the son of Jesse, the Bethlehemite, who is cunning in playing and a mighty, valiant man, and a man of war, and understanding in matters, and a handsome man, and the Lord is with him' (1Sa. 16:18). [Freedman, p. 626, n. 1: The six epithets, viz., cunning in playing, mighty, valiant, etc., are regarded as blessings applicable to each of the six persons mentioned]."

G. And said R. Judah said Rab, "The entire verse was stated by Doeg only as vicious gossip.

H. "'Cunning in playing' — skillful in asking questions;

I. "'a mighty valiant man' — skillful in answering them;

J. "'a man of war' — skillful in the battle of Torah-learning;

K. "'understanding in matters' — understanding in learning one thing from another;

L. "'and a comely person' — who argues for his position with considerable reasons;

M. "'and the Lord is with him' — the law everywhere follows his opinion.

- N. “‘And in all regards, ‘he said to him, ‘my son Jonathan is his equal.’
- O. *“When he said, ‘The Lord is with him’ — something which did not apply to himself — he was humbled and envied him.*
- P. “For of Saul it is written, ‘And wherever he turned about, he vexed them’ (1Sa. 14:47), while of David it is written, ‘And wherever he turned about he prospered.’”

Q. *How do we know that this was Doeg?*

R. *It is written here, “then one of the servants answered,” meaning, “one who was distinguished from the other young men,” and there it is written, “Now a man of the servants of Saul was there that day, detained before the Lord, and his name was Doeg, an Edomite, head herdman that belonged to Saul” (1Sa. 21: 8). [Freedman, p. 626, n. 8: Thus “a man” that is, “one distinguished” is the epithet applied to Doeg.]*

S. [Reverting to Bar Qappara’s statement:] “The Messiah, as it is written, ‘And the spirit of the Lord shall rest upon him, the spirit of wisdom and understanding, the spirit of counsel and might, the spirit of knowledge of the fear of the Lord, and shall make him of quick understanding in the fear of the Lord’ (Isa. 11:2-3).”

T. And R. Alexandri said, “The use of the words ‘for quick understanding’ indicates that he loaded him down with good deeds and suffering as a mill [which uses the same letters] is loaded down.”

U. [Explaining the same word, now with reference to the formation of the letters of the word to mean “smell,”] said Raba, “[The Messiah] smells and judges, for it is written, ‘And he shall judge not after the sight of his eyes nor reprove after the hearing of his ears, yet with righteousness shall he judge the poor’ (Exo. 11:3-4).”

V. *Bar Koziba ruled for two and a half years. He said to rabbis, “I am the Messiah.”*



W. *They said to him, "In the case of the Messiah it is written that he smells a man and judges. Let us see whether you can smell a man and judge."*

X. *When they saw that he could not smell a man and judge, they killed him.*

Y. [Reverting again to Bar Qappara's statement:] "Daniel, Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah, as it is written, 'In whom there was no blemish, but well favored, skillful in all wisdom, and cunning in knowledge, understanding science, and such as had ability in them to stand in the king's palace, and whom they might teach the learning and the tongue of the Chaldeans' (Dan. 1: 4)."

Z. *What is the meaning of, "In whom there was no blemish" (Dan. 1: 4)?*

AA. Said R. Hama bar Hanina, "Even the scar made by bleeding was not on them."

BB. *What is the meaning of, "And such as had ability in them to stand in the king's palace" (Dan. 1: 3)?*

CC. Said R. Hama in the name of R. Hanina, "This teaches us that they restrained themselves from laughing and chatting, from sleeping, and they held themselves in when they had to attend to the call of nature, on account of the reverence owing to the king."

**I.47 A.** "Now among these were of the children of Judah, Daniel, Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah" (Dan. 1: 6):

B. Said R. Eleazar, "All of them came from the children of Judah."

C. And R. Samuel bar Nahmani said, "Daniel came from the children of Judah, but Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah came from the other tribes."

**I.48 A.** "And of your sons which shall issue from you, which you shall beget, shall they take away, and they shall be eunuches in the palace of the king of Babylonia" (2Ki. 20:18):

B. *What are these "eunuches"?*

C. Rab said, "Literally, eunuches."

- D. And R. Hanina said, "The sense is that idolatry was castrated [i.e. made sterile] in their time."
- E. *In the view of him who has said that idolatry was castrated in their time, that is in line with the verse of Scripture, "And there is no hurt in them" (Dan. 3:25).*
- F. *But in the view of him who says that "eunuch" is in its literal sense, what is the meaning of, "And there is no hurt in them" (Dan. 3:25) [Since they had been castrated]?*
- G. *It is that the fire did them no injury.*
- H. But has it not been written, "Nor the smell of fire had passed on them" (Dan. 3:27)?
- I. *There was neither injury nor the smell of fire.*
- J. *In the view of him who has said that idolatry was made a eunuch in their time, that is in line with the following verse: "For thus says the Lord to the eunuches who keep my Sabbaths" (Isa. 56: 4).*
- K. *But in the view of him who says that eunuch is in its literal sense, would Scripture dwell on what is embarrassing to the righteous?*
- L. Among the group were both sorts [actual eunuches, as well as those in whose day were idols sterilized].
- M. *Now there is no difficulty for the view of him who says that they were literally eunuches in the following verse: "Even to them will I give in my house and within my walls a place and a name better than of sons and of daughters" (Isa. 56: 5).*
- N. *But in the view of the one who says that the sense is that in their day idolatry was made a eunuch, what is the sense of the statement, "Better than of sons and of daughters"?*
- O. Said R. Nahman bar Isaac, "Better than the sons whom they had already had and who had died."
- P. *What is the meaning of the statement, "I shall give them an everlasting name, that shall not be cut off" (Isa. 56: 5)?*
- Q. Said R. Tanhum, "Bar Qappara interpreted the matter in Sepphoris: 'This refers to the book of Daniel, which is called by his name.'"

- I.49** A. *Now since whatever concerns Ezra was stated by Nehemiah b. Hachlia, what is the reason that the book was not called by his name?*
- B. Said R. Jeremiah bar Abba, “It is because he took pride in himself, as it is written, ‘Think up on me for good, my God’ (Neh. 5:19).”
- C. *David also made such a statement, “Remember me, Lord, with the favor that you bear for your people, visit me with your salvation” (Psa. 106: 4).*
- D. *It was supplication that David sought.*
- E. R. Joseph said, “It was because [Nehemiah] had spoken disparagingly about his predecessors, as it is said, ‘But the former governors who had been before me were chargeable unto the people and had taken of them bread and wine, beside forty shekels of silver’ (Neh. 5:15).
- F. “Furthermore, he spoke in this way even of Daniel, who was greater than he was.”
- G. And how do we know that Daniel was greater than he was?
- H. As it is written, “And I Daniel alone saw the vision, for the men that were with me did not see the vision, but a great quaking fell upon them, so that they fled to hide themselves” (Dan. 10: 7).
- I. “For the men that were with me did not see the vision” (Dan. 10: 7):
- J. *Who were they?*
- K. R. Jeremiah (some say, R. Hiyya b. Abba) said, “They were Haggai, Zechariah, and Malachi.”
- L. **[94A]** *They were greater than he, and he was greater than they.*
- M. *They were greater than he, for they were prophets, and he was not a prophet.*
- N. *And he was greater than they, for he saw a vision and they did not see a vision.*
- O. *And since they did not see it, what is the reason that they were frightened?*

- P. *Even though they did not see it, their star saw it.*
- Q. *Said Rabina, "That yields the conclusion that one who is afraid even though he saw nothing is so because his star saw something."*
- R. *"What is his remedy?"*
- S. *"Let him jump four cubits from where he is standing."*
- T. *"Or let him recite the Shema."*
- U. *"But if he is standing in an unclean place, let him say, 'The butcher's goat is fatter than I am.'"*

### **The Messiah. Pharaoh, Sennacherib, Hezekiah, and Other Players in the Messianic Drama**

- I.50** A. "Of the increase of his government and peace there shall be no end" (Isa. 9: 6):
- B. R. Tanhum said, "In Sepphoris, Bar Qappara expounded this verse as follows:
- C. "On what account is every M in the middle of a word open, but the one in the word "increase" is closed?
- D. "The Holy One, blessed be he, proposed to make Hezekiah Messiah, and Sennacherib into Gog and Magog.
- E. "The attribute of justice said before the Holy One, blessed be he, "Lord of the world, Now if David, king of Israel, who recited how many songs and praises before you, you did not make Messiah, Hezekiah, for whom you have done all these miracles, and who did not recite a song before you, surely should not be made Messiah."
- F. "On what account the M was closed.
- G. "Forthwith, the earth went and said before him, "Lord of the world, I shall say a song before you in the place of this righteous man, so you make him Messiah."
- H. "The earth went and said a song before him, as it is said, "From the uttermost part of the earth we have heard songs, even glory to the righteous" (Isa. 24:16).
- I. "Said the prince of the world before him, "Lord of the world, [The earth] has carried out your wish in behalf of this righteous man."
- J. "An echo went forth and said, "It is my secret, it is my secret" (Psa. 24:16).
- K. "Said the prophet, "Woe is me, woe is me" (Isa. 24:16). How long?"
- L. "How dealt treacherously, yes, the treacherous dealers have dealt very treacherously" (Isa. 24:16)."

M. *And said Raba, and some say, R. Isaac, "Until spoilers come, and those who spoil spoilers."*

**I.51** A. "The burden of Dumah. He calls to me out of Seir, Watchman, what of the night? Watchman, what of the night?" (Isa. 21:11):

B. Said R. Yohanan, "That angel who is appointed over the souls is named Dumah. All the souls gathered to Dumah, and said to him, "'Watchman, what of the night? Watchman, what of the night?" (Isa. 21:11).

C. "Said the watchman, 'The morning comes and also the night, if you will inquire, inquire, return, come' (Isa. 21:11)."

**I.52** A. *A Tannaite authority in the name of R. Pappias [said], "It was a shame for Hezekiah and his associates that they did not recite a song, until the earth opened and said a song, as it is said, 'From the uttermost part of the earth have we hard songs, even glory to the righteous' (Isa. 24:16)."*

B. Along these same lines you may say, "And Jethro said, Blessed be the Lord who has delivered you" (Exo. 18:10).

C. *A Tannaite authority in the name of R. Pappias said, "It was a shame for Moses and the six hundred thousand, that they did not say, 'Blessed ...,' until Jethro came and said, 'Blessed is the Lord.'"*

**I.53** A. "And Jethro rejoiced" (Exo. 18: 9):

B. Rab and Samuel —

C. Rab said, "It was that he passed a sharp knife across his flesh [circumcising himself]."

D. And Samuel said, "All his flesh became goose-pimples [because of the destruction of the Egyptians]."

E. *Said Rab, "That is in line with what people say, 'As to a proselyte, up to the tenth generation do not insult an Aramaean [since he retains his former loyalty, as Jethro did to the Egyptians]."*

**I.54** A. "Therefore shall the Lord, the Lord of hosts, send among his fat ones leanness" (Isa. 10:16):

B. *What is "among his fat ones leanness"?*

C. Said the Holy One, blessed be he, "Let Hezekiah come, who has eight names, and exact punishment from Sennacherib, who has eight names."

D. As to Hezekiah, it is written, "For unto us a child is born, unto us a son is given, and the government shall be upon his shoulder, and his name shall be called wonderful, counsellor, mighty, judge, everlasting, father, prince, and peace" (Isa. 9: 5).

E. *And there is yet the name "Hezekiah" too?*

F. [Hezekiah] means "Whom God has strengthened."

G. Another matter: it is Hezekiah, for he strengthened Israel for their father in heaven.

H. As to Sennacherib, it is written, "Tiglath-pileser" (2Ki. 15:29), "Pilneser" (1Ch. 5:26), "Shalmeneser" (2Ki. 17: 3), "Pul" (2Ki. 15:29), "Sargon" (Isa. 20: 1), "Asnapper" (Ezr. 4:10), "Rabba" (Ezr. 4:10), and "Yaqqira" (Ezr. 4:10).

- I. *And there is yet the name "Sennacherib" too.*
- J. It bears the sense that his conversation is contentious.
- K. Another matter: He talked and babbled against the Most High.
  - L. [Referring to Ezr. 4:10], said R. Yohanan, "On what account did that wicked man have the merit of being called 'the great and noble Asnapper' (Ezr. 4:10)?"
  - M. "Because he did not speak critically of the land of Israel, as it is said, 'Until I come and take you away to a land like your own land' (2Ki. 18:32)."
  - N. Rab and Samuel: One said he was a shrewd king, and the other said he was a foolish king.
    - O. *In the view of him who said that he was a shrewd king, if he had said, "A land that is better than yours," they would have said to him, "You are lying to us."*
    - P. *In the view of him who said that he was a foolish king, If [the land to which they would be exiled was no better than their own], then what value was there [in their agreeing to go].*
      - Q. *Where did he exile them?*
      - R. Mar Zutra said, "To Africa."
      - S. R. Hanina said, "To the mountains of Salug."
      - T. But [for their part], the Israelites spoke critically about the land of Israel. *When they came to Shush, they said, "This is the same as our land."*
      - U. *When they got to Elmin, they said, "It is like the house of eternities [Jerusalem]."*
      - V. *When they go to Shush Tere, they said, "This is twice as good."*

**I.55** A. "And beneath his glory shall he kindle a burning like the burning of a fire" (Isa. 10:16):

- B. Said R. Yohanan, "Under his glory, but not actually his glory."
- C. *That is in line with how R. Yohanan called his clothing* "Those who do me honor."
- D. R. Eleazar said, "'Under his glory' literally, just as is the burning of the sons of Aaron.
- E. "Just as in that case it was a burning of the soul while the body endured, so here there is a burning of the soul while the body remained intact."

**I.56** A. *A Tannaite authority in the name of R. Joshua b. Qorhah taught,* "Since Pharaoh blasphemed personally, the Holy One, blessed be he, exacted punishment from him personally.

- B. "Since Sennacherib blasphemed **[94B]** through a messenger, the Holy One, blessed be he, exacted punishment from him through a messenger.
- C. "In the case of Pharaoh, it is written, "Who is the Lord, that I should obey his voice' (Exo. 5: 2).

- D. “The Holy One, blessed be he, exacted punishment from him personally, as it is written, ‘And the Lord overthrew the Egyptians in the midst of the sea’ (Exo. 14:27), and it also is written, ‘You did walk through the sea with your horses’ (Hab. 3:15).
- E. “In the case of Sennacherib, it is written, ‘By your messengers you have reproached the Lord’ (2Ki. 19:23), so the Holy One, blessed be he, exacted punishment from him through a messenger, as it is written, ‘And the angel of the Lord went out and smote in the camp of the Assyrians a hundred fourscore and five thousand’ (2Ki. 19:23).”

**I.57** A. *R. Hanina b. Pappa contrasted two verses:* “It is written, ‘I will enter the height of his border’ (Isa. 37:24), and it is further written, ‘I will enter into the lodgings of his borders’ (2Ki. 19:23).

- B. “Said that wicked man, ‘First I shall destroy the lower dwelling, and afterward I shall destroy the upper dwelling.’”

**I.58** A. *Said R. Joshua b. Levi, “What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture, ‘Am I now come up without the Lord against this place to destroy it? The Lord said to me, Go up against this land and destroy it’ (2Ki. 18:25).*

- B. *“What is the sense of the passage?”*
- C. *“He had heard the prophet, who had said, ‘Since this people refuses the waters of Shiloah that go softly and rejoice in Rezin and Ramaliah’s son, [now therefore behold the Lord brings up upon them the waters of the river, strong and many, even the king of Assyria and all his glory, and he shall come up over all his channels and go over all his banks]’ (Isa. 8: 6). [Freedman, p. 635, n. 3: This was understood by Sennacherib as an order to possess Jerusalem.]”*
- D. *Said R. Joseph, “Were it not for the following rendering of this verse of Scripture, I should not have understood what it meant: ‘Because this people is tired of the rule of the house of David, which rules them mildly, like the waters of Shiloah, which flow gently, and have preferred Rezin and the son of Ramaliah.’”*

**I.59** A. *Said R. Yohanan, “What is the meaning of this verse: ‘The curse of the Lord is in the house of the wicked, but he blesses the habitation of the just’ (Pro. 3:33)?*

- B. *“‘The curse of the Lord is in the house of the wicked’ refers to Pekah, son of Ramaliah, who would eat forty seahs of pigeons for desert.*
- C. *“‘But he blesses the habitation of the just’ refers to Hezekiah, king of Judea, who would eat a litra of vegetables for a whole meal.”*

**I.60** A. *“Now therefore behold, the Lord brings up upon them the waters of the river, strong and many, even the king of Assyria and all his glory” (Isa. 8: 7).*

- B. *And it is written, “And he shall pass through Judea, he shall overflow and go over, he shall reach even to the neck” (Isa. 8: 8).*
- C. *Then why was [Sennacherib] punished?*
- D. *The prophet prophesied about the ten tribes, but [Sennacherib] gave mind to the whole of Jerusalem.*
- E. *The prophet came to him and said to him, “‘For the wearied is not for the oppressor’ (Isa. 8:23).”*



F. Said R. Eleazar b. R. Berekhiah, "The people that is weary because of its devotion to Torah-study will not be given into the power of the one that oppresses it."

**I.61 A.** *What is the meaning of this verse:* "When aforetime the land of Zebulun and the land of Naphtali lightened its burden, but in later times it was made heavy by the way of the sea, beyond Jordan, in Galilee of the nations" (Isa. 8:23)?

B. It was not like the early generations, who made the yoke of the Torah light for themselves, but the later generations, who made the yoke of the Torah heavy for themselves.

C. And these were worthy that a miracle should be done for them, just as was done for those who passed through the sea and trampled over the Jordan.

D. If Sennacherib should repent, well and good, but if not, I shall make him into dung among the nations [a play on the latter's GLL, the word for Galilee and dung].

**I.62 A.** "After these things, and the truth thereof, Sennacherib, king of Assyria, came and entered Judea and encamped against the fortified cities and thought to win them for himself" (2Ch. 32: 1):

B. *Such a recompense [to Hezekiah] for such a gift?* [Freedman, p. 636, n. 9: The previous verse relates that Hezekiah turned earnestly to the service of God. Was then Sennacherib's invasion his just reward?]

C. *What is the sense of,* "After these things and the truth thereof" (2Ch. 32: 1)?

D. Said Rabina, "After the Holy One, blessed be he, went and took an oath, saying *'If I say to Hezekiah that I am going to bring Sennacherib and hand him over to you, he will say to me, "I don't want him and I don't want his terror either."*'

E. "So the Holy One, blessed be he, went ahead and took an oath ahead of time *that he would bring him*, as it is said, 'The Lord of hosts has sworn, saying, Surely as I have thought, so shall it come to pass, and as I have purposed, so shall it stand, that I will break the Assyrian in my land and upon my mountains tread him under foot; then shall his yoke depart from off them, and his burden depart from off their shoulders' (Isa. 14:24-25)."

F. Said R. Yohanan, "Said the Holy One, blessed be he, 'Let Sennacherib and his company come and serve as a crib for Hezekiah and his company.'"

**I.63 A.** "And it shall come to pass in that day that his burden shall be taken away from off your shoulders and his yoke from off your neck, and the yoke shall be destroyed because of the oil" (Isa. 10:27):

B. Said R. Isaac Nappaha, "The yoke of Sennacherib will be destroyed because of the oil of Hezekiah, which he would kindle in the synagogues and school houses.

C. "What did [Hezekiah] do? He affixed a sword at the door of the school house and said, 'Whoever does not take up study of the Torah will be pierced by this sword.'

D. "They searched from Dan to Beer Sheba and found no ignoramus, from Gabbath to Antipatris and found no boy or girl, no man or woman, not expert in the laws of uncleanness and cleanness.

E. "Concerning that generation Scripture says, 'And it shall come to pass in that day that a man shall nourish a young cow and two sheep' (Isa. 7:21), and it says, 'And it shall come to pass on that day that every place shall be, where there were a

thousand vines at a thousand silverlings, it shall even be for briers and thorns' (Isa. 7:23).

- F. "Even though 'a thousand vines are worth a thousand pieces of silver,' yet it shall be 'for briers and thorns.'"

**I.64 A.** "And your spoil shall be gathered like the gathering of a caterpillar" (Isa. 33: 4):

- B. Said the prophet to Israel, "Gather your spoil."  
C. They said to him, "Is it for individual spoil or for sharing?"  
D. He said to them, "'Like the gathering of a caterpillar' (Isa. 33: 4): Just as in the gathering of a caterpillar it is each one for himself, so in your spoil it is each one for himself."  
E. They said to him, "And is not the money of the ten tribes mixed up with it?"  
F. He said to them, "'As the watering of pools does he water it' (Isa. 33: 4): Just as pools of water serve to raise up a human being from a state of uncleanness to a state of cleanness, so the money that has belonged to Israelites, once it has fallen into the hands of idolators, forthwith imparts cleanness. [Freedman, p. 638, n. 5: When the Israelites have abandoned all hope of the return thereof other Jews may take it.]"

**I.65 A.** Said R. Huna, "That wicked man [Sennacherib] made ten marches that day,

- B. "as it is said, 'He is come to Aiath, he is passed at Migron, at Michmash he has laid up his carriages, they are gone over the passage, they have taken up their lodgings at Geba, Ramah is afraid, Gibeah of Saul is fled, Lift up your voice, O daughter of Gallim, cause it to be heard to Laish, O poor Anathoth, Madmenah is removed, the inhabitants of Gebim gather themselves to flee' (Isa. 10:28-31)."  
C. *But they are more than [ten]?*  
D. [Huna responded,] "Lift up your voice, O daughter of Gallim," *was said by the prophet to the congregation of Israel [as follows]:*  
E. "'Lift up your voice, O daughter of Gallim' — daughter of Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob, who carried out religious duties like the waves of the ocean [in number].  
F. "'Cause it to be heard to Laish" — *from this one do not fear, but fear the wicked Nebuchadnezzar, who is compared to a lion.*  
G. "For it is written, 'The lion is come up from his thicket' (Jer. 4: 7)."  
H. *What is [95A] the sense of "O poor Anathoth" (Isa. 10:31)?*  
I. Jeremiah b. Hilkiyah is destined to come up from Anathoth and to prophesy, as it is written, "The words of Jeremiah, son of Hilkiyah, of the priests who were in Anathoth in the land of Benjamin" (Jer. 1: 1).  
J. *But is there any parallel? There [Nebuchadnezzar] is called a lion, but what is written here is laish [another word for lion].*  
K. Said R. Yohanan, "A lion is called six things: ari (Jer. 4: 7), kefir (Gen. 49: 9), labi (Gen. 39: 9), laish (Judges 14: 5), shahal (Psa. 91:13), and shahaz (Job. 28: 8)."  
L. *If so, they are fewer [than ten]?*  
M. "They are gone over" [and] "the passage" add up to two [more].

**I.66 A.** *What is the meaning of the statement, "As yet shall be halt at Nob that day" (Isa. 10:32)?*

- B. Said R. Huna, "That day alone remained [for the punishment of] the sin committed at Nob [1Sa. 22:17-19]. [Freedman, p. 639, n. 9: When the priests of Nob were massacred. God set a term for punishment, of which that day was the last.]
- C. *"The Chaldean [soothsayers] said to him, 'If you go now, you will overpower it, and if not, you will not overpower it.'*
- D. *"A journey that should require ten days required only one day.*
- E. *"When they got to Jerusalem, they piled up mattresses so that, when he climbed up and took up his position on the top one, he could see Jerusalem. When he saw it, it looked tiny in his eyes. He said, 'Is this really the city of Jerusalem, on account of which I moved all my troops and came up and conquered the entire province? Is it not smaller and weaker than all of the cities of the peoples that by my power I have already conquered?'"*
- F. *"He went and got up and shook his head and waved his hand backward and forward, with contempt, toward the mountain of the house of the sanctuary in Zion and toward the courts of Jerusalem."*
- G. *"They said, 'Let us raise a hand against it right now.'*
- H. *"He said to them, 'You are tired. Tomorrow each one of you bring me a stone and we shall stone it [Freedman, following Jastrow].'"*
- I. "Forthwith: 'And it came to pass that night that the angel of the Lord went out and smote in the camp of the Assyrians a hundred fourscore and five thousand, and when they arose early in the morning, behold they were all dead corpses' (2Ki. 19:35)."
- J. Said R. Pappa, *"That is in line with what people say: 'Justice delayed is justice denied.'"*

- I.67** A. "And Ishbi-benob, who was of the sons of the giant, the weight of whose spear weighed three hundred shekels of brass in weight, being girded with a new sword, thought to have slain David" (2Sa. 21:16):
- B. *What is the sense of "Ishbi-be-nob"?*
  - C. Said R. Judah said Rab, "It was a man [ish] who came on account of the matter of [the sin committed at] Nob.
  - D. "Said the Holy One, blessed be he, to David, 'How long will the sin committed [against Nob] be concealed in your hand. On your account, Nob was put to death, the city of priests, on your account, Doeg the Edomite was sent into exile; on your account, Saul and his three sons were killed.
  - E. "Do you want you descendents to be wiped out, or do you want to be handed over into the power of an enemy?"
  - F. "He said to him, 'Lord of the world, It is better that I be handed over to an enemy but that my descendents not be wiped out.'"
  - G. *One day, when he went out to Sekhor Bizzae [Freedman, p. 640, n. 7: literally: "your seed to cease"]. Satan appeared to him in the form of a deer. He shot an arrow at it, and the arrow did not reach [the deer]. It drew him until he came to the land of the Philistines. When Ishbi-benob saw him, he said, 'This is the one who killed Goliath, my brother.'"*

- H. *He bound him, doubled him up, and threw him under an olive press. A miracle was done for [David], in that the earth underneath him became soft. This is in line with the following verse of Scripture: "You have enlarged my steps under me, that my feet did not slip" (Psa. 18:37).*
- I. *That day was the eve of the Sabbath [Friday]. Abishai ben Zeruiah [David's nephew] was washing his head in four casks of water. He saw stains of blood [in the water].*
- J. *Some say a dove came and slapped its wings before him.*
- K. *He said, "The congregation of Israel is compared to a dove, for it is said, 'You are as the wings of a dove covered with silver' (Psa. 68:14). This then bears the inference that David, king of Israel, is in trouble."*
- L. *He came to his house and did not find him. He said, "We have learned in the Mishnah: **People are not to ride on his horse or sit on his throne or hand his scepter [M. San. 2:5].***
- M. *"What is the rule about a time of crisis?"*
- N. *He came and asked at the school house. They said to him, "In a time of crisis it is all right."*
- O. *He mounted his mule and rode off and the earth crumbled up [to make the journey quick]. While he was riding along, he saw Orpah, mother of [Ishbi-benob] who was spinning. When she saw him, she broke off the spindle." He threw it at her head and killed her.*
- P. *When Ishbi-benob saw him, he said, "Now there are two against me, and they will kill me."*
- Q. *He threw David up and stuck his spear [into the ground], saying, "Let him fall on it and be killed."*
- R. *[Abishai] shouted the Name [of God], so David was suspended between heaven and earth.*
- S. *But why should David himself not have said it?*
- T. *Because one who is bound cannot free himself from his chains.*
- U. *He said to him, "What do you want here?"*
- V. *He said to him, "This is what the Holy One, blessed be he, has said to me, and this is what I said to him."*
- W. *He said to him, "Take back your prayer. May your son's son sell wax, but may you not suffer."*
- X. *He said to him, "If so, help me."*
- Y. *That is in accord with what is written, "But Abishai, son of Zeruiah, helped him" (2Sa. 21:17).*
- Z. *Said R. Judah said Rab, "He helped him in prayer."*
- AA. *Abishai pronounced the Name and brought [David] down.*
- BB. *He pursued the two of them. When they came to Kubi, they said, "Let us stand against him."*
- CC. *When they came to Bethre, they said, "Will two whelps kill a lion?"*
- DD. *They said to him, "Go find Orpah, your mother, in the grave."*

- EE. *When they mentioned the name of his mother to him, he grew weak, and they killed him.*
- FF. *So it is written, "Then the men of David swore to him, saying, You shall no more go out with us to battle, that you not put out the light of Israel" (2Sa. 21:17).*

**I.68 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. For three did the earth fold up [to make their journey quicker]: Eliezer, Abraham's servant, Jacob our father, and Abishai b. Zeruiah.
- C. As to Abishai, son of Zeruiah, it is as we have just said.
- D. As to Eliezer, Abraham's servant, it is written, "And I came this day to the well" (Gen. 24:42), meaning that that very day he had set out.
- E. As to Jacob, our father, **[95B]** as it is written, "And Jacob went out from Beer Sheba and went to Haran" (Gen. 28:10), and it is said, "And he lighted upon a certain place and tarried there all night, because the sun had set" (Gen. 28:11).
- F. When he got to Haran, he said, "Is it possible that I have passed through a place in which my ancestors have prayed, and I did not say a prayer there?"
- G. *He wanted to go back. As soon as the thought of going back had entered his mind, the earth folded up for him. Forthwith:* "He lighted upon a place" (Gen. 28:11).
- H. Another matter: "Lighting upon..." refers only to praying, as it is written, "Therefore do not pray for this people or lift up a cry or prayer for them nor make intercession [using the same root] to me" (Jer. 7:16).
- I. "And he tarried there all night, because the sun had set" (Gen. 28:10):
- J. *After he had prayed, he wanted to go back.* Said the Holy One, blessed be he, "This righteous man has come to the house of my dwelling. Should he go forth without spending the night?"
- K. Forthwith the sun set. That is in line with what is written, "And as he passed over Penuel, the sun rose for him" (Gen. 32:32).
- L. And did it rise only for him? And did not it not rise for the entire world?
- M. "But," said R. Isaac, "Since the sun had set [too soon] on his account, it also rose on his account."

**I.69 A.** *And how do we know that the seed of David ceased?*

- B. As it is written, "And when Athaliah, mother of Ahaziah, saw that her son was dead, she rose and destroyed all the royal seed" (2Ki. 11: 1).
- C. *And lo, Joash remained. Also Abiathar remained, for it is written,* "And one of the sons of Ahimelech, son of Ahitub, named Abiathar, escaped" (1Sa. 22:20).
- D. Said R. Judah said Rab, "If Abiathar were not left to Ahimelech, son of Ahitub, neither shred nor remnant of the seed of David would have survived."

**I.70 A.** Said R. Judah said Rab, "The wicked Sennacherib came against them with forty-five thousand men, sons of kings seated on golden chariots, with their concubines and whores, and with eighty thousand mighty soldiers, garbed in coats of mail, and sixty thousand swordsmen running before him, and the rest cavalry.

- B. And so they came against Abraham, and in the age to come so they will come with Gog and Magog.
- C. *On Tannaite authority it was taught:* The length of his camp was four hundred parasangs, and the breadth of his horses, neck to neck, was forty parasangs, and the total of his army was two million six hundred thousand less one.
  - D. *Abbayye asked, "Does this mean less one myriad or one thousand?"*
  - E. *The question stands.*

**I.71 A.** *A Tannaite statement:*

- B. The first ones crossed by swimming, as it is said, "He shall overflow and go over" (Isa. 8: 8).
- C. The middle ones crossed standing up, as it is said, "He shall reach even to the neck" (Isa. 8: 8).
- D. The last group brought up the dirt [of the river] with their feet and so found no water in the river to drink, so that they had to bring them water from some other place, which they drank, as it is said, "I have digged and drunk water" (Isa. 37:25).
- E. [How could the army have been so large,] for is it not written, "Then the angel of the Lord went forth and smote in the camp of the Assyrians a hundred and fourscore and five thousand, and when they arose early in the morning, behold, they were all dead corpses" (Isa. 37:36)?
- F. Said R. Abbahu, "Those were the heads of the troops."
- G. *Said R. Ashi, "Read the text closely with the same result, for it is written, '[therefore shall the Lord... send] among his fat ones leanness [i.e. the cream of the crop].'*
- H. *Said Rabina, "Read the text closely with the same result; for it is written, 'And the Lord sent an angel, which cut off all the men of valor, and the leaders and the princes in the camp of the king of Assyria. So he returned with shamefacedness to his own land, and when he entered into the house of his god, they that came forth of his own bowels slew him there with the sword' (2Ch. 32:21).*
- I. *This proves [that the reference is only to the leaders (Freedman, p. 644, n. 6)].*

**I.72 A.** How did [the angel] smite [the army]?

- B. R. Eliezer says, "He hit them with his hand, as it is said, 'And Israel saw the great hand' (Exo. 14:31), that was destined to exact punishment of Sennacherib."
- C. R. Joshua says, "He hit them with a finger, as it is said, 'Then the magicians said to Pharaoh, This is the finger of God' (Exo. 8:14), that finger that was destined to exact punishment of Sennacherib."
- D. R. Eleazar, son of R. Yosé the Galilean, says, "Said the Holy One, blessed be he, to Gabriel, 'Is your sickle sharpened?'"
- E. "He said before him, 'Lord of the world, it has been ready and sharpened since the six days of creation, as it is said, 'For they fled from the swords, from the sharpened sword' (Isa. 21:15)."
- F. R. Simeon b. Yohai says, "That season was the time for the ripening of the produce. Said the Holy One, blessed be he, to Gabriel, When you go forth to ripen the produce, attack them, as it is said, 'As he passes, he shall take you, for morning



by morning shall he pass by, by day and by night, and it shall be a sheer terror to understand the report' (Isa. 28:19)."

- G. *Said R. Pappa, "This is in line with what people say: 'As you pass by, reveal yourself to your enemy' [and so take revenge whenever you have the chance]."*
- H. Others say, "He blew into their noses and they died, as it is said, 'And he shall also blow upon them, and they shall wither' (Isa. 40:24)."
- I. R. Jeremiah b. Abba said, "He clapped his hands at them and they died, as it is written, 'I will also smite my hands together and I will cause my fury to rest' (Eze. 21:22)."
- J. R. Isaac Nappaha said, "He opened their ears for them and they heard a song of the living creatures [of the heaven] and they died, as it is written, 'At your exaltation the people were scattered' (Isa. 33: 3)."

**I.73 A.** How many [of Sennacherib's army] remained?

- B. Rab said, "Ten, as it is said, 'And the rest of the trees of his forest shall be few, that a child may write them' (Isa. 10:19).
- C. "What is the letter representing a number that a child can write? The one that stands for ten."
- D. Samuel said, "Nine, as it is written, 'Yet gleaning grapes shall be left in it, as the shaking of an olive tree, two and three berries in the top of the uppermost bough, four and five in the utmost fruitful branches thereof' (Isa. 17: 6). [Freedman, p. 645, n. 12: This is rendered: "just as after the shaking of an olive tree there may remain two olives here and three there, so shall there be left of the arm army four here and five there — nine in all."]
- E. R. Joshua b. Levi said, "Fourteen, as it is written, 'Two, three..., four, five' (Isa. 17: 6)."
- F. R. Yohanan said, "Five: Sennacherib, his two sons, Nebuchadnezzar, and Nebuzaradan.
- G. "Nebuzaradan['s survival is] a tradition.
- H. "Nebuchadnezzar, as it is written, 'And the form of the fourth is like an angel of God' (Dan. 3:25).
- I. *"If he had not seen [an angel], how would he have known?"*
- J. "Sennacherib and his two sons, as it is written, 'And it came to pass, as he was worshipping in the house of Nisroch his god, that Adrammelech and Sharezer, his sons, smote him with the sword' (2Ki. 19:37)."

**I.74 A.** Said R. Abbahu, "Were it not that a verse of Scripture is explicitly spelled out, it would not have been possible to say it:

- B. "For it is written, 'In the same day shall the Lord shave with a razor that is hired, namely, by the riverside, by the king of Assyria, the head and the hair of the feet, and it shall consume the beard' (Isa. 7:20).
- C. *"The Holy One, blessed be he, came and appeared before [Sennacherib] as an old man. He said to him, 'When you go against the kings of east and west, whose sons you brought and saw killed, what will you say to them?'"*
- D. *"He said to him, 'This man [I] was also fearful on that account.'*
- E. *"He said to him, 'What should we do?'"*

- F. *"He said to him, 'Go [96A] and change your appearance.'*
- G. *"How shall I change?'*
- H. *"He said to him, 'Go and bring me a razor, and I shall shave you.'*
- I. *"Where shall I get it?'*
- J. *"He said to him, 'Go to that house and bring it from there.'*
- K. *"He went and found it. Ministering angels came and appeared to him in the form of men, grinding palm-nuts.'*
- L. *"He said to them, 'Give me the razor.'*
- M. *"They said to him, 'Grind a cask of palm-nuts, and we shall give it to you.'*
- N. *"He ground a cask of palm-nuts, and they gave the razor to him.*
- O. *"It got dark before he came back. [God] said to [Sennacherib], 'Go and bring fire.'*
- P. *"He went and brought fire. While he was blowing on it, the fire caught his beard, so [God] shaved his head as well as his beard. [Freedman, p. 646, n. 8: Thus he was shaved with a razor hired by his own work, a work which is done 'by the riverside,' 'grinding,' the water providing power for the mill.]"*
- Q. *They said, "This is in line with what is written: 'And it shall also consume the beard' (Isa. 7:20)."*
- R. *Said R. Pappa, "This is in line with what people say: 'If you are singeing an Aramaean's hair and it suits him, light a fire to his beard, so you will not suffer his mockery.'"*
- S. *[Reverting to the tale of Abbahu:] "He went and found a plank from Noah's ark. He said, 'This must be the great god who saved Noah from the flood.'*
- T. *"He said, 'If that man [I] goes and is victorious, he will offer his two sons before you.'*
- U. *"His sons heard and killed him. That is in line with the verse of Scripture, 'And it came to pass, as he was worshipping in the house of Nisroch his god, that Adrammelech and Sharezer his sons smote him with the sword' (2Ki. 19:37)."*
- I.75 A.** *"And he fought against them, he and his servants, by night, and smote them" (Gen. 14:15):*
- B. *Said R. Yohanan, "That angel who was assigned to Abraham was named 'Night,' as it is said, '[Let the day perish wherein I was born] and the Night which said, There is a man-child conceived' (Job. 3: 3). [Freedman, p. 647, n. 4: The verse, Gen. 14:15, is translated, and Night fought on their behalf, he and his....]"*
- C. *R. Isaac Nappaha ["the smith"] said, "It did for him the deeds that are done by night, as it is said, 'They fought from heaven, the stars in their courses fought against Sisera' (Judges 5:20)."*
- D. *R. Simeon b. Laqish said, "What the smith [Yohanan] has said is better than what the son of the smith [Isaac] has said."*
- E. *"And he pursued them to Dan" (Gen. 14:14):*
- F. *Said R. Yohanan, "When that righteous man came to Dan, he grew weak. He foresaw that the children of his children were destined to commit acts of idolatry in Dan, as it is said, 'And he set the one in Beth El, and the other he put in Dan' (1Ki. 12:29).*



G. “And also that wicked man [Nebuchadnezzar] did not grow strong until he reached Dan, as it is said, ‘From Dan the snorting of his horses was heard’ (Jer. 8:16).”

- I.76 A.** Said R. Zira, “Even though R. Judah b. Beterah sent word from Nisibis, ‘Pay heed to an elder who has forgotten his learning through not fault of his own and to cut the jugular veins [in slaughtering a beast], in accord with the view of R. Judah,
- B. “and take heed of the sons of the ordinary folk, for from them [too] will Torah go forth,’  
C. *“for such a matter as the following we may convey matters to them [and not refrain from teaching this lesson:]*  
D. ““You are righteous, Lord, when I please with you, yet let met talk to thee of your judgments, wherefore does the way of the wicked prosper? Wherefore are all they happy who deal very treacherously? You have planted them, yes, they have taken root, they grow, yes, they bring forth fruit” (Jer. 12:1-2).  
E. “*What did he answer him?* “If you have run with the footmen and they have tired you, then how can you contend with the horses? And if in a land of peace, in which you trust, they have wearied you, how will you do in the prideful swelling of the Jordan” (Jer. 12: 5).  
F. ““The matter may be compared to the case of a man who said “I can run in a marsh three parasangs before horses.” He happened upon a man on foot and ran before him for only three mils on dry land, and he got tired.  
G. ““He said to him, “Now if matters are this way when you run before a man on foot, all the more so [will you be unable to run] before horses! And if matters are this way for three mils, how much the more so in three parasangs! And if matters are this way in dry land, how much the more so in a marsh!”  
H. “““So it is with you. If on account of the reward for taking four steps [explained later, J-Y] that I paid that wicked man, which he took in running on account of my honor, you are amazed, when I pay the reward owing to Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob, who ran before me like horses, how much the more so [will you be amazed]!”  
I. ““This is in line with the following verse of Scripture: “My heart within me is broken because of the prophets, all my bones shake, I am like a drunken man, and like a man whose wine has overcome, because of the Lord and because of the words of his holiness” (Jer. 23: 9).”  
J. *As to the reference to the four steps [taken by the wicked man in honor of God], what is its meaning?*  
K. *It is in accord with that which is written:* “At that time Merodach-baladan, son of Baladan, king of Babylonia, sent letters and a present to Hezekiah [for he had heard that he had been sick and recovered]” (Isa. 39: 1).  
L. And merely because Hezekiah was sick and got better, did he sent him letters and a present?!  
M. Yes, so as “to inquire of the wonder that was done in the land” (2Ch. 32:31).  
N. For R. Yohanan said, “That day on which Ahaz died was only two hours long, *and on the day on which Hezekiah got sick and got better, the Holy One, blessed be he, gave back the other ten hours.*

- O. “For it is written, ‘Behold I will bring again the shadow of the degrees which is gone down in the sun dial of Ahaz, ten degrees backward. So the sun returned ten degrees, by which degrees it was gone down’ (Isa. 38: 8). [Freedman, p. 649, ns. 5-6: The sun had set ten hours too soon, to allow no time for funeral eulogies. This was in order to make atonement for his sins, for the disgrace of being deprived of the usual funeral honors expiates one’s misdeeds. The return of the ten degrees to which Isaiah refers is assumed to mean a prolongation of the day by ten hours, light having healing powers.]
- P. *“Merodach-baladan] said to [his staff], ‘What is going on?’*
- Q. *“They said to him, ‘Hezekiah got sick and got better.’*
- R. *“He said, ‘Is there such a great man in the world, and should I know want to greet him?’*
- S. *“He wrote him, ‘Peace to King Hezekiah, peace to the city of Jerusalem, peace to the Great God!’*
- T. *“Nebuchadnezzar was the scribe of Baladan. At that time he was not there. When he came, he said to him, ‘What did you write?’*
- U. *“They said to him, ‘This is what we wrote.’*
- V. *“He said to him, ‘You called him “the great God” and yet you mentioned him last?’*
- W. *“He said, ‘Rather, this is how you should write: “Peace to the great God, peace to the city of Jerusalem, peace to King Hezekiah.”’*
- X. *“They said to him, ‘Let the one who has read the letter serve as the messenger.’*
- Y. *“He ran after [the messenger] [thus in honor of God]. But when he had run four steps, Gabriel came and froze him in place.”*
- Z. Said R. Yohanan, “Had Gabriel not come and kept him standing in place, there would have been no remedy for (the enemies of) Israel.” [Freedman, p. 650, n. 3: The learned children of the ordinary folk should thus be informed that the honor paid to them is due to the slight merit of their fathers, as in this case.]
- I.77** A. *What is the meaning of the fact that [Merodach-] Baladan is called “the son of Baladan”?*
- B. *They say: Baladan was king, and his appearance changed into that of a dog, so his son sat on the throne.*
- C. *When he would sign a document, he would write his name and the name of his father, “King Baladan.”*
- D. *This is the sense of that which is written: “A son honors his father, and a servant his master” (Mal. 1: 6).*
- E. *“A son honors his father” (Mal. 1: 6) refers to what we have just said.*
- F. *As to “A servant his master” (Mal. 1: 6)?*
- G. *It is in line with that which is written: “Now in the fifth month, on the tenth day of the month, the nineteenth year of Nebuchadnezzar, king of Babylonia, came Nebuzaradan, captain of the guard, and stood before the king of Babylonia in Jerusalem. And he burned the house of the Lord and the house of the king” (Jer. 52:12-13).*

- H. **[96B]** *But did Nebuchadnezzar go up to Jerusalem? Has it not been written, "They carried him up to the King of Babylonia, to Riblah" (Jer. 52: 9)? And, said R. Abbahu, "That town is the same as Antioch."*
- I. R. Hisda and R. Isaac b. Abudimi: One said, "His picture was engraved on [Nebuzaradan's] chariot."
- J. "The other said, "He was so much in awe of him that it was as though he were standing before him."

**I.78 A.** *Said Raba, "It was bearing three hundred mules loaded with iron axes that could break iron that Nebuchadnezzar sent Nebuzaradan. All of them broke on one gate of Jerusalem, as it is said, 'And now they attack its gate together; with axes and hammers they hit it' (Psa. 74: 6).*

B. *"He wanted to go back. He said, 'I am afraid that they might do to me as they did to Sennacherib.*

C. *"A voice came forth: 'Leaper son of a leaper, leap, Nebuzaradan! The time has come for the sanctuary to be destroyed and the palace burned.'*

D. *"Left to him was only a single axe. He went and hit it with its head, and the gate opened, as it is said, 'A man was famous according as he had lifted up axes upon thick trees' (Psa. 74: 5).*

E. *"He continued with the killing until he reached the Temple. He set fire to it. The Temple sought to rise up [to heaven], but from heaven it was pushed down, as it is said, 'The Lord has trodden down the virgin daughter of Judah as in a winepress' (Lam. 1:15).*

F. *"He was elated, but an echo came and said, 'You have killed a dead people, you have burned a burned Temple, you have crushed already ground corn, as it is said, 'Take the millstones and grind meal, uncover your locks, make the leg bare, uncover the thigh, pass over the rivers' (Isa. 47: 2).*

G. "What is said is not 'wheat' but 'ground meal.'"

H. *[Nebuzaradan] saw the blood of Zechariah boiling. He said to them, "What is this?"*

I. *They said to him, "It is the blood of the sacrifices, that has been poured out."*

J. *He said to them, "Come and let us bring [animal blood to make a comparison to see whether they are alike or not alike]." He slaughtered an animal and the blood was not like [that which was boiling].*

K. *He said to them, "Explain it to me, and if not, I shall comb your flesh with iron combs."*

L. *They said to him, "This one was a priest and a prophet, and he prophesied to Israel concerning the destruction of Jerusalem, so they killed him."*

M. *He said to them, "I shall be the one to appease him." He brought rabbis and killed them over him, but [the blood] did not come to rest. He brought school children and killed them over him, but still the blood did not come to rest. He brought the blossoms of the priesthood and killed them over him, and still the blood did not come to rest, until he had killed over him ninety-four myriads, and still his blood did not rest.*

- N. He drew near [the blood] and said, “Zechariah, Zechariah, I have destroyed the best of them. *Do you want me to kill them all?*”
- O. *Forthwith the blood came to rest.*
- P. *He gave thought to repentance, saying, “Now if they, who killed only a single person, were treated in such a way, that man [I] — what will come of him?”*
- Q. *He fled, sent his instructions to his household [giving over his property to his family], and then converted [to Judaism].*

**I.79 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. Naaman was a resident proselyte.
- C. Nebuzaradan was a righteous proselyte.
- D. Grandsons of Sisera studied Torah in Jerusalem.
- E. Grandsons of Sennacherib taught Torah in public.
- F. *And who were they? Shemaiah and Abtalion.*
- G. Grandsons of Haman studied Torah in Bene Beraq.
- H. And so too grandsons of that wicked man [Nebuchadnezzar] did the Holy One, blessed be he, want to bring under the wings of the Presence of God.
- I. Said the ministering angels before the Holy One, blessed be he, “Lord of the world, will you bring under the wings of your Presence him who destroyed your house and burned your Temple?”
- J. For it is written, “We should have healed Babylonia, but she is not healed” (Jer. 21: 9).
- K. Said Ulla, “This speaks of Nebuchadnezzar.”
- L. *Said R. Samuel b. Nahmani, “This refers to the ‘canals of Babylonia’ (Psa. 137: 1), which flow among the palm trees of Babylonia.”*

**I.80 A.** Said Ulla, “Ammon and Moab were bad neighbors of Jerusalem.

- B. *“When they heard the prophets prophesying the destruction of Jerusalem, they sent word to Nebuchadnezzar, ‘Go out and come here.’*
- C. *“He said, ‘I am afraid that they will do to me what they did to those who came before me.’*
- D. *“They sent to him, ““For the man is not at home” (Pro. 7:19), and “man” can refer only to the Holy One, blessed be he, as it is said, “The Lord is a man of war” (Exo. 15: 3).’*
- E. *“He replied, ‘He is nearby and he will come.’*
- F. *“They sent to him, ““He has gone on a far journey” (Pro. 7:19).’*
- G. *“He sent to them, ‘There are righteous men there, who will pray for mercy and bring him back.’*
- H. *“They sent to him, ““He has taken a bag of money with him” (Pro. 7:20), and “money” refers only to the righteous, as it is said, “So I bought her to me for fifteen pieces of silver and for a homer of barley and a half-homer of barley” (Hos. 3: 2).’*
- I. *“He sent word to them, ‘The wicked may repent and pray for mercy and bring him back.’*

- J. *"They sent to him, 'He has already set a time for them, as it is said, "And he will come home at the day appointed" (Pro. 7:20), and "day appointed" can refer only to time, as it is said, "In the time appointed on our solemn feast day" (Psa. 81:1,3).'*
- K. *"He sent word to them, 'It is winter, and I cannot make the trip because of the snow and rain.'*
- L. *"They sent to him, 'Come through the mountains [if need be]. For it is said, "Send you a messenger to the ruler of the earth [that he may come] by way of the rocks to the wilderness to the mountain of the daughter of Zion" (Isa. 16: 1).'*
- M. *"He sent to them, 'If I come, I shall not have a place in which to make camp.'*
- N. *"They sent word to him, 'Their cemeteries are superior to your palaces, as it is written, "At that time, says the Lord, they shall bring out the bones of the king of Judea and the bones of his princes and the bones of the priests and the bones of the prophets and the bones of the inhabitants of Jerusalem, out of their graves. And they shall spread them before the sun and the moon and all the host of heaven, whom they have loved and whom they have served and after whom they have walked" (Jer. 8:1-2).'* [Freedman, p. 654, n. 1: The great burial vaults will be cleared out to give shelter to Nebuchadnezzar's army.]"

### **When Will the Messiah Come?**

**I.81 A.** *Said R. Nahman to R. Isaac, "Have you heard when the son of 'the fallen one' will come?"*

- B. *He said to him, "Who is the son of 'the fallen one'?"*
- C. *He said to him, "It is the Messiah."*
- D. *"Do you call the Messiah 'the son of the fallen one'?"*
- E. *He said to him, "Yes, for it is written, 'On that day I will raise up [97A] the tabernacle of David, the fallen one' (Amo. 9:11)."*
- F. *He said to him, "This is what R. Yohanan said, 'The generation to which the son of David will come will be one in which disciples of sages grow fewer,*
- G. *"and, as to the others, their eyes will wear out through suffering and sighing,*
- H. *"and troubles will be many, and laws harsh, forever renewing themselves so that the new one will hasten onward before the old one has come to an end.'"*

**I.82 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. The seven year cycle in which the son of David will come:
- C. As to the first one, the following verse of Scripture will be fulfilled: "And I will cause it to rain upon one city and not upon another" (Amo. 4: 7).
- D. As to the second year, the arrows of famine will be sent forth.
- E. As to the third, there will be a great famine, in which men, women, and children will die, pious men and wonder-workers alike, and the Torah will be forgotten by those that study it.
- F. As to the fourth year, there will be plenty which is no plenty.
- G. As to the fifth year, there will be great prosperity, and people will eat, drink, and rejoice, and the Torah will be restored to those that study it.
- H. As to the sixth year, there will be rumors.

- I. As to the seventh year, there will be wars.
- J. As to the end of the seventh year [the eighth year], the son of David will come.
- K. *Said R. Joseph, "Lo, how many septennates have passed like that one, and yet he has not come."*
- L. *Said Abbaye, "Were there rumors in the sixth year and wars in the seventh year? And furthermore, did they come in the right order?"*

**I.83 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. R. Judah says, "In the generation in which the son of David will come, **the gathering place will be for prostitution, Galilee will be laid waste, Gablan will be made desolate, and the men of the frontier will go about from town to town, and none will take pity on them; and the wisdom of scribes will putrefy; and those who fear sin will be rejected; and the truth will be herded away** [M. [Sot. 9:15AA-GG](#)].
- C. "For it is said, 'And the truth will be herded away' (Isa. 59:15)."
- D. *What is the meaning of the statement, "The truth will be herded away" (Isa. 59:15)?*
- E. *Said members of the house of Rab, "This teaches that it will be divided into herds and herds, each going its way."*
- F. *What is the meaning [of the concluding passage of the same verse], "And he who departs from evil makes himself a prey" (Isa. 59:15)?*
- G. *Said members of the house of R. Shila, "Whoever departs from evil will be treated as a fool [using the same letters as those for prey] by other people."*

**I.84 A.** [Here is a case of how a righteous man was treated like a fool:]

- Said Raba, "To begin with I had supposed that there is no truth in the world. One of the rabbis, R. Tabut by name (and some say, R. Tabyomi by name), who would not go back on his word even though people gave him all the treasures of the world, said to me that one time he happened to come to a place called Truth.*
- B. *"It was a place in which people would not go back on their word, and in which no person died before his day.*
- C. *"He took a woman of theirs as wife and had two sons from her.*
- D. *"One day his wife was sitting and shampooing her hair. Her neighbor came and knocked on the door. Thinking that it would be improper [to say what his wife was doing], he said to her, 'She is not here.'*
- E. *"His two sons died.*
- F. *"The people of the place came to him and said to him, 'What is going on?'*
- G. *"He said to them, 'This is what happened.'*
- H. *"They said to him, 'By your leave, please go away from our place, so as not to incite Satan against these men [us].'"*

**I.85 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. R. Nehorai says, "In the generation in which the son of David will come, **children will shame elders, and elders will stand up before children. 'The daughter**



**rises up against the mother, and the daughter-in-law against her mother-in-law' (Mic. 7: 6). The face of the generation is the face of a dog, and a son is not ashamed before his father" [M. Sot. 9:15HH-KK].**

**I.86 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. R. Nehemiah says, "In the generation in which the son of David will come, **presumption increases, and dearth increases, and the vine gives its fruit and wine at great cost. The government turns to heresy, and there is no reproof**" [M. Sot. 9:15W-Z].
- C. *That statement supports the view of R. Isaac.*
- D. For R. Isaac said, "The son of David will come only when the entire kingdom has turned to heresy."
- E. *Said Raba, "What is the text of Scripture that makes that point?*
- F. "It is all turned white, he is clean' (Lev. 13:13). [Freedman, p. 656, n. 5: When all are heretics, it is a sign that the world is about to be purified by the advent of the Messiah.]"

**I.87 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. "For the Lord shall judge his people and repent himself of his servants, when he sees that their power has gone, and there is none shut up or left" (Deu. 32:36).
- C. The son of David will come only when traitors are many.
- D. Another matter: Only when disciples are few.
- E. Another matter: Only when a penny will not be found in anyone's pocket.
- F. Another matter: Only when people will have given up hope of redemption, as it is said, "There is none shut up or left" (Deu. 32:36), as it were, when there is none [God being absent] who supports and helps Israel.
- G. *That accords with the statement of R. Zira, who, when he would find rabbis involved in [figuring out when the Messiah would come], would say to them, 'By your leave, I ask you not to put it off.*
- H. *"For we have learned on Tannaite authority: Three things come on the spur of the moment, and these are they: the Messiah, a lost object, and a scorpion."*

**I.88 A.** *Said R. Qattina, "The world will exist for six thousand years and be destroyed for one thousand,*

- B. *"as it is said, 'And the Lord alone shall be exalted in that day' (Isa. 2:11)."*
- C. *Abbayye said, "It will be desolate for two thousand years, as it is said, 'After two days will he revive us, in the third day, he will raise us up and we shall live in his sight' (Hos. 6: 2)."*
- D. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority in accord with the view of R. Qattina:*
- E. Just as at the advent of the Sabbatical Year the world will lie fallow for one out of seven years.
- F. so it is with the world. A thousand years will the world lie fallow out of seven thousand years,
- G. as it is said, "And the Lord alone shall be exalted in that day" (Isa. 2:11), and Scripture says, "A Psalm and song for the Sabbath Day" (Psa. 92: 1) — a day that is wholly the Sabbath.

H. And Scripture says, "For a thousand years in your sight are but as yesterday when they are past" (Psa. 90: 4). [A day stands for a thousand years.]

**I.89** A. *A Tannaite authority of the house of Elijah [said], "For six thousand years the world will exist.*

B. "For two thousand it will be desolate, two thousand years [will be the time of] Torah, and two thousand years will be the days of the Messiah.

C. **[97B]** but on account of our numerous sins what has been lost [of those years, in which the Messiah should have come but has not come] has been lost.

**I.90** A. Said Elijah to R. Sala the Pious, "The world will last for no fewer than eighty-five Jubilees [of fifty years each], and the son of David will come in the last one."

B. He said to him, "Will it be in the first or the last year of the last Jubilee?"

C. He said to him, "I do not know."

D. "Will it come at the end or not come at the end of the fiftieth year?"

E. He said to him, "I do not know."

F. *R. Ashi said, "This is what he said to him: 'Up to that time, do not look for his coming, but from that time onward, do look for his coming.'"*

**I.91** A. R. Hanan, son of Tahalipa, sent to R. Joseph, "I came across a man who had in hand a scroll, written in Assyrian [block] letters in the holy language.

B. "I said to him, 'Where did you get this?'

C. "He said to me, 'I was employed in the Roman armies, and I found it in the Roman archives.'

D. "In the scroll it is written that after four thousand two hundred ninety-two years from the creation of the world, the world will be an orphan.

E. "[As to the years to follow] in some there will be wars of the great dragons, and in some, wars of Gog and Magog, and the rest will be the days of the Messiah.

F. "And the Holy One, blessed be he, will renew his world only after seven thousand years."

G. R. Aha, son of Raba, said, "'After five thousand years' *is what is said.*"

**I.92** A. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

B. R. Nathan says, "This verse of Scripture pierces to the depth:

C. "'For the vision is yet for an appointed time, but at the end it shall speak and not lie; though he tarry, wait for him; because it will surely come, it will not tarry' (Hab. 2: 3)."

D. This is not in accord with our rabbis, who interpreted, "Until a time and times and the dividing of time" (Dan. 7:25).

E. Nor does it accord with R. Simlai, who would interpret, "You feed them with the bread of tears and given them tears to drink a third time" (Psa. 80: 6).

F. Nor does it accord with R. Aqiba, who would interpret the verse, "Yet once, it is a little while, and I will shake the heavens and the earth" (Hag. 2: 6).

G. Rather, the first kingdom will last for seventy years, the second kingdom for fifty-two years, and the kingdom of Ben Koziba will be for two and a half years.

**I.93** A. *What is the meaning of the verse, "But at the end it shall speak and not lie" (Hab. 2: 3)?*



- B. Said R. Samuel bar Nahmani said R. Jonathan, “[Freedman, p. 659, n. 5: Reading the verse as, ‘He will blast him who calculates the end,’] blasted be the bones of those who calculate the end [when the Messiah will come].
- C. “For they might say, ‘Since the end has come and he has not come, he will not come.’
- D. “Rather, wait for him, as it is said, ‘Though he tarry, wait for him’ (Hab. 2: 3).
- E. “Should you say that we shall wait, but he may not wait, Scripture responds, ‘And therefore will the Lord wait, that he may be gracious to you, and therefore will he be exalted, that he may have mercy upon you’ (Isa. 30:18).
- F. “Then, since we are waiting and he is waiting, what is holding things up?
- G. “It is the attribute of justice that is holding things up.
- H. “But if the attribute of justice is holding things up, why should we wait?
- I. “It is so as to receive the reward for our patience, as it is written, ‘Blessed are all those who wait for him’ (Isa. 30: 9).”

- I.94** A. *Said Abbaye, “There are in the world never fewer than thirty-six righteous men, who look upon the face of the Presence of God every day, for it is said, ‘Happy are those who wait for him’ (Isa. 30:18), and the numerical value of the letters in the word ‘for him’ is thirty-six.”*
- B. *Is this so? And did not Raba say, “The row of the righteous before the Holy One, blessed be he, is made up of eighteen thousand, as it is said, ‘There shall be eighteen thousand round about’ (Eze. 48:35)”?*
  - C. *There is no contradiction between the two views. The former number refers to those few who see him through a bright mirror, the latter number refers to those many who see him only through a dirty mirror.*
    - D. *And are they so numerous?*
    - E. *And did not Hezekiah said R. Jeremiah said in the name of R. Simeon b. Yohai, “I have myself seen the inhabitants of the upper world, and they are only a few. If they are a thousand, my son and I are among their number. If they are only a hundred, my son and I are among their number. If they are only two, they are only my son and I.”*
    - F. *There is still no contradiction. The larger number speaks of those who go inside only with permission, the smaller number those who go inside even without permission.*

- I.95** A. Said Rab, “All of the ends have passed, and the matter now depends only on repentance and good deeds.”
- B. And Samuel said, “It is sufficient for a mourner to remain firm in his mourning.”
  - C. *This accords with the following dispute among Tannaite authorities:*
  - D. R. Eliezer says, “If the Israelites repent, they will be redeemed, and if not, they will not be redeemed.”
  - E. Said R. Joshua to him, “If they do not repent, will they not be redeemed?!”
  - F. “Rather, the Holy One, blessed be he, will raise up for them a king whose decrees will be as harsh as those of Haman, and the Israelites will repent, and [God] will restore them to a good path.”
  - G. *A further Tannaite version:*

- H. R. Eliezer says, "If the Israelites repent, they will be redeemed, as it is said, 'Return, backsliding children, and I will heal your back-slidings' (Jer. 3:22)."
- I. Said to him R. Joshua, "And is it not written, 'You have sold yourselves for nought, and you shall be redeemed without money' (Isa. 52: 3)?"
- J. "'You have sold yourselves for nought' — for idolatry.
- K. "'But you shall be redeemed without money' — with neither repentance nor do good deeds."
- L. Said to him R. Eliezer, "But is it not written, 'Return to me and I shall return to you' (Mal. 3: 7)?"
- M. Said to him R. Joshua, "But is it not written, 'For I am master over you, and I will take you, one from a city and two from a family and I will bring you to Zion' (Jer. 3:14)?"
- N. Said to him R. Eliezer, "But it is written, 'In returning and rest you shall be saved' (Isa. 30: 5)."
- O. Said R. Joshua to R. Eliezer, "But is it not written, 'Thus says the Lord, the redeemer of Israel, and his holy one, to whom man despises, to him whom the nations abhor, to a servant of rulers, [98A] kings shall see and arise, princes also shall worship' (Isa. 49: 7)?"
- P. Said to him R. Eliezer, "But is it not written, 'If you will return, O Israel, says the Lord, return to me' (Jer. 4: 1)?"
- Q. Said to him R. Joshua, "But it is written elsewhere, 'And I heard the man clothed in linen, which was upon the waters of the river, when he held up his right hand and his left hand to heaven and swore by him who lives forever that it shall be for a year, two years, and half a year and when he shall have accomplished scattering the power of the holy people, all these things shall be finished' (Dan. 12: 7)."
- R. And R. Eliezer shut up.

**I.96** A. And said R. Abba, "You have no indication of the end more openly stated than the following, as it is said: 'But you, O Mountains of Israel, shall shoot forth your branches and yield your fruit to my people, Israel, for they are at hand to come' (Eze. 36: 8)."

- B. R. Eliezer says, "Also the following, as it is said: 'For before these days there was no hire for man, nor any hire for beast neither was there any peace to him that went out or came in because of the affliction' (Zec. 8:10)."
- C. *What is the meaning of the phrase*, "Neither was there any peace to him that went out or came in because of the affliction"?
- D. Rab said, "Even to disciples of sages, concerning whom peace is written in Scripture, as it is written, 'Great peace shall they have who love your Torah' (Psa. 119:165)."
- E. "Neither was there any peace... because of the affliction" (Zec. 8:10):
- F. And Samuel said, "Until all prices will be equal."

**I.97** A. Said R. Hanina, "The son of David will come only when a fish will be sought for a sick person and not be found, as it is said, 'Then I will make their waters deep and

cause their rivers to run like oil' (Eze. 32:14), and it is written, 'In that day I will cause the horn of the house of Israel to sprout forth' (Eze. 29:21)."

- B. Said R. Hama bar Hanina, "The son of David will come only when the rule over Israel by the least of the kingdoms will come to an end, as it is said, 'He shall both cut off the springs with pruning hooks and take away and cut down the branches' (Isa. 18: 5), and further: 'In that time shall the present be brought to the Lord of hosts of a people that is scattered and peeled' (Isa. 18: 7)."
- C. Said Zeiri said R. Hanina, "The son of David will come only when arrogant people will no longer be [found] in Israel, as it is said, 'For then I will take away out of the midst of you those who rejoice in your pride' (Zep. 8:11), followed by: 'I will also leave in the midst of you an afflicted and poor people, and they shall take refuge in the name of the Lord' (Zep. 3:12)."
- D. Said R. Simlai in the name of R. Eliezer b. R. Simeon, "The son of David will come only when all judges and rulers come to an end in Israel, as it is said, 'And I will turn my hand upon you and purely purge away your dross and take away all your tin, and I will restore your judges as at the first' (Isa. 1:25-26)."

**I.98** A. Said Ulla, "Jerusalem will be redeemed only through righteousness, as it is written, 'Zion shall be redeemed with judgment and her converts with righteousness' (Isa. 1:27)."

- B. *Said R. Pappa, "If the arrogant end [in Israel], the Magi will end [in Iran], if the judges end [in Israel], the rulers of thousands will come to an end [in Iran]."*
- C. *"If the arrogant end [in Israel], the magi will end [in Iran], as it is written, 'And I will purely purge away your haughty ones and take away all your tin' (Isa. 1:25).*
- D. *"If judges end [in Israel], the rulers of thousands will come to an end [in Iran], as it is written, 'The Lord has taken away your judgments, he has cast out your enemy' (Zep. 3:15)."*

**I.99** A. Said R. Yohanan, "If you see a generation growing less and less, hope for him, as it is said, 'And the afflicted people will you save' (2Sa. 22:28)."

- B. Said R. Yohanan, "If you see a generation over which many troubles flow like a river, hope for him, as it is written, 'When the enemy shall come in like a flood, the spirit of the Lord shall lift up a standard against him' (Isa. 59:19), followed by: 'And the redeemer shall come to Zion' (Isa. 59:20)."
- C. And said R. Yohanan, "The son of David will come to a generation that is either entirely righteous or entirely wicked.
- D. "A generation that is entirely righteous, as it is written, 'Your people also shall be all righteous, they shall inherit the land for ever' (Isa. 60:21),
- E. "or a generation that is entirely wicked, as it is written, 'And he saw that there was no man and wondered that there was no intercessor' (Isa. 59:16), and it is written, 'For my own sake, even for my own sake I will do it' (Isa. 60:22)."

**I.100** A. *Said R. Alexandri, "R. Joshua b. Levi contrasted verses as follows:*

- B. "It is written; 'in its time [will the Messiah come],' and it is also written; 'I [the Lord] will hasten it.'
- C. "[What is the meaning of the contrast?]

- D. "If [the Israelites] have merit, I will hasten it, if they do not, [the messiah] will come in due course.
- E. "It is written, "And behold, one like the son of man came with the clouds of heaven" (Dan. 7:13, and it is written, "Behold your king comes to you... lowly and riding upon an ass" (Zec. 9: 7). [What is the meaning of the contrast?]
- F. "If [the Israelites] have merit, it will be "with the clouds of heaven" (Dan. 7:13), and if they do not have merit, it will be "lowly and riding upon an ass" (Zec. 9: 7)."

**I.101** A. *Said King Shapur to Samuel, "You say that the Messiah will come on an ass [which is a humble way]. Come and I shall send him a white horse that I have."*

B. *He said to him, "Do you have one of many colors?"*

**I.102** A. *R. Joshua b. Levi found Elijah standing at the door of the burial vault of R. Simeon b. Yohai. He said to him, "Am I going to come to the world to come?"*

B. *He said to him, "If this master wants."*

C. *Said R. Joshua b. Levi, "Two did I see, but a third voice did I hear."*

D. *He said to him, "When is the Messiah coming?"*

E. *He said to him, "Go and ask him."*

F. *"And where is he sitting?"*

G. *"At the gate of the city."*

H. *"And what are the marks that indicate who he is?"*

I. *"He is sitting among the poor who suffer illness, and all of them untie and tie their bandages all together, but he unties them and ties them one by one. He is thinking, 'Perhaps I may be wanted, and I do not want to be held up.'"*

J. *He went to him, saying to him, "Peace be unto you, my master and teacher."*

K. *He said to him, "Peace be unto you, son of Levi."*

L. *He said to him, "When is the master coming?"*

M. *He said to him, "Today."*

N. *He went back to Elijah, who said to him, "What did he tell you?"*

O. *He said to him, "Peace be unto you, son of Levi."*

P. *He said to him, "He [thereby] promised you and your father the world to come."*

Q. *He said to him, "But he lied to me. For he said to me, 'I am coming today,' but he did not come."*

R. *He said to him, "This is what he said to you, "Today, if you will obey his voice" (Psa. 95: 7)."*

**I.103** A. *His disciples asked R. Yosé b. Qisma, "When is the son of David coming?"*

B. *He said to them, "I am afraid [to answer], lest you ask an omen from me [that my answer is right]."*

C. *They said to him, "We shall not ask for an omen from you." He said to them, "When this gate falls and is rebuilt, falls and is rebuilt, and falls a third time. They will not suffice to rebuild it before the son of David will come."*

D. *They said to him, "Our master, give us an omen."*

E. *He said to them, "But did you not say to me that you would not ask for an omen from me?"*

- F. They said to him, "Even so."
- G. He said to them, "Then let the waters of the grotto of Banias turn to blood," and they turned to blood.
- H. When he died, he said to them, "Dig my bier deep into the ground, [98B] for there is not a palm tree in Babylonia on which a Persian horse has not been tied, nor is there a bier in the land of Israel from which a Median horse will not eat straw."

**I.104** A. Said Rab, "The son of David will come only when the monarchy [of Rome] will spread over Israel for nine months,

- B. "as it is said, 'Therefore will he give them up, until the time that she who travails has brought forth; then the remnant of his brethren shall return to the children of Israel' (Mic. 5: 2)."

**I.105** A. *Said Ulla, "Let him come, but may I not see him."*

- B. *Said Rabba, "Let him come, but may I not see him."*
- C. *R. Joseph said, "May he come, and may I have the merit of sitting in the shade of the dung of his ass."*
- D. *Said Abbaye to Rabbah, "What is the reason [that some do not wish to see the coming of the messiah]? Is it because of the turmoil of the Messiah?"*
- E. *"And has it not been taught on Tannaite authority:*
- F. *"His disciples asked R. Eliezer, 'What should someone do to save himself from the turmoil of the Messiah?"*
- G. *"[He replied to them], 'Let him engage in study of the Torah and acts of loving kindness.'*
- H. *"And lo, the master [at hand] practices Torah-study and acts of loving kindness. [So why not want to see him?]"*
- I. He said to him, "Perhaps he fears sin will cause [him to suffer], in line with what R. Jacob bar Idi said."
- J. *For R. Jacob bar Idi contrasted two verses of Scripture, as follows: "It is written, 'And behold, I am with you and will keep you wherever you go' (Gen. 28:15), and another verse states, 'Then Jacob was greatly afraid' (Gen. 32: 8).*
- K. *"[Why the contrast between God's promise and Jacob's fear?] Jacob feared [and thought to himself,] 'Sin which I have done may cause [punishment for me instead].'"*
- L. *That accords with what has been taught on Tannaite authority:*
- M. "Till your people pass over, O Lord, till your people pass over, that you have acquired" (Exo. 15:16).
- N. "Till your people pass over" refers to the first entry into the land [in Joshua's time].
- O. "Till your people pass over, that you have acquired" refers to the second entry into the land [in the time of Ezra and Nehemiah. Thus a miracle was promised not only on the first occasion, but also on the second. But it did not happen the second time around. Why not?]
- P. On the basis of this statement, sages have said, "The Israelites were worthy of having a miracle performed for them in the time of Ezra also, just as it had been

performed for them in the time of Joshua b. Nun, but sin caused the miracle to be withheld.”

**I.106** A. *So said R. Yohanan, “Let him come, but let me not see him.”*

- B. *Said R. Simeon b. Laqish to him, “What is the scriptural basis for that view? Shall we say that it is because it is written, ‘As if a man fled from a lion and a bear met him, or went into the house and leaned his hand on the wall and a serpent bit him’ (Amo. 5:19)?*
- C. *“Come and I shall show you an example of such a case in this world.*
- D. *“When a man goes out to the field and bailiff meets him, it is like one whom a lion meets. He goes into town and a tax-collector meets him, it is like one whom a bear meets.*
- E. *“He goes into his house and finds his sons and daughters suffering from hunger, it is like one whom a snake bit.*
- F. *“Rather, it is because it is written, ‘Ask you now and see whether a man travails with child? Why do I see every man with his hands on his loins, as women in travail, and all faces are turned into paleness’ (Jer. 30: 6).”*
- G. *What is the sense of, “Why do I see every man...”?*
- H. *Said Raba bar Isaac said Rab, “It speaks of him to whom all [manly] power belongs [God].”*
- I. *And what is the sense of “all faces are turned into paleness”?*
- J. *Said R. Yohanan, “[It speaks of God’s] heavenly family and his earthly family, at the moment at which God says, ‘These are the creation of my hands, and those are the creation of my hands. How shall I destroy these [gentiles] on account of [what they have done to] those [Israelites]? [Freedman, p. 667, n. 2: to avenge the wrongs suffered by the Jews. Because the suffering would be so great that even the Almighty would lament it, Yohanan desired to be spared the Messiah’s coming.]”*
- K. *Said R. Pappa, “This is in line with what people say: ‘The ox runs and falls, so the horse is put in its stall.’ [Freedman, p. 667, n. 3: Then it is hard to get the horse out. So the Israelites, having fallen, were replaced in power by the gentiles, but on their recovery, it will be difficult to remove the gentiles from their position without inflicting much suffering.]”*

**I.107** A. *Said R. Giddal said Rab, “The Israelites are going to eat [and not starve] in the years of the Messiah.”*

- B. *Said R. Joseph, “That is self-evident. If not, then who will eat? Joe and Mo?! [Text: Hiliq and Bileq?]”*
- C. *[The statement at hand] serves to exclude the view of R. Hillel, who has said, “There will be no further Messiah for Israel, for they already consumed him in the time of Hezekiah.”*

**I.108** A. *Said Rab, “The world was created only for David.”*

- B. *And Samuel said, “For Moses.”*
- C. *And R. Yohanan said, “For the Messiah.”*
- D. *What is his name?*



- E. *The house of R. Shila said, "His name is Shiloh, as it is said, 'Until Shiloh come' (Gen. 49:10)."*
- F. *Members of the house of R. Yannai say, "His name is Yinnon, for it is written, 'His name shall endure forever, before the sun was, his name is Yinnon' (Psa. 72:17)."*
- G. *Members of the house of R. Haninah said, "It is Haninah, as it is said, 'Where I will not give you Haninah' (Jer. 16:13)."*
- H. *Others say, "His name is Menahem, son of Hezekiah, for it is written, 'Because Menahem that would relieve my soul, is far' (Lam. 1:16)."*
- I. *Rabbis said, "His name is 'the leper of the school house,' as it is written, 'Surely he has borne our griefs and carried our sorrows, yet we did esteem him a leper, smitten of God and afflicted' (Isa. 53: 4)."*

**I.109** A. *Said R. Nahman, "If he is among the living, he is such as I, as it is said, 'And their nobles shall be of themselves and their governors shall proceed from the midst of them' (Jer. 30:21)."*

- B. *Said Rab, "If he is among the living, he is such as our Holy Rabbi [Judah the Patriarch], and if he is among the dead, he is such as Daniel, the most desirable man."*
- C. *Said R. Judah said Rab, "The Holy One, blessed be he, is destined to raise up for [Israel] another David, as it is said, 'But they shall serve the Lord their God and David their king, whom I will raise up for them' (Jer. 30: 9)."*
- D. *"'Raised up' is not what is said, but rather, 'will raise up.'"*
- E. *Said R. Pappa to Abbaye, "But lo, it is written, 'And my servant David shall be their prince forever' (Eze. 37:25) [with the title for prince standing for less than the title for king]."*
- F. *[He said to him,] "It is like a king and a viceroy [the second David being king]."*

**I.110** A. *R. Simlai interpreted the following verse: "What is the meaning of that which is written, 'Woe to you who desire the day of the Lord! to what end is it for you? the day of the Lord is darkness and not light' (Amo. 5:18)?"*

- B. *"The matter may be compared to the case of the cock and the bat who were waiting for light."*
- C. *"The cock said to the bat, 'I am waiting for the light, for the light belongs to me, but what do you need light for [99A]?"*
- D. *That is in line with what a min said to R. Abbahu, "When is the Messiah coming?"*
- E. *He said to him, "When darkness covers those men."*
- F. *He said to him, "You are cursing me."*
- G. *He said to him, "I am merely citing a verse of Scripture: 'For behold, the darkness shall cover the earth, and great darkness the people, but the Lord shall shine upon you, and his glory shall be seen upon you' (Isa. 60: 2)."*

**I.111** A. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. *R. Eliezer says, "The days of the Messiah will last forty years, as it is said, 'Forty years long shall I take hold of the generation' (Psa. 95:10)."*

- C. R. Eliezer b. Azariah says, "Seventy years, as it is said, 'And it shall come to pass in that day that Tyre shall be forgotten seventy years, according to the days of one king' (Isa. 23:15).
- D. "Now what would be a one [and singular] king? We must say that it is the Messiah."
- E. Rabbi says, "Three generations, as it is said, 'They shall fear you with the sun and before the moon, a generation and generations' (Psa. 72: 5)."

**I.112** A. R. Hillel says, "Israel will have no Messiah, for they consumed him in the time of Hezekiah."

- B. *Said R. Joseph, "May R. Hillel's master forgive him. When did Hezekiah live? It was in the time of the first Temple. But Zechariah prophesied in the second Temple's time and said, 'Rejoice greatly, O daughter of Zion, shout, O daughter of Jerusalem, behold your king comes to you; he is just and has salvation; lowly and riding upon an ass and upon a colt the foal of an ass' (Zec. 9: 9)."*

**I.113** A. *A further teaching on Tannaite authority:*

- B. R. Eliezer says, "The days of the Messiah will last for forty years. Here it is written, 'And he afflicted you and made you hunger and fed you with manna' (Deu. 8: 3), and elsewhere: 'Make us glad according to the days [forty years in the wilderness] in which you have afflicted us' (Psa. 90:15)."
- C. R. Dosa says, "Four hundred years. Here it is written, 'And they shall serve them and they shall afflict them four hundred years' (Gen. 15:13), and elsewhere: 'Make us glad according to the days wherein you have afflicted us' (Psa. 90:15)."
- D. Rabbi says, "Three hundred and sixty-five years, according to the number of days in the solar year, as it is said, 'For the day of vengeance is in my heart and the year of my redemption has come' (Isa. 63: 4)."
- E. *What is the meaning of "the day of vengeance is in my heart" (Isa. 63: 4)?*
- F. Said R. Yohanan, "I have revealed it to my heart, but I have not revealed it to my limbs."
- G. R. Simeon b. Laqish said, "To my heart I have revealed it, to the ministering angels I have not revealed it."
- H. *Abimi, son of R. Abbahu, stated on Tannaite authority, "The days of the Messiah for Israel will be seven thousand years, as it is said, 'And as the bridegroom rejoices over the bride [a week], so shall your God rejoice over you' (Isa. 62: 5)."*
- I. Said R. Judah said Samuel, "The days of the Messiah are the same as the days that have passed from the day of the creation of the world even to now, as it is said, 'As the days of heaven upon earth' (Deu. 11:21)."
- J. R. Nahman bar Isaac said, "As the days from Noah to now, as it is said, 'For this is as the waters of Noah, which are mine, so I have sworn it' (Isa. 54: 9)."

**I.114** A. Said R. Hiyya bar Abba said R. Yohanan, "All of the prophets prophesied only concerning the days of the Messiah.

- B. "But as to the world to come [thereafter]: 'Eye has not seen, O Lord, beside you, what he has prepared for him who waits for him' (Isa. 64: 3)."
- C. *That statement differs from the view of Samuel.*



- D. For said Samuel, “There is no difference between this world and the days of the Messiah except for [Israel’s] subjugation to the rule of the empires alone.”
- E. And said R. Hiyya bar Abba said R. Yohanan, “All of the prophets prophesied only concerning those who repent, but as to the perfectly righteous people [who have never sinned to begin with]: ‘Eye has not seen, O God, beside you, what he has prepared for him who waits for him’ (Isa. 54: 3).”
- F. *That statement differs from the view of R. Abbahu.*
- G. For, said R. Abbahu, “In the place in which those who repent stand, the righteous cannot stand, for it is said, ‘Peace, peace to him who is far off and to him that is near’ (Isa. 57:19).
- H. “‘To begin with, he was ‘far off,’ and then he repented and so became ‘near.’
- I. *“What is the sense of ‘far off’? Originally far off [a sinner], and what is the sense of ‘near’? Originally near and still near. [Freedman, p. 671, n. 3: Thus he assigns a higher rank to the repentant sinner than to the completely righteous.]”*
- J. R. Yohanan said, “‘To the one who was distant’ because he was far from sin, and ‘near’ in that he was near sin but distanced himself from it.”
- K. And said R. Hiyya bar Abba said R. Yohanan, “All of the prophets prophesied only concerning him who marries his daughter off to a disciple of sages, conducts business to the advantage of a disciple of a sage, and benefits a disciple of a sage from his wealth.
- L. “But as to disciples of sages themselves: ‘Eye has not seen, O God beside you’ (Isa. 64: 3).”
- M. *What is the meaning of the phrase, “Eye has not seen”?*
- N. Said R. Joshua b. Levi, “This refers to wine that has been kept in the grapes from the six days of creation.”
- O. R. Simeon b. Laqish said, “This refers to Eden, which no eye has ever seen.
- P. “And if you should say, ‘Then we where did Adam dwell?’ the answer is, in the garden.
- Q. “And if you should say, ‘But it was the Garden that was Eden,’ Scripture says, ‘And a river issued from Eden to water the garden’ (Gen. 2:10).”

## **II.1 A. And he who says, “The Torah does not come from heaven” [M. 11:1D]:**

- B. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
- C. “Because he has despised the word of the Lord and broken his commandment, that soul shall utterly be cut off” (Num. 15:31):
- D. This refers to one who says, **“The Torah does not come from heaven.”**
- E. Another matter:
- F. “Because he has despised the word of the Lord”: This refers to an Epicurean.
- G. Another matter:
- H. “Because he has despised the word of the Lord”: This refers to one who is without shame in interpreting the Torah.

- I. “And broken his commandment”: This refers to one who removes the mark fleshly arks of the covenant.
- J. “That soul shatter utterly be cut off”: “Be cut off” — in this world. “Utterly” in the world to come.
- K. On the basis of this exegesis, said R. Eliezer the Modite, **“He who treats Holy Things as secular, he who despises the appointed times, he who humiliates his companion in public, he who removes the signs of the covenant of Abraham, our father, and he who exposes aspects of the Torah not in accord with the law, even though he has in hand learning in Torah and good deeds, will have no share in the world to come”** [M. [Abot 3:11](#)].
- L. *A further teaching on Tannaite authority:*
- M. “Because he has despised the word of the Lord” (Num. 14:31): This refers to one who says, **“The Torah does not come from heaven.”**
- N. And even if he had said, “The entire Torah comes from heaven, except for this one verse, which the Holy One, blessed be he, did not say, but which Moses said on his own,” such a one falls under the verse, “Because he has despised the word of the Lord” (Num. 15:31).
- O. And even if he had said, “The entire Torah comes from heaven, except for one minor point, an argument a fortiori, an argument based on analogy,” such a one falls under the verse, “Because he has despised the way of the Lord” (Num. 15:31).

## **II.2** A. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. R. Meir would say, “He who studies the Torah but does not teach it falls under the verse, “Because he has despised the word of the Lord” (Num. 15:31).”
- C. R. Nathan says, “Whoever does not pay close attention to the Mishnah.”
- D. R. Nehorai says, “Whoever has the possibility of taking up the study of the Torah and does not do so.”
- E. R. Ishmael says, “This refers to one who worships an idol.”
- F. *What provides the implication that such a one is subject to discussion here?*
- G. *It accords with what the Tannaite authority of the house of R. Ishmael [said], “Because he has despised the word of the Lord’ (Num. 15:31) refers to one who despises the statement that was made to Moses at Sinai: ‘I am the Lord your God. You shall have no other gods before me’ (Exo. 20:2-3).”*

## **II.3** A. R. Joshua b. Qorhah says, **“Whoever studies the Torah and does not review it is like a man who sows seed but does not harvest it.”**

- B. R. Joshua says, **“Whoever learns the Torah and forgets it is like a woman who bears and buries.”**
- C. R. Aqiba says, **“[99B] A song is in me, a song always”** [T. [Ah. 16:8H-I](#)].
- D. *Said R. Isaac b. Abudimi, “What is the pertinent proof-text? As it is said, ‘He who labors labors for himself, for his mouth craves it of him’ (Pro. 16:26).*
- E. *“He labors in one place, and the Torah labors for him in a different place.”*

## **II.4** A. Said R. Eleazar, “Every man was born to work, as it is said, ‘For man is born to work’ (Job. 5: 7).

- B. "I do not know whether it is for work done with the mouth that he is created, or whether it is for labor done through physical work that he was created.
- C. "When Scripture says, 'For his mouth craves it of him' (Pro. 16:26), one has to conclude that it is for work done with the mouth that he was created.
- D. "Yet I still do not know whether it was to labor in the Torah or to labor in some sort of other conversation.
- E. "When Scripture says, 'This book of the Torah shall not depart out of your mouth' (Jos. 1: 8), one must conclude that it is for labor in the Torah that he is created."
- F. *That is in line with what Raba said, "All bodies serve to bear burdens. Happy are those who have the merit of bearing the burden of the Torah."*

**II.5 A.** "Whoever commits adultery with a woman lacks understanding" (Pro. 6:32):

- B. Said R. Simeon b. Laqish, "This refers to one who studies the Torah at occasional intervals.
- C. "For it is said, 'For it is a pleasant thing if you keep them within you, they shall withal be fitted in your lips' (Pro. 22:18). [Freedman, p. 673, n. 11: One can keep the Torah only if its words are fitted always on his lips, not at rare intervals only.]"

**II.6 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. "But the soul that does anything presumptuously" (Num. 15:30):
- C. This refers to Manasseh, son of Hezekiah, who would go into session and interpret tales seeking flaws in them, saying, "Did Moses have nothing better to do than to write such verses as 'And Lotan's sister was Timna' (Gen. 36:22). 'And Timna was concubine to Eliphaz' (Gen. 36:12). 'And Reuben went in the days of the wheat harvest and found mandrakes in the field' (Gen. 30:14)?"
- D. An echo came forth and said to him, "You sit and speak against your brother; you slander your own mother's son. These things you have done, and I kept silence, you thought that I was altogether such a one as yourself, but I will reprove you and set them in order before your eyes" (Psa. 50:20-21)."
- E. Concerning him it is spelled out in tradition: "Woe to them who draw iniquity with cords of vanity and sin as it were with a cart rope" (Isa. 5:18).
- F. *What is the sense of "and sin as it were with a cart rope"?*
- G. Said R. Assi, "The inclination to do evil to begin with is like a spider's thread and ends up like a cart do rope."
- H. *In any event, what is the meaning of, "And Lotan's sister was Timna" (Gen. 36:22)?*
- I. She was a princess, as it is written, "Duke Lotan, Duke Timna," and "duke" refers to a kid who has not yet got his crown.
- J. *She had wanted to convert to Judaism.* She came to Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob, and they did not accept her. She went and became the concubine to Eliphaz, son of Esau, saying, "It is better to be a handmaiden to this nation and not a noble woman to any other nation."
- K. *From her descended Amalak, who distressed Israel.*
- L. *What is the reason? It was because they should not have put her off [but should have accepted her].*

- M. “And Reuben went in the days of the wheat harvest [and found mandrakes in the field]” (Gen. 36:12)”
- N. Said Raba, son of R. Isaac, said Rab, “On the basis of this verse, we learn that righteous folk do not lay hands on what is stolen.”
- O. “And found mandrakes in the field” (Gen. 36:12):
  - P. *What are these?*
  - Q. Said Rab, “Mandrakes.”
  - R. Said Levi, “Violets.”
  - S. Said R. Jonathan, “Mandrake flowers.”

**II.7** A. Said R. Alexandri, “Whoever is occupied in study of the Torah for the sake of heaven brings peace to the family above and to the family below,

- B. “as it is said, ‘Or let him take hold of my strength that he may make peace with me, and he shall may make peace with me’ (Isa. 27: 5).”
- C. Rab said, “It is as if he built the palace above and the one below, as it is said, ‘And I have put my words in your mouth and I have covered you in the shadow of my hand, that I may plant the heavens and lay the foundations of the earth, and say to Zion, You are my people’ (Isa. 51:16).”
- D. R. Yohanan said, “Also he shields the world, as it is said, ‘And I have covered you in the shadow of my hand’ (Isa. 51:16).”
- E. Levi said, “Also he draws the redemption nearer, as it is said, ‘And say to Zion, you are my people’ (Isa. 51:16).”

**II.8** A. Said R. Simeon b. Laqish, “Whoever teaches Torah to the son of his neighbor is credited by Scripture as if he had made him,

- B. “as it is said, ‘And the souls which they had made in Haran’ I (Gen. 12: 5).”
- C. R. Eleazar said, “It is as though he had made the words of Torah, as it is said, ‘Therefore keep the words of this covenant and make them’ (Deu. 29: 9).”
- D. Raba said, “It is as though he had made himself, as it is said — ‘And make them’ (Deu. 29: 9).
- E. “Do not read ‘them’ but ‘yourselves.’”

**II.9** A. Said R. Abbahu, “Whoever makes his neighbor carry out a religious duty is credited by Scripture as if he himself had done it, as it is said, ‘The Lord said to Moses, Take...your rod, with which you hit the river’ (Exo. 17: 5).

- B. “But did Moses hit the river? It was Aaron who hit the river.
- C. “Rather, this shows, whoever makes his neighbor carry out a religious duty is credited by Scripture as if he himself had done it.”

**III.1** A. ...an Epicurean [M. 11:1D]:

- B. *Both Rab and R. Hanina say*, “This refers to one who humiliates disciples of sages.”
- C. *Both R. Yohanan and R. Joshua b. Levi say*, “It is one who humiliates his fellow before a disciple of a sage.”
- D. *Now from the viewpoint of him who says* it is one who humiliates his fellow before a sage, it would also encompass a disciple of a sage himself, who **exposes aspects**

**of the Torah not in accord with the law [M. Abot 3:11]** [acts impudently against the Torah (Freedman)].

- E. *But in the view of him who says that an Epicurean is one who humiliates a disciple of a sage himself, then at sort of person would fall into the category of one who exposes aspects of the Torah not in accord with the law [M. Abot 3:11]?*
- F. It would be someone of the sort of Manasseh b. Hezekiah.
- G. *There are those who repeat on Tannaite authority the dispute at hand in conjunction with the latter, rather than the former category, as follows:*
- H. **One who exposes aspects of the Torah [not in accord with the law] [M. Abot 3:11]:**
- I. *Rab and R. Hanina say, "It is one who humiliates a disciple of sages."*
- J. *R. Yohanan and R. Joshua b. Levi say, "It is one who humiliates his fellow before a disciple of a sage."*
- K. *Now from the viewpoint of him who says it is one who humiliates a disciple of a sage himself, then one who reveals aspects of the Torah, one who humiliates his fellow before a disciple of a sage, would be an Epicurean.*
- L. *But from the viewpoint of him who says that it is one who humiliates his fellow before a disciple of a sage, with one who reveals aspects of the Torah [in an improper way] as an Epicurean, then who would fall into that latter category?*
- M. *Said R. Joseph, "It would, for example, be those who say, 'What good are the rabbis for us? It is for their own benefit that they study Scripture. It is for their own benefit that they repeat Mishnah-teachings.'"*
- N. *Said Abbaye to him, "That too falls into the category of one who reveals aspects of the Torah in an improper way, for it is written, 'Thus says the Lord, But for my covenant [studied] day and night, I had not appointed the ordinances of heaven and earth' (Jer. 33:25). [Freedman, p. 676, n. 3: The world endures only because the Torah — 'my covenant' — is studied. To deny the utility of scholars therefore is to express disbelief of what is asserted in the Torah.]"*
- O. *Said R. Nahman bar Isaac, "The proof derives as well from the following, as it is said, 'Then I will spare all the place for their sakes' (Gen. 18:26)."*
- P. *Rather, it is one who for example was sitting before his master, and the topic of discussion moved to another subject, and he said, "This is what we said on the subject," rather than, "Master, you have said [on that topic]."*
- Q. *Raba said, "It would, for example, be like the members of the house of Benjamin, the physician, who say, 'What good are rabbis to us. They have never [100A] permitted us to eat a raven or forbidden us to eat a dove [but are limited to what the Torah itself states]."*
- R. *When people of the house of Benjamin brought Raba a problem involving the validity of a beast that had been slaughtered and that may or may not have been able to survive, if he found a reason to permit the matter, he would say to them, "See, I do permit the raven to you."*
- S. *When he found a reason to prohibit it, he would say to them, "See, I do forbid the dove to you."*
- T. *R. Pappa said, "It would be such as one who said, 'O, these rabbis!'"*

U. *R. Pappa forgot himself and said, "O these rabbis!" He sat and fasted.*

**III.2** A. *Levi bar Samuel and R. Huna bar Hiyya were fixing the mantles of the Torah scrolls of the house of R. Judah. When they got to the scroll of Esther, they said, "Lo, this scroll of Esther does not have to have a mantle at all."*

B. *He said to them, "This sort of talk also appears to be Epicureanism."*

**III.3** A. *R. Nahman said, "It is one who refers to his master by his name."*

B. *For R. Yohanan said, "On what account was Gehazi punished because he called his master by name.*

C. *"as it is said, 'My lord, O King, this is the woman, and this is her son whom Elisha restored to life' (2Ki. 8: 5)."*

**III.4** A. *R. Jeremiah was in session before R. Zira and said, "The Holy One, blessed be he, by which there will be many kinds of delicious produce, as it is said, 'And by the river upon that bank thereof, on this side and on that side, shall grow all trees for meat, whose leaf shall not fade, neither shall the fruit thereof be consumed; it shall bring forth new fruit, according to his months, because their waters they issued out of the sanctuary, and the fruit therefore shall be for meat, and the leaf thereof for medicine' (Eze. 47:12)."*

B. *"Said to him a certain old man, 'Well said, and so did R. Yohanan say.'"*

C. *Said R. Jeremiah to R. Zira, "Behavior of this sort [condescension to the master] likewise appears to be Epicureanism."*

D. *He said to him, "But this represented a mere support for your position.*

E. *"But if you have heard any tradition, this is the tradition that you heard:*

F. *"R. Yohanan was in session and interpreting Scripture as follows: 'The Holy One, blessed be he, is destined to bring forth precious stones and jewels which are thirty cubits long and thirty cubits high, and engrave on them an engraving ten by twenty cubits, and he will set them up as the gates of Jerusalem, for it is written, "And I will make your windows of agates and your gates of carbuncles" (Isa. 54:12).'*

G. *"A disciple ridiculed him, saying "Now if we do not find jewels the size of a dove's egg, are we going to find any that big?"*

H. *"After some time he took a sea voyage, and he saw ministering angels cutting precious stones and jewels. He said to them, "As to these, what are they for?"*

I. *"They said to him, "The Holy One, blessed be he, is destined to set them up as the gates of Jerusalem."*

J. *"When he came back, he found R. Yohanan in session and expounding Scripture. He said to him, "Rabbi, indeed give your exposition, for it is appropriate that you should expound Scripture. Exactly as you said, so I myself saw."*

K. *"He said to him, "Empty head! Had you not seen, would you not have believed me! You are one who ridicules teachings of sages." He set his eye on him and turned him into a hill of bones."*

L. *An objection was raised [to the teaching of Yohanan]"*

M. *"And I will make you go upright (Lev. 26:13).*

N. *R. Meir says, "It is the height of two hundred cubits, twice the height of Adam."*



- O. R. Judah says, "A hundred cubits, the length of the Temple and its walls, as it is written, 'That our sons may be as plants grown up in their youth, that our daughters may be as corner stones, fashioned after the similitude of the Temple' (Psa. 144:12)."
- P. *What R. Yohanan meant was [Freedman]: the ventilation — windows.* [These would be ten by twenty, but the gates themselves would be much taller (Freedman, p. 678, n. 7)].
- Q. *What is the meaning of the phrase, "And the leaf thereof is for medicine" (Eze. 47:12)?"*
- R. R. Isaac bar. Abodimi and R. Hisda: one said, "It is to open up the upper mouth [and help the dumb to speak]."
- S. One said, "It is to open the lower mouth [and heal the barrenness of a barren woman]."
- T. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*
- U. Hezekiah said, "It is to open the mouth of the dumb."
- V. Bar Qappara said, "It is to open the mouth of the barren women."
- W. R. Yohanan said, "It serves as medicine, literally."
- X. *What is the meaning of the statement, "Medicine"?*
- Y. R. Ramual bar Nahmani said, "It is to improve the appearance of masters of mouths [disciples]."

- III.5** A. R. Judah b. R. Simon interpreted, "Whoever blackens his face [in fasting] on account of teachings of Torah in this world will find that the Holy One, blessed be he, polishes his luster in the world to come.
- B. "For it is said, 'His countenance shall be as the Lebanon, excellent as the cedars' (Son. 5:15)."
  - C. R. Tanhum bar Hanilai said, "Whoever starves himself for words of Torah in his world will the Holy One, blessed be he, feed to satisfaction in the world to come,
  - D. "as it is said, 'They shall be abundantly satisfied with the fatness of your house, and you shall make them drink of the river of your pleasures' (Psa. 36: 9)."
  - E. When R. Dimi came, he said, "The Holy One, blessed be he, is destined to give to every righteous person his full pack-load, as it is said, 'Blessed be the Lord, day by day, who loads us with benefits, even the God of our salvation, Selah' (Psa. 68:20)."
  - F. Said Abbaye to him, "And is it possible to say so? Is it not said, 'Who has measured the waters in the hollow of his hand and measured out heaven with the span' (Isa. 40:12)?"
  - G. *He said to him, "What is the reason that you are not at home in matters of lore. They say in the West in the name of Raba bar Mari, 'The Holy One, blessed be he, is destined to give each righteous person three hundred and ten worlds, as it is said, "That I may cause those who love me to inherit substance and I will fill their treasures," (Pro. 8:21), and the numerical value of the word for substance is three hundred ten."*

**III.6** A. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. **R. Meir says, “By the same measure by which a mate metes out, do they mete out to him [M. Sot. 1:7A],**
- C. “For it is written, By measure in sending her away thou dost contend with her’ (Isa. 27: 8).
- D. Said R. Judah, “And can one say so? If a person gives a handful [to charity] to a poor man in this world, will the Holy One, blessed be he, give him a handful [of his, so much larger hand], in the world to come?
- E. “And has it not been written, ‘And meted out heaven with a span’ (Isa. 40:12)?”
- F. [Meir replied] “But do you not say so? Which measure is greater? That of goodness or that of punishment?
- G. **[100B]** “One must say, it is the measure of goodness that is greater than the measure of punishment. For with regard to the measure of goodness it is written, ‘And he commanded the clouds from above, and opened the doors of heaven and rained down manna upon them to eat’ (Psa. 78:23-24).
- H. “With regard to the measure of punishment it is written, ‘And the windows of heaven were opened’ (Gen. 7:11) [Freedman, p. 680, n. 5: ‘Doors’ implies a greater opening than windows; God metes out reward more fully than punishment.]
- I. “In respect to the measure even of punishment it is written, ‘And they shall go forth and look upon the carcasses of the men who have transgressed against me, for their worm shall not die, neither shall their fire be quenched, and they shall be a horror to all flesh’ (Isa. 66:24).
- J. “But is it not so that if a person put his finger into a fire in this world, he will be burned right away.
- K. “But just as the Holy One, blessed be he, gives the wicked the power to receive their punishment, so the Holy One, blessed be he, gives the righteous the power to receive the goodness that is coming to them.”

**IV.1 A. R. Aqiba says, “Also: He who reads in heretical books...” [M. 11:1E]:**

- B. *It was taught on Tannaite authority:* That is the books of the minim.

**IV.2 A. R. Joseph said, “It is also forbidden to read in the book of Ben Sira.”**

- B. *Said to him Abbaye, “What is the reason for that view? Should I say that it is because it is written in it, ‘Do not skin the fish, even from the ear, so that you will not go and bruise it, but roast it in the fire and eat two loaves with it’? In point of fact in the explicit view of Scripture it is also said, ‘You shall not destroy the trees thereof’ (Deu. 20:19). [Freedman, p. 681, ns. 1-2: A fish is fit for consumption even if baked or roasted with its skin and therefore it is wasteful to remove it. Likewise, one must not wantonly destroy what is fit for use]. And if it is a matter of exegesis [and not the literal sense], then the saying teaches us proper conduct, namely, that one should not have sexual relations in an unnatural way. Rather, might it be because it is written in it, ‘A daughter is a worthless treasure for her father. For concern for her, he cannot sleep by night. In her childhood, it is lest she be seduced; in her girlhood, it is lest she play the whore; in her maturity, it is lest she not wed; once she is wed, it is lest she not have sons. In her old age it is lest she practice witchcraft’? But rabbis have also made the same statement: ‘The world cannot exist without males and without females. Happy is he whose*



children are males, and woe is him whose children are females.’ *Rather, might it be because it is written in [Ben Sira]: ‘Do not admit despair into your heart, for despair has killed many men’? Lo, Solomon made the same statement; ‘Anxiety in the heart of man makes him stoop’ (Pro. 12:25).’’*

C. R. Ammi and R. Assi: One said, “Let him banish it from his mind.”

D. “The other said, “Let him tell it to others.”

E. *[Reverting to Abbaye’s inquiry:] “Rather, might it be because it is written in [Ben Sira]: ‘Keep large numbers of people away from your house, and do not let just anyone into your house’? Lo, Rabbi also made that statement. For it has been taught on Tannaite authority: Rabbi says, ‘A person should never admit a great many friends into his house, as it is said, “A man who has many friends brings evil upon himself” (Pro. 18:24).’ Rather, it is because it is written in it: ‘A man with a thin beard is wise, a man with a thick beard is a fool; one who blows forth his beard is not thirsty. One who says, “What is there to eat with my bread” — take the bread away from him. [He too is not hungry.] He who parts his beard will overpower the world [being very clever.]’ [This foolish statement, in point of fact, forms the basis for Joseph’s judgment.]”*

J. *Said R. Joseph, “But the excellent statements in the book [of Ben Sira] we do expound, [such as the following]:*

K. “A good woman is a good gift, who will be put into the bosom of a God-fearing man. A bad woman is a plague for her husband. *What is his remedy?* Let him drive her from his house and be healed from what is plaguing him.

L. “A lovely wife — happy is her husband. The number of his days is doubled.

M. “Keep your eyes from a woman of charm, lest you be taken in her trap. Do not turn to her husband to drink wine with him, or strong drink, for through the looks of a beautiful woman many have been slain, and numerous are those who have been slain by her.

N. “Many are the blows with which a peddler is smitten [for dealing with women]. Those who make it a habit of committing fornication are like a spark that lights the ember. As a cage is full of birds, so are their houses full of deceit” (Jer. 5:27).

O. “Keep large numbers of people away from your house, and do not let just anybody into your house.

P. “Let many people ask how you are, but reveal your secret to one out of a thousand. From her who lies in your house keep protected the opening of your mouth.

Q. “Do not worry about tomorrow’s sorrow,’ “For you do not know what a day may bring forth” (Pro. 27: 1). Perhaps tomorrow you will no longer exist and it will turn out that you will worry about a world that is not yours.

R. “All the days of the poor are evil” (Pro. 15:15). Ben Sira said, “So too his nights. His roof is the lowest in town, his vineyard on the topmost

mountain. Rain flows from other roofs onto his and from his vineyard onto other vineyards.”

- IV.3 A.** *Said R. Zira said Rab, “What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture, ‘All the days of the afflicted are evil’ (Pro. 15:15)?*
- B. “This refers to masters of Talmud.
- C. “‘But he that is of a good heart has a continuous banquet’ (Pro. 15:15)? This refers to masters of the Mishnah.”
- D. *Raba said, “Matters are just the opposite.”*
- E. *And that is in line with what R. Mesharshayya said in the name of Raba, “What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture: ‘Whoever removes stones shall be hurt with them’ (Qoh. 10: 9)?*
- F. “This refers to masters of the Mishnah.
- G. “‘But he who cleaves wood shall be warmed by it’ (Qoh. 10: 9)?
- H. “This refers to masters of Talmud.”
- I. R. Hanina says, “‘All of the days of the afflicted are evil’ (Pro. 15:15) refers to a man who has a bad wife.
- J. “‘But he that is of a good heart has a continuous banquet’ (Pro. 15:15) refers to a man who has a good wife.
- K. R. Yannai says, “‘All the days of the afflicted are evil’ (Pro. 15:15) refers to one who is fastidious.
- L. “‘But he that is of a good heart has a continuous banquet (Pro. 15:15) refers to one who is easy to please.”
- M. R. Yohanan said, “‘All the days of the afflicted are evil’ (Pro. 15:15) refers to a merciful person.
- N. “‘But he that is of a good heart has a continuous banquet’ (Pro. 15:15) refers to someone who is cruel by nature [so nothing bothers him].”
- O. R. Joshua b. Levi said, “‘All the days of the afflicted are evil’ (Pro. 15:15) refers to **[101A]** someone who is worrisome.
- P. “‘But he that is of a good heart has a continuous banquet’ (Pro. 15:15) refers to one who is serene.”
- Q. R. Joshua b. Levi said, “‘All the days of the afflicted are evil’ (Pro. 15: 1) — *but [not] there are Sabbaths and festival days [on which the afflicted gets some pleasure]?*”
- R. *The matter accords with what Samuel said. For Samuel said, “The change in diet [for festival meals] is the beginning of stomach ache.”*

**IV.4 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. **He who recites a verse of the Song of Songs and turns it into a kind of love-song, and he who recites a verse in a banquet hall not at the proper time [but in a time of carousal] bring evil into the world [cf. T. San. 12:10A].**
- C. For the Torah puts on sack cloth and stands before the Holy One, blessed be he, and says before him, “Lord of the world, your children have treated me like a harp which scoffers play.”

- D. He then says to her, “My daughter, when they eat and drink, what should keep them busy?”
- E. She will say to him, “Lord of the world, if they are masters of Scripture, let them keep busy with the Torah, prophets, and writings; if they are masters of the Mishnah, let them keep busy with the Mishnah, law and lore; and if they are masters of the Talmud, let them keep busy on Passover with the laws of the Passover, with the laws of Pentecost on Pentecost, and with the laws of the Festival [of Tabernacles] on the Festival.”
- F. R. Simeon b. Eleazar gave testimony in the name of R. Simeon b. Hanania, “Whoever recites a verse of Scripture at the proper time brings good to the world, as it is said, ‘And a word spoken in season, how good is it’ (Pro. 15:23).”

**V.1 A. And he who whispers over a wound [M. 1:1F]:**

- B. Said R. Yohanan, “That is the rule if one spits over the wound, for people may not make mention of the Name of heaven over spit.”

**V.2 A. *It has been stated on Amoraic authority:***

- B. Rab said, “Even ‘When the plague of leprosy’ (Lev. 1: 1) [may not be recited].”

**V.3 A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:***

- B. People may anoint and massage the intestines on the Sabbath, and whisper to snakes and scorpions on the Sabbath, and place utensils on the eyes on the Sabbath.
- C. Said Rabban Simeon b. Gamaliel, “Under what circumstances? In the case of a utensil that may be carried [on the Sabbath], but in the case of a utensil that may not be carried, it is forbidden.”
- D. And a question may not be addressed on a matter having to do with demons on the Sabbath.
- E. R. Yosé says, “Even on a weekday it is forbidden to do so.
- F. Said R. Huna, “The decided law accords with the view of R. Yosé.
- G. And R. Yosé made that statement only on account of the danger involving in doing so.
- H. *This is illustrated by the case of R. Isaac bar Joseph, who got stuck in a cedar tree, and a miracle was done for him, so that the cedar tree split open and spit him out* [Freedman, p. 685, n. 5: He consulted a demon, which turned itself into a tree and swallowed him; it was only through a miracle that he escaped.]

**V.4 A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:***

- B. People may anoint and massage the intestines on the Sabbath, so long as one not do so as he does on a weekday.
  - C. *How then should one do it?*
  - D. R. Hama, son of R. Hanini, said, “One puts on some oil and then massages.”
  - E. R. Yohanan said, “One puts on oil and massages simultaneously.”

**V.5 A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:***

- B. As to the spirits of oil or eggs, it is permitted to address questions to them, except that they prove unreliable.

- C. People whisper over oil that is in a utensil but not over oil that is held in the hand.
- D. Therefore people apply oil by hand and not out of a utensil.

**V.6 A.** *R. Isaac bar Samuel bar Marta happened to stay at a certain inn. They brought him oil in a utensil, and he anointed himself. He broke out in blisters all over his face. He went to a market place, and a certain woman saw him and said to him, "The blast of Hamath do I see here."*

*B. She did something for him, and he was healed.*

**V.7 A.** Said R. Abba to Rabba bar Mari, "It is written, 'I will put none of these diseases upon you, which I have brought upon the Egyptians, for I am the Lord who heals you' (Exo. 15:26)."

*B. "But if he does not place those diseases, what need is there for healing anyhow?"*

*C. He said to him, "This is what R. Yohanan said, 'This verse of Scripture provides its own interpretation, since it is said, "And he said, If you will diligently obey the voice of the Lord your God" (Exo. 15:16). "If you obey, I shall not place those diseases upon you, and if you will not obey, I will do so."*

*D. "Yet even so: "I am the Lord who heals you"(Exo. 15:26)."*

**V.8 A.** Said Rabbah bar bar Hanah, "When R. Eliezer fell ill, his disciples came in to call on him.

*B. "He said to them, 'There is great anger in the world [to account for my sickness].'*

*C. "They began to cry, but R. Aqiba began to laugh. They said to him, 'Why are you laughing?"*

*D. "He said to them, 'Why are you crying?"*

*E. "They said to him, 'Is it possible that, when a scroll of the Torah [such as Eliezer] is afflicted with disease, we should not cry?"*

*F. "He said to them, 'For that reason I am laughing. So long as I observed that, as to my master, his wine did not turn to vinegar, his flux was not smitten, his oil did not putrefy, and his honey did not become rancid,*

*G. "I thought to myself, 'Perhaps, God forbid, my master has received his reward in this world.'" But now that I see my master in distress, I rejoice [knowing that he will receive his full reward in the world to come.]'*

*H. "[Eliezer] said to him, 'Aqiba, have I left out anything at all from the whole of the Torah?"*

*I. "He said to him, '[Indeed so, for] you have taught us, our master, "For there is not a just man upon earth, who does good and does not sin" (Qoh. 7:20)."*

**V.9 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

*B. When R. Eliezer fell ill, four elders came to call on him: R. Tarfon, R. Joshua, R. Eleazar b. Azariah, and R. Aqiba.*

*C. R. Tarfon responded first and said, "You are better for Israel than a drop of rain, for a drop of rain is good for this world, but my master is good for this world and the world to come."*

*D. R. Joshua responded and said, "You are better for Israel than the orb of the sun, for the orb of the sun serves for this world, but my master serves for this world and the world to come."*

- E. R. Eleazar b. Azariah responded and said, "You are better for Israel than a father and a mother, for a father and a mother are for this world, but my master is for this world and the world to come."
- F. R. Aqiba responded and said, "Suffering is precious."
- G. He said to them, "Prop me up so that I may hear the statement of Aqiba, my disciple, who has said, 'Suffering is precious.'"
- H. He said to him, "Aqiba, how do you know?"
- I. He said to him, "I interpret a verse of Scripture: 'Manasseh was twelve years old when he began to reign, and he reigned fifty five years in Jerusalem...and he did what was evil in the sight of the Lord' (2Ki. 21:1-2).
- J. "And it is written **[101B]**, 'These are the proverbs of Solomon, which the men of Hezekiah, king of Judah, copied out' (Pro. 25: 1).
- K. "Now is it possible that Hezekiah, king of Judah, taught the Torah to the entire world, but to his son, Manasseh, he did not teach the Torah? [Obviously not!]
- L. "But out of all the trouble that [his father] took with him, and with all the labor that he poured into him, nothing brought him back to the good way except for suffering.
- M. "For it is said, 'And the Lord spoke to Manasseh and to his people, but they would not hearken to him. Therefore the Lord brought upon them the captains of the host of the king of Assyria, who took Manasseh among the thorns and bound him with chains and carried him to Babylonia' (2Ch. 33:10-11).
- N. "And it is written, 'And when he was in affliction, he sought the Lord his God and humbled himself greatly before the God of his fathers. And he prayed to him and he was entreated of him and heard his supplication and brought him again to Jerusalem to his kingdom, and Manasseh knew that the Lord is God' (2Ch. 33:12-13).
- O. "So you learn that suffering is precious."

**V.10 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. Three came with a self-serving plea, and these are they: Cain, Esau, and Manasseh.
- C. Cain, as it is written, "Is my sin too great to be forgiven?" (Gen. 4:13).
- D. He said before him, "Lord of the world, Is my sin any greater than that of the six hundred thousand who are destined to sin before you? And yet you will forgive them!"
- E. Esau, as it is written, "Have you but one blessing, my father" (Gen. 27:38).
- F. Manasseh: To begin with he called upon many gods and in the end he called upon the God of his fathers.

**VI.1 A.** **Abba Saul says, "Also: he who pronounces the divine Name as it is spelled out" [M. 11:1G].:**

- B. *On Tannaite authority [it was stated]:*
- C. That is the rule in the provinces, and [when it is] in blasphemous language.

**VII.1 A.** **Three kings and four ordinary folk [have no portion in the world to come. Three kings: Jeroboam, Ahab, and Manasseh] [M. 11:2A-B]:**

- B. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
- C. “Jerobam”: for he treated the people as his sexual object.
- D. Another matter: “Jeroboam: “for he made strife in the people.
- E. Another matter: “Jeroboam: “for he brought strife between the people of Israel and their father in heaven.
- F. Son of Nebat, a son who saw [a vision] but did not see [its meaning].

**VII.2 A.** *On Tannaite [authority it was stated]:*

- B. Nebat is the same as Micah and Sheba son of Bichri.
- C. Nebat: Because he saw a vision but did not see [its meaning].
- D. Micah: because he was [Freedman]: crushed in the building. [Freedman, pp. 688-689, n. 11: According to legend, when the Israelites in Egypt did not complete their tale of bricks, their children were built into the walls instead. On Moses’ complaining thereof to God, He answered him that He was thus weeding out the destined wicked. As proof, he was empowered to save Micah, who had already been built it, but only to become an idolator on his reaching manhood. Rashi also gives an alternative rendering: he became impoverished through building — presumably his idolatrous shrine.]
- E. But what was his real name? It was Sheba, son of Bichri.

**VII.3 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. There were three who saw [a vision] but did not see [its meaning], and these are they: Nabat, Ahitophel, and Pharaoh’s astrologers.
- C. Nabat saw fire coming forth from his penis. *He thought that [it meant that] he would rule, but that was not the case. It was that Jeroboam would come forth from him [who would rule].*
- D. Ahitophel saw saraat spread over him and over his penis. *He thought that it meant that he would be king, and that was not the case. It was Sheba, his daughter, from whom Solomon would come forth from him.*
- E. The astrologers of Pharaoh: *In line with what R. Hama, son of R. Hanina, said, “What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture, ‘These are the waters of rebellion, because they strove’ (Num. 20:13)?*
- F. “These are the waters which the astrologers of Pharaoh foresaw, and about which they erred.
- G. “They saw that the savior of Israel would be smitten because of water. So [Pharaoh] decreed, ‘Every son that is born you shall cast into the river’ (Exo. 1:22).
- H. “But they did not know that it was on account of the water of rebellion that he would be smitten:

**VII.4 A.** *And how do we know that [Jeroboam] will not come into the world to come?*

- B. As it is written, “And this thing became sin to the house of Jeroboam, even to cut it off and to destroy it from off the face of the earth” (1Ki. 13:34).
- C. “To cut it off” in this world.
- D. “And to destroy it” in the world to come.

**VII.5A.** Said R. Yohanan, “On what account did Jeroboam have the merit to rule?

- B. Because he reproved Solomon.
- C. “And on what account was he punished?”
- D. “Because he reproved him publicly.
- E. “So it is said, ‘And this was the cause that he lifted up his hand against the king: Solomon built Millo and repaired the breaches of the city of David his father’ (1Ki. 11:27).
- F. “He said to him, ‘David your father made breaches in the wall so that the Israelites might come up for the pilgrim-festivals, but you have filled them in so as to collect a tax for the daughter of Pharaoh.’”
- G. *And what is the meaning of the phrase, “That he lifted up his hand against the king” (1Ki. 11:27)?*
- H. Said R. Nahman, “Because he took off his phylacteries in his presence.”

**VII.6** A. Said R. Nahman, “The arrogance that characterized Jeroboam is what drove him out of the world.

- B. “For it is said, ‘Now Jeroboam said in his heart, Now shall the kingdom return to the house of David. If this people go up to sacrifice in the house of the Lord at Jerusalem, then shall the heart of this people turn to their Lord, even to Rehoboam, king of Judah, and they shall kill me and go again to Rehoboam, king of Judah’ (1Ki. 12:27-26).
- C. *“He said, ‘We have a tradition that no one may sit down in the Temple courtyard except kings of the house of Judah alone. When the people see that Rehoboam is sitting down and I am standing, they will think that he is king, and I am merely a servant.*
- D. *“But if I sit down, I shall be in the position of rebelling against the monarchy, and they will kill me and follow.’*
- E. “Forthwith: ‘Wherefore the king took counsel and made two calves of gold and said to them, It is too much for you to go up to Jerusalem. Behold your gods O Israel, who brought you up out of the land of Egypt, and he put one in Beth El and the other he put in Dan’ (1Ki. 12:28).”
- F. *What is the meaning of the phrase, “The king took counsel”?*
- G. Said R. Judah, “That he sat a wicked person next to a righteous person. *He said to them, ‘Will you sign everything that I do.’*
- H. *“They said to him, ‘Yes.’*
- I. *“He said to them, ‘I want to be king.’*
- J. *“They said to him, ‘Yes.’*
- K. *“He said to them, ‘Will you do whatever I say?’*
- L. *“They said to him, ‘Yes.’”*
- M. *“Even to worship an idol.’*
- N. “The righteous one said to him, ‘God forbid.’
- O. *“The wicked one said to the righteous one, ‘Do you think that a person such as Jeroboam would really worship an idol? Rather, what he wants to do is to test us to see whether or not we shall accept his word.’”*
- P. **[102A]** “Even Ahijah the Shilonite made a mistake and signed, for Jehu was a very righteous man, as it is said, And the Lord said to Jehu, Because



you have done well in executing what is right in my eyes and have done to the house of Ahab according to all that was in my heart, your children of the fourth generation shall sit upon the throne of Israel' (2Ki. 10:30).

Q. "But it is written, 'But Jehu took no heed to walk in the law of the Lord God of Israel with all his heart, for he did not depart from the sins of Jeroboam, which he had made Israel to sin' (2Ki. 10:31)."

R. *What caused it?*

S. Said Abbaye, "A covenant made orally, as it is said, 'And Jehu gathered all the people together and said to them, Ahab served Baal a little, but Jehu shall serve him much' (2Ki. 10:18). [Freedman, p. 691, n. 5: These words, though spoken guilefully, had to be fulfilled.]"

T. Raba said, "He saw the signature of Ahijah the Shilonite, and he erred on that account."

**VII.7** A. It is written, "And the revolvers are profound to make slaughter, though I have been a rebuke of all of them" (Hos. 5: 2):

B. Said R. Yohanan, "Said the Holy One, blessed be he, 'They have gone deeper than I did. I said, "Whoever does not go up to Jerusalem for the Festival transgresses an affirmative requirement," but they have said, "Whoever does go up to Jerusalem for the festival will be stabbed with a sword."'"

**VII.8** A. "And it came to pass at that time, when Jeroboam went out of Jerusalem, that the prophet Ahijah the Shilonite found him in the way, and he had clad himself with a new garment" (1Ki. 11:20):

B. *It was taught on Tannaite authority in the name of R. Yose,* "It was a time designated for punishment. [Freedman, p. 691, n. 9: On that occasion Ahijah prophesied the division of the kingdom as a punishment for Solomon's backsliding.]"

C. "In the time of their visitation they shall perish" (Jer. 51:18):

D. *It was taught on Tannaite authority in the name of R. Yose,* "A time designated for punishment."

E. "In an acceptable time I have heard you" (Isa. 49: 8):

F. *It was taught on Tannaite authority in the name of R. Yose,* "A time designated for good."

G. "Nevertheless in the day when I visit, I will visit their sin upon them: (Exo. 32:34):

H. *It was taught on Tannaite authority in the name of R. Yose,* "A time designated for punishment."

I. "And it came to pass at that time, that Judah went down from his brethren" (Gen. 38: 1):

J. *It was taught on Tannaite authority in the name of R. Yose,* "A time designated for punishment."

K. "And Rehoboam went to Shechem, for all Israel were come to Shechem to make him king" (1Ki. 12: 1)"

- L. *It was taught on Tannaite authority in the name of R. Yosé, "A time designated for punishment. In Shechem men raped Dinah, in Shechem his brothers sold Joseph, in Shechem the kingdom of David was divided."*
- VII.9** A. "Now it came to pass at that time that Jeroboam went out of Jerusalem" (1Ki. 11:29)"
- B. Said R. Hanina bar Pappa, "He went out of the realm of Jerusalem."
- VII.10** A. "And the prophet Ahijah the Shilonite found him in the way, and he clad himself with a new garment, and the two were alone in the field" (1Ki. 11:29):
- B. *What is this "new garment"?*
- C. said R. Nahman, "It was as with a new garment: just as a new garment has no sort of blemish, so the Torah-learning of Jeroboam had no sort of flaw."
- D. Another matter: "A new garment:"
- E. It was that they said things so new that no ear had ever heard them.
- F. "And the two were alone in the field" (1Ki. 11:29): What is the meaning of this statement?
- G. Said R. Judah said Rab, "It is that all the disciples of sages were as grass of the field before them [and of no account]."
- H. *And there is he who says, "It is that the reasons for the rulings of the Torah were revealed to them in the open as in a field."*
- VII.11** A. "Therefore shall you give parting gifts to Moresheth-gath, the houses of Achzib shall be a lie to the kings of Israel" (Mic. 1:14):
- B. Said R. Hanina bar Pappa, "An echo came forth and said to them, 'He who killed the Philistine and gave you possession of Gath — to his sons you will give parting gifts.'"
- C. "Therefore the houses of Achzib shall be a lie to the kings of Israel" (Mic. 1:14) [Freedman, p. 693, n. 2: "Since you deal treacherously with the house of David, preferring the rule of the kings of Israel, therefore you shall be delivered into the hands of the heathen, whose religion is false."]
- VII.12** A. Said R. Hinnena bar Pappa, "Whoever derives benefit from this world without reciting a blessing is as if he steals from the Holy One, blessed be he, and the community of Israel.
- B. "For it is said, 'Who robs from his father or his mother and says, It is no transgression, is the companion of a destroyer' (Pro. 28:24).
- C. "'His father' is only the Holy One, blessed be he, as it is said, 'Is not [God] your father, who has bought you' (Deu. 32: 6), and 'his mother' can mean only the congregation of Israel, as it is said, 'My son, hear the instruction of your father and do not forsake the Torah of your mother' (Pro. 1: 8)."
- D. *"What is the sense of He is the companion of a destroyer (Pro. 28:24)?*
- E. "He is companion of Jeroboam, son of Nebat, who destroyed Israel for their father in heaven."
- VII.13** A. "And Jeroboam drove Israel from following the Lord and made them sin a great sin" (2Ki. 17:21)"
- B. Said R. Hanin, "It was like two sticks that rebound from one another."

**VII.14 A.** “[These are the words which Moses spoke to all Israel in the wilderness] and Di Zahab” (Deu. 1: 1):

- B. Said a member of the house of R. Yannai, “Moses said before the Holy One, blessed be he, ‘Lord of the world, on account of the silver and gold which you showered on Israel until they said, “Enough,” they were caused to make for themselves gods of gold.’
- C. “It is comparable to the case of a lion, who does not tear and roar on account of what is in a basket containing straw, but because of what is in a basket of meat.”
- D. Said R. Oshaia, “Up to the time of Jeroboam, the Israelites would suck from a single calf [sinning on account of only one], but from that time on, it was from two or three calves.”
- E. Said R. Isaac, “You do not have any sort of punishment that comes upon the world in which is contained at least one twenty-fourth of part of the overweight of a litra of the first calf.
- F. “For it is written, ‘Nevertheless in the day when I visit, I will visit their sin upon them’ (Exo. 32:34).”
- G. Said R. Hanina, “After twenty-four generations this verse of Scripture will be exacted: ‘He cried also in my ears with a loud voice, saying, Cause the visitations of the city to draw near, even every man with his destroying weapon in his hand’ (Eze. 9: 1).” [Freedman, p. 694, n. 4: The use of “visitations” suggests that this was the fulfillment of the doom threatened in Exo. 32:34. There were twenty-four generations from that of the wilderness, when the calf was made, to that of Zedekiah, in whose reign the state was overthrown and Judah was deported to Babylonia.]”

**VII.15 A.** “After this thing Jeroboam did not turn from his evil way” (1Ki. 13:33)”

- B. What is the sense of “after”?
- C. Said R. Abba, “After the Holy One, blessed be he, seized Jeroboam by his garment and said to him, ‘Repent, and you and the son of Jesse and I shall walk about in the Garden of Eden.’
- D. “He said to him, ‘He who will be at the head?’
- E. ““The son of Jesse will be at the head.’
- F. “If so, I don’t want it.”

**VII.16 A.** *R. Abbahu would regularly give a public interpretation of the three kings [of M. 11:2A]. He fell ill and undertook not to give such an address [since he thought the illness was punishment for speaking about the king’s sins].*

- B. *When [102B] he got better, he reversed himself and gave an address. They said to him, “You undertook not to speak about them.”*
- C. *He said to them, “Did they repent, that I should repent!”*

**VII.17 A.** *At the house of R. Ashi, [the group] arose [from studying] at the teaching of the three kings. He said, “Tomorrow we shall open discourse with the topic of ‘our colleagues’ [M. 11:2, that is, the three kings, all of whom were held to be disciples of sages.]”*

- B. *Manasseh came and appeared in a dream: “Do you call us ‘your colleague’ and ‘your father’s colleague’? [If you are as good as we are, then tell me] from what*

*part of the bread do you take the piece for reciting the blessing, 'Who brings forth bread from the earth'?"*

- C. *He said to him, "I don't know."*
- D. *He said to him, "If you have not learned from what part of the bread do you take a piece for reciting the blessing, 'Who brings forth bread from the earth,' how can you call us 'your colleague'?"*
- E. *He said to him, "Teach me. Tomorrow I shall expound the matter in your name in the class-session."*
- F. *He said to him, "One takes the part that is baked into a crust [and not the dough on the inside]."*
- G. *He said to him, "If you are so wise, then what is the reason that you worshipped an idol?"*
- H. *He said to him, "If you had been there, you would have picked up the hem of your garment and run after me."*
- I. *The next day he said to the rabbis, "Let us begin with our teacher."*

**VIII.1 A. Ahab:** The name 'Ahab' signifies that he was a brother to heaven (ah) but father of idolatry (ab).

- B. "He was brother to heaven, as it is written, 'A brother is born for trouble' (Pro. 17:17).
- C. "He was father to idolatry, as it is written, 'As a father loves his children' (Psa. 103:13)."

**VIII.2 A.** "And it came to pass, that it was a light thing for him to walk in the sins of Jeroboam, the son of Nebat" (1Ki. 16:31):

- B. Said R. Yohanan, "The lightest [sins] committed by Ahab were as the most severe ones that were committed by Jeroboam.
- C. "And on what account did Scripture blame Jeroboam? It was because he was the beginning of the corruption."

**VIII.3 A.** "Yes, their altars are as heaps in the furrows of the fields" (Hos. 12:12):

- B. Said R. Yohanan, "You have no furrow in the whole of the land of Israel in which Ahab did not set up an idol and bow down to it."

**VIII.4 A.** *And how do we know that [Ahab] will not enter the world to come?*

- B. As it is written, "And I will cut off from Ahab him who pisses against the wall, him that is shut up and forsaken in Israel" (1Ki. 21:21).
- C. "Shut up" in this world.
- D. "Forsaken" in the world to come.

**VIII.5 A.** Said R. Yohanan, "On what account did Omri merit the monarchy? Because he added a single town to the land of Israel, as it is written, 'And he bought the hill Samaria of Shemer for two talents of silver and built on the hill and called the name of the city which he built after the name of Shemer, owner of the hill, Samaria' (1Ki. 16:24)."

- B. Said R. Yohanan, "On what account did Ahab merit ruling for twenty-two years? Because he honored the Torah, which was given with twenty-two letters [of the Hebrew alphabet], as it is said, 'And he sent messages to Ahab, king of Israel, to

the city, and said to him, Thus says Hen-hadad, Your silver and your gold is mine, your wives also and your children, even the goodliest are mine ... Yet will I send my servants to you tomorrow at this time and they shall search your house, and the houses of your servants, and it shall be, that whatsoever is pleasant in your eyes they shall put in their hand and take it away ... Therefore he said to the messengers of Ben-hadad, Tell my lord the king, all that you send for to your servants at the first I will do, but this thing I may not do' (1Ki. 20:3, 6, 9).

- C. *"What is the meaning of 'whatsoever is pleasant in your eyes'? Is it not a scroll of the Torah?"*
- D. *But could it not be an idol?*
- E. *"Let it not enter your mind, for it is written, 'And all the leader and all the people said to him, Do not listen to him or consent' (1Ki. 20: 8) [the elders being sages]."*
- F. *And perhaps they were elders [who were identified with] the shame [of the idol itself]?*
- G. Is it not written, "And the saying pleased Absalom well and all the elders of Israel" (2Sa. 17: 4)? *On this passage, said R. Joseph, "They were elders [associated with] the shame."*
- H. *"In that passage, it is not written, 'And all the people,' while here it is written, 'And all the people.' It is not possible that among them were no righteous men, for it is written, 'Yet have I left seven thousand in Israel, all the knees which have not bowed to Baal and every mouth which has not kissed him' (1Ki. 19:18)."*

**VIII.6** A. Said R. Nahman, "Ahab was right in the middle [between wickedness and righteousness], as it is said, 'And the Lord said, Who shall persuade Ahab, that he may go up and fall at Ramoth-gillean? And one said in this manner, and one said in that manner' (1Ki. 22:20). [Freedman, p. 697, n. 1: This shows that it was a difficult matter to lure him to his fate, and that must have been because his righteousness equalled his guilt.]"

- B. *To this proposition R. Joseph objected, "We speak of one concerning whom it is written, 'But there was none like Ahab, who sold himself to work wickedness in the sight of the Lord, whom Jezebel his wife stirred up' (1Ki. 21:25),*
- C. *"on which passage it was repeated on Tannaite authority, 'Every day she would weigh out gold shekels for idolatry,' and can you say that he was right in the middle"*
- D. *"Rather, Ahab was generous with his money, and because he gave benefit to disciples of sages out of his property, half of his sins were forgiven."*

**VIII.7** A. "And there came forth the spirit and stood before the Lord and said, I will persuade him. And the Lord said to him, With what? And he said, I will go forth and I will be a lying spirit in the mouth of his prophets. And he said, You shall persuade him and also prevail. Go forth and do so" (1Ki. 22:21-23):

- B. *What spirit was it?*
- C. Said R. Yohanan, "It was the spirit of Naboth the Jezreelite."
- D. *What is meant by "go forth"?*
- E. Said Rabina, "Go forth from my precincts, as it is written, 'He who lies will not tarry in my sight' (Psa. 101: 7)."

- F. *Said R. Pappa, "This is in line with what people say, 'He who exacts vengeance destroys his house.'"*

**VIII.8 A.** "And Ahab made a grove, and Ahab did more to provoke the Lord God of Israel to anger than all of the kings of Israel that were before him" (1Ki. 16:33):

- B. Said R. Yohanan, "It was that he wrote on the gates of Samaria, 'Ahab has denied the God of Israel.' Therefore he has no portion in the God of Israel."

**VIII.9 A.** "And he sought Ahaziah, and they caught him for he hid in Samaria" (2Ch. 22: 9):

- B. Said R. Levi, "He was blotting out the mentions of the divine name [in the Torah] and writing in their place the names of idols."

**IX.1 A. Manasseh** — [Based on the root for the word "forget"] for he forgot the Lord.

- B. Another explanation: Manasseh — for he made Israel forget their father in heaven.
- C. *And how do we know that he will not come to the world to come?*
- D. As it is written, "Manasseh was twelve years old when he began to reign, and he reigned fifty-five years in Jerusalem, ... and he made a grove as did Ahab, king of Israel" (2Ki. 21:2-3).
- E. Just as Ahab has no share in the world to come, so Manasseh has no share in the world to come.

**X.1 A. R. Judah says, "Manasseh has a portion in the world to come, since it is said, 'And he prayed to him and he was entreated of him ...' (2Ch. 33:13)" [M. 11:2C-D]:**

- B. Said R. Yohanan, "Both authorities [who dispute the fate of Manasseh] interpret the same verse of Scripture, as it is said, 'And I will cause to be removed to all the kingdoms of the earth, because of Manasseh, son of Hezekiah, king of Judah' (Jer. 15: 4).
- C. *"One authority takes the view that it is 'on account of Manasseh,' who repented, while they did not repent.*
- D. *"The other authority takes the view [103A] that it is 'because of Manasseh,' who did not repent."*

**X.2 A.** Said R. Yohanan, "Whoever maintains that Manasseh has no share in the world to come weakens the hands of those who repent."

- B. *For a Tannaite authority repeated before R. Yohanan, "Manasseh repented for thirty-three years, as it is written, 'Manasseh was twelve years old when he began to reign, and he reigned fifty-five years in Jerusalem and he made a grove as did Ahab, king of Israel' (2Ki. 21:2-3).*
- C. *"How long did Ahab rule? Twenty-two years. How long did Manasseh rule? Fifty-five years. Take away twenty-two years, and you are left with thirty-three."*

**X.3 A.** Said R. Yohanan in the name of R. Simeon b. Yohai, "What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture, 'And he prayed to him and an opening was made for him' (2Ch. 33:13)?

- B. *"It should say, 'and he was entreated of him'!*



- C. "It teaches that the Holy One, blessed be he, made a kind of cave for him in the firmament, so as to receive him in repentance, despite the [contrary will of] the attribute of justice."
- D. *And said R. Yohanan in the name of R. Simeon b. Yohai, "What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture, 'In the beginning of the reign of Jehoiakim, son of Josiah, king of Judah' (Jer. 26: 1)?"*
- E. "And it is written, 'In the beginning of the reign of Zedekiah, king of Judah' (Jer. 28: 1).
- F. *"And is it the case that, up to that time there were no kings?"*
- G. "Rather, the Holy One, blessed be he, planned to return the world to [its beginning condition of] chaos and formlessness on account of Jehoiakim. When, however, he took a close look at his generation, his anger subsided.
- H. "[Along these same lines], the Holy One, blessed be he, planned to return the world to chaos and formlessness on account of the generation of Zedekiah. But when he took a close look at Zedekiah, his anger subsided."
- I. *But with regard to Zedekiah, also, it is written, "And he did that which was evil in the sight of God" (2Ki. 24:19)?"*
- J. He could have stopped others but did not do so.
- K. *And said R. Yohanan in the name of R. Simeon b. Yohai, "What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture, 'If a wise man content with a foolish man, whether rage or laughter, there is no satisfaction' (Pro. 29: 9)?"*
- L. "Said the Holy One, blessed be he, 'I was angry with Ahaz and I handed him over to the kings of Damascus and he sacrificed and offered incense to their gods, as it is said, 'For he sacrificed to the gods of Damascus who smote him, and he said, Because the gods of the kinds of Syria help them, therefore will I sacrifice to them that they may help me. But they were the ruin of him and of all Israel' (2Ch. 28:23).
- M. "'I smiled upon Amaziah and delivered the kings of Edom into his power, so he brought their gods and bowed down to them, a it is said, 'Now it came to pass, after Amaziah was come from the slaughter of the Edomites, that he brought the gods of the children of Seir and set them up to be his gods and bowed down himself before them and burned incense to them' (2Ch. 25:14)."
- N. *Said R. Pappa, "This is in line with what people say: 'Weep for the one who does not know, laugh for the one who does not know. Woe to him who does not know the difference between good and bad.'"*
- O. "And all the princes of the king of Babylonia came in and sat in the middle gate" (Jer. 39: 3):
- P. Said R. Yohanan in the name of R. Simeon b. Yohai, "It was the place in which laws were mediated."
- Q. *Said R. Pappa, "That is in line with what people say: 'In the place in which the master hangs up his sword, the shepherd hangs up his pitcher.' [Freedman, p. 700, n. 3: Where the Jews decided upon their laws, there Nebuchadnezzar issued his decrees.]"*

**X.4 A.** *Said R. Hisda said R. Jeremiah bar Abba, "What is the meaning of the following verse: 'I went by the field of the slothful and by the vineyard of the man void of*



understanding. And lo, it was all grown over with thorns and nettles had covered the face thereof, and the stone wall thereof was broken down' (Pro. 24:30-31)?

- B. "‘I went by the field of the slothful’ — this speaks of Ahaz.
- C. "‘And by the vineyard of the man void of understanding’ — this speaks of Manasseh.
- D. "‘And lo, it was all grown over with thorns’ — this refers to Amon.
- E. "‘And nettles had covered the face thereof’ — this refers to Jehoiakim.
- F. "‘And the stone wall thereof was broken down’ — this refers to Zedekiah, in whose time the Temple was destroyed.
- G. And said R. Hisda said R. Jeremiah bar Abba, "There are four categories who will not receive the face of the Presence of God:
- H. "The categories of scoffers, flatterers, liars, and slanderers.
- I. "The category of scoffers, as it is written, ‘He has stretched out his hand against scorers’ (Hos. 7: 5).
- J. "The category of flatterers, as it is written, ‘He who speaks lies shall not be established in my sight’ (Job. 13:16).
- K. "The category of liars, as it is written, ‘He who speaks lies shall not be established in my sight’ (Psa. 101: 7).
- L. "The category of slanderers, as it is written, ‘For you are not a God who has pleasure in wickedness; evil will not dwell with you’ (Psa. 5: 5). ‘You are righteous, O Lord, and evil will not dwell in your house [Psa. 5 addresses slander.]’
- M. *And said R. Hisda said R. Jeremiah bar Abba, "What is the meaning of the verse, ‘There shall nor evil befall you, neither shall any plague come near your dwelling’ (Psa. 91:10)?*
- N. "There shall not evil befall you’ means that the evil impulse will not rule over you.
- O. "‘Neither shall any plague come near your dwelling’ means that, when you come home from a trip, you will never find that your wife is in doubt as to whether or not she is menstruating.”
- P. "Another matter: ‘There shall not evil befall you’ means that bad dreams and fantasies will never frighten you.
- Q. "‘Neither shall any plague come near your dwelling’ means that you will not have a son or a disciple who in public burns his food [that is, teaches something heretical].’
- R. "Up to this point is the blessing that his father had given him.
- S. "From this point forward comes the blessing that his mother had given to him: ‘For he shall give his angels charge over you, to keep you in all your ways. They shall bear you in their hands ... You shall tread upon the lion and the adder’ (Psa. 91:10).
- T. "Up to this point is the blessing that his mother gave him.
- U. "From this point onward comes the blessing that heaven gave him:
- V. " **[103B]** Because he has set his love upon me, therefore will I deliver him. I will set him on high, because he has known my name. He shall call upon me, and I will

answer him. I will be with him in trouble. I will deliver him and honor him. With long life will I satisfy him and show him my salvation' (Psa. 91:14-16)."

**X.5 A.** *Said R. Simeon b. Laqish, "What is the meaning of the following verse of Scripture: 'And from the wicked their light is withheld, and the high arm shall be broken' (Job. 38:15)?*

B. "Why is the letter ayin in the word for wicked suspended [in the text, being written above the level of the line, making it read 'poor,' rather than 'wicked' (Freedman, p. 701, n. 10)]?"

C. "When a person becomes poor below, he is made poor above [Freedman, p. 701, n. 11: Where one earns the disapproval of man, it is proof that he has earned the disapproval of God too.]"

D. *Then the letter should not be written at all?*

E. R. Yohanan and R. Eleazar: one said, "It is because of the honor owing to David."

F. The other said, "It is because the honor owing to Nehemiah B. Hachaliah. [Freedman, p. 702, n. 1: Both had many enemies yet were truly righteous men.]"

**X.6 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

B. Manasseh would teach the book of Leviticus from fifty-five viewpoints, corresponding to the years of his reign.

C. Ahab did so in eighty-five ways.

D. Jeroboam did so in a hundred and three ways.

**X.7 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

B. R. Meir would say, "Absalom has no share in the world to come,

C. "as it is said, 'And they smote Absalom and slew him' (2Sa. 18:15).

D. "They smote him' in this world.

E. "And they slew him' in the world to come."

**X.8 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority"*

B. R. Simeon b. Eleazar says in the name of R. Meir, "Ahaz, Ahaziah, and all the kings of Israel concerning whom it is written, 'And he did what was evil in the sight of the Lord' will not live or be judged [in the world to come.]"

**X.9 A.** "Moreover Manasseh shed much innocent blood, until he had filled Jerusalem from one end to another, beside his sin wherewith he made Judah to sin, in doing that which was evil in the sight of the Lord" (2Ki. 21:16):

B. *Here [in Babylonia] it is explained that he killed Isaiah, [and that is the sin at hand].*

C. *In the West they say that it was that he made an idol as heavy as a thousand men, and every day it killed them all.*

D. *In accord with whose position is the following statement made by Raba b. b. Hana: "The soul of a righteous man is balanced against the whole world?"*

E. *In accord with whom? With the position of him who has said that he had killed Isaiah.*

- X.10** A. [It is written,] “And he set the graven image” (2Ch. 33: 7), and it is stated, “And the graves and the graven images which he had set up” (2Ch. 33:19). [was there one image or were there many?]
- B. Said R. Yohanan, “In the beginning he made one face for it, and in the end he made four faces for it, so that the Presence of God should see it and become angry.
- C. “Ahaz set it up in the upper chamber, as it is written, ‘And the altars that were on top of the upper chamber of Ahaz’ (2Ki. 23:13).
- D. “Manasseh set it in the Temple, as it is written, ‘And he set up a graven image of the grove that he had made in the house, of which the Lord said to David and to Solomon his son, In this house and in Jerusalem which I have chosen out of all tribes of Israel will I put my name for ever’ (2Ki. 21: 7).
- E. “Amon put it into the Holy of Holies, as it is said, ‘For the bed is shorter than that a man can stretch himself on it, and the covering narrower than that he can wrap himself in it’ (Isa. 28:20).”
- F. *What is the sense of*, “For the bed is shorter than that one can stretch himself on it”?
- G. Said R. Samuel bar Nahmani said R. Jonathan, “This bed is too short for two neighbors to rule over it at one time.”
- H. *What is the sense of* “And the covering is narrower”?
- I. *Said R. Samuel bar Nahmani, “When R. Jonathan would reach this verse of Scripture, he would cry. ‘He of whom it is written,’ ‘He gathers the waters of the sea together as a heap’ (Psa. 33: 7) — should a molten statue rival him!’”*
- X.11** A. Ahaz annulled the sacrificial service and sealed the Torah, for it is said, “Bind up the testimony, seal the Torah among my disciples” (Isa. 8:16).
- B. Manasseh blotted out the mentions of the divine Name and destroyed the altar.
- C. Amon burned the Torah and let spider webs cover the altar.
- D. Ahaz permitted consanguineous marriages.
- E. Manasseh had sexual relations with his sister.
- F. Amon had sexual relations with his mother, as it is said, “For Amon sinned very much” (2Ch. 33:23).
- G. R. Yohanan and R. Eleazar: one said that he burned the torah.
- H. The other said that he had sexual relations with his mother.
- I. His mother said to him, “Do you have any pleasure from the place from which you came forth?”
- J. He said to her, “Am I doing anything except to spite my creator?”
- K. *When Jehoiakim came, he said, “The ones who came before me really did not know how to anger him. Do we need him for anything more than his light? We have pure gold, which we use [for light], so let him take away his light.”*
- L. They said to him, “But do not silver and gold belong to him, as it is written, ‘Mine is the silver, and mine is the gold, saith the Lord of hosts’ (Hag. 2: 8).”
- M. “He said to them, “He has already given them to us, as it is said, ‘The heavens are the Lord’s, and the earth he has given to the children of men’ (Psa. 115:16).”

**Wicked Monarches Who Nonetheless Merit  
a Portion in the World to Come, e.g., Jehoiakim, Ahaz, Amon**

- X.12** A. Said Raba to Rabbah bar Mari, “On what account did they not count Jehoiakim [among those who do not get the world to come]?”
- B. “For it is written of him, ‘And the remaining words of Jehoiakim and the abomination which he wrought and that which was found up upon him’ (2Ch. 36: 8).”
- C. *What is the sense of* “that which was found upon him” (2Ch. 36: 8)?
- D. R. Yohanan and R. Eleazar: one said that he engraved the name of his idol on his penis.
- E. The other said that he engraved the name of heaven on his penis.
- F. [Rabbah b. Mari] said to him, “As to the matter of kings, I have not heard any answer. But as to ordinary people, I have heard an answer.
- G. “Why did they not count Micah? Because he made his bread available to travellers, for it is said, ‘Every traveller turned to the Levites.’”
- H. “And he shall pass through the sea with affliction and shall smite the waves in the sea” (Zec. 10:11).”
- I. Said R. Yohanan, “This speaks of the idol of Micah.”
- J. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*
- K. R. Nathan says, “From Hareb to Shiloah is three miles, and the smoke of the pile and the smoke of the image of Micah mixed together. The ministering angels wanted to drive [Micah] off. The Holy One, blessed be he, said to them, ‘Leave him alone, for his bread is made available to travellers.’”
- L. And for the same matter those involved in the matter of the concubine at Gibeah [Judges 19] were punished.
- M. Said the Holy One, blessed be he, “On account of the honor owing to me you did not protest, and on account of the honor owing to a mortal you protested.”
- X.13** A. Said R. Yohanan in the name of R. Yosé b. Qisma, “Great is a mouthful of food, for it set a distance between two families and Israel,
- B. “as it is written, ‘[An Ammonite or Moabite shall not enter the congregation of the Lord] ... because they did not meet you with bread and water in the way when you came forth from Egypt’ (Deu. 33:4-5).”
- C. And R. Yohanan on his own said, “It creates distance among those who are close; it draws near those who are afar; it blinds the eye [of God] from the wicked; it makes the Presence of God rest even on the prophets of Baal, and it makes an unwitting offense appear to be deliberate [if it is performed in connection with care of the wayfarer].”
- D. [Now to spell out the foregoing:] “It creates distance among those who are close:
- E. [Proof derives] from **[104A]** the case of Ammon and Moab.
- F. “It draws near those who are afar:”
- G. [Proof derives] from the case of Jethro.

- H. For said R. Yohanan, “As a reward for saying, ‘Call him that he may eat bread’ (Exo. 2:20), [Jethro]’s descendants had the merit of going taking seats [as authorities] in the chamber of the hewn stones, it is said, ‘And the family of the scribes which dwell at Jabez, the Tirahites, the Shimeathites, and Suchathites. These are the Kenites that came of Hemath, the father of the house of Rechan’ (1Ch. 2:55).
- I. “And elsewhere it is written, ‘And the children of the Kenite, Moses’ father-in-law, went up out of the city of palm trees with the children of Judah into the wilderness of Judah, which lies in the south of Arab, and they went and dwelt among the people’ (Jud. 1:16). [Freedman, p. 705, n. 10: This shows that the Kenites were descended from Jethro and they sat in the hall of hewn stones as scribes and sanhedrin.]”
- J. “It blinds the eye [of God] from the wicked:”
- K. [Proof derives] from the case of Micah.
- L. “It makes the Presence of God rest even on the prophets of Baal:”
- M. [Proof derives] from the friend of Iddo, the prophet, for it is written, “And it came to pass, as they sat at the table, that the word of the Lord came to the prophet that brought him back” (1Ki. 13:20). [Freedman, p. 706, n. 2: He was a prophet of Baal, yet God’s word came to him as a reward for his hospitality.]
- N. “And it makes an unwitting offense appear to be deliberate:”
- O. [Proof derives] from what R. Judah said Rab, said, “Had Jonathan only brought David two loaves of bread, Nob, the city of priests, would not have been put to death, Doeg the Edomite would not have been troubled, and Saul and his three sons would not have been killed. [Freedman, p. 706, n. 4: For had he provided him with food, he would not have taken any from Ahimelech. Thus all this happened, though Jonathan’s initial offense was due to an oversight.]”

**X.14 A.** And why did they not list Ahaz [at M. 11:2]?

- B. Said R. Jeremiah bar Abba, “Because he was positioned between two righteous men, between Jotham and Hezekiah.”
- C. R. Joseph said, “Because he had the capacity to be ashamed on account of Isaiah, as it is said, ‘Then said the Lord to Isaiah, Go forth now to meet Ahaz, you and Shear-jashub your son, at the end of the conduit of the upper pool in the highway of the field of the fuller’s trough’ (Isa. 7: 3).”
- D. *What is the source of “fuller’s trough”?*
- E. *Some say, “He hid his face [using the same consonants] and fled.”*
- F. *Some say, “He dragged a fuller’s trough [the meaning of the word in general] on his head and fled.”*

**X.15 A.** Why did they not list Amon [at M. 11:2]?

- B. On account of the honor owing to Josiah.
- C. In that case, they also should not have listed Manasseh, on account of the honor owing to Hezekiah.

- D. *The son imparts merit to the father, but the father does not give any merit to the son, for it is written, "Neither is there any one who can deliver out of my hand" (Deu. 32:39).*
- E. *Abraham cannot save Ishmael. Isaac cannot save Esau.*
- F. *If you go that far, then Ahaz also was omitted from the list on account of the honor owing to Hezekiah.*

**X.16** A. And on what account did they not list Jehoiakim?

- B. *It is on account of what R. Hiyya b. R. Abuyyah said.*
- C. *For R. Hiyya b. R. Abuyyah said, "It was written on the skull of Jehoiakim, 'This and yet another.'"*
- D. *The grandfather of R. Perida found a skull tossed at the gates of Jerusalem, on which was written, "This and yet another."*
- E. *He buried it, but it did not stay buried, and he buried it again but it did not stay buried.*
- F. *He said, "It must be the skull of Jehoiakim, for it is written in that connection, 'He shall be buried with the burial of an ass, drawn and cast forth beyond the gates of Jerusalem' (Jer. 22:19)."*
- G. *He said, "Still, he was a king, and it is not proper to treat him lightly."*
- H. *He wrapped the skull in silk and put it in a closet. His wife saw it. She thought, "This is [the bone of] his first wife, whom he has not forgotten."*
- I. *She lit the oven and burned it up, and that is the meaning of what is written, "This and yet another." [Freedman, p. 707, n. 2: These indignities made sufficient atonement for him that he should share in the future world.]*

## **Hezekiah, the Righteous Monarch on Account of Whom Israel Went into Exile. And the Exegesis of Lamentations**

**X.17** A. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. *R. Simeon b. Eleazar said, "On account of [Hezekiah's] statement, 'And I have done that which was good in your sight,' (2Ki. 20: 3), [he had further to ask,] 'What shall be the sign [that the Lord will heal me]?' (2Ki. 20: 9).*
- C. *"On account of the statement, 'What shall be the sign' (2Ki. 20: 9), gentiles ate at his table.*
- D. *"On account of gentiles' eating at his table, [2Ki. 20:17-18], he made his children go into exile."*
- E. *That statement supports what Hezekiah said.*
- F. *For Hezekiah said, "Whoever invites an idolator into his house and serves him [as host] causes his children to go into exile, as it is said, 'And of your sons who will issue from you, which you shall beget, shall they take away; and they shall be eunuchs in the palace of the king of Babylonia' (2Ki. 20:18)."*
- G. *"And Hezekiah was happy about them and showed them the treasure house, the silver and gold, spices and precious ointment" (Isa. 39: 2):*
- H. *Said Rab, "What is the sense of 'his treasure house'? It means, his wife, who served them drinks."*

- I. Samuel said, "His treasury is what he showed them"
- J. R. Yohanan said, "His weapons, which had the capacity to consume other weapons, is what he showed them."

**X.18 A.** "How does the city sit solitary" (Lam. 1: 1):

- B. Said Rabbah said R. Yohanan, "On what account were the Israelites smitten with the word 'how' [that begins the dirge]? [Since the numerical value of the letters of the word equals thirty-six], it is because they violated the thirty-six rules in the Torah that are penalized by extirpation."
- C. Said R. Yohanan, "Why were they smitten [with a dirge that is] alphabetical?"
- D. "Because they violated the Torah, which is given through the alphabet. [Freedman, p. 708, n. 6: Its words are formed from the alphabet.]"

**X.19 A.** "Sit solitary" (Lam. 1: 1)"

- B. Said Rabbah said R. Yohanan, "Said the Holy One, blessed be he, 'I said, "Israel then shall dwell in safety alone, the foundation of Jacob shall be upon a land of corn and wine, also his heavens shall drop down dew" (Deu. 33:28) [so that sitting solitary was supposed to be a blessing (Freedman, p. 708, n. 8)], but now, where they dwell will be alone.'"

**X.20 A.** "The city that was full of people" (Lam. 1: 1):

- B. Said Rabbah said R. Yohanan, "For they used to marry off a minor girl to an adult male, or an adult woman to a minor boy, so that they should have many children. [But two minors would not marry.]"

**X.21 A.** "She is become as a widow" (Lam. 1: 1):

- B. Said R. Judah said Rab, "Like a widow, but not actually a widow, but like a woman whose husband has gone overseas and plans to return to her."

**X.22 A.** "She was great among the nations and princess among the provinces" (Lam. 1: 1):

- B. Said R. Rabbah said R. Yohanan, "Everywhere they go they become princes of their masters."

**X.23 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. There is the case of two men who were captured on Mount Carmel. The kidnapper was walking behind them. **[104B]** One of them said to his fellow, "The camel that is walking before us is blind in one eye, it is carrying two skins, one of wine and one of oil, and of the two men that are leading it, one is an Israelite and the other is a gentile."
- C. The kidnapper said to them, "Stiff-necked people, how do you know?"
- D. They said to him, "As to the camel, it is eating from the grass before it on the side on which it can see, but on the side on which it cannot see, it is not eating."
- E. "And it is carrying two skins, one of wine and one of oil. The one of wine drips and the drippings are absorbed in the ground, while the one of oil drips, and the drippings remain on the surface."



- F. “And as the two men who are leading it, one is a gentile and one is an Israelite. The gentile relieves himself right on the road, while the Israelite turns to the side [of the road].”
- G. The man ran after them and found that things were just as they had said. He came and kissed them on their head and brought them to his house. He made a great banquet for them and danced before them, saying, “Blessed is he who chose the seed of Abraham and gave part of his wisdom to them, and wherever they go they become princes over their masters.”
- H. He sent them away and they went home in peace.

**X.24 A.** “She weeps, yes, she weeps in the night” (Lam. 1: 2):

- B. Why these two acts of weeping?
- C. Said Rabbah said R. Yohanan, “One is for the first Temple and the other is for the second Temple.”
- D. “At night:”
- E. On account of things done in the night, as it is said, “And all the congregation lifted up their voice and cried, and the people wept that night [at the spies’ false report]” (Num. 14: 1).
- F. Said Rabbah said R. Yohanan, “That was the ninth of Ab. Said the Holy One, blessed be he, to Israel, ‘You have wept tears for nothing. I now shall set up for you weeping for generations to come.’”
- G. Another interpretation of “At night:”
- H. Whoever cries at night will find that his voice is heard.
- I. Another interpretation of “At night:”
- J. Whoever cries at night finds that the stars and planets will cry with him.
- K. Another interpretation of “At night:”
- L. Whoever cries at night finds that whoever hears his voice will cry along with him.
- M. That was the case of a woman in the neighborhood of Rabban Gamaliel, whose child died. She was weeping by night on account of the child. Rabban Gamaliel heard her voice and cried with her, until his eyelashes fell out. The next day, his disciples recognized what had happened and removed the woman from his neighborhood.

**X.25 A.** “And her tears are on her cheeks” (Lam. 1: 2):

- B. Said Rabbah said R. Yohanan, “It is like a woman who weeps for the husband of her youth, as it is said, ‘Lamentation like a virgin girded with sackcloth for the husband of her youth’ (Joel 1: 8).”

**X.26 A.** “Her adversaries are the chief” (Lam. 1: 5):

- B. Said Rabbah said R. Yohanan, “Whoever persecutes Israel becomes head,
- C. “as it is said, ‘Nevertheless, there shall be no weariness for her that oppressed her. In the former time he brought into contempt the land of Zebulun and the land of Naphtali, but in the latter time he has made it glorious, by way of the sea, beyond Jordan, the circuit of the nations’ (Isa. 8:23).”
- D. Said Rabbah said R. Yohanan, “Whoever oppresses Israel does not get tired.”

**X.27 A.** “May it not happen to you, all passersby” (Lam. 1:12).”

- B. Said Rabbah said R. Yohanan, "On this basis we find in the Torah support for saying [when reciting woes], 'May it not happen to you.'"

**X.28 A.** "All passersby" (Lam. 1:12):

- B. Said R. Amram said Rab, "They have turned me into one of those who transgress the law.
- C. "For in respect to Sodom, it is written, 'And the Lord rained upon Sodom [and upon Gomorrah brimstone and fire' (Gen. 19:24). But in respect to Jerusalem it is written, 'From above he has sent fire against my bones and it prevails against them' (Lam. 1:13). [Freedman, p. 711, n. 4: Thus Jerusalem was treated as Sodom and Gomorrah.]"
- D. "For the iniquity of the daughter of my people is greater than the sin of Sodom" (Lam. 4: 6):
- E. And is any sort of favoritism shown in such a matter [since Jerusalem was left standing, Sodom was wiped out]?
- F. Said Rabbah said R. Yohanan, "[Not at all, in fact] there was a further measure [of punishment] directed against Jerusalem but not against Sodom.
- G. "For with respect to Sodom, it is written, 'Behold, this was the iniquity of your sister, Sodom, pride, fullness of bread, and abundance of idleness was in her and in her daughters, neither did she strengthen the hand of the poor and the needy' (Eze. 16:49).
- H. "With respect to Jerusalem, by contrast, it is written, 'The hands of merciful women have boiled their own children' (Lam. 4:10). [Freedman, p. 711, n. 8: Jerusalem suffered extreme hunger, which Sodom never did, and this fact counterbalanced her being spared total destruction.]"

**X.29 A.** "The Lord has trodden under foot all my mighty men in the midst of me" (Lam. 1:15):

- B. This is like a man who says to his fellow, "This coin has been invalidated."
- C. "All your enemies have opened their mouths against you" (Lam. 2:16):
- D. Said Rabbah said R. Yohanan, "On what account does the letter P come before the letter ayin [in the order of verses in the chapter of Lamentation, while in the alphabet, the ayin comes before the P]?
- E. "It is on account of the spies, who said with their mouths [and the word for mouth begins with a P] what their eyes had not seen [and the word for eye begins with an ayin.]"

**X.30 A.** "They eat my people as they eat bread and do not call upon the Lord" (Psa. 14: 4):

- B. Said Rabbah said R. Yohanan, "Whoever eats the bread of Israelites tastes the flavor of bread, and who does not eat the bread of Israelites does not taste the flavor of bread."

**X.31 A.** "They do not call upon the Lord" (Psa. 14: 4):

- B. Rab said, "This refers to judges."
- C. And Samuel said, "This refers to those who teach children."

## **The List of those Who Do Not Enter the World to Come**

### **Kings and Commoners:**

### **Summary Judgments**

**X.32** A. Who counted [the kings and commoners of M. 11:2A]?

B. Said R. Ashi, "The men of the great assembly counted them."

**X.33** A. Said R. Judah said Rab, "They wanted to count yet another [namely, Solomon], but an apparition of his father's face came and prostrated himself before them. But they paid no attention to him. A fire came down from heaven and licked around their chairs, but they did not pay attention. An echo come forth and as said to them, 'Do you see a man diligent in his business? He shall stand before kings, he shall not stand before mean men' (Pro. 22:29).

B. "He who gave precedence to my house over his house, and not only so, but built my house over a span of seven years, while building his own house over a span of thirteen years 'he shall stand before kings, he shall not stand before mean men.'"

C. "But they paid no attention to that either.

D. "An echo came forth, saying, 'Should it be according to your mind? He will recompense it, whether you refuse or whether you choose, and not I' (Job. 34:33)."

**X.34** A. Those who interpret signs [symbolically] would say, "All of them [listed at M. 11:2] will enter the world to come, as it is said, 'Gilead is mine, Manasseh is mine, Ephraim also is the strength of my head, Judah is my lawgiver, Moab is my washpot, over Edom will I cast my shoe, Philistia, you triumph because of me' (Psa. 60:9-10):

B. "'Gideon is mine' speaks of Ahab, who fell at Ramoth-gilead.

C. "'Manasseh' — literally.

D. "'Ephraim also is the strength of my head' speaks of Jeroboam, who comes from Ephraim.

E. "'Judah is my lawgiver' refers to Ahitophel, [105A] who comes from Judah.

F. "'Moab is my washpot' refers to Gehazi, who was smitten on account of matters having to do with washing.

G. "'Over Edom will I cast my shoe' refers to Doeg the Edomite.

H. "'Philistia, you triumph because of me.' The Ministering angels said before the Holy One, blessed be he, 'Lord of the world, if David should come, who killed the Philistine, and who gave Gath to them as an inheritance, what are you going to do to him?'

I. "He said to them, 'It is my task to make them friends of one another.'"

**X.35** A. "Why is this people of Jerusalem slidden back by a perpetual backsliding" (Jer. 8: 5):

B. Said Rab, "The community of Israel answered the prophet with a lasting reply [a play on the words for backsliding and answer, using the same root].

C. "The prophet said to Israel, 'Return in repentance. Your fathers who sinned — where are they now?'

- D. “They said to him, ‘And your prophets, who did not sin, where are they now? For it is said, “Your fathers, where are they? and the prophets, do they live forever” (Zec. 1: 5)?’
- E. “He said to them, ‘They repented and confessed as it is said, “But my words and my statutes, which I commanded my servants the prophets, did they not take hold of your fathers? And they returned and said, Like as the Lord of hosts thought to do unto us, according to our ways and according to our doings, so has he dealt with us” (Zec. 1: 6).’”
- F. Samuel said, “Ten men came and sat before him. He said to them, ‘Return in repentance.’
- G. “They said to him, ‘If a master has sold his slave, or a husband has divorced his wife, does one party have any further claim upon the other? [Surely not.] Freedman, p. 714, n. 3: Since God has sold us to Nebuchadnezzar, he has no further claim upon us, and we have no cause to repent. This in Samuel’s view was the victorious answer.]
- H. “Said the Holy One, blessed be he, to the prophet, ‘Go and say to them, ‘Thus says the Lord, where is the bill of your mother’s divorcement, whom I have put away? Or which of my creditors is it to whom I have sold you? Behold for your iniquities you have sold yourselves, and for you transgressions is your mother put away’ (Isa. 50: 1).’”
- I. *And this is in line with what R. Simeon b. Laqish said, “What is the meaning of what is written, ‘David my servant [and ] Nebuchadnezzar my servant’ (Jer. 43:10)?*
- J. “It is perfectly clear before him who spoke and brought the world into being that the Israelites were going to say this, and therefore the Holy One, blessed be he, went ahead and called him ‘his servant.’ [Why so?] If a slave acquires property, to whom does the slave belong, and to whom does the property belong?” [Freedman, p. 714, n. 7: Even if God had sold them to Nebuchadnezzar, they still belong to God.]”

**X.36 A.** “And that which comes into your mind shall not be at all, that you say, We will be as the heathen, as the families of the countries, to serve wood and stone. As I live, says the Lord God, surely with a mighty hand and with an outstretched arm, and with fury poured out, will I rule over you” (Eze. 20:32-33):

- B. *Said R. Nahman, “Even with such anger may the All-Merciful rage against us, so long as he redeems us.”*

**X.37 A.** “For he chastises him to discretion and his God teaches him” (Isa. 28:26):

- B. Said Rabbah bar Hanah, “Said the prophet to Israel, ‘Return in repentance.’
- C. “They said to him, ‘We cannot do so. The impulse to do evil rules over us.’
- D. “He said to them, ‘Reign in your desire.’
- E. “They said to him, ‘Let his God teach us.’”

**XI.1 A. Four ordinary folk: Balaam, Doeg, Ahitophel, and Gehazi [M. 11:2F]:**

- B. [The name] Balaam [means] not with [the rest of] the people [using the same consonants], [who will inherit the world to come].
- C. Another interpretation: Balaam, because he devoured the people.

- D. “Son of Beor” means that he had sexual relations with a cow [a play on the consonants of the word for Beor].

**XI.2 A.** *A Tannaite statement:*

- B. Beor, Cushan-rishathaim, and Laban, the Syrian, are one and the same person.  
C. Beor: because he had sexual relations with a cow.  
D. Cushan-rishathaim [two acts of wickedness], for he committed two acts of wickedness against Israel, one in the time of Jacob and one in the time of the Judges.  
E. But what was his real name? It was Laban the Aramaean.

**XI.3 A.** It is written, “The son of Beor” (Num. 22:50), but it also is written, “His son was Beor” (Num. 24: 3).

- B. Said R. Yohanan, “His father was his son as to prophecy.”

**XI.4 A.** *Balaam is the one who will not come to the world to come. Lo, others will come.*

- B. *In accord with whose view is the Mishnah-passage at hand?*  
C. *It represents the view of R. Joshua.*  
D. *For it has been taught on Tannaite authority:*  
E. [In Tosefta’s version:] **R. Eliezer says, “None of the gentiles has a portion in the world to come,**  
F. **“as it is said, ‘The wicked shall return to sheol. All the gentiles who forget God’ (Psa. 9:17).**  
G. **“‘The wicked shall return to Sheol’ — these are the wicked Israelites.**  
H. **“‘And all the gentiles who forget God’ — these are the nations.”**  
I. Said to him R. Joshua, **“If it had been written, ‘The wicked shall return to Sheol — all the gentiles’ and then said nothing further, I should have maintained as you do.**  
J. **“Now that it is in fact written, ‘All the gentiles who forget God,’ it indicates that there also are righteous people among the nations of the world who have a portion in the world to come” [T. San. 13:2E-J].**  
K. And that wicked man [Balaam] also gave a sign concerning his own fate, when he said, “Let me die the death of the righteous” (Num. 23:10).  
L. [He said,] “If my soul dies the death of the righteous, may my future be like his, and if not, ‘Then behold I go to my people’ (Num. 24:14).”

**XI.5 A.** “And the elders of Moab and the elders of Midian departed” (Num. 22: 7):

- B. *A Tannaite statement:*  
C. There was never peace between Midian and Moab. The matter may be compared to two dogs who were in a kennel, barking at one another.  
D. A wolf came and attacked one. The other said, “If I do not help him today, he will kill him, and tomorrow he will come against me.”  
E. So the two dogs went and killed the wolf.  
F. *Said R. Pappa, “This is in line with what people say: ‘The weasel and the cat can make a banquet on the fat of the unlucky.’”*

**XI.6 A.** “And the princes of Moab abode with Balaam” (Num. 22: 8):

B. *And as to the princes of Midian, where had they gone?*

C. *When he said to them, “Lodge here this night and I will bring you word again [as the Lord shall speak to me],” (Num. 22: 8), they said, “Does any father hate his son? [No chance!]”*

**XI.7 A.** *Said R. Nahman, “Hutzbah, even against heaven, serves some good. To begin with, it is written, ‘You shall not go with them’ (Num. 22:12), and then it is said, ‘Rise up and go with them’ (Num. 22:20).”*

B. *Said R. Sheshet, “Hutzbah is dominion without a crown.*

C. *“For it is written, ‘And I am this day weak, though anointed king, and these men, the sons of Zeruiah, be too hard for me’ (2Sa. 3:39). [Freedman, p. 717, n. 1: Thus their boldness and impudence outweighed sovereignty.]”*

**XI.8 A.** *Said R. Yohanan, “Balaam had one crippled foot, for it is written, ‘And he walked haltingly’ (Num. 23: 3).*

B. *“Samson had two crippled feet, as it is said, ‘An adder in the path that bites the horses’ heels’ (Gen. 49:17). [Freedman, p. 717, n. 3: This was a prophecy of Samson. “An adder in the path’ is taken to mean that he would have to slither along like an adder, being lame in both feet.]*

C. *“Balaam was blind in one eye, as it is said, ‘Whose eye is open’ (Num. 24: 3).*

D. *“He practiced enchantment with his penis.*

E. *“Here it is written, ‘Falling but having his eyes open’ (Num. 24: 3), and elsewhere: ‘And Haman was fallen on the bed whereon Esther was’ (Est. 7: 8)..”*

F. *It has been stated on Amoraic authority:*

G. *Mar Zutra said, “He practiced enchantment with his penis.”*

H. *Mar, son of Rabina, said, “He had sexual relations with his ass.”*

I. *As to the view that he practiced enchantment with his penis it is as we have just now stated.*

J. *As to the view that he had sexual relations with his ass:*

K. *Here it is written, “He bowed, he lay down as a lion and as a great lion” (Num. 24: 9), and elsewhere it is written, “At her feet [105B] he bowed, he fell” (Jud. 5:27).”*

**XI.9 A.** *“He knows the mind of the most high” (Num. 24:16):*

B. *Now if he did not know the mind of his own beast, how could he have known the mind of the most high?*

C. *What is the case of the mind of his beast?*

D. *People said to him, “What is the reason that you did not ride on your horse?”*

E. *He said to them, “I put it out to graze in fresh pasture.”*

F. *[The ass] said to him, “Am I not your ass” (Num. 22:30). [That shows he rode an ass, not a horse.]*

G. *“[You are] merely for carrying loads.”*

H. *“Upon whom you rode” (Num. 22:30).*

I. *“It was a happenstance.”*

J. *“Ever since I was yours, until this day” (Num. 22:30).*

- K. [The ass continued,] “And not only so, but I serve you for sexual relations by night.”
- L. *Here it is written, “Did I ever do so to you” (Num. 22:30) and elsewhere it is written, “Let her serve as his companion.” [The same word is used, proving that sexual relations took place as with David and the maiden in his old age.]*
- M. *Then what is the meaning of the statement, “He knows the mind of the Most High” (Num. 24:16)?*
- N. He knew how to tell the exact time at which the Holy One, blessed be he, was angry.
- O. *That is in line with what the prophet said to Israel, “O my people, remember now what Balak, king of Moab, consulted, and what Balaam the son of Beor answered him from Shittim to Gilgal, that you may know the righteousness of the Lord” (Mic. 6: 5).*
- P. *What is the meaning of the statement, “That you may know the righteousness of the Lord” (Mic. 6: 5)?*
- Q. Said the Holy One, blessed be he, to Israel, “Know that I have done many acts of charity with you, that I did not get angry with you in the time of the wicked Balaam.
- R. “For if I had become angry during all those days, there would not remain out of (the enemies of) Israel a shred or a remnant.”
- S. *That is in line with what Balaam said to Balak, “How shall I curse one whom God has not cursed? Or shall I rage, when the Lord has not raged?” (Num. 23: 8).*
- T. This teaches that for all those days the Lord had not been angry.
- U. But: “God is angry every day” (Psa. 7:12).
- V. And how long does his anger last? It is a moment, for it is said, “For his anger endures but a moment, but his favor is life” (Psa. 30: 5).
- W. *If you wish, I shall propose, “Come, my people, enter into your chambers and shut your doors about you, hide yourself as it were for a brief moment, until the indignation be past” (Isa. 26:20).*
- X. *When is he angry? It is in the first three hours [of the day], when the comb of the cock is white.*
- Y. *But it is white all the time?*
- Z. *All the other time it has red streaks, but when God is angry, there are no red streaks in it.*

**XI.10** A. *There was a min living in the neighborhood of R. Joshua b. Levi, who bothered him a great deal. One day he took a chicken and tied it up at the foot of his bed and sat down. He said, “When that moment comes [at which God is angry], I shall curse him.”*

B. *When that moment came, he was dozing. He said, “What this teaches is that it is improper [to curse], for it is written, ‘Also to punish is not good for the righteous’ (Pro. 17:26) — even in the case of a min.”*



**XI.11** A. *A Tannaite authority in the name of R. Meir [said], “When the sun shines and the kings put their crowns on their heads and bow down to the sun, forthwith he is angry.”*

**XI.12** A. “And Balaam rose up in the morning and saddled his ass” (Num. 22:21):

- B. *A Tannaite authority taught in the name of R. Simeon b. Eleazar, “That love annuls the order of proprieties [we learn] from the case of Abraham.*
- C. *“For it is written, ‘And Abraham rose up early in the morning and saddled his ass’ (Gen. 22: 3) [not waiting for the servant to do so].*
- D. *“And that hatred annuls the order of proprieties [we learn] from the case of Balaam.*
- E. *“For it is said, ‘And Balaam rose up early in the morning and saddled his ass’ (Num. 22.21).”*

**XI.13** A. Said R. Judah said Rab, “Under all circumstances a person should engage in study of Torah and practice of religious duties, even if it is not for their own sake, for out of doing these things not for their own sake one will come to do them for their own sake.”

- B. For as a reward for the forty-two offerings that Balak offered, he had the merit that Ruth should come forth from him.
- C. Said R. Yosé bar Huna, “Ruth was the daughter of Eglon, grandson of Balak, king of Moab.”

**XI.14** A. *Said Raba to Rabbah bar Mari, “It is written, ‘[And moreover the king’s servants came to bless our lord king David, saying] God make the name of Solomon better than your name, and make his throne greater than your throne’ (1Ki. 1:47).*

- B. *“Now is this appropriate to speak in such a way to a king?”*
- C. *He said to him, “What they meant is, ‘as good as ....’ [Freedman, p. 720, n. 2: ‘God make the name of Solomon illustrious even as the nature of your own and make his throne great according to the character of your throne.’]*
- D. *“For if you do not say this, then [take account of the following:] ‘Blessed above women shall be Jael, the wife of Heber the Kenite, be, blessed shall she be above women in the tent’ (Jud. 5:24).*
- E. *“Now who are the women in the tent? They are Sarah, Rebecca, Rachel, and Leah.*
- F. *“Is it appropriate to speak in such a way? Rather, what is meant is ‘as good as ....,’ and here too the sense is, ‘as good as ....’”*
- G. *That statement differs from what R. Yosé bar Honi said.*
- H. For R. Yosé bar Honi said, “One may envy anybody except for his son and his disciple.
- I. “One learns the fact about one’s son from the case of Solomon.
- J. *“And as to the case of one’s disciple, if you wish, I shall propose, ‘Let a double quantity of your spirit be upon me.’ (2Ki. 2: 9)*
- K. *“Or if you wish, I shall derive proof from the following: ‘And he laid his hands upon him and gave him a charge’ (Num. 27:23).”*

**XI.15** A. “And the Lord put a thing in the mouth of Balaam” (Num. 23: 5):

B. R. Eleazar says, “It was an angel.”

C. R. Jonathan said, “It was a hook.”

**XI.16** A. Said R. Yohanan, “From the blessing said by that wicked man, you learn what he had in his heart.

B. “He wanted to say that they should not have synagogues and school houses: ‘How goodly are your tents, O Jacob’ (Num. 24: 5).

C. “[He wanted to say that] the Presence of God should not dwell on them: ‘And your tabernacles, O Israel’ (Num. 24: 5).

D. “[He wanted to say] that their kingdom should not last [thus, to the contrary]: ‘As the valleys are they spread forth’ (Num. 24: 6);

E. “... that they should have no olives and vineyards: ‘As the trees of aloes which the Lord has planted’ (Num. 24: 6);

G. “... that their kings should not be tall: ‘And as cedar trees beside the waters’ (Num. 24: 6).

H. “... that they should not have a king succeed his father as king: ‘He shall pour the water out of his buckets’ (Num. 24: 6).

I. “... that their kingdom should not rule over others: ‘And his seed shall be in many waters’ (Num. 24: 6).

J. “... that their kingdom should not be strong: ‘And his king shall be higher than Agag’ (Num. 24: 6).

K. “... that their kingdom not be fearful: ‘And his kingdom shall be exalted’ (Num. 24: 6).”

L. Said R. Abba b. Kahana, “All of them were [ultimately] turned into a curse, except for the one on the synagogues and school houses, as it is said, ‘But the Lord your God turned the curse into a blessing for you, because the Lord your God loved you’ (Deu. 23: 6).

M. “‘The curse’ — not the [other] curses...”

**XI.17** A. Said R. Samuel bar Nahmani said R. Jonathan, “What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture: ‘Faithful are the wounds of a friend, but the kisses of an enemy are deceitful’ (Pro. 27: 6)?

B. “Better was the curse with which Ahijah the Shilonite cursed the Israelites than the blessing with which the wicked Balaam blessed them.

C. “Ahijah the Shilonite cursed the Israelites by reference to a reed, as it is said, ‘For the Lord shall smite Israel as a reed is shaken in the water’ (1Ki. 14:15).

D. “Just as a reed stands in a place in which there is water, so its stem **[106A]** is renewed and its roots abundant, so that, even if all the winds in the world come and blow against it, they cannot move it from its place, but it goes on swaying with them. When the winds fall silent, the reed stands in its place. [So is Israel].

E. “But the wicked Balaam blessed them by reference to a cedar tree [at 24:6].

F. “Just as a cedar tree does not stand in a place in which there is water, so its roots are few, and its truck is not renewed, so that while, even if all the winds in the world come and blow against it, they will not move it from its place, when the

south wind blows against it, it uproots it right away and turns it on its face, [so is Israel].

- G. “And not only so, but the reed has the merit that from it a quill is taken for the writing of scrolls of the Torah, prophets, and writings.”

**XI.18** A. “And he looked on the Kenite and took up his parable” (Num. 24:21):

- B. Said Balaam to Jethro the Kenite, “Were you not with us in that conspiracy [of Pharaoh, Exo. 1:22]? [Of course you were.] Then who gave you a seat among the mighty men of the earth [in the sanhedrin]?”
- C. *This is in line with what R. Hiyya bar Abba said R. Simai said*, “Three participated in that conspiracy [of Exo. 1:22, to destroy the Israelites in the river], Balaam, Job, and Jethro.
- D. “Balaam, who gave the advice, was slain. Job, who kept silent, was judged through suffering. Jethro, who fled, had the merit that some of his sons’ sons would go into session [as judges] in the Hewn-Stone Chamber,
- E. “as it is said, ‘And the families of scribes which dwelt at Jabez, the Tirahites, the Shemathites, the Sucathites. These are the Kenites that came of Hammath, the father of the house of Rehab’ (2Ch. 2:55). And it is written, ‘And the children of the Kenite, Moses’ father-in-law ...’ (Jud. 1:16).”

**XI.19** A. “And he took up his parable and said, Alas, who shall live when God does this” (Num. 24:23):

- B. Said R. Yohanan, “Woe to the nation who is at hand when the Holy One, blessed be he, effects the redemption of his children!
- C. “Who would want to throw his garment between a lion and a lioness when they are having sexual relations?”

**XI.20** A. “And ships shall come from the coast of Chittim” (Num. 24:24):

- B. Said Rab, “[Legions will come] from the coast of Chittim” [cf. Freedman, p. 722, n. 12].
- C. “And they shall afflict Assyria and they shall afflict Eber” (Num. 24:24):
- D. *Up to Assyria they shall kill, from that point they shall enslave.*

**XI.21** A. “And now, behold, I go to my people; come and I shall advise you what this people shall do to your people in the end of days” (Num. 24:24):

- B. *Rather than saying*, “This people to your people,” *it should say*, “Your people to this people.” [Freedman, p. 723, n. 4: He advised the Moabites to ensnare Israel through uncharity. Thus he was referring to an action by the former to the latter, while Scripture suggests otherwise.]
- C. Said R. Abba, “It is like a man who curses himself but assigns the curse to others. [Scripture alludes to Israel but refers to Moab.]
- C. “[Balaam] said to [Balak], ‘The God of these people hates fornication, and they lust after linen [clothing, which rich people wear]. Come and I shall give you advice: Make tents and set whores in them, an old one outside and a girl inside. Let them sell linen garments to them.’
- E. “He made tents for them from the snowy mountain to Beth Hajeshimoth [north to south] and put whores in them, old women outside, young women inside.

- F. “When an Israelite was eating and drinking and carousing and going out for walks in the market, the old lady would say to him, ‘Don’t you want some linen clothes?’
- G. “The old lady would offer them at true value, and the girl would offer them at less.
- H. “This would happen two or three times, and then [the young one] would say to him, ‘Lo, you are at home here. Sit down and make a choice for yourself.’ Gourds of Ammonite wine would be set near her. (At this point the wine of gentiles had not yet been forbidden to Israelites.) She would say to him, ‘Do you want to drink a cup of wine?’
- I. “When he had drunk a cup of wine, he would become inflamed. He said to her, ‘Submit to me.’ She would then take her god from her bosom and said to him, ‘Worship this.’
- J. “He would say to her, ‘Am I not a Jew?’
- K. “She would say to him, ‘What difference does it make to you? Do they ask anything more from you than that you bare yourself?’ But he did not know that that was how this idol was served.
- L. ““And not only so, but I shall not let you do so until you deny the Torah of Moses, your master!’
- M. “As it is said, ‘They went in to Baal-peor and separated themselves unto that shame, and their abominations were according as they loved’ (Hos. 9:10).”

**XI.22** A. “And Israel dwelt in Shittim” (Num. 25: 1):

- B. R. Eliezer says, “The name of the place actually was Shittim.”
- C. R. Joshua says, “It was so called because when there they did deeds of idiocy (STWT).”
- D. “And they called the people to the sacrifices of their gods” (Num. 25: 2):
- E. R. Eliezer says, “They met them naked.”
- F. R. Joshua says, “They all had involuntary seminal emissions.”
- G. *What is the meaning of Rephidim [Exo. 17: 8: “Then came Amalek and fought with Israel in Rephidim”]?*
- H. R. Eliezer says, “It was actually called Rephidim.”
- I. R. Joshua says, “It was a place in which they weakened their [ties to] the teachings of the Torah, as it is written, ‘The fathers shall not look back to their children for feebleness of hands’ (Jer. 47: 3).”

**XI.23** A. R. Yohanan said, “Any passage in which the word, ‘And he abode’ appears, it means suffering.

- B. “So: ‘And Israel abode in Shittim, and the people began to commit whoredom with the daughters of Moab’ (Num. 23: 1).
- C. ““And Jacob dwelt in the land where his father was a stranger, in the land of Canaan’ (Gen. 37: 1). ‘And Joseph brought to his father their evil report’ (Gen. 37: 3).
- D. “And Israel dwelt in the land of Egypt, in the country of Goshen’ (Gen. 47:27), ‘And the time drew near that Israel must die’ (Gen. 47:29).
- E. ““And Judah and Israel dwelt safely, every man under his vine and under his fig tree’ (1Ki. 5: 5). ‘And the Lord stirred up an adversary to Solomon, Hadad the Edomite; he was the king’s seed in Edom’ (1Ki. 11:14).”

- XI.24** A. "And they slew the kings of Midian, beside the rest of them that were slain ... Balaam also, the son of Beor, they slew with the sword" (Num. 31: 8):
- B. *What was he doing there anyhow?*
  - C. Said R. Yohanan, "He went to collect a salary on account of the twenty-four thousand Israelites whom he had brought down" [Cf. Num. 25:1-9]."
  - D. *Mar Zutra b. Tobiah said Rab said, "That is in line with what people say: 'When the camel went to ask for horns, the ears that he had they cut off him.'"*
- XI.25** A. "Balaam also, the son of Beor, the soothsayer, [did the children of Israel slay with the sword]" (Jos. 13:22):
- B. A soothsayer? He was a prophet!
  - C. Said R. Yohanan, "At first he was a prophet, but in the end, a mere soothsayer."
  - D. *Said R. Pappa, "This is in line with what people say: 'She who came from princes and rulers played the whore with a carpenter.'"*
- XI.26** A. **[106B]** "...did the children of Israel slay with the sword, among those who were slain by them" (Jos. 13:22):
- B. Said Rab, "They inflicted upon him all four forms of execution: stoning, burning, decapitation, and strangulation."
- XI.27** A. *A min said to R. Hanina, "Have you heard how old Balaam was?"*
- B. *He said to him, "It is not written out explicitly. But since it is written, 'Bloody and deceitful men shall not live out half their days' (Psa. 55:24), he would have been thirty-three or thirty-four years old."*
  - C. *He said to him, "You have spoken well. I saw the notebook of Balaam, in which it is written, 'Balaam, the lame, was thirty-three years old when Phineas, the brigand, killed him.'"*
- XI.28** A. *Said Mar, son of Rabina, to his son, "In regard to all of those [listed as not having a share in the world to come], you should take up the verses relating to them and expound them only in the case of the wicked Balaam. In his case, in whatever way one can expound the relevant passages [to his detriment], you do so."*
- XII.1** A. **Doeg:** It is written, "Doeg" (1Sa. 21: 8) [meaning, "anxious" (Freedman, p. 726, n. 1)] and it is written, "Doeeg" (1Sa. 22:18) [with letters indicating "woe" being inserted (Freedman, ad loc.)].
- B. Said R. Yohanan, "To begin with, the Holy One, blessed be he, sits and worries lest such a son one go forth to bad ways. After he has gone forth to bad ways, he says, 'Woe that this one has gone forth!'"
- XII.2** A. *Said R. Isaac, "What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture, 'Why do you boast yourself in mischief, O mighty man? The goodness of God endures forever' (Psa. 52: 3)?"*
- B. "Said the Holy One, blessed be he, to Doeg, 'Are you not a hero in Torah-learning! 'Why do you boast in mischief?' Is not the love of God spread over you all day long?'"
  - C. *And said R. Isaac, "What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture, 'But to the wicked God says, What have you to do to declare my statutes?' (Psa. 50:16)?"*

- D. “So the Holy One, blessed be he, said to the wicked Doeg, “‘What have you to do to declare my statutes? “When you come to the passages that deal with murderers and slanderers, what have you to say about them!’”

**XII.3** A. “Or that you take my covenant in your mouth?” (Psa. 50:16):

- B. Said R. Ammi, “The Torah-knowledge of Doeg comes only from the lips and beyond [but not inside his heart].”

**XII.4** A. Said R. Isaac, “What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture, ‘The righteous also shall see and fear and shall laugh at him’ (Psa. 52: 8)?

- B. “To begin with they shall fear [the wicked], but in the end they shall laugh at him.”
- C. *And said R. Isaac, “What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture: ‘He has swallowed down riches and he shall vomit them up again, the God shall cast them out of his belly’ (Job. 20:15)?*
- D. “Said David before the Holy One, blessed be he, ‘Lord of the world, let Doeg die.’
- E. “He said to him, “‘He has swallowed down riches, and he shall vomit them up again’ (Job. 20:15).’
- F. “He said to him, “‘Let God cast them out of his belly’ (Job. 20:15).”
- G. *And said R. Isaac, “What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture: ‘God shall likewise destroy you forever’ (Psa. 52: 7)?*
- H. “Said the Holy One, blessed be he, to David, ‘Should I bring Doeg to the world to come?’
- I. “He said to him, “‘God shall likewise destroy you forever’ (Psa. 52: 7).”
- J. “What is the meaning of the verse: ‘He shall take you away and pluck you out of the tent and root you out of the land of the living, selah’ (Psa. 52: 7)?
- K. “Said the Holy One, blessed be he, ‘*Let a tradition in the school house be repeated in his name.*’
- L. “He said to him, “‘He shall take you away and pluck you out of the tent’ (Psa. 52: 7).’
- M. “*Then let his children be rabbis.*’
- N. “““And your root out of the land of the living, selah!””
- O. *And said R. Isaac, “What is the meaning of the verse of Scripture: ‘Where is he who counted, where is he who weighed? Where is he who counted the towers’ (Isa. 33:18)?*
- P. ““Where is he who counted all the letters in the Torah? Where is he who weighed all of the arguments a fortiori in the Torah?”
- Q. ““Where is he who counted the towers’ — who counted the three hundred decided laws that concern the ‘tower that flies in the air’ [that is, the laws governing the status of the contents of a closed cabinet not standing on the ground].”

**XII.5** A. Said R. Ammi, “*Four hundred questions did Doeg and Ahitophel raise concerning the ‘tower flying in the air,’ and they could not answer any one of them.*”

- B. Said Raba, “*Is there any recognition of the achievement of raising questions? In the time of R. Judah, all of their repetition of Mishnah-teachings concerned the civil laws [of Baba Qamma, Baba Mesia, and Baba Batra], while, for our part,*



*we repeat the Mishnah-traditions even dealing with tractate Uqsin [a rather peripheral topic].*

- C. *“When for his part R. Judah came to the law, ‘A woman who pickles vegetables in a pot’ [M. Toh. 2:1], or some say, ‘Olives which were pickled with their leaves are insusceptible to uncleanness’ [M. Uqs. 2:1], he would say, ‘I see here all the points of reflection of Rab and Samuel.*
- D. *“But we repeat the tractate of Uqsin at thirteen sessions [having much more to say about it].*
- E. *“When R. Judah merely removed his shoes [in preparation for a fast], it would rain.*
- F. *“When we cry out [in supplication], no one pays any attention to us.*
- G. *“But the Holy One, blessed be he, demands the heart, as it is written, ‘But the Lord looks on the heart’ (1Sa. 16: 7).”*

**XII.6** A. Said R. Mesharshayya, *“Doeg and Ahitophel did not know how to reason concerning traditions.”*

- B. *Objected Mar Zutra, “Can it be the case that one concerning whom it is written, ‘Where is he who counted, where is he who weighed, where is he who counted the towers?’ (Isa. 33:18) should not be able to reason concerning traditions? But it never turned out that traditions [in their names] were stated in accord with the decided law, for it is written, ‘The secret of the Lord is with those who fear him’ (Psa. 25:14).”*

**XII.7** A. Said R. Ammi, *“Doeg did not die before he forgot his learning, as it is said, ‘He shall die without instruction, and in the greatness of his folly he shall go astray’ (Pro. 5:23).”*

- B. Rab said, *“He was afflicted with saraat, for it is said, ‘You have destroyed all them who go awhoring from you’ (Psa. 73:27), and elsewhere it is written, ‘And if it not be redeemed within the span of a full year, then the house shall be established finally [to him who bought it]’ (Lev. 25:30).*
- C. *“[The word indicated as ‘finally’ and the word for ‘destroyed’ use the same letters]. And we have learned in the Mishnah: **The only difference between one who is definitely afflicted with saraat and one who is shut away for observation is in respect to letting the hair grow long and tearing the garment [M. Meg. 1:7],** [Freedman, p. 729, n. 6: which shows that the term at hand is used to indicate someone is afflicted with saraat. Hence the first of the two verses is to be rendered, ‘You have smitten with definite leprosy all those who go awhoring from you.’]”*

**XII.8** A. Said R. Yohanan, *“Three injurious angels were designated for Doeg: one to make him forget his learning, one to burn his soul, and one to scatter his dust among the synagogues and school houses.”*

- B. And said R. Yohanan, *“Doeg and Ahitophel never saw one another. Doeg lived in the time of Saul, and Ahitophel in the time of David.*
- C. *“And said R. Yohanan, “Doeg and Ahitophel did not live out half their days.”*
- D. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority along these same lines:*
- E. *“Bloody and deceitful men shall not live out half their days” (Psa. 55:24):*



- F. Doeg lived only for thirty-four years, Ahitophel for thirty three.
- G. And said R. Yohanan, “At the outset David called Ahitophel his master, at the end he called him his friend, and finally he called him his disciple.
- H. “At the beginning he called him his master: ‘But it was you, a man my equal, my guide and my acquaintance’ (Psa. 55:14).
- I. “Then his companion: ‘We took sweet counsel together and walked into the house of God in company’ (Psa. 55:15).
- J. “Finally, his disciple: ‘Yea, my own familiar friend, in whom I trusted **[107A]**, who ate my bread, has lifted his heel against me’ (Psa. 56:10). [Freedman, p. 729, n. 10: This is understood to refer to Ahitophel, and eating bread is a metaphor for ‘who learned of my teaching.’]”

### **King David: His Sin and Atonement**

- XII.9** A. Said R. Judah said Rab, “One should never put himself to the test, for lo, David, king of Israel, put himself to the test and he stumbled.
- B. “He said before him, ‘Lord of the world, on what account do people say, “God of Abraham, God of Isaac, and God of Jacob, “but they do not say, “God of David”?’
  - C. *“He said to him, ‘They endured a test for me, while you have not endured a test for me.’*
  - D. “He said before him, ‘Lord of the world, here I am. Test me.’
  - E. “For it is said, ‘Examine me, O Lord, and try me’ (Psa. 26: 1).
  - F. *“He said to him, ‘I shall test you, and I shall do for you something that I did not do for them. I did not inform them [what I was doing], while I shall tell you what I am going to do. I shall try you with a matter having to do with sexual relations.’*
  - G. “Forthwith: ‘And it came to pass in an eventide that David arose from off his bed’ (2Sa. 11: 2).”
  - H. Said R. Judah, “He turned his habit of having sexual relations by night into one of having sexual relations by day.
  - I. “He lost sight of the following law:
  - J. ““There is in man a small organ, which makes him feel hungry when he is sated and makes him feel sated when he is hungry.”
  - K. “And he walked on the roof of the king’s palace, and from the roof he saw a woman washing herself, and the woman was very beautiful to look upon” (2Sa. 11: 2):
  - L. *Bath Sheba was shampooing her hair behind a screen. Satan came to [David] and appeared to him in the form of a bird. He shot an arrow at [the screen] and broke it down, so that she stood out in the open, and he saw her.*
  - M. Forthwith: “And David sent and inquired after the woman. And one said, Is not this Bath Sheba, the daughter of Eliam, the wife of Uriah the Hittite? And David sent messengers and took her, and she came to him, and he lay with her; for she was purified from her uncleanness; and she returned to her house; (2Sa. 11:203).
  - N. *That is in line with what is written:* “You have tried my heart, you have visited me in the night, you have tried me and shall find nothing; I am purposed that my mouth shall not transgress” (Psa. 17: 3).

- O. *He said, "Would that a bridle had fallen into my mouth, that I had not said what I said!"*

**XII.10** A. *Raba interpreted Scripture, asking, "What is the meaning of the following verse: 'To the chief musician, a Psalm of David. In the Lord I put my trust, how do you say to my soul, Flee as a bird to your mountain?' (Psa. 11: 1)?"*

- B. *"Said David before the Holy One, blessed be he, 'Lord of the world, Forgive me for that sin, so that people should not say, "The mountain that is among you [that is, your king] has been driven off by a bird.'"*
- C. *Raba interpreted Scripture, asking, "What is the meaning of the following verse: 'Against you, you alone, have I sinned, and done this evil in your sight, that you might be justified when you speak and be clear when you judge' (Psa. 11: 1)?"*
- D. *"Said David before the Holy One, blessed be he, 'Lord of the world. It is perfectly clear to you that if I had wanted to overcome my impulse to do evil, I should have done so. But I had in mind that people not say, "The slave has conquered the Master [God, and should then be included as 'God of David']'."*
- E. *Raba interpreted Scripture, asking, "What is the meaning of the following verse: 'For I am ready to halt and my sorrow is continually before me' (Psa. 38:18)?"*
- F. *"Bath Sheba, daughter of Eliam, was designated for David from the six days of creation, but she came to him through anguish."*
- G. *And so did a Tannaite authority of the house of R. Ishmael [teach], "Bath Sheba, daughter of Eliam, was designated for David, but he 'ate' her while she was yet unripe."*
- H. *Raba interpreted Scripture, asking, "What is the meaning of the following verse: 'But in my adversity they rejoiced and gathered themselves together, yes, the abjects gathered themselves together against me and I did not know it, they tore me and did not cease' (Psa. 35:15)?"*
- I. *"Said David before the Holy One, blessed be he, 'Lord of the world, it is perfectly clear to you that if they had torn my flesh, my blood would not have flowed [because I was so embarrassed]."*
- J. *Not only so, but when they take up the four modes of execution inflicted by a court, they interrupt their Mishnah-study and say to me, "David, he who has sexual relations with a married woman — how is he put to death?"*
- K. *"I say to them, "He who has sexual relations with a married woman is put to death through strangulation, but he has a share in the world to come," while he who humiliates his fellow in public has no share in the world to come.'"*

**XII.11** A. *Said R. Judah said Rab, "Even when David was sick, he carried out the eighteen acts of sexual relations that were owing to his [eighteen] wives, as it is written, 'I am weary with my groaning, all night I make my bed swim, I water my couch with my tears' (Psa. 6: 7)."*

- B. *And said R. Judah said, Rab, "David wanted to worship idols, as it is said, 'And it happened that when David came to the head, where he worshipped God' (2Sa. 15:32), and 'head' only means idols, as it is written, 'This image's head was of fine gold' (Dan. 2:32)."*
- C. *"Behold, Hushai, the Archite came to meet him with his coat rent and earth upon his head' (2Sa. 15:32):"*

- D. “He said to David, ‘Are people to say that a king such as you have worshipped idols?’
- E. “He said to him, ‘Will the son of a king such as me kill him? It is better that such a king as me worship an idol and not profane the Name of heaven in public.’
- F. *“He said, ‘Why then did you marry a woman captured in battle? [Freedman, p. 732, n. 7: Absalom’s mother, Maachah, the daughter of Talmai, king of Geshur, was a war captive.]”*
- G. *“He said to him, ‘As to a woman captured in battle, the All-Merciful has permitted marrying her.’*
- H. *“He said to him, ‘You did not correctly interpret the meaning of the proximity of two verses. For it is written, ‘If a man has stubborn and rebellious son’ (Deu. 21:18).*
- I. “[The proximity teaches that] whoever marries a woman captured in battle will have a stubborn and rebellious son.”

**XII.12** A. R. Dosetai of Biri interpreted Scripture, “To what may David be likened? To a Samaritan merchant.

- B. “Said David before the Holy One, blessed be he, ‘Lord of the world, “Who can understand his errors?” (Psa. 19:13).’
- C. *“He said to him, ‘They are remitted for you.’*
- D. ““Cleanse me of hidden faults” (Psa. 19:13).’
- E. *“‘They are remitted to you.’*
- F. ““Keep back your servant also from presumptuous sins” (Psa. 19:13).’
- G. *“‘They are remitted to you.’*
- H. ““Let them not have dominion over me, then I shall be upright” (Psa. 19:13), *so that the rabbis will not hold me up as an example.*’
- I. *“‘They are remitted to you.’*
- J. ““And I shall be innocent of great transgression” (Psa. 19:13), *so that they will not write down my ruin.*’
- K. “He said to him, ‘That is not possible. Now if the Y that I took away from the name of Sarah [changing it from Sarah to Sarah] stood crying for so many years until Joshua came and I added the Y [removed from Sarah’s name] to his name, as it is said, “And Moses called Oshea, the son of Nun, Jehoshua” (Num. 13:16), how much the more will a complete passage of Scripture [cry out if I remove that passage from its rightful place]!”

**XII.13** A. “And I shall be innocent from great transgression: (Psa. 19:13):

- B. He said before him, “Lord of the world, forgive me for the whole of that sin [as though I had never done it].”
- C. He said to him, “Solomon, your son, even now is destined to say in his wisdom, ‘Can a man take fire in his bosom, and his clothes not be burned? Can one go upon hot coals, and his feet not be burned? So he who goes in to his neighbor’s wife, whoever touches her shall not be innocent’ (Pro. 6:27-29).”
- D. *He said to him, “Will I be so deeply troubled?”*
- E. He said to him, “Accept suffering [as atonement].”

F. He accepted the suffering.

**XII.14 A.** Said R. Judah said Rab, “For six months David was afflicted with saraat, and the Presence of God left him, and the sanhedrin abandoned him.

B. “He was afflicted with saraat, as it is written, ‘Purge me with hyssop and I shall be clean, wash me and I shall be whiter than snow/ (Psa. 51: 9).

C. “The Presence of God left him, as it is written, ‘Restore to me the joy of your salvation and uphold me with your free spirit’ (Psa. 51:14).

D. “The sanhedrin abandoned him, as it is written, ‘Let those who fear you turn to me and those who have known your testimonies’ (Psa. 119:79).

E. “How do we know that this lasted for six months? As it is written, ‘And the days that David rules over Israel were forty years: **[107B]** Seven years he reigned in Hebron, and thirty-three years he reigned in Jerusalem’ (1Ki. 2:11).

F. “Elsewhere it is written, ‘In Hebron he reigned over Judah seven years and six months’ (2Sa. 5: 5).

G. *“So the six months were not taken into account. Accordingly, he was afflicted with saraat [for such a one is regarded as a corpse].*

H. “He said before him, ‘Lord of the world, forgive me for that sin.’

I. “‘It is forgiven to you.’

J. ““‘Then show me a token for good, that they who hate me may see it and be ashamed, because you, Lord, have helped me and comforted me’” (Psa. 86:17).’

K. “He said to him, ‘While you are alive, I shall not reveal [the fact that you are forgiven], but I shall reveal it in the lifetime of your son, Solomon.’

L. “When Solomon had built the house of the sanctuary, he tried to bring the ark into the house of the Holy of Holies. The gates cleaved to one another. He recited twenty-four prayers [Freedman, p. 734, n. 4: in 2Ch. 6 words for prayer, supplication and hymn occur twenty-four times], but was not answered.

M. “He said, ‘Lift up your head, O you gates, and be lifted up, you everlasting doors, and the King of glory shall come in. Who is this King of glory? The Lord strong and might, the Lord mighty in battle’ (Psa. 24:7ff.).

N. “And it is further said, ‘Lift up your heads, O you gates even lift them up, you everlasting doors/ (Psa. 24: 7).

O. “But he was not answered.

P. “When he said, ‘Lord God, turn not away the face of your anointed, remember the mercies of David, your servant’ (2Ch. 6:42), forthwith he was answered.

Q. “At that moment the faces of David’s enemies turned as black as the bottom of a pot, for all Israel knew that the Holy One, blessed be he, had forgiven him for that sin.”

**XIII.1 A. Gehazi [M. 11:2F]:**

B. As it is written, “And Elisha came to Damascus” (2Ki. 8: 7).

C. *Where was he traveling [when he came to Damascus]?*

D. Said R. Yohanan, “He went to bring Gehazi back in repentance, but he did not repent.

E. “He said to him, ‘Repent.’

- F. “He said to him, ‘This is the tradition that I have received from you: “Whoever has both sinned and caused others to sin will never have sufficient means to do penitence.”””
- G. *What had he done?*
- H. *Some say, “He hung a lodestone on the sin[ful statue built by] Jeroboam and suspended it between heaven and earth.”*
- I. *Others say, “He carved on it the Name of God, so that it would say, ‘I [am the Lord your God]...You shall not have [other gods...]’ (Exo. 20:1-2).”*
- J. *Still others say, “He drove rabbis away from his presence, as it is said, ‘And the sons of the prophets said to Elisha, “See now the place where we swell before you is too small for us” (2Ki. 6: 1). The sense then is that up to that time, it was not too small.”*

**XIII.2 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. Under all circumstances the left hand should push away and the right hand should draw near,
- C. not in the manner of Elisha, who drove away Gehazi with both hands.
- D. What is the case with Gehazi?
- E. As it is written, “And Naaman said, ‘Be pleased to accept two talents” (2Ki. 5:23).
- F. And it is written, “But he said to him, ‘Did I not go with you in spirit when the man turned from his chariot to meet you? Was it a time to accept money and garments, olive orchards and vineyards, sheep and oxen, menservants and maidservants” (2Ki. 5:26).
- G. *But did he receive all these things? He got only silver and garments.*
- H. Said R. Isaac, “At that moment Elisha was occupied with the study of the list of eight dead creeping things [M. **Shab. 14:1**, Lev. 11:29].
- I. Naaman, head of the army of the king of Syria, was afflicted with saraat. *A young girl who had been taken captive from the land of Israel said to him, “If you go to Elisha, he will heal you.”*
- J. *When he got there, he said to him, “Go, immerse in the Jordan.”*
- K. *He said to him, “You are making fun of me!”*
- L. *Those who were with him said to him, “Go, try it, what difference does it make to you?”*
- M. *He went and immersed in the Jordan and was healed.*
- N. *He came and brought him everything that he had, but [Elisha] would not take it. Gehazi took leave of Elisha and went and took what he took and hid it.*
- O. *When he came back, Elisha saw the marks of saraat, as they blossomed all over his head.*
- P. “He said to Gehazi, ‘Wicked one! The time has come to receive the reward for the eight dead creeping things: “Therefore the leprosy of Naaman shall cleave to you and to your descendants forever” (2Ki. 8:27).”

**XIII.3 A.** “Now there were four men who were lepers [at the entrance to the gate]” (2Ki. 7: 3):

- B. R. Yohanan said, "This refers to Gehazi and his three sons."
- C. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:* R. Simeon b. Eleazar says, "Also in one's natural impulse, as to a child or a woman, one should push away with the left hand and draw near with the right hand."

[Freedman, p. 736, n. 2: The uncensored edition continues: What of R. Joshua b. Perahjah? — When King Jannai slew our Rabbis, R. Joshua b. Perahjah (and Jesus) fled to Alexandria of Egypt. On the resumption of peace, Simeon b. Shetach sent to him: 'From me, (Jerusalem) the holy city, to thee, Alexandria of Egypt (my sister). My husband dwelleth within thee and I am desolate.' He arose, went, and found himself in a certain inn, where great honour was shown him. 'How beautiful is this Acsania?' (The word denotes both inn and innkeeper. R. Joshua used it in the first sense; the answer assumes the second to be meant.) Thereupon (Jesus) observed, 'Rabbi, her eyes are narrow.' 'Wretch," he rebuked him, 'dost thou thus engage thyself.' He sounded four hundred trumpets and excommunicated him. He (Jesus) came before him many times pleading, 'Receive me!' But he would pay no heed to him. One day he (R. Joshua) was reciting the Shema', when Jesus came before him. He intended to receive him and made a sign to him. He (Jesus) thinking that it was to repel him, went, put up a brick, and worshipped it. 'Repent,' said he (R. Joshua) to him. He replied, 'I have thus learned from thee: He who sins and causes others to sin is not afforded the means of repentance.' And a Master has said, 'Jesus the Nazarene practiced magic and led Israel astray.']

### **XIII.4** A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. Elisha bore three illnesses,
- C. one because he brought the she-bears against the children, one because he pushed Gehazi away with both hands, and one on account of which he died.
- D. For it is said, "Now Elisha had fallen sick of the ailment of which he died" (2Ki. 13:14).

### **XIII.5** A. Until Abraham there was no such thing as [the sign of] old age. Whoever saw Abraham thought, "This is Isaac." Whoever saw Isaac thought, "This is Abraham."

- B. *Abraham prayed for mercy so that he might have [signs of] old age, as it is said, "And Abraham was old, and well stricken in age" (Gen. 24: 1).*
- C. *Until the time of Jacob there was no such thing as illness, so he prayed for mercy and illness came about, as it is written, "And someone told Joseph, behold, your father is sick: (Gen. 48: 1).*
- D. *"Until the time of Elisha, no one who was sick ever got well. Elisha came along and prayed for mercy and got well, as it is written, "Now Elisha had fallen sick of the illness of which he died" (2Ki. 13:14) [Freedman: This shows that he had been sick on previous occasions too, but recovered.]*

The important question at hand is self-evident: how has the compositor of this tractate of monstrous proportions arranged the materials at hand. The answer is given in the outline at Chapter Twelve. There we see that the entire construction devotes itself to the exposition of the Mishnah, with one topical composite after another, but remarkably few secondary insertions and accretions.



## 11:3A-CC

- A. The generation of the flood has no share in the world to come,
- B. and they shall not stand in the judgment,
- C. since it is written, “My spirit shall not judge with man forever” (Gen. 6: 3)
- D. neither judgment nor spirit.
- E. The generation of the dispersion has no share in the world to come,
- F. since it is said, “So the Lord scattered them abroad from there upon the face of the whole earth” (Gen. 11: 8).
- G. “So the Lord scattered them abroad” — in this world,
- H. “and the Lord scattered them from there” — in the world to come.
- I. The men of Sodom have no portion in the world to come,
- J. since it is said, “Now the men of Sodom were wicked and sinners against the Lord exceedingly” (Gen. 13:13)
- K. “Wicked” — in this world,
- L. “And sinners” — in the world to come.
- M. But they will stand in judgment.
- N. R. Nehemiah says, “Both these and those will not stand in judgment,
- O. ‘for it is said, ‘Therefore the wicked shall not stand in judgment [108A], nor sinners in the congregation of the righteous’ (Psa. 1: 5)
- P. ‘Therefore the wicked shall not stand in judgment’ — this refers to the generation of the flood.
- Q. ‘Nor sinners in the congregation of the righteous’ — this refers to the men of Sodom.”
- R. They said to him, “They will not stand in the congregation of the righteous, but they will stand in the congregation of the sinners.”
- S. The spies have no portion in the world to come,
- T. as it is said, “Even those men who brought up an evil report of the land died by the plague before the Lord” (Num. 14:37)
- U. “Died” — in this world.
- V. “By the plague” — in the world to come.
- W. “The generation of the wilderness has no portion in the world to come and will not stand in judgment,
- X. “for it is written, ‘In this wilderness they shall be consumed and there they shall die’ (Num. 14:35), “The words of R. Aqiba.
- Y. R. Eliezer says, “Concerning them it says, ‘Gather my saints together to me, those that have made a covenant with me by sacrifice’ (Psa. 50: 5).”
- Z. “The party of Korah is not destined to rise up,
- AA. “for it is written, ‘And the earth closed upon them’ — in this world.
- BB. ““And they perished from among the assembly’ — in the world to come,” the words of R. Aqiba.
- CC. And R. Eliezer says, “Concerning them it says, ‘The Lord kills and resurrects, brings down to Sheol and brings up again’ (1Sa. 2: 6).”



**I.1** A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. “The generation of the flood has no share in the world to come [M. 11:3A],
- C. “nor will they live in the world to come,
- D. “as it is said, And he destroyed every living thing that was upon the face of the earth (Gen. 7:23) in this world;
- E. “and they perished from the earth in the world to come,” the words of R. Aqiba.
- F. R. Judah B. Betera says, “They will live nor be judged, as it is said, And the Lord said, My spirit shall not contend with man forever’ (Gen. 6: 3)
- G. “It will not contend, nor will my spirit be in them forever.”
- H. Another matter: “And the Lord said, My spirit shall not contend: — [Said the Omnipresent,] that their spirit will not return to its sheath.
- I. R. Menahem b. R. Joseph says, [In T.’s version:] “It will not contend —
- J. “Said the Omnipresent, ‘I shall not contend with them when I pay the good reward which is coming to the righteous.’
- K. “But the spirit of the evil is harder for them than that of all the others.
- L. “as it is written, Their spirit is a fire consuming them (Isa. 33:11)” [T. San. 13:6A-K].

**I.2** A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. The generation of the Flood acted arrogantly before the Omnipresent only on account of the good which he lavished on them, since it is said, “Their houses are safe from fear, neither is the rod of God upon them” (Job. 21: 9). “Their bull genders and fails not, their cow calves and casts not her calf” (Job. 21:10). “They send forth their little ones like a flock, and their children dance” (Job. 21:11). “They spend their days in prosperity and their years in pleasures” (Job. 36:11).
- C. That is what caused them to say to God, “Depart from us, for we do not desire knowledge of thy ways. What is the Almighty, that we should serve Him, and what profit should we have, if we pray to him (Job. 21:14).
- D. They said, “Do we need Him for anything except a few drops of rain? But look, we have rivers and wells which are more than enough for us in the sunny season and in the rainy season, since it is said, And a mist rose from the earth (Gen. 2: 6).”
- E. The Omnipresent then said to them, “By the goodness which I lavished on them they take pride before me? By that same good I shall exact punishment from them!”
- F. What does it say? “And I, behold, I bring a flood of water upon the earth” (Gen. 6:17).
- G. R. Yosé B. Durmasqit says, “The men of the Flood took pride only on account of [the covetousness of] the eyeball, which is like water, as it is said, ‘The sons of God saw that the daughter of men were fair, and they took them wives from all which they chose (Gen. 6: 2).
- H. “Also the Omnipresent exacted punishment from them only through water, which is like the eyeball, as it is written, ‘All the fountains of the great deep

were broken up, and the windows of heaven were opened' (Gen. 7:11)" [T. Sot. 3:6-9]

- I.3** A. Said R. Yohanan, "As to the generation of the flood, they corrupted their way 'greatly,' and they were judged 'greatly.'"  
B. "They corrupted their way greatly, as it is said, 'And God saw that the wickedness of man was great in the earth' (Gen. 6: 5).  
C. "They were judged greatly, as it is said, 'All the fountains of the great deep' (Gen. 7:11)."  
D. Said R. Yohanan, "Three [of those fountains remained, the gulf of Gaddor, the hot springs of Tiberias, and the great well of Biram.:

- I.4** A. "For all flesh had corrupted its way upon the earth" (Gen. 6:12):  
B. Said R. Yohanan, "This teaches that [the men of the generation of the flood] made a hybrid match between a domesticated beast and a wild animal, a wild animal and a domesticated beast, and every sort of beast with man and man with every sort of beast."  
C. Said R. Abba bar Kahana, "And all of them reverted [to the right way] except for the Tartarian lark [Freedman, p. 740, n. 10]."

- I.5** A. "And God said to Noah, the end of all flesh is come before me" (Gen. 6:13).  
B. Said R. Yohanan, "Come and take note of how great is the power of robbery.  
C. "For lo, the generation of the flood violated every sort of law, but the decree of punishment against them was sealed only when they went and committed robbery, for it is said, 'For the earth is filled with violence through them, and behold I will destroy them with the earth' (Gen. 6:13).  
D. "And it is written, 'Violence is risen up into a rod of wickedness, none of them shall remain, nor of their multitude, nor any of theirs, neither shall there be wailing for them' (Eze. 7:11)."  
E. Said R. Eleazar, "The cited verse teaches that [violence] stood up straight like a staff and stood before the Holy One, blessed be he, and said to him, 'Lord of the world, Neither them, nor of their multitudes, nor of any thing belonging to them, nor will there be wailing for them.'"

- I.6** A. *A Tannaite authority of the house of R. Ishmael [said],* "Also the decree of punishment for Noah was issued, but he pleased the Lord,"  
B. "as it is said, 'I am sorry that I made them. But Noah found favor in the eyes of the Lord' (Gen. 6: 7-8)."

- I.7** A. "And the Lord was comforted that he had made man in the earth" (Gen. 6: 6).  
B. When R. Dimi came, [he said,] "The Holy One, blessed be he, said, 'I did well that I made graves for them in the earth [Freedman, p. 741, n. 6: since the wicked are thereby destroyed].'  
C. "*How is this indicated? Here it is written, 'And the Lord was comforted' (Gen. 6: 6) and elsewhere: 'And he comforted them and spoke kindly to them' (Gen. 50:21).*"  
D. *There are those who say,* "[He said,] 'I did not do well that I made graves for them in the earth.

E. “Here it is written, ‘And the Lord regretted...’ (Gen. 6: 6) and elsewhere: ‘And the Lord regretted the evil that he had thought to do to his people’ (Exo. 32:14).”

**I.8 A.** “These are the generations of Noah: Noah was a righteous man, perfect in his generations” (Gen. 6: 9):

B. Said R. Yohanan, “By the standards of his generations, but not by the standards of other generations [was he perfect].”

C. R. Simeon b. Laqish said, “By the standards of his generations, and all the more so by the standards of other generations.”

D. Said R. Hanina, “As to the view of R. Yohanan, one may propose a comparison. To what may the matter be compared? To the case of a keg of wine, stored in a wine cellar of vinegar.

E. “In its setting, its fragrance is noteworthy, but in any other setting, its fragrance would not be noteworthy.”

F. Said R. Oshaia, “As to the view of R. Simeon b. Laqish, one may propose a comparison. To what may the matter be compared? To the case of a bottle of perfumed oil lying in a garbage dump.

G. “If it smells good in such a place, all the more so in a place in which there is spice!”

**I.9 A.** “And every living substance was destroyed which was upon the face of the ground, both man and beast” (Gen. 7:23):

B. While man sinned, what sin had beasts committed?

C. *It was taught on Tannaite authority in the name of R. Joshua b. Qorha*, “The matter may be compared to the case of a man who made a marriage banquet for his son. He prepared all sorts of food for the banquet. After some days the son died. The man went and threw out [all the food he had prepared for] the banquet.

D. “He said, ‘Did I do anything except for my son? Now that he is died, what need have I for a marriage banquet?’

E. “So too the Holy One, blessed be he, said, ‘Did I create domesticated and wild beasts for any purpose other than for man? Now that man has sinned, what need have I for domesticated beasts or wild beasts?’”

**I.10 A.** “All that was on the dry land died” (Gen. 7:22) —

B. But not the fish in the sea.

**I.11 A.** R. Yosé of Caesarea expounded as follows: “What is the sense of the verse, ‘He is swift as the waters, their portion is cursed in the earth, [he does not behold the way of the vineyards]’ (Job. 24:18)?

B. “The verse teaches that Noah, the righteous man, rebuked them, saying to [his generation], ‘Carry out an act of repentance, for if not, the Holy One, blessed be he, will bring upon you a flood and your corpses will float on the water like gourds.’

C. “‘So it is written, “He is light upon the waters” (Job. 24:18).

D. “‘And not only so, but people will take from your example a curse for all who will pass through the world, as it is said, “Their portion is cursed in the earth” (Job. 24:18).’

E. “They said to him, ‘And what is stopping him now?’

- F. "He said to them, '[God] has one dear one to take away from your midst.'
- G. "[They replied], **[108B]** 'If so, we will not turn aside from the way of the vineyards, [that is, we shall continue in our drunkenness].'"

**I.12 A.** *Raba expounded as follows: "What is the meaning of the verse, 'He that is ready to slip with his feet is as a stone despised in the thought of him that is at ease' (Job. 12: 5)?"*

- B. "This teaches that the righteous Noah rebuked them, saying to them words as hard as stone, but they despised him, saying, 'Old man, what is this ark for?'
- C. "He said to them, 'The Holy One, blessed be he, is bringing a flood on you.'
- D. "They said to him, 'What sort of flood? If it is a flood of fire, we have something called alitha [Freedman, p. 743, n. 7: a fire-extinguishing demon].
- E. "'And if he brings a flood of water, if it comes from the earth, we have iron plates to cover up the earth [and keep the water down].
- F. "'If it comes from heaven, we have aqob (others say, aqosh) [Freedman, p. 743, n. 8: a legendary fungus, which when donned on the head protects against rain].'
- G. "He said to them, 'He will bring it from between your heels [legs, that is, from your penis], as it is said, "He is ready for the steps of your feet" (Job. 12: 5).'"
  - H. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*
    - I. The water of the flood was as hard as semen, as it is written, "It is ready for the steps of his feet" (Job. 12: 5).

**I.13 A.** Said R. Hisda, "By hot fluid they corrupted their way in transgression, and by hot fluid they were judged.

- B. "Here it is written, 'And the water cooled' (Gen. 8: 1), and elsewhere: 'Then the king's wrath cooled down' (Est. 7:10)."

**I.14 A.** "And it came to pass after seven days that the waters of the flood were upon the earth" (Gen. 7:10)"

- B. Said Rab, **"What is the meaning of these seven days?"**
- C. **"These are the seven days of mourning for Methuselah, the righteous man. This teaches that lamentation for the righteous held back the retribution from coming upon the world.**
- D. **"Another matter: 'After seven days' teaches that the Holy One, blessed be he, changed the order of the world for them, so that the sun came up in the west and set in the east.**
- E. **"Another matter: It teaches that the Holy One, blessed be he, first set a long a time for them, and then a short time.**
- F. **"Another matter: It teaches that he gave them a taste of the world to come, so that they should know how much good he would withhold from them [T. Sot. 10:3C. 4]."**

**I.15 A.** "Of every clean beast you shall take by sevens, man and wife" (Gen. 7: 2):

- B. *Do beasts relate as man and wife?*
- C. Said R. Samuel bar Nahmani said R. Jonathan, "It was to be from among those with whom no transgression had been committed."
- D. *How did he know?*

E. Said R. Hisda, "He brought them before the ark. Any that the ark received could be known not to have been the object of a transgression, and any that the ark did not receive could be known to be those with whom a transgression had been committed."

F. R. Abbahu said, "It was from among those who came on their won."

**I.16 A.** "Make an ark of gopher wood for yourself" (Gen. 6:14)"

B. *What is gopher wood?*

C. *Said R. Adda, "Members of the house of R. Shila say, 'It is a kind of cedar.'*

D. *"Others say, 'It is a hard wood of cedar.'"*

**I.17 A.** "A window (SHR) you shall make in the ark" (Gen. 6:16):

B. Said R. Yohanan, "The Holy One, blessed be he, said to Noah, 'Put up in its precious stones and pearls, so that they will give light for you as at noon [using the root for window].'"

**I.18 A.** "And in a cubit you shall finish the above" (Gen. 6:16)"

B. *In what way will it stand firm [against the rain].*

C. "With lower, second, and third stories you shall make it" (Gen. 6:16)"

D. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

E. The bottom for dung, the middle for beasts, the upper for man.

**I.19 A.** "And he sent forth a raven" (Gen. 8: 7):

B. Said R. Simeon b. Laqish, "The raven gave Noah a victorious reply, saying to him, 'Your master [God] hates me, and you hate me.

C. "'Your master hates me: 'Of the clean, seven, of the unclean, two' [and the raven is unclean].

D. "'You hate me, for you exempt the species of which you have seven, and send forth a species of which you have only two.

E. "'If I should be injured by the prince of heat or cold, will the world not end up lacking one species?

F. "'Or perhaps you need only to make use of my wife?'

G. "He said to him, 'Wicked creature! Even sexual relations with one normally permitted to me are presently forbidden [since it was not permitted to have sexual relations in the ark. Is it not an argument a fortiori that I should not desire sexual relations with one who normally is forbidden to me [namely, a bird]?'"

H. *And how do we know that sexual relations were forbidden?*

I. As it is written, "And you shall enter the ark, you, your sons, your wife, and the wives of your sons with you" (Gen. 6:18).

J. And elsewhere: "Go forth from the ark, you, your wife, your sons, and your sons' wives with you" (Gen. 8:16).

K. And, said R. Yohanan, "On the basis of this statement they said that sexual relations were forbidden in the ark [ad the instruction to go forth once more permitted sexual relations]."

**I.20 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. Three species had sexual relations in the ark, and all of them were smitten: the dog, raven, and Ham.
- C. The dog [was smitten by being condemned to be] tied up.
- D. The raven was smitten by having to spit [his semen into his mate's mouth].
- E. Ham was smitten in his skin.

**I.21** A. "Also he sent forth a dove from him to see if the waters had abated" (Gen. 8: 8):

- B. Said R. Jeremiah, "On the basis of this verse [we learn] that the dwelling of clean fowl was with the righteous."

**I.22** A. "And lo, in her mouth was an olive leaf as food" (Gen. 8:11):

- B. Said R. Eleazar, "The dove said before the Holy One, blessed be he, 'May my food be as bitter as an olive leaf but placed in our hand, and let it not be as sweet as honey but placed in the hand of mortals.'
- C. *"What gives evidence that the word at hand means 'as food'?"*
- D. *"From the following: 'Feed me [using the same root] with food convenient for me' (Pro. 30: 8)."*

**I.23** A. "After their families they went forth from the ark" (Gen. 8:19):

- B. Said R. Yohanan, "'After their families' and not they [Freedman: alone]." [Freedman, p. 746, n. 6: While in the ark, copulation was forbidden. On their exit, it was permitted. That is the significance of "after their families," which denotes that mating was resumed and they ceased to be a group of single entities.]

**I.24** A. Said R. Hana bar Bizna, "Said Eliezer [Abraham's servant] to Shem, the eldest [son], 'It is written, "After their families they went forth from the ark" (Gen. 8:19). *How was it with you? [How did you take care of all the animals, given their diverse needs, while you were in the ark?]*'

- B. "He said to him, 'We had a great deal of trouble in the ark. A beast who usually was to be fed by day we fed by day. One that usually was to be fed by night we fed by night. *As to the chameleon, father did not know what it ate.*'
- C. *"One day he was sitting and cutting up a pomegranate, and a worm fell out of it. [The chameleon] ate it. From that point forth, he would mash bran for it. When it became maggots, [the chameleon] ate it."*
- D. *As to the lion, it was fed by a fever, for said Rab, "For no fewer than six days and no more than thirteen, fever sustains."*
- E. *[Reverting to Shem's statement,] "'As to the phoenix, father found it lying in the hold of the ark. He said to it, "Don't you want food?"*
- F. *"It said to him, "I saw that you were occupied and thought not to bother you. "*
- G. *"He said to it, "May it be God's will that you not die, as it is written, 'Then I said I shall die in the nest, but I shall multiply my days as the phoenix' (Job. 29:18)."*
- H. Said R. Hanah bar Livai, "Said Shem, the eldest [son] to Eliezer, 'When the kings of the east and the west came against you, what did you do?'
- I. "He said to him, 'The Holy One, blessed be he, came to Abraham and set him at his right hand, and [God and Abraham] threw dirt, which turned into swords, and [they threw] chaff, which turned into arrows.



- J. *“So it is written, ‘A Psalm of David. The Lord said to my master, Sit at my right hand until I make your enemies your footstool’ (Psa. 110: 1). And it is written, ‘Who raised up the righteous man from the east, called him to his food, gave the nations before him, and made him rule over kings? He made his sword as the dust and his bowl as driven stubble’ (Isa. 41: 2).”*

**I.25 A.** *Nahum of Gam Zo [“This too”] was accustomed to say, on the occasion of anything that happened, “This too is for the good.” One day, the Israelites wanted to end a gift to Caesar.*

- B. *They said, “With [109A] whom shall we send it? Let us send it with Nahum of Gam Zo, for he is familiar with miracles.”*

- C. *When he got to an inn, he wanted to lodge there. They said to him, “What do you have with you?”*

- D. *He said to them, “I’m bringing a gift to Caesar.”*

- E. *They got up in the middle of the night and untied his box, took out everything in it, and filled the box with dirt. When he got there [to the capital], it turned out to be dirt. The [courtiers] said to him, “The Jews are ridiculing us.”*

- F. *They took him out to kill him. He said, “This too is for the good.”*

- G. *Elijah came and appeared to them as one of them. He said to them, “Perhaps this dirt comes from the dirt of Abraham, our father, who threw dirt that turned into swords and chaff that turned into arrows.”*

- H. *They looked, and that is what turned out. There was a province that they had not been able to conquer. They threw some of that dirt against it, and they conquered it. They brought [Nahum] to the treasury and said to him, “Take whatever you want.”*

- I. *He filled his box with gold. When he returned, those who were at the inn came and said to him, “What did you bring to the palace?”*

- J. *He said to them, “What I took from here I brought there.”*

- K. *They took [dirt] and brought it there, and [the courtiers] put them to death.*

**II.1 A.** *The generation of the dispersion has no share in the world to come [M. 10:3E]:*

- B. *What did they do wrong?*

- C. *Said members of the house of R. Shila, “[They said], ‘Let us build a tower and go up to the firmament and hit it with axes, so that the water will gush forth.’”*

- D. *They ridiculed this in the West, “If so, they should have built it on a mountain!”*

- E. *Said R. Jeremiah bar Eleazar, “They divided up into three parties. One said, ‘Let us go up and dwell there.’*

- F. *“The second said, ‘Let us go up and worship an idol.’*

- G. *“The third said, ‘Let us go up and make war.’*

- H. *“The party that said, ‘Let us go up and dwell there — the Lord scattered them’ (Gen. 11: 9).*

- I. *“The party that said, ‘Let us go up and make war’ turned into apes, spirits, devils, and night-demons.*

- J. *“The party that said, ‘Let us go up and worship an idol’ — ‘for there the Lord did confound the language of all the earth’ (Gen. 11: 9).”*



**II.2 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. R. Nathan says, “All of them [went up] intending to worship an idol.
- C. “Here it is written, ‘Let us make us a name’ (Gen. 11: 4), and elsewhere: ‘And make no mention of the name of other gods’ (Exo. 23:13).
- D. “Just as in the latter passage [name stands for] idolatry, so here too ‘name’ stands for idolatry.”

**II.3 A.** Said R. Yohanan, “As to the tower, a third of it burned, a third of it sank into the earth, and a third is yet standing.”

- B. Said Rab, “The air of the tower makes people forget.”
- C. *Said R. Joseph, “Babylonia and Borsif are a bad sign for Torah-study [because people there forget what they learn (Freedman, p. 748, n. 8)].”*
- D. *What is the sense of Borsif?*
- E. *Said R. Asi, “An empty pit [bor: pit: sif/shafi: empty].”*

**III.1 A.** **The men of Sodom have no portion in the world to come [M. 10:31]:**

- B. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
- C. **The men of Sodom have no portion in the world to come [M. 11:31],**
- D. **since it is said, “And the men of Sodom were wicked sinners” (Gen. 13:13) in this world**
- E. **“against the Lord exceedingly” — in the world to come. [T. San. 13:8A-C].**

**III.2 A.** Said R. Judah, “‘Wicked’ — with their bodies.

- B. “And ‘sinners’ — with their money.
- C. “‘Wicked’ — with their bodies, as it is written, ‘How then can I do this great wickedness and sin against God?’ (Gen. 39: 9).
- D. “‘Sinners’ — with their money, as it is written, ‘And it be a sin unto you’ (Deu. 15: 9).
- E. “‘Before the Lord’ — this is blasphemy.
- F. “‘Very much’ — for they intended deliberately to sin.”
- G. *On Tannaite authority it was taught:*
- H. “‘Wicked’ — with their money.
- I. “And sinners” — with their bodies.
- J. “‘Wicked’ — with their money, as it is written, “And your eye be wicked against your poor brothers” (Deu. 15: 9).
- K. “And sinners” — with their bodies, as it is written, “And I will sin against God” (Gen. 39: 9).
- L. “‘Before the Lord’ — this is blasphemy.
- M. “‘Very much’ — this refers to murder, as it is written, “Moreover, Manasseh shed innocent blood exceedingly” (2Ki. 21:16).

**III.3 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. **The men of Sodom acted arrogantly before the Omnipresent only on account of the good which he lavished on them, since it is said, “As for the land, out of it comes bread...Its stones are the place of sapphires, and it has dust of**

gold. That path, no bird of prey knows...The proud beasts have not trodden it" (Job. 28: 5-8).

- C. Said the men of Sodom, "Since bread comes forth from our land, and silver and gold come forth from our land, and precious stones and pearls come forth from our land, we do not need people to come to us.
- D. "They come to us only to take things away from us. Let us go and forget how things are usually done among us."
- E. [Following T.'s version:] The Omnipresent said to them, "Because of the goodness which I have lavished upon you, you deliberately forget how things are usually done among you. I shall make you be forgotten from the world."
- F. What does it say? "They open shafts in a valley from where men live. They are forgotten by travelers. They hang afar from men, they swing to and fro (Job. 28: 4). In the thought of one who is at ease there is contempt for misfortune; it is ready for those whose feet slip. The tents of robbers are at peace, and those who provoke God are secure, who bring their god in their hand" (Job. 12: 5-6).
- G. And so it says, "As I live, says the Lord God, your sister Sodom and her daughters have not done as you and your daughters have done. Behold, this was the guilt of your sister Sodom: she and her daughters had pride, surfeit of food, and prosperous ease, but did not aid the poor and needy. They were haughty and did abominable things before me. Therefore I removed them when I saw it" (Eze. 16:48-50). [T. [Sot. 3:11-2](#)].

- III.4** A. *Raba expounded [the following verse]: "What is the sense of this verse: 'How long will you imagine mischief against a man? You shall be slain, all of you, you are all as a bowing wall and as a tottering fence' (Psa. 62: 4)?"*
- B. "This teaches that the [Sodomites] would look enviously at wealthy men, so they would set such a man near a tottering fence and push it over on him and come and take away all his money."
  - C. *Raba expounded [the following verse]: "What is the meaning of this verse: 'In the dark they dig through houses, which they had marked for themselves in the daytime; they know not the light' (Job. 24:16)?"*
  - D. "This teaches that the [Sodomites] would look enviously at wealthy men, so they would deposit with such a man valuable balsam. [The wealthy men] would put it into their treasure rooms. In the night [the others] would come and smell it out like a dog [and so know where there treasure was], as it is written, 'They return at evening, they make a noise like a dog, and go around the city' (Psa. 59: 7).
  - E. "They would then come and dig there and take away the money.
  - F. "[As to the victim]" 'They cause him to go naked without clothing' (Job. 24:10), 'that they have no covering in the cold' (Job. 24: 7). 'They lead away the ass of the fatherless, they take the widow's ox for a pledge' (Job. 24: 3). 'They remove the landmarks, they violently take away flocks and feed them' (Job. 24: 2). 'And he shall be brought to the grave and remain in the tomb' (Job. 21:32)."
  - G. *R. Yosé interpreted the passage in this way in Sepphoris. That night three hundred houses in Sepphoris were broken into. They came and blamed him. They said to him, "You have shown the way to thieves."*

- H. *He said to them, "Did I know that thieves would come?"*
- I. *When R. Yosé died, the streets of Sepphoris ran with blood.*

**III.5** A. *[The Sodomites] said, "Whoever has one ox must guard the herd one day, and whoever has no oxen must guard the herd two days."*

- B. *There was an orphan, son of a widow, the whom they gave the herd to pasture. He went and killed the [oxen]. He said to them, [109B] "He who has one ox may take one hide. He who has no oxen may take two hides."*
- C. *"Why so" they asked him?*
- D. *He said to them "The end of the matter must accord with its beginning. Just as, at the beginning, one who had an ox had to pasture the herd for one day and one who had none had to do it two days, so at the end, one who had an ox takes one hide, and one who has none takes two."*
- E. *One who crosses a river [by a ferry] pays one zuz, and one who does not cross the river by a ferry [but crosses on his own] has to pay two.*
- F. *If one had a row of bricks [drying in the sun], each one of them would take one, saying to him, "I only took one."*
- G. *If one had garlic or onions drying [in the sun], each one of them would take one, saying to him, "I only took one."*

**III.6** A. *There were four judges in Sodom, named Liar, Big Liar, Forger, and Perverter of Justice.*

- B. *If someone beat his neighbor's wife and made her abort, they say to him, "Give her to him, and he will make her pregnant for you."*
- C. *If someone cut off the ear of his neighbor's ass, they say to him, "Give it to him, until it grows a new one."*
- D. *If someone injured his neighbor, they say to [the victim], "Pay him the fee for letting blood from you."*
- E. *One who crosses the river in a ferry pays four zuz, one who crosses through the water pays eight.*
- F. *One day a washerman came by there. They said to him, "Pay four zuz."*
- G. *He said to them, "I crossed in the water."*
- H. *They said to him, "If so, pay eight, because you crossed through the water."*
- I. *He would not pay, so they beat him up. He came before a judge, who said to him, "Pay the fee for his having let blood from you, as well as the eight zuz for crossing through the water."*
- J. *Eliezer, Abraham's servant, happened to come there. Someone beat him up. He came before a judge, who said to him, "Pay him a fee for letting blood from you."*
- K. *He took a stone and beat the judge. He said to him, "What's this?"*
- L. *He said to him, "The fee that you now owe me give to this man, and my money will remain where it is."*
- M. *They had beds, on which they would place guests. If someone was too long, they shortened him [by cutting off his legs], and if he was too short, they stretched him [on a rack].*

- N. *Eliezer, Abraham's servant, happened by there. They said to him, "Come, lie down on the bed."*
- O. *He said to the, "I took a vow from the time that my mother died never to sleep on a bed."*
- P. *When a poor man came there, each one of them gave him a denar, on which he wrote his name. But they gave him no bread. When he would die, each one of them came and took back his denar.*
- Q. *They made this stipulation among them: Whoever invited someone to a banquet will have to give over his cloak. There was a banquet, and Eliezer happened to come there, but they did not give him any bread. Since he wanted to eat, Eliezer came and sat down at the end of them all. They said to him, "Who invited you here?"*
- R. *He said to the one who sat nearby, "You were the one who invited me."*
- S. *He said, "Perhaps they will hear that I was the one who invited him and take away the cloak of that man [me]." He took off his cloak and ran away. And so they all did, until all of them were gone, and he ate the entire banquet.*
- T. *A certain girl brought out bread hidden in a pitcher to a poor man. The matter became known. They covered her with honey and put her on the parapet of the wall, and a swarm of bees came and ate her up.*
- U. *For it is written, "And the Lord said, The cry of Sodom and Gomorrah, because it is great" (Gen. 18:20).*
- V. *On this passage, said R. Judah said Rab, "It is on account of the girl [with the consonants for 'girl' and 'great' being the same]."*

- IV.1 A. The spies have no portion in the world to come, as it is said, "Even those men who brought up an evil report of the land died by the plague before the Lord" (Num. 14:37). "Died" in this world. "By the plague" in the world to come.**
- B. "The party of Korah is not destined to rise up, for it is written 'And the earth closed upon them' — in this world. 'And they perished from among the assembly' in the world to come," the words of R. Aqiba. And R. Eliezer says, "Concerning them it says, 'The Lord kills and resurrects, brings down to Sheol and brings up again' (1Sa. 2: 6).**
  - C. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
  - D. "Korah and his company have no portion in the world to come and will not live in the world to come,**
  - E. "since it is said, 'And the earth closed upon them' (Num. 16:33) — in this world.**
  - F. "'And they perished from among the assembly' — in the world to come," the words of R. Aqiba [M. 11:3Z-BB].**
  - G. R. Judah b. Petera says, "Lo, they are like something lost and searched for [T.: They will come to the world to come].**
  - H. "For concerning them it is written, 'I have gone astray like a perishing sheep; seek your servant' (Psa. 119:176)**

- I. [Following T.:] ‘Perishing’ is said here, and in the matter of Korah and his company, ‘perishing’ also is said.
- J. “Just as ‘perishing’ spoken of later on refers to that which is being sought, so ‘perishing’ spoken of here refers to that which is being sought” [T. San. 13:9C-I].

**IV.2** A. “Now Korah took...” (Num. 16: 1):

- B. He took a bad deal for himself.
- C. “Korah” — for he was made a bald-spot [“Korah” and “bald-spot” using the same consonants] in Israel.
- D. “Son of Izhar” — a son who turned the heat of the entire world against himself, as the heat of noon [“Izhar” and “noon” use the same consonants].
- E. “Son of Kohath” — who set on edge [KHT] the teeth of those who gave birth to him.
- F. “Son of Levi” — a son of the company of Gehenna [“Levi” and “company” use the same consonants].
- G. Then why not say, “son of Jacob” — a son who followed to Gehenna [with the letters for “Jacob” and “follow” being shared]?
- H. Said R. Samuel b. R. Isaac, “‘Jacob sought mercy for himself, [that he should not be listed here], as it is said, ‘O my soul, come not into their secret, to their assembly my honor be not united’ (Gen. 39: 6).
- I. “‘O my soul, come not into their secret’ — this refers to the spies.
- J. “‘Unto their assembly, my honor be not united’ refers to the assembly of Korah.”
- K. “Dathan” (Num. 16: 1) [colleague of Korah] — so-called because he transgressed the law [dat] of God.
- L. “Abiram” (Num. 16: 1) — so-called because he strengthened himself [using the consonants of the name] not to carry out an act of repentance.
- M. “On” (Num. 16: 1) [whose name means “lamentation”] — so-called because he sat and lamented [what he had done].
- N. “Peleth [On’s father]” (Num. 16: 1) — so-called because wonders [using the same letters as the name] were done for him.
- O. “The son of Reuben” (Num. 16: 1) — who saw and understood [using the consonants of the name] [not to get involved].

**IV.3** A. Said Rab, “As to On, son of Peleth, his wife saved him. *She said to him, ‘What do you get out of this matter? If one master is the greater, you are his disciple, and if the other master is the greater, you are still his disciple!’*”

- B. *“He said to her, ‘What should I do? I was in their conspiracy and I took an oath to be with them.’*
- C. *“She said to him, ‘I know that they are all a holy congregation, for it is written, “Seeing all the congregation are holy, every one of them” (Num. 16: 3).’*
- D. *“She said to him, ‘Stay here, and I’ll save you.’ She got him drunk on wine and laid him down in [the tent]. She sat down at the flap [110A] and loosened her hair. Whoever came and saw her turned back. [No one would gaze at her.]*
- E. *“Meanwhile Korah’s wife joined them, saying to them, ‘See what Moses is doing! He is king. His brother made him high priest. His brother’s sons he has made*

assistant priests. If heave-offering is brought, he says, "Give it to the priest." If tithe is brought, which you have every right to take [since it is for the Levites], he says, "Give a tenth of it to the priest."

- F. "Moreover, he has shaved off all your hair [as part of the purification rite, Num. 8:7], and ridicules you as if you were dirt, for he envied your hair.'
- G. "He said to her, 'But he did the same thing to himself?'
- H. "She said to him, 'It was because all the greatness was coming to him, he said also, "Let my soul die with the Philistines" (Jud. 16:30). [Freedman, p. 754, n. 5: This was used proverbially to denote readiness to suffer, so that others might suffer too. Moses, retaining all the greatness himself, did not mind shaving his own hair off, seeing that he had caused all the rest to do so, thus depriving them of their beauty.]
- I. "And furthermore he has said to you to make [fringes] of blue [on your garments] [Num. 15:38]. But if you think that the blue [fringe] is a religious duty, then produce cloaks of blue and dress your entire academy in them.'
- J. "That is in line with what is written, "Every wise woman builds her house' — referring to the wife of On, son of Peleth.
- K. "But the foolish woman tears it down with her own hands' (Pro. 14: 1) — referring to the wife of Korah."

**IV.4 A.** "And they rose up before Moses, with certain of the children of Israel, two hundred and fifty" (Num. 16: 2):

- B. They were the distinguished members of the community.
- C. "Chosen for the appointed times" (Num. 16: 2):
- D. For they knew how to intercalate years and designate the beginnings of the new months.
- E. "Men or renown" (Num. 16: 2):
- F. For they were known throughout the world.

**IV.5 A.** "And when Moses heard, he fell on his face" (Num. 16: 4):

- B. What did he hear?
- C. Said R. Samuel bar Nahmani said R. Jonathan, "That people suspected him of having sexual relations with a married woman, as it is said, 'And they expressed jealousy [as to sexual infidelity] of Moses in the camp' (Psa. 106:16)."
- D. Said R. Samuel bar Isaac, "This teaches that everyone expressed jealousy of his wife [M. [Sot. 1:1](#)] with respect to Moses, as it is said, 'And Moses took the tent and pitched it outside the camp.' (Exo. 33: 7) [Freedman, p. 755, n. 5: to avoid all ground of suspicion.]"

**IV.6 A.** "And Moses rose up and went to Dathan and Abiram" (Num. 16:25):

- B. Said R. Simeon b. Laqish, "On the basis of this verse we learn that one should not hold on to a quarrel [but should be eager to end it, in the model of Moses, who modestly went out to the other side to seek a resolution]."
- C. For Rab said, "Whoever holds on to a quarrel [and does not seek to end it] violates a negative commandment, for it is said, 'And let him not be as Korah and as his company' (Num. 17: 5)."
- D. R. Ashi said, "He is worthy of being smitten with *saraat*.



- E. “Here it is written, ‘As the Lord said to him by the hand of Moses’ (Num. 17: 5), and elsewhere it is written, ‘And the Lord said to him, Put your hand into your bosom [and when he took it out, behold, his hand was leprous as snow’ (Exo. 4: 6).”

**IV.7 A.** Said R. Yosé, “Whoever contends with the kingdom of the house of David is worthy that a snake bite him.

- B. “Here it is written, ‘And Adonijah slew sheep and oxen and fat cattle by the stone of Zoheleth’ (1Ki. 1: 9), and elsewhere it is written, ‘With the poison of serpents [using the same consonants as the word Zoheleth] of the dust’ (Deu. 32:24).”
- C. Said R. Hisda, “Whoever is contentious with his master is as if he were contentious with the presence of God, as it is said, ‘When they strove against the Lord’ (Num. 26: 9). [Freedman, p. 755, n. 14: The reference is to Korah’s rebellion; though against Moses only, it is stigmatized as being against God.]”
- D. Said R. Hama b. R. Hanina, “Whoever undertakes to quarrel with his master is as if he had quarrelled with the Presence of God, as it is said, ‘This is the water of Strife, because the children of Israel strove with the Lord’ (Num. 20:13).”
- E. Said R. Hanina bar Pappa, “Whoever complains against his master is as if he complains against the Presence of God, as it is said, ‘Your murmurings are not against us but against the Lord’ (Exo. 16: 8).”
- F. Said R. Abbahu, “Whoever murmurs against his master is as if he murmurs against the Presence of God, as it is said, ‘And the people spoke against God and against Moses’ (Num. 21: 5).”

**IV.8 A.** “Riches kept for the owners to their hurt” (Qoh. 5:12):

- B. Said R. Simeon b. Laqish, “This refers to the riches of Korah.”
- C. “And all the substance that was at their feet” (Deu. 11: 6)”
- D. Said R. Eleazar, “This refers to the wealth of a man, that puts him on his feet.”
- E. And said R. Levi, “A load for three hundred white mules were made up by the keys of Korah’s treasury, *although all of them were made of leather, both keys and locks [and not metal].*”
- F. Said R. Hama b. R. Hanina, “Joseph hid three treasures in Egypt. One of them was revealed to Korah, one of them was revealed to Antoninus, son of Severus, and one of them is hidden away for the righteous in the world to come.”

**IV.9 A.** And said R. Yohanan, “Korah was not among those who were swallowed up nor among those who were burned.

- B. “He was not among those who were swallowed up, for it is written, ‘And all the men that joined Korah’ (Num. 16:32) — but not Korah.
- C. “He was not among those who were burned, for it is written, ‘When the fire devoured two hundred and fifty men’ (Num. 16:10) — but not Korah.”
- D. *In a Tannaite teaching it was repeated:*
- E. Korah was one of those who were burned up, and he was one of those who were swallowed up.
- F. He was one of those who were swallowed up, for it is written, “And swallowed them up together with Korah” (Num. 16:10).



- G. He was one of those who were burned, since it is written, “And there came up a fire from the Lord and consumed the two hundred fifty men” (Num. 16:35) — *including Korah.*

- IV.10** A. *Said Raba, “What is the meaning of that which is written, ‘The sun and the moon stood still in their zebul, at the light of your arrows they went’ (Hab. 3: 1)? [Freedman, p. 757, n. 1: There are seven heavens, of which zebul is one. What were they doing in zebul, seeing that they are set in the firmament, a lower heaven?]*
- B. “This teaches that the sun and the moon went up to the firmament called Zebul. They said before the Holy One, blessed be he, ‘Lord of the world, if you do justice with the son of Amram, we shall go forth, and if not, we shall not go forth.’
- C. “He shot arrows at them and said to them, ‘On account of the honor owing to me you never objected, but on account of the honor owing to a mortal man, you make a protest!’
- D. *“Nowadays they go forth only when they are driven out.”*

- IV.11** A. *Raba interpreted a verse of Scripture, “What is the meaning of what is written, ‘But if the Lord make a new thing and the earth open her mouth’ (Num. 16:30)?*
- B. “Said Moses before the Holy One, blessed be he, ‘If Gehenna has been created, well and good, and if not, let the Lord now create it.’”
- C. *For what purpose? If we say that he was actually to create it then and there, [how can this be so, for] “There is no new thing under the sun” (Qoh. 1: 9)?*
- D. *Rather, it was to bring its mouth near [to the present place].*

- IV.12** A. “But the children of Korah did not die” (Num. 26:11):
- B. *A Tannaite authority taught in the name of our Master [Judah the Patriarch]: “A place was set aside for them in Gehenna, and they sat there and recited a song [for God].”*
- IV.13** A. *Said Rabbah bar bar Hana, “One time I was going along the way, and a Tai [Arab] said to me, ‘Come, and I shall show you where the men of Korah were swallowed up.’ I went and saw two crevasses, from which smoke came forth. He took a piece of wool, wet it down, and set it on the tip of his spear and passed it over the spot, and it was singed.*
- B. *“I said to him, ‘Listen to what you are going to hear.’*
- C. *“And I heard him saying, ‘Moses and his Torah are true, and they are liars.’*
- D. *“[110B] He said to me, ‘Every thirty days Gehenna turns them over like meat in a pot, and they say this: ‘Moses and his Torah are true, and they are liars.’”*

- V.1** A. **The generation of the wilderness has no portion in the world to come [M. 11:3W]:**
- B. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
- C. **“The generation of the wilderness has no portion in the world to come [M. 10:3W],**
- D. **[T. adds:] “and will not live in the world to come,**

- E. **“for it is said, ‘In this wilderness they shall be consumed and there they shall die’ (Num. 14:35),**
- F. **“‘In this wilderness they shall be consumed’ — in this world,**
- G. **“and there they will die, ‘ in the world to come.**
- H. **“And it says, ‘Of them I swore in my wrath that they should not enter into my rest’ (Psa. 95:11)”, the words of R. Aqiba.**
- I. **R. Eliezer says, “They will come into the world to come,**
- J. **“for concerning them it is said, ‘Gather my saints together to me, those that have made a covenant with me by sacrifice’ (Psa. 50: 5) [M. 11:3Y] [T. San. 13:10].**
- K. **“What does Scripture mean, ‘I swore in my wrath’?**
- L. **“‘In my wrath I swore, but I retract it.’”**
- M. **R. Joshua b. Qorha says, “These things were spoken only regarding generations to come,**
- N. **as it is said, ‘Gather my saints together to me’ — these are the righteous of every generation [T.: because they did deeds of loving kindness to me];**
- O. **“‘Those that have made a covenant with me’ — this refers to Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah, who gave themselves up to the fiery furnace on my account.**
- P. **“‘By sacrifice’ — this refers to R. Aqiba and his colleagues, who gave themselves over to the slaughter on account of the teachings of the Torah.”**
- Q. **R. Simeon b. Menassia says, “They will come [into the world to come],**
- R. **“and concerning them it is said, ‘And the redeemed of the world shall return and come to Zion with gladness’ (Isa. 35:10) [T. San. 13:11].**
- S. *Said Rabbah bar bar Hannah said R. Yohanan, “R. Aqiba abandoned his love [of Israel, when he said that the generation of the wilderness will not enjoy the world to come].*
- T. **“For it is written, ‘Go and cry in the ears of Jerusalem, saying Thus says the Lord, I remember the loyalty of your youth, the love of your espousals, when you went after me in the wilderness, in an unsown land’ (Jer. 2: 2). [Freedman, p. 759, n. 1: Thus the merit of this act of faith on the part of the generation of the wilderness stood their descendants in good stead and conferred the privilege on them of a share in the world to come].**
- U. **“Now if others will come on account of their merit [to the world to come,] how much the more so they themselves!”**

The Talmud simply lays forth materials to complement the Mishnah’s topics, item by item. The sole point of note is the change in the order of the Mishnah’s topics at the final two items. Otherwise the sequence and topical unfolding are just as expected in a commentary to a received text.

## 11:3DD-FF

- DD.** “The ten tribes are not destined to return,  
**EE.** “since it is said, ‘And he cast them into another land, as on this day’ (Deu. 29:28). Just as the day passes and does not return, so they have gone their way and will not return,” the words of R. Aqiba.  
**FF.** R. Eliezer says, “Just as this day is dark and then grows light, so the ten tribes for whom it now is dark — thus in the future it is destined to grow light for them.”

**I.1 A.** *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B.** “The ten tribes have no portion in the world to come [T.: and will not live in the world to come],  
**C.** “as it is said, ‘And the Lord drove them out of their land with anger and heat and great wrath’ (Deu. 29: 8) — in this world;  
**D.** “and cast them forth into another land’ (Deu. 29:28) — in the world to come,” the words of R. Aqiba.  
**E.** R. Simeon b. Judah of Kefar Akkum says in the name of R. Simeon, “Scripture said, ‘As at this day’ —  
**F.** “if their deeds remains as they are this day, they will [not] reach it, and if not, they will (not) reach it.”  
**G.** Rabbi says, “[Both these and those] have a portion in the world to come,  
**H.** “as it is said, ‘And it shall come to pass in that day that the trumpet shall be blown [and those who are perishing in the land of Assyria and those who are driven away in to the Land of Egypt shall come and worship the Lord in the holy mountain, in Jerusalem]’ (Isa. 27:13).” [T. [San. 13:12](#)].  
**I.** *Said Rabbah b. b. Hana said R. Yohanan, “R. Aqiba abandoned his love [for Israel in taking the position that he did.]*  
**J.** “For it is written ‘Go and proclaim these words toward the north and say, Return, you backsliding Israel, says the Lord, and I will not cause my anger to fall upon you, for I am merciful, says the Lord, and I will not keep my anger forever’ (Jer. 3:12).”  
**K.** *What is the reference to [Aqiba’s] love?*  
**L.** *As it has been taught on Tannaite authority:*  
**M.** “Minors who are children of the wicked of the Land [of Israel] have no portion in the world to come, as it is said, ‘Behold, the day is coming, burning like a furnace, and all the proud, and all who do wickedly, shall be as stubble, and the day coming shall burn them up, said the Lord, that it shall leave them neither root nor branch’ (Mal. 3:19).  
**N.** “‘Root’ — in this world.  
**O.** “‘Branch’ — in the world to come,” the words of Rabban Gamaliel.  
**P.** R. Aqiba says, “They come into the world to come. For it says, ‘The Lord preserves the simple’ (Psa. 116: 6), and in the coastal towns they call a child ‘the simple one.’ And further, ‘Hew down the tree and

destroy it, nevertheless, leave the stump of the roots thereof in the earth' (Dan. 4:23)."

Q. Said Rabban Gamaliel said to [Aqiba], "How shall I interpret, 'He shall leave to them neither the root nor the branch'"?

R. [Joshua] said to Gamaliel, "That the Omnipresent will not leave them [the merit of a single] religious duty or the remnant of a religious duty, or for their fathers, forever" [T. San. 13:1 A-D].

S. Another matter:

T. "Root" — this refers to the soul.

U. And "branch" — this refers to the body.

V. And the children of the wicked among the heathen will not live [in the world to come] nor be judged.

W. And Rabban Gamaliel?

X. *He derives the same fact from the verse*, "And you have made all their memory perish" (Isa. 26:14).

**I.2 A.** *It has been stated upon Amoraic authority:*

B. As to an infant, at what point does it enter the world to come?

C. R. Hiyya and R. Simeon b. Rabbi: one said, "From the time that it is born."

D. The other said, "From the time that it cried."

E. *The one who has said*, "From the time that it is born" — as it is said, "They shall come and declare his righteousness to a people that shall be born, that he has done this" (Psa. 22:32).

F. *The one who has said*, "From the time that it spoke" — as it is written, "A seed shall serve him it shall be related of the Lord for a generation" (Psa. 22:31).

G. *It has been stated upon Amoraic authority:*

H. Rabina said, "From the time that of conception as it is written, 'A seed shall serve him' (Psa. 22:31)."

I. R. Nahman b. Isaac said, "From the time of circumcision, as it is written, 'I am afflicted and ready to die from my youth up, while I suffer your terrors I am distracted.' (Psa. 88:16)."

J. *It was taught on Tannaite authority in the name of R. Meir*, "From the time that is said, 'Amen,' as it is said, 'Open you the gates, that the righteous nation which keeps the truth may enter in' (Isa. 26: 2). Do not read 'which keeps truth' but 'which says, "Amen"'" [rearranging the consonants at hand]."

K. **[111A]** *What is the meaning of "Amen"?*

L. God, faithful king.

**I.3 A.** "Therefore hell has enlarged herself and opened her mouth without measure" (Isa. 5:15):

- B. Said R. Simeon b. Laqish, "For him who leaves over even one law [unobserved]."
- C. *Said R. Yohanan, "It is not a pleasing to their Master that you make such a statement to them. Rather: even if one who has not studied a single statute [it will save a person from Gehenna]."*
- D. "And it shall come to pass that in all the land, says the Lord, two parts therein shall be cut off and die, but the third shall be left therein" (Zec. 13: 8):
- E. Said R. Simeon b. Laqish, "The third of the descendants of Shem."
- F. *Said R. Yohanan, "It is not pleasing to their Master that you make such a statement to them [since most of humanity will perish]. Rather: A third even of the descendants of Noah."*
- G. "For I am married to you and I will take you one of a city and two of a family" (Jer. 3:14):
- H. Said R. Simeon b. Laqish, "The matter is to be interpreted just as it is written."
- I. *Said R. Yohanan to him, "It is not pleasing to their Master that you should say this to them. Rather: One in a given city imparts merit to save the entire city, and two of a family impart merit to save the entire family."*
- J. *R. Kahana was in session before Rab and said [in this same context], "The matter is to be interpreted just as it is written."*
- K. *Said Rab to him, "It is not pleasing to their Master that you should say this to them. Rather: One in a given city imparts merit to save the entire city, and two of a family impart merit to save the entire family."*
  - L. *Rab saw that he straightened out his hair and then went and took up a seat before Rab. He said to him, "'And it shall not be found in the land of the living' (Job. 28:13)."*
  - M. *He said to him, "You curse me."*
  - N. *He said to him, "I cite a verse to you: You shall not find Torah in him who worries about his own needs ahead of it."*

**I.4 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. R. Simai says, "It is said, 'I shall take you to me for a people' (Exo. 6: 7), and it is said, 'And I will bring you in [to the land]' (Exo. 6: 7)."
- C. "Their exodus from Egypt is compared to their entry into the land. Just as, when they came into the land, they were only two out of the original six hundred thousand [only Caleb and Joshua], so when they left Egypt, there were only two out of six hundred thousand."
- D. Said Raba, "So it will be in the times of the Messiah, as it is said, 'And she shall sing there, as in the days of her youth, and as in the days when she came up out of the land of Egypt' (Hos. 2:17)."

**I.5 A.** *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. Said R. Eleazar b. R. Yosé, "One time I went to Alexandria, Egypt. I found an old man there, who said to me, 'Come and I shall show you what my forefathers did to your forefathers.'"
- C. "'Some of [your ancestors] did [my ancestors] drown in the sea, some of them they slew with a sword, some of them they crushed in the buildings.'

- D. “And on that account, Moses, our master, was punished, as it is said, ‘For since I came to Pharaoh to speak in your name, he has done evil to this people, neither have you delivered your people at all’ (Exo. 5:23).
- E. “Said to him the Holy One, blessed be he, ‘Woe for those who are gone and no longer to be found! How many times did I appear to Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob, as God Almighty, and they did not complain against what I meted out, nor did they ask me, “What is your name?”’
- F. “I said to Abraham, “Arise, walk through the land in the length of it and in the breadth of it, for I will give it to you” (Gen. 13:17), [yet] he had to go begging for a place in which to bury Sarah, and he found nothing until he acquired a place for four hundred silver shekels, yet he did not complain against what I meted out.
- G. “I said to Isaac, “Sojourn in this land and I will be with you and will bless you” (Gen. 26: 3), and while his servants went begging for water and found none to drink until they had a quarrel, as it is said, “And the herdmen of Gerar did strive with Isaac’s herdmen, saying, the water is ours” (Gen. 26:20). Yet he did not complain against what I meted out [to him].
- H. “I said to Jacob, “The land on which you lie will I give to you and to your seed” (Gen. 28:13). Yet he went begging for a place on which to pitch his tent and found none until he bought it for a hundred pieces of money [Gen. 33:19], yet he did not complain against what I meted out.
- I. ““And none of them said to me, “What is your name?”’
- J. ““Yet in the beginning you have said to me, “What is your name?”’
- K. ““And now you say to me, “Neither have you delivered your people at all” (Exo. 5:23)!
- L. ““Now shall you see what I will do to Pharaoh” (Exo. 6: 1). You will see the war against Pharaoh, but you will not see the war against Pharaoh, but you will not see the war against the thirty-one kings’ [Jos. 12:24].”

- I.6 A.** “And Moses made haste and bowed his head toward the earth and worshipped: (Exo. 34: 8):
- B. What did Moses see?
- C. R. Hanina b. Gamula said, “He saw [God’s attribute of] being long-suffering [Exo. 34:7].”
- D. Rabbis say, “He saw [the attribute of] truth [Exo. 34:7].”
- E. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority in accord with him who has said, “He saw God’s attribute of being long-suffering.”*
- F. *For it has been taught on Tannaite authority:*
- G. When Moses went up on high, he found the Holy One, blessed be he, sitting and writing, “Long-suffering.”
- H. He said before him, “Lord of the world, “Long-suffering for the righteous?”
- I. He said to him, “Also for the wicked.”
- J. [Moses] said to him, “Let the wicked perish.”
- K. He said to him, “Now you will see what you want.”

- L. When the Israelites sinned, he said to him, “Did I not say to you, ‘Long suffering for the righteous?’”
- M. **[111B]** He said to him, “Lord of the world, did I not say to you, ‘Also for the wicked?’”
- N. That is in line with what is written, “And now I beseech you, let the power of my Lord be great, according as you have spoken, saying” (Num. 14:17). [Freedman, p. 764, n. 7: What called forth Moses’ worship of God when Israel sinned through the Golden Calf was his vision of the Almighty as long-suffering.]

**I.7 A.** *R. Hagga was going up the stairs of the house of Rabbah bar Shila. He heard a child saying, “Your testimonies are very sure, holiness becomes your house, O Lord, you are for the length of days’ (Psa. 93: 5).*

B. “And near the same verse: ‘A prayer of Moses’ (Psa. 90: 1).”

C. He said, “This proves that he saw [the attribute of God’s being’ long-suffering.]”

**I.8 A.** Said R. Eleazar said R. Hanina, “The Holy One, blessed be he, is destined to be a crown on the head of every righteous person, as it is said, ‘In that day shall the Lord of Hosts be for a crown of glory and for a diadem of beauty to the remnant of his people’ (Isa. 28: 5).”

B. *What is the meaning of “a crown of glory and a diadem of beauty”?*

C. It is for those who do his will and look forward to his salvation. [The word for “glory” uses letters that, in Aramaic, also mean “will” or “desire,” and the word for “diadem” contains letters that also mean “look forward” or “hope”. The whole reads: In that day shall the Lord of hosts be for a crown of desire and for a diadem of hope (Freedman, pp. 764-5, n. 12)].

D. Might one suppose that it is for everyone?

E. Scripture states, “For the remnant of his people” (Isa. 28: 5). For those who make themselves as a remnant [Freedman, p. 75, n. 1: of no value, hence, to the humble].

F. “And for a spirit of judgment to him who sits in judgment and for strength to them that turn the battle to the gate” (Isa. 28: 6)”

G. “For a spirit of judgment” — this is one who rules over his impulse to do evil.

H. “To him who sits in judgment” — this refers to one who gives a true and honest judgment.

I. “And for strength” — to him who is stronger than his impulse to do evil.

J. “To them that turn the battle” — this refers to one who engages in the give and take of Torah-study.

K. “To the gate” — this refers to those who get up early in the morning and go to bed late at night to spend time in synagogues and school houses.

L. The attribute of justice said before the Holy One, blessed be he, “Lord of the world, how do these differ from those? [Why do those who have these qualities differ from those who do not have them them?]

M. He said to it, ““But they also have erred through wine and through strong drink are out of the way...they stumble in giving judgment”” (Isa. 28: 7).”



- N. The word used for “stumble” refers to Gehenna, as it is said, “That this shall be no grief to you” (I 1Sa. 25:31), and the word for “judgment” refers only to judges, as it is said, “And he shall pay as the judges determine” (Exo. 21:22).  
The layout of the whole is explained in Chapter Twelve. I see no major problems, and little secondary material at that.

### 11:4-6

- A. The townsfolk of an apostate town have no portion in the world to come,  
B. as it is said, “Certain base fellows [sons of Belial] have gone out from the midst of thee and have drawn away the inhabitants of their city” (Deu. 13:14).  
C. And they are not put to death unless those who misled the [town] come from that same town and from that same tribe,  
D. and unless the majority is misled,  
E. and unless men did the misleading.  
F. [If] women or children misled them,  
G. of if a minority of the town was misled,  
H. or if those who misled the town came from outside of it,  
I. lo, they are treated as individuals [and not as a whole town],  
J. and they [thus] require [testimony against them] by two witnesses, and a statement of warning, for each and every one of them.  
K. This rule is more strict for individuals than for the community:  
L. for individuals are out to death by stoning.  
M. Therefore their property is saved.  
N. But the community is put to death by the sword,  
O. Therefore their property is lost.

M.11:4

- A. “And you shall surely smite the inhabitants of the city with the edge of the sword” (Deu. 13:15)  
B. Ass-drivers, camel-drivers, and people passing from place to place — lo these have the power to save it,  
C. as, it is said, “Destroying it utterly and all that is therein and the cattle thereof, with the edge of the sword” (Deu. 13:17)  
D. On this basis they said, The property of righteous folk which happens to be located in it is lost. But that which is outside of it is saved.  
E. And as to that of evil folk, whether it is in the town or outside of it, lo, it is list.

M.11:5

- A. [As it is said,] “And you shall gather all the spoil of it into the midst of the wide place thereof” (Deu. 13:17).  
B. If it has no wide place, they make a wide place for it.  
C. [If] its wide place is outside of it, they bring it inside.  
D. “And you will burn with fire the city and all the spoil thereof, (ever whit, unto the Lord your God)” (Deu. 13:17).

- E. “The spoil thereof” — but not the spoil which belongs to heaven.
- F. On this basis they have said:
- G. Things which have been consecrated which are in it are to be redeemed; heave-offering left therein is allowed to rot; second tithe and sacred scrolls are hidden away.
- H. “Ever whit unto the Lord your God”
- I. Said R. Simeon, “Said the Holy One, blessed be he: ‘If you enter into judgment in the case of an apostate city, I give credit to you as if you had offered a whole burnt-offering before me.’”
- J. “And it shall be a heap forever, it shall not be built again”
- K. “It should not be made even into vegetable-patches or orchards,” the words of R. Yosé the Galilean.
- L. R. Aqiba says, “‘It shall not be built again’ — as it was it may not be rebuilt, but it may be made into vegetable patches and orchards.”
- M. “And there shall cleave nought of the devoted things to your hand [that the Lord may turn from the fierceness of his anger and show you mercy and have compassion upon you and multiply you]” (Deu. 13:18)
- N. for so long as evil people are in the world, fierce anger is in the world.
- O. When the evil people have perished from the world, fierce anger departs from the world.

M.11:6

**I.1 A.** [The townsfolk of an apostate town have no portion in the world to come, as it is said, “Certain base fellows sons of Belial have gone out from the midst of thee and have drawn away the inhabitants of their city:”:] *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. “...have gone out...” (Deu. 13:14) — they and not messengers.
- C. “...fellows...” — the plural means there must be two.
- D. Another matter: “...fellows...” — and not women.
- E. “...fellows...” and not children.
- F. “...sons of Belial...” — sons who have broken the yoke of heaven from their shoulders.
- G. “From your midst” — and not from the border towns.
- H. “The inhabitants of their city” — and not the inhabitants of some other city.
- I. “Saying” — indicating that there must be proper testimony and admonition for each one [who is involved].

**I.2 A.** *It has been stated on Amoraic authority:*

- B. R. Yohanan said, “They may divide a single town between two tribes [if the boundary between tribes runs through it].”
- C. R. Simeon b. Laqish said, “They may not divide a single town between two tribes.”
- D. R. Yohanan objected to R. Simeon b. Laqish, “...**unless those misled the town come from that same town and from that same tribe** [M. 11:4C] — *does this not bear the implication that even though the ones who led the town astray come from that town only, if they also come from that tribe as well, the law applies, and*

*if not, it does not apply? Then it bears the implication that a single town may be divided among two tribes.”*

- E. *[He replied,] “No, it may be a case in which part of the town came to [the one who led it astray] through an inheritance, or it was given to him.”*
- F. *He objected, “‘Nine cities out of these two tribes’ (Jos. 21:16) — is that not four and a half from one and four and a half from the other, in which case it follows that they do divide a single town among two tribes?”*
- G. *He replied, “No, it means four from one and five from the other.”*
- H. *If so, it should be made explicit [which one gave which number].*
- I. **[112A]** *That is a problem.*

**I.3 A.** *The question was raised:*

- B. *If the inhabitants were led astray on their own, what is the law?*
- C. *[Do we say that] the All-Merciful has said, “...have seduced the inhabitants” (Deu. 13:14), and not those who were seduced on their own?*
- D. *Or perhaps, even if the inhabitants were induced on their own, [the law still applies]?*
- E. *Come and take note: **If women or children misled them...**[M. 11:4F] — [the people of the town are exempt from punishment]. Now why should this be the case? Let them be in the status of those who were led astray on their own? [It would follow that if a town is led astray on its own, it would be exempt from penalty.]*
- F. *[No, the comparison is apt, for] these followed their own will alone, while the others [in the case specified in the Mishnah-rule] were led astray by women and children.*

**II.1 A.** *And unless the majority is misled [M. 11:4D]:*

- B. *[Since each participant is subject to the usual testimony of two witnesses as well as admonition,] how do we handle the matter [of dealing with the majority of a town]?*
- C. *Said R. Judah, “The court judges and imprisons, judges and imprisons [again and again, working their way through the population, until a majority has been convicted. Then all are executed.]”*
- D. *Said Ulla to him, “You turn out to delay the judgment [and execution of those tried earlier, and this is intolerable].”*
- E. *Rather, said Ulla, “The court judge and executes the death penalty of stoning, judges and executes the death penalty of stoning. [Freedman, p. 769, n. 10: When half of a town have thus been executed and there are still more, the place is declared a condemned city, and the rest are decapitated.]”*
- F. *It has been stated on Amoraic authority:*
- G. *R. Yohanan said, “The court judges and executes the death penalty through stoning, judges and executes the death penalty through stoning.”*
- H. *R. Simeon b. Laqish said, “They set up many courts [to judge the community more or less simultaneously and the trials are under the aspect of the condemnation of the town as a whole].”*

- I. Is this so? And has not R. Hama, son of R. Yosé, said in R. Oshaia's name, "Then you shall bring forth that man or that woman to your gates' (Deu. 17: 5), teaching that a man or a woman do you bring to your gates, but do not bring an entire town to your gates."
- J. *Rather, they set up many courts and look into the cases of each of the persons involved [without pronouncing a verdict], then they take the accused out to the high court and complete the trials and put them all to death.*

### **III.1 A. And you shall surely smite the inhabitants of the city with the edge of the sword" (Deu. 13:15):**

- B. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
- C. **Ass-drivers, camel-drivers, and people passing from place to place [M. 11:5B] who spent the night in its midst and became apostates with [the others of the town]**
- D. **if they spent thirty days in the town, they are put to death by the sword, and their property and the town are prohibited.**
- E. **But if they did not spend thirty days in the town, they are put to death by stoning, but their property is rescued [T. San. 14:2 A-D].**
- F. *An objection was raised from the following:*
- G. **How long must a man be in a town to count as one of the men of the town? Twelve months [M. B.B 1:5].**
- H. *Said Raba, "There is no contradiction [between the two definitions of residency for,] one serves the purpose of designating a person as one of the men of the town [which takes a year], and the other serves the purpose of designating him as one of the permanent residents of the town [which takes thirty days]."*
- I. *And has it not been taught on Tannaite authority [in support of that view]:*
- J. **He who is prohibited by vow from deriving benefit from his town or from the people of his town, and someone came from the outside and lived there for thirty days — he who took the vow is permitted to derive benefit from him.**
- K. **But if he was prohibited by vow from deriving benefit from those who dwell in his town, and someone came from the outside and lived there for thirty days, he is prohibited from deriving benefit from him [T. Ned. 2:10A-D].**

### **IV.1 A. Destroying it utterly and all that is therein and the cattle thereof with the edge of the sword (Deu. 13:17) [M. 11:5C]:**

- B. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
- C. "Destroying it utterly and all that is therein" (Deu. 13:17) —
- D. **excluding the property of the righteous which is outside of it, [M. 11:5D].**
- E. "And all that is therein" —
- F. **encompassing the property of righteous folk which happens to be located in it [M. 11:5D].**
- G. "The spoil that is in it" (Deu. 13:17) — but not the spoil that belongs to heaven.
- H. "All the spoil of it" (Deu. 13:17) — encompassing the property of wicked folk that is located outside of it.

**IV.2** A. Said R. Simeon, “On what account did they rule, The property of the righteous which is in it is lost?

B. “Because that property caused the righteous to live among evil people.

C. [T. adds: “And is it not a matter of an argument a fortiori? And if property, which does not see, hear, or speak, because it caused righteous men to live among wicked people, the Scripture has ruled that it must be burned, he who turns his fellow through the way of life to the way of death, all the more so should he be put to death by burning.”] [T. [San. 14:4G-K](#)].

**IV.3** A. A master said, “‘And all the spoil of it you shall gather’ (Deu. 13:17) — encompassing the property of evil folk that is outside of it.”

B. Said R. Hisda, “[But that applies, in particular, to that which can be] gathered together in it.”

C. Said R. Hisda, “Objects left on deposit with men of an apostate city are permitted [to the original owners].”

D. *To what circumstance does that statement pertain?*

E. *If one should say that the property belongs to people of a different city but is now within [the apostate city], then it is self-evident that it is permitted, since it does not fall into the category of “its spoil.”*

F. *Rather, they would be objects belonging to the inhabitants of the city located in another town.*

G. *But if they are capable of being assembled back in the apostate city, then why should they be permitted. And if they are not going to be assembled in the apostate town, he already has made that statement once [and why repeat it in the present form]?*

H. *In point of fact the property belongs to inhabitants of another town, and has been deposited in the apostate town. And here with what sort of case do we deal? It is with a case in which the resident of the apostate town accepted responsibility to replace the deposited property if lost. What might you have said? Since he has accepted responsibility for the deposited property if it is lost, it falls into the category of his own property.*

I. *So we are informed that that is not the case.*

J. Said R. Hisda, “As to a domesticated beast half of which belongs to a resident of an apostate city and half of which belongs to a resident of another town, it is forbidden. But as to dough half of which belongs to a resident of an apostate city and half of which belongs to a resident of another town, it is permitted.

K. *“What is the difference? The beast is treated as something which has not been divided, while the dough falls into the category of something that already has been divided.”*

L. *R. Hisda raised the question, “As to a domesticated beast belonging to a resident of an apostate city, what is the law on regarding proper slaughter as an act effective to purify the beast from the uncleanness pertaining to carrion [and so permitting use of the carcass]?”*

- M. *“The All-Merciful has said, ‘[You shall surely smite...the cattle thereof] with the edge of the sword’ (Deu. 13:17), and there is no difference whether the beast is properly slaughtered or merely put to death [and not slaughtered as required for ritual use].*
- N. *“Or perhaps, once the beast has been properly slaughtered, does the act of slaughter serve [to permit use of the beast]?”*
- O. *“What is the law?”*
- P. *The question stands over.*

- IV.4 A.** *R. Joseph raised the question, “What is the law concerning use of the hair of righteous women [in such a city]?”*
- B. *Said Raba, “Lo, that of wicked women is forbidden [if it is shaved off before they are executed].*
  - C. *“Scripture states, ‘You shall gather...and you shall burn...’ (Deu. 13:17), thus referring to something that lacks only being collected together and burned. Then the present matter is excluded, for it also lacks cutting off, as well as gathering and burning.”*
  - D. *Rather, said Raba, “We deal with a wig made from the hair of a gentile woman.”*
  - E. *If it is a wig made from the hair of a gentile woman, then what is the condition of the wig? If it is attached to her body, it is in the status of her body [and of course is not burned].*
  - F. *No, it is a question in a case in which the wig is hung on a peg.*
  - G. *Does it fall into the category of the property of the righteous that are located in the town, in which case it is destroyed?*
  - H. *Or perhaps, since it is put on and taken off, it falls into the category of the woman’s clothing [and is preserved].*
  - I. *The question stands.*

- V.1 A.** **“And you shall gather all the spoil of it into the midst of the wide place thereof” (Deu. 13:17):**
- B. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
  - C. *“If it does not have a wide place, it is not declared to be an apostate city,” the words of R. Ishmael.*
  - D. **R. Aqiba says, “If it has no wide place, they make a wide place for it” [M. 11:6B].**
  - E. *What is at issue here?*
  - F. *One authority takes the view that “its wide place” has the sole meaning of a wide place already present.*
  - G. *The other authority maintains that “wide place” also bears the meaning of a wide place existing only at present.*

- VI.1 A.** **[112B] Things which have been consecrated which are in it are to be redeemed; [heave-offering left therein is allowed to rot; second tithe and sacred scrolls are hidden away] [M. 11:6G]:**

- B. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
- C. **If there were Holy Things in it, things that have been consecrated for use on the altar are left to die; things which are consecrated for the upkeep of the Temple building are to be redeemed; heave-offering left therein is allowed to rot; second tithe and sacred scrolls are hidden away.**
- D. **R. Simeon says, “‘Its cattle’ — excluding firstlings and tithe of cattle.**
- E. **“‘And its spoil’ — excluding money which has been consecrated, and money which has taken on the status of second tithe” [T. [San. 14:5A-D](#)].**

**VI.2 A.** A master has said, **“If there were Holy Things in it, things that have been consecrated for use on the altar are left to die:”**

- B. *Now why should they be left to die? Rather, let them pasture until they are permanently disfigured, at which point let them be sold, and let the proceeds fall for the purchase of a freewill offering [as would be done under ordinary circumstances with such donations].*
- C. R. Yohanan said, *“‘The sacrifice of the wicked is an abomination’ (Pro. 21:27).”*
- D. R. Simeon b. Laqish said, *“It is property belonging to its original owner, for here we deal with Holy Things which the donor is liable to replace if lost.”*
- E. *At hand, then, is the viewpoint of R. Simeon, for he has said, “It remains the property of the owners.”*
- F. *But since the next clause [M. 11:6I] represents the view of R. Simeon, it must follow that the present clause does not stand for his opinion at all.*
- G. *[Rather, we try a different tack:] the passage speaks of Lesser Holy Things and is framed in accord with the position of R. Yosé the Galilean, who has ruled, “Lesser Holy Things fall into the category of property owned by the original donor.”*
- H. *Then what would be the rule for Most Holy Things? They should be redeemed [since they belong to the Temple and not to the original donor, that is, the resident of the apostate city].*
- I. *If that is the case, then the framer of the passage should have given the rule concerning things consecrated for the upkeep of the Temple building not separately, but as part of the rule covering Most Holy Things, framing matters in this way:*
- J. *“Under what circumstances? In the case of Lesser Holy Things. But as to Most Holy Things, they are to be redeemed.” [That would have covered both matters.]*
- K. *[The reason he could not frame matters in that way is that is hand also is a sacrifice such as] a beast designated as a sin-offering, the owner of which now is put to death. [Such a beast is killed, but not as a sacrifice.] Accordingly, the framer of the passage could not state matters as a general rule [since the rule would contradict the case of the sin-offering].*
- L. *Now we can understand why R. Yohanan did not rule as did R. Simeon b. Laqish, for it is written, “The sacrifice of the wicked is an abomination” (Pro. 21:27).*
- M. *But why did R. Simeon b. Laqish not reply in the way in which R. Yohanan did [since Yohanan gave a good reply]?*



- N. *He may say to you, “Where we invoke the rule, ‘The sacrifice of the wicked is an abomination,’ it is where the beast is present and at hand, but in the present case, since the status of the beast has changed, [for it is redeemed], the rule likewise may differ [and the cited verse will not apply].”*

**VI.3 A. R. Simeon says, “‘Its cattle’ — excluding firstlings and tithe of cattle” [T. San. 14:5C].**

- B. *With what sort of case do we deal?*
- C. *If we say that we deal with those that are unblemished, then this falls into the category of the spoil belonging to heaven.*
- D. *Rather we deal with those that are blemished.*
- E. *In that case, the beasts fall into the category of “the spoil of it” [the city itself, and are to be destroyed].*
- F. Said Rabina, “In point of fact we deal with blemished beasts. What falls into the category of “the cattle thereof” [to be destroyed] are beasts that are eaten as ‘its cattle,’ excluding the ones at hand, which are not eaten in the category of ‘its cattle,’ but rather in the category of firstlings and tithes [under a different rule entirely, not as ordinary animals], and so the fall into the category of ‘the spoil of heaven.’”
- G. *That then differs from the view of Samuel for Samuel has said, “Everything may be sacrificed and everything may be redeemed.”*
- H. *What is the sense of his statement?*
- I. *This is what he means to say: Whatever may be offered if it is unblemished or redeemed if it is blemished falls into the category of “the spoil of it” [that is to say, all animals designated for offerings of a lesser sanctity, except for firstlings and tithes].*
- J. *“But whatever may be offered if unblemished, while not subject to redemption if blemished, for example, the firstling and tithe of cattle, would be excluded by the phrase, “And the cattle thereof.” [This would stand at variance with Rabina’s position.]*

**VII.1 A. Heave-offering left therein is allowed to rot [M. 11:6G]:**

- B. Said R. Hisda, “That rule applies only to heave offering in the possession of ordinary Israelites, but as to heave-offering in the possession of a priest, to whom the produce actually belongs, it must be burned.”
- C. *To this proposition R. Joseph objected, “**Second title and sacred scrolls are hidden away [M. 11:6G].** Now lo, second tithe in the possession of ordinary Israelites is in the same classification as heave-offering in the possession of a priest. And yet, the Mishnah-passage states, **It is to be hidden away.**”*
- D. *Rather, if a statement on Amoraic authority has been made, this is how it has been made:*
- E. Said R. Hisda, “The stated rule [at M. 11:6G] applies only to heave-offering in the possession of priests. But as to heave-offering in the possession of ordinary Israelites, let it be handed over to a priest located in some other town [than the apostate city].”

## VII.2 A. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- B. “Dough prepared from produce in the status of second tithe [e.g., grain set aside as second tithe that has been milled into flour and made into dough], is exempt from the requirement of the separation of dough-offering,” the words of R. Meir.
- C. And sages declare it liable.
- D. Said R. Hisda, “The dispute concerns second tithe that is located in Jerusalem. *For R. Meir takes the view that* produce in the status of second tithe is the property of the Most High [and hence it will not be subject to the requirement of the separation of an additional holy offering, namely, dough-offering.]
- E. “*Sages, by contrast, maintain that* it is in the ownership of the ordinary person [and hence, even in Jerusalem, remains liable to the separation of dough-offering. Since, in Jerusalem, the farmer can eat the produce, it is regarded as his own property, and not property belonging to the Most High].
- F. “But in the provinces, all parties concur that it is exempt to the separation of dough-offering [because the farmer may not make use of the produce as he likes but is subject to the obligation to bring it to Jerusalem. Hence it is subject to God’s claim.]”
- G. *To this proposition R. Joseph objected, “Second tithe and sacred scrolls are hidden away [M. 11:6G]. Now with what case do we deal? If we say that it is produce in Jerusalem, can Jerusalem ever fall into the category of an apostate city? And has it not been taught on Tannaite authority: ‘There are ten rules stated with respect to Jerusalem, and this is one of them: it may not be declared an apostate city’?*
- H. *“If, furthermore, we deal with another town, the second tithe produce of which they brought up to Jerusalem, then the walls of Jerusalem have enveloped the produce [and imparted to it the status of such produce as it is defined in Jerusalem. It cannot be redeemed for money and removed.] Thus do we not deal with a case of produce in the status of second tithe located in the provinces, and it has been taught in the Mishnah that it is hidden away! [So it is treated as secular property, not as holy property, when it is in Jerusalem, contrary to Hisda’s thesis.]”*
- I. [In behalf of Hisda, this is the reply:] No, in point of fact it is produce in the status of second tithe that derives from some other town, *which people brought to Jerusalem. There it became unclean.* [Freedman, p. 776, n. 6: In this case it may not be eaten; consequently, it must be hidden away.]
- J. *But then should one not redeem the produce [that has become unclean]? For* said R. Eleazar, “How do we know that even in Jerusalem people are to redeem produce in the status of second tithe that has become unclean? Scripture says, “When you are not able to bear it, then you shall turn it into money” (Deu. 14:25).
- K. “The word for bear has the meaning of ‘eat,’ as it is said, ‘And he took and sent them gifts to them from before him’ (Gen. 43:34. [So Freedman, p. 776, n. 10: Thus he translates, If you are not able to eat it — since it is defiled — then you shall turn it into money, that is, redeem it].”
- L. *[No, one need not redeem this produce, for] here with what do we deal? It is with produce that has been purchased [113A] [with the money received in the*

redemption of the original produce in the status of second tithe. Now the newly purchased produce has become unclean. Freedman, p. 776, n.11: At this stage it is assumed that only the original second tithe can be redeemed if made unclean, but not produce later purchased with the redemption money].

- M. *But why not redeem [that produce, too], for it has been taught in the Mishnah: **If produce that has been purchased with money received for the second tithe has become unclean, it is to be redeemed [M. M.S. 3:10].***
- N. *The passage accords with the view of R. Judah, who has said that it should be buried.*
- O. *If that is the case, then why do you maintain that at issue is produce in the status of second tithe deriving in particular from an apostate city? Even a city in general [would be subject to the same rule. So we have gained nothing.]*
- P. *Rather, we deal with produce in the status of second tithe which is clean, and which has come within the fallen walls of Jerusalem.*
- Q. *This accords with the statement of Raba, for Raba has said, “The rule that one must eat produce in the status of second tithe within Jerusalem’s walls derives from the Torah.*
- R. *“The rule that the walls of Jerusalem envelope the produce [and impart to it the status of second tithe, so that once the produce has entered the walls of the city, it cannot then be redeemed for money and be removed from the city] derives only from the authority of rabbis, “Now when rabbis made that decree, it applied to a time in which the walls were there [to form a barrier], the rule does not apply.” [Freedman, p. 777, n. 2. Hence in this case since it actually belongs to the condemned city, and Jerusalem cannot assimilate it to itself, because its walls had fallen, it must be destroyed, but being sacred, it is hidden instead of burned.]”*

### **VIII.1 A. Sacred scrolls are hidden away [M. 11:6G]:**

- B. *The cited passage of the Mishnah does not accord with the view of R. Eliezer.*
- C. *For it has been taught on Tannaite authority:*
- D. R. Eliezer says, “Any city in which is to be found even a single mezuzah is not declared to be an apostate city, as it is said, ‘And you shall burn the city with fire, and all the spoil thereof, every whit’ (Deu. 13:17).
- E. *“Now if it contains even a single mezuzah, this would be impossible, as it is written, ‘You shall not do so to the Lord your God’ (Deu. 12: 4).”*

### **IX.1 A. R. Simeon says, “The Holy One, blessed be he, said...” [M. 11:6I]:**

- B. *[With reference to the dispute of Yosé the Galilean and Aqiba at M. 11:6K-L], may one propose that they dispute about the matter at issue in what R. Abin said R. Ilai said?*
- C. For said R. Abin said R. Ilai, “In any passage in which you find a generalization concerning an affirmative action, followed by a qualification expressing a negative commandment, people are not to construct on that basis an argument resting on the notion of a general proposition followed by a concrete exemplification only the substance of the concrete exemplification. [Freedman, p. 777-8, n. 8: The rule in such a case is: the general proposition includes only what is enumerated in the particular specification. But when one is thrown into the form of a positive command and the other stated as a negative injunction this does not apply. Now,

in the passage under discussion, “And it shall be an heap forever” is a general proposition, implying that it may not be turned even into parks or orchards; whilst “it shall not be built again” is a particular specification, denoting a prohibition against the erection of houses, etc., which require building, but not against parks, etc. Now had they both been expressed in the form of a positive or negative command, the rule of exegesis would be as stated, the particularized expression defining the general proposition. Thus “It shall be an heap for ever,” and that only in respect of rebuilding, but not in respect of parks, etc. Since, however, they are not both expressed in the same form, this method of exegesis is not followed, but the two clauses are regarded as distinct, a different exegetical rule being followed; viz., ‘That which is included in the general proposition and was then separately stated is intended to illumine the former’ (for “it shall not be built again,” which refers to houses, etc., was really included in the general proposition). Thus: “And it shall be an heap for ever” implies a prohibition of parks and orchards. Now, how is this implication understood? Because Scripture continues, “it shall not be built again,” from which we deduce, just as a building is anything erected in a human settlement, so “it shall be an heap for ever” prohibits everything that finds a place in civilization, and therefore includes gardens, etc.]

- D. *It would follow [in accord with this theory of what is at issue] that one authority [namely, Yosé] concurs with R. Abin, and the other [Aqiba] does not? [Accordingly, Aqiba prohibits building alone, while Yosé prohibits all sorts of land-use].*
- E. *No, all parties concur with the principle of R. Abin, and what is at issue here? One authority [Yosé] takes the view that the word “again” bears the meaning, ‘entirely, hence, never again,’ while the other [Aqiba] understands the word to the “again — as it had been” [allowing space for some other usage than the original one].*

**X.1 A. It may not be rebuilt, but it may be made into vegetable patches and orchards [M. 11:6L]:**

- B. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*
- C. **If the town contained trees that had already been cut down [prior to the trial], they are forbidden. If at the time of the verdict they were yet attached to the ground, they are permitted. But as to the trees of another city, whether they are cut down or attached to the ground, they are forbidden [T. San. 14:5E-G].**
- D. *What is this “other city”?*
- E. *Said R. Hisda, “It is Jericho, as it is written, ‘And the city shall be herem to the Lord’ (Jos. 6:17).”*

**“And the city shall be herem to the Lord:” Jericho in Particular**

**X.2 A.** “And Joshua adjured them at that time, saying, Cursed be the man before the Lord who rises up and builds this city, Jericho. He shall lay the foundation thereof in his firstborn, and in his youngest son shall he set up the gates of it.” (Jos. 6:17).

- B. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*

- C. **One may not rebuild it and call it by the name of some other town, and one may not build some other town and call it Jericho.” [T. San. 14:6L].**
- X.3 A.** It is written, “In his days did Heil the Bethelite build Jericho; he laid the foundations thereof in Abiram his firstborn and set up the gates thereof in his youngest son Segub, according to the word of the Lord which he spoke by Joshua the son of Nun” (1Ki. 16: 4).
- B. *It has been taught on Tannaite authority:*
- C. **“In Abiram his first born” (1Ki. 16:34):**
- D. **That wicked man! To begin with [with Abiram] he had no example from which to learn, but in the case of segub, he had an example from which to learn [T. San. 14:9A-C].**
- E. *What did Abiram and Segub do [that they, who were not wicked, did not learn the reason for the death]?*
- F. *This is the sense of the passage: “From the case of Abiram, his first born, that wicked man should have learned [what would happen to] Segub, his youngest son.”*
- G. Since it is said, “In Abiram, his first born” (1Ki. 16:34), do I not know that Segub was his youngest son? Why then does Scripture state, “Segub his youngest son”?
- H. This teaches that he continued burying his sons, from Abiram down to Segub.
- I. *Ahab had been his groomsman. He and Elijah came to greet him at the house of mourning. [Ahab] went into session and stated, “Perhaps when Joshua made that curse, this was the sense of the curse:*
- J. **“‘One may not rebuild it and call it by the name of some other town, and one may not build some other town and call it Jericho [T. San. 14:6L]’?”**
- K. *Elijah said to him, “Indeed so.”*
- L. *He said to him, “Now if the curse of Moses has not been carried out —*
- M. *“for it is written, ‘And you turn aside and serve other gods and worship them’ (Deu. 11:16), followed by, ‘And he shut up the heaven that there be no rain’ (Deu. 11:17), while if someone sets up an idol at the end of every furrow, the rain will not allow him to go and bow down to them —*
- N. *“will the curse of Joshua, his disciple, be carried out? [Surely not!]”*
- O. Forthwith: “And Elijah, the Tishbite, who was one of the inhabitants of Gilead, said to Ahab, As the Lord God of Israel lives, before whom I stand, there shall not be dew or rain these years, but according to my word” (1Ki. 17: 1).

P. *He sought mercy, and the key of rain was given to him. He got up and went his way.*

**X.4 A.** *“And the word of the Lord came to him, saying, Go away and turn eastward and hide yourself by the brook Cherith, that is before Jordan...And the ravens brought him bread and flesh in the morning” (1Ki. 17:2, 6).*

B. *Where did they get [validly slaughtered meat]?*

C. *Said R. Judah said Rab, “They got it from the butchery of Ahab.”*

D. *“And it came to pass, after a while, that the brook dried up, because there had been no rain in the land” (1Ki. 17: 7):*

E. *When [God] saw that there was suffering in the world, it is written, “And the work of the Lord came to him saying, Arise, go to Zarephath” (1Ki. 17:8-9).*

F. *And it is written, “And it came to pass after these things that the son of the woman, mistress of the house, fell sick” (1Ki. 17:17).*

G. *[Elijah] prayed for mercy that the keys of the resurrection of the dead might be given to him.*

H. *They said to him, “Three keys are not handed over to a messenger: those of birth, rain, and the resurrection of the dead.*

I. *“For will people say, ‘Two already are in the hand of the disciple [he already had the one for rain] and one in the hand of the master?’ Bring the one and take the other.”*

J. *For it is written, “Go, appear to Ahab, and I will send rain upon the earth” (1Ki. 18: 1).*

**X.5 A.** *A Galilean gave an exposition before R. Hisda, “To what may Elijah be compared? To the case of a man who locked his gate and lost the key. [Elijah locked up the rain and could not unlock it]”*

B. *R. Yosé gave an exposition in Sepphoris, “Father Elijah [113B] was an impatient man.”*

C. *[Elijah] had been used earlier to come to visit [Yosé], but he refrained from visiting him for three days and did not come. When he did come, he said to him, “Why did master not come?”*

D. *He said to him, “You called me impatient!”*

E. *He said to him, “But before us the master has shown himself to be impatient!”*

**XI.1** A. “And there shall cleave nought of the devoted thing to your hand’ (Deu. 13:18), for so long as evil people are in the world, fierce anger — is in the world [M. 11:6M-N]:

B. *Who are these wicked?*

C. *Said R. Joseph, “Thieves [who steal property from the apostate city].”*

**XI.2** A. *Our rabbis have taught on Tannaite authority:*

B. When the wicked come into the world, fierce anger comes into the world, for it is written, “When the wicked comes, then comes also contempt, and with ignominy, reproach” (Pro. 18: 3).

C. When the wicked departs from the world, goodness comes into the world and retribution leaves the world, as it is written, “And when the wicked perish, there is exultation” (Pro. 11:10).

D. When righteous people leave the world, evil comes into the world, as it is said, “The righteous man perishes, and no one lays it to heart, and merciful men are taken away, none considering that the righteous is taken away from the evil to come” (Isa. 57: 1).

E. When the righteous come into the world, goodness comes into the world, as it is written, “This one will comfort us in our work and in the toil of our hands” (Gen. 5:29) [T. **Sot. 10:1-3**].

As the outline in Chapter Twelve shows, the entire composition is organized and worked out in relationship to the Mishnah.